# **Historic Preservation Commission Meeting** December 8, 2022, 5:00 P.M.

**MINUTES** 

In Person: McCloskey Room #134, 401 N Morton St., Bloomington, IN 47404 Zoom: https://bloomington.zoom.us/j/95852185508?pwd=M3J2aDgrdjdXaWh1QUN3eWRKYThKQT09 Meeting ID: 958 5218 5508 Passcode: 082945

### **CALL TO ORDER**

Meeting called to order by John Saunders at 5:01 pm

#### **ROLL CALL**

#### **Commissioners Present:**

Marleen Newman (Present)

Doug Bruce (Present)

Daniel Schlegel (Present)

Sam DeSollar (Present)

John Saunders (Present)

Elizabeth Mitchell (Present)

Allison Chopra (Present)

# **Advisory Members Present:**

**Duncan Campbell (Present)** 

Ernesto Castañeda (Electronic)

#### **Staff Present:**

Gloria M. Colom Braña, HAND

John Zody, HAND

Beth Cate, City Legal Department

Gabriel Holbrow, Planning and Transportation

#### **Guests Present:**

CATS (Present)

Mark Webb (Present)

Charlie Webb (Present)

Dina Kellams (Present)

Terry Cole (Present)

Joshua Hogan (Present)

Wei Xiaoshi (Online)

Nancy Jones (Online)

Richard Lewis (Online)

Diane Phail (Online)

Dawn Grey (Online)

Jonathan Hess (Online)

Barre Klapper (Online)

#### **APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

November 17, 2022 Historic Preservation Commission Meeting

# **Approval of November 17, 2022**

**Sam DeSollar** made a motion to approve the November 17, 2022 Minutes **Doug Bruce** seconded.

Motion carries 7 yes (Newman, Bruce, Schlegel, DeSollar, Saunders, Mitchell, Chopra), 0 Abstain, 0 No.

#### **CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS**

# **Staff Approvals**

**Gloria Colom** presented staff approvals from November and December. Items are listed on the agenda.

# **Commission Review**

# A. COA 22-82 (Appealing 22-72)

1304 E 2nd St. (Elm Heights Historic District)

Petitioner: Terry Cole

Window Replacement (Post action)

**Gloria Colom** presented, staff commented that this was heard last time and brought back up for this meeting. **Terry Cole** thought the last meeting was left because they were out of time and didn't have expectations for what to do next. Discussion took place.

**John Saunders** asked for questions and comments. No questions; comments ensued.

**Sam DeSollar** made the motion to levy a fine commensurate with the cost of replacing the windows and deny the petitioner's COA.

Allison Chopra Second.

Motion carries 7 yes (Newman, Bruce, Schlegel, DeSollar, Saunders, Mitchell, Chopra), 0 Abstain, 0 No.

#### B. COA 22-88

1018 E Wylie St. (Elm Heights Historic District)

Petitioner: Asa Palley and Charlotte Agger

Fence Installation and tree removal (Post Action)

**Gloria Colom** presented. See the Packet for details. Commissioner made comments and questions ensued. **Asa Palley** spoke.

#### Motion #1

Motion to approve COA <u>without the staff recommendation regarding</u> the repair of the retaining wall. Otherwise approve COA as presented in the staff report.

Sam DeSollar seconded.

Motion fails 3 Yes (Bruce, DeSollar, Chopra), 4 No (Newman, Schlegel, Saunders, Mitchell), 0 Abstain.

## Motion #2

Motion to approve COA as written and recommended by staff - moved by Marleen Newman **John Saunders** seconded.

Motion carries 4 Yes (Newman, Schlegel, Saunders, Mitchell), 3 No (Bruce, DeSollar, Chopra), 0 Abstain.

# C. COA 22-89 (Amend COA 22-14)

820 W Kirkwood Ave. (Near West Side Conservation District)

Petitioner: Justin Fox

New Construction - Change to the roofline

**Gloria Colom** presented, see packet for information. No questions. Some comments given to the petitioner.

**Doug Bruc**e moved to approve COA as recommended.

Sam DeSollar Seconded.

Motion carries 7 yes (Newman, Bruce, Schlegel, DeSollar, Saunders, Mitchell, Chopra), 0 Abstain, 0 No.

# D. COA 22-91 (Amend COA 22-15)

600 W Kirkwood Ave. (Near West Side Conservation District)

Petitioner: Dawn Gray, Springpoint Architects

To amend the window material

**Gloria Colom** presented, see packet for information. Some questions and comments ensued regarding the change from wooden to vinyl windows.

**Doug Bruce** motioned to approve COA as recommended.

Allison Chopra seconded.

Motion carries 7 yes (Newman, Bruce, Schlegel, DeSollar, Saunders, Mitchell, Chopra), 0 Abstain, 0 No.

# E. COA 22-92 (Amend COA 21-15)

507 S Ballantine Rd. (Elm Heights Historic District)

Petitioner: Mark C. Webb, Attorney at Law representing David H. Jacobs, Jr.

Change the roofline configuration and window height

**Gloria Colom** presented, see packet for information. (**Mark Webb** and **Charlie Webb** presented on behalf of **David Jacobs**). Questions and comments ensued. Discussion about the roof line were asked

Sam DeSollar moved to approve COA as recommended by staff.

John Saunders Second.

Motion carries 7 yes (Newman, Bruce, Schlegel, DeSollar, Saunders, Mitchell, Chopra), 0 Abstain, 0 No.

#### F. COA 22-93

339 S Fairview St. (Greater Prospect Hill Historic District) Petitioner: Joshua Hogan and Elizabeth Winchester Restorations and changes to the exterior

**Gloria Colom** presented, see packet for information. Comments from the neighborhood that are also noted in the staff report. Commissioners asked questions about windows and porch columns. Further Commissioner comments.

**Doug Bruce** made a motion to approve COA, but amended to reflect round, wood porch columns (not square) and horizontal lap siding should remain and go up to the top gable. Any replacement siding should match existing siding.

Daniel Schlegel second.

Motion carries 7 yes (Newman, Bruce, Schlegel, DeSollar, Saunders, Mitchell, Chopra), 0 Abstain, 0 No.

#### **Demolition Delays**

# A. DD 22-17

752 S Walnut St. (Contributing) Petitioner: Randy Sciscoe *Full Demolition* 

**Gloria Colom** presented, see packet for information. **John Saunders** read Demolition Delay language

Motion not needed.

Release carries 7 yes (Newman, Bruce, Schlegel, DeSollar, Saunders, Mitchell, Chopra), 0 Abstain, 0 No.

# B. DD 22-18

622 N Washington St. (Contributing)

Petitioner: Barre Klapper, Springpoint Architects

Partial Demolition

**Gloria Colom** presented, see packet for information. Notes by **Barre Klapper**: vinyl windows would be replaced; rear non-original addition would be removed.

Conversation ensued on moving to January 26 meeting - has clock started yet on demo delay?

**Allison Chopra** motioned to postpone to the January 26, 20233 meeting - by Allison C. **Elizabeth Mitchell** seconded.

Motion carries 7 yes (Newman, Bruce, Schlegel, DeSollar, Saunders, Mitchell, Chopra), 0 Abstain, 0 No.

## **New Business**

Much of new business is being postponed due to the late hour of the meeting. Discussed Miller Lecture Series.

**Allison Chopra** commented on attendance rule being followed for Commissioners - and how many meetings can be missed in a year. Three meetings missed means removal?

Meeting adjourned at 8:38 pm