ORDINANCE 19-04

TO AMEND TITLE 8 OF THE BLOOMINGTON MUNICIPAL CODE, ENTITLED "HISTORIC PRESERVATION AND PROTECTION" TO ESTABLISH A HISTORIC DISTRICT – Re: 1175 S. Smith Road Historic District (The Harvey-Nelson House) (James and Sally Harvey, Petitioner)

- WHEREAS, the Common Council adopted <u>Ordinance 95-20</u> which created a Historic Preservation Commission ("Commission") and established procedures for designating historic districts in the City of Bloomington; and
- WHEREAS, the current owner of 1175 South Smith Road, James and Sally Harvey, voluntarily contacted and requested the Commission to recognize the Harvey-Nelson House as a historic property; and
- WHEREAS, on December 13, 2018, the Commission held a public hearing for the purpose of allowing discussion and public comment on the proposed historic designation of the property; and
- WHEREAS, at the same hearing, the Commission found that the three structures on the property have historical and architectural significance that merits the protection of the property as a historic district; and
- WHEREAS, at the same hearing, the Commission approved a map and written report which accompanies the map and validates the proposed district by addressing the criteria outlined in Bloomington Municipal Code 8.08.010; and
- WHEREAS, at the same hearing, the Commission voted to submit the map and report to the Common Council for its consideration; and
- WHEREAS, the report considered by the Commission at this hearing notes that this property consists of three "Contributing" structures; a slightly altered I-House built circa 1875; a Prairie-style barn and a one-room vernacular house both built circa 1930;

NOW THEREFORE, BE IT HEREBY ORDAINED BY THE COMMON COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF BLOOMINGTON, MONROE COUNTY, INDIANA, THAT:

SECTION 1. The map setting forth the proposed historic district for the site is hereby approved by the Common Council, and said historic district is hereby established. A copy of the map and report submitted by the Commission are attached to this ordinance and incorporated herein by reference and two copies of them are on file in the Office of the Clerk for public inspection.

The legal description of this property is further described as:

015-14335-00 Pt Nw Sw 1-8-1w 3.46a in the City of Bloomington, Monroe County, Indiana.

SECTION 2. The property located at 1175 S. Smith Road shall be classified as "Contributing".

SECTION 3. Chapter 8.20 of the Bloomington Municipal Code, entitled "List of Designated Historic and Conservation Districts," is hereby amended to insert the "Harvey-Nelson House" and such entry shall read as follows:

The Harvey-Nelson House

1175 S. Smith Road

SECTION 4. If any section, sentence, or provision of this ordinance, or the application thereof to any person or circumstances shall be declared invalid, such invalidity shall not affect any of the other sections, sentences, provisions, or applications of this ordinance which can be given effect without the invalid provision or application, and to this end the provisions of this ordinance are declared to be severable.

SECTION 5. This ordinance shall be in full force and effect from and after its passage by the Common Council of the City of Bloomington and approval of the Mayor.

DAVE ROLLO, President

Bloomington Common Council

ATTEST:

NICOLE BOLDEN, Clerk City of Bloomington

NICOLE BOLDEN, Clerk City of Bloomington

SIGNED and APPROVED by me upon this ______

01/2 1/

JOHN HAMILTON, Mayor City of Bloomington

SYNOPSIS

This ordinance amends Title 8 of the Bloomington Municipal Code (BMC) entitled "Historic Preservation and Protection" in order to designate "The Harvey-Nelson House – 1175 S. Smith Road" as a historic district. James and Sally Harvey sought this action and, after a public hearing on December 13, 2018, the Historic Preservation Commission ("Commission") recommended that the structures be designated historic with a rating as "Contributing" based upon certain historical and architectural criteria set forth in Chapter 8.08 of the BMC entitled "Historic Districts, Conservation Districts, and Standards." Historic designation of a property under Title 8 provides for the Commission or staff to approve a Certificate of Appropriateness before conspicuous changes to the exterior of sites and structures may be made and, thereby, helps assure that the historic significance of properties is preserved.

The property at 1175 S. Smith Rd, qualifies for local designation under the following highlighted criteria found in Ordinance 95-20 of the Municipal Code (1) a # (2) e, g.

- (1) Historic:
- a) Has significant character, interest, or value as part of the development, heritage, or cultural characteristics of the city, state, or nation; or is associated with a person who played a significant role in local, state, or national history; or
- b) Is the site of an historic event; or
- c) Exemplifies the cultural, political, economic, social, or historic heritage of the community.
- (2) Architectural:
- a) Embodies distinguishing characteristics of an architectural or engineering type; or
- b) Is the work of a designer whose individual work has significantly influenced the development of the community; or
- c) Is the work of a designer of such prominence that such work gains its value from the designer's reputation; or
- d) Contains elements of design, detail, materials, or craftsmanship which represent a significant innovation; or
- e) Contains any architectural style, detail, or other element in danger of being lost; or
- f) Owing to its unique location or physical characteristics, represents an established and familiar visual feature of the city; or
- g) Exemplifies the built environment in an era of history characterized by a distinctive architectural style

Background: The proposed district at 1175 S. Smith Rd consists of three buildings on a 3.46 acre parcel. The main house is a wooden I-House style farm house built in the mid-19th century. The parcel also has an original Prairie-style barn and a one-room house which is purported to have been the tenant house when the property was still a working farm. This property is located a couple of miles east of College Mall and is in an area that has recently seen increased pressure from large scale development through the expansion of the Gentry subdivisions. The farmhouse is considered endangered by its location where the development pressures generally propels higher density housing. The main house is currently well-maintained and the tenant house and barn are basically unaltered. The property was given a "Contributing" rating on the 2015 SHAARD survey.

Historical Significance:

(A) Has significant character, interest, or value as part of the development, heritage, or cultural characteristics of the city, state, or nation; or is associated with a person who played a significant role in local, state, or national history.

The property was part of a larger tract deeded from the State of Indiana to Robert Ewing on January 8, 1830. The tract remained intact until 1936 when a twenty acre parcel including the two-story I-House, one-bedroom tenant house, and barn was sold to Alice and Ralph Nelson.

The Nelson's were active members in the community. Alice worked at Indiana University (IU) where she was the Director of the Halls of Residence for twenty-five years during the tenure of IU president Herman B. Wells. Alice was instrumental in the development of libraries in the dorms, and oversaw a massive dormitory building program in the 1950s. Ralph was a civic leader, active in community development and expansion, and served as President of First National Bank.



Architectural Significance:

(G) Exemplifies the built environment in an era of history characterized by a distinctive architectural style.

The I-House is a British folk form of construction which was common in 17th century New England but became favored as both farm and city dwellings in the Midwestern states after the arrival of the railroad. The traditional I-House form is two-stories tall built two rooms wide and one room deep. The I-House at 1175 S. Smith Rd was constructed of brick and wood in 1875 and originally had four rooms. There has been two separate additions which have added a third bedroom and a bathroom upstairs, and a screened in porch, dining room, kitchen, pantry and laundry area, and another bedroom and bathroom on the main level.

The small one bedroom house on the property was used as tenant housing when the land was still used for farming. The exterior of the structure unaltered and maintains high historic integrity.

The original barn was a two story, wooden barn built using wooden peg construction. At one time the barn had a wooden shingle roof which has been replaced. The barn is believed to have been extended to the east and west. An interesting feature of the three structures on this property is that all of their gutters and downspouts are all connected to five, beehive-shaped underground cisterns constructed from brick.



(E) Contains any architectural style, detail, or element in danger of being lost.

These three familiar neighborhood structures, known by many, appear to be the last remaining 19th century structures in the vicinity. There was a similar barn on the Belcher Farm to the east which was torn down during the construction of the Gentry Estates subdivision, and another similar barn and Queen Anne house on the Smith Farm to the north which were torn down during the construction of the gentry Honours subdivision.

Recommendation: Approval

Staff recommends property parcel 53-08-01-300-004.000-009 (1175 S. Smith Rd) be designated as a local historic district. After careful consideration of the application and review of the Historic District Criteria as found in Ordinance 95-20 of the Municipal Code, staff finds that the property not only meets, but exceeds the minimum criteria listed in the code.

The property meets Criteria 1(a) because of its association with Alice and Ralph Nelson, civic leaders and prominent members of the community from the 1930s –1960s.

The property meets Criteria 2(g) due to the high level of integrity maintained by all three buildings which can be listed as contributing. Although several additions have been made to the main residence, the structure still possesses the distinct form, and modest style, of a traditional I-House. Built in 1875, the I-House still retains some of the original materials including brick walls and floor beams made from tulip poplar. The original barn, built using wooden peg construction, is still on the property and situated on its authentic location.

The property meets Criteria 2 (e) because the barn is the last remaining structure of its kind in Perry Township. Two older barns of similar construction in the vicinity have recently been demolished to make way for new residential development.



By: herteric 1 Oct 18

⊨= 100

For reference only; map information NOT warranted.

