



City of Bloomington Common Council

Packet of Materials

Containing legislation and materials related to:

Tuesday, 10 December 2024

Special Session Meeting at 7:30pm



CITY OF BLOOMINGTON COMMON COUNCIL

AGENDA AND NOTICE:
SPECIAL MEETING
TUESDAY | 7:30 PM
10 DECEMBER 2024

*Allison Conference Room (#225), Showers Building, 401 N. Morton Street
The meeting may also be accessed at the following link:*

<https://bloomington.zoom.us/j/82115857710?pwd=NK9dnZMaHw1pIRMI40WcbOSGZ4ke45.1>

1. ROLL CALL
2. AGENDA SUMMATION
3. DISCUSSION OF ORDINANCE 2024-26 – TO FIX THE SALARIES OF ALL ELECTED CITY OFFICIALS FOR THE CITY OF BLOOMINGTON FOR THE YEAR 2025

Note: There will be a public comment period on this item.

The discussion and public comment period on this item of legislation is not intended to replace the discussion during the second reading on the Wednesday, December 11th Regular Session starting at 6:30pm. Rather, this meeting is to allow for additional discussion of this ordinance.

4. ADJOURNMENT

Posted: 05 December 2024

MEMO FROM COUNCIL OFFICE:

To: Members of the Common Council

From: Lisa Lehner, Council Administrator/Attorney

Date: November 25, 2024

Re: Ordinance 2024-26 – An Ordinance to Fix the Salaries of Elected Officers of the City of Bloomington, Monroe County, Indiana for the Year 2025

Synopsis

Ordinance 2024-26 sets the maximum 2025 salary rate for the elected offices of Mayor, Council and Clerk of the City of Bloomington, Indiana.

Relevant Materials

- Ordinance 2024-26
- Memorandum and attachments from the Ad Hoc Salary Committee (the “Committee”)

Summary

Ordinance 2024-26 would fix the salaries for the Mayor, the Clerk and all Common Councilmembers (the “Elected Officers”) for the year 2025. State law details how compensation for Elected Officers should be fixed. Pursuant to I.C. 36-4-7-2, Council, as the city’s legislative body, is responsible for fixing the annual compensation, including the salaries, of elected city officers.

Earlier this year, Council passed Ordinance 2024-20 which fixed the salaries of appointed officers and non-union and A.F.S.C.M.E employees of the City of Bloomington for the year 2025. Likewise Council passed Ordinance 2024-19 which fixed the salaries of officers and employees of the Police and Fire Departments of the City of Bloomington for the year of 2025. Council delayed the passage of a salary ordinance for elected officers, pending the findings of the Committee.

The Committee was formed to make recommendations for fixing the salaries of elected officers in the City of Bloomington, culminating in Ordinance 2024-26. The Committee consisted of Councilmembers Sydney Zulich (Chair), Kate Rosenbarger, Hopi Stosberg, and Matt Flaherty. Additional support was provided by Crowe LLP consulting team, Clerk Nicole Bolden, and city staff including Sharr Pechac, Sam Roll, and Taylor Brown.

Guided in the development process by the Crowe team, the Committee developed the Framework to create a values-based and repeatable method for setting salaries, departing from the recent past practice of making minor adjustments to salaries based primarily on the prior year’s salary plus a cost of living adjustment (COLA).

As explained in the Committee’s Memorandum and its attachments, the Framework led the Committee to recommend the salary increases in Ordinance 2024-26.

Contact

Councilmember Sydney Zulich, Email: sydney.zulich@bloomington.in.gov

Lisa Lehner, (812)349-3562, Email: lisa.lehner@bloomington.in.gov

Council Office, (812)349-3409, Email: council@bloomington.in.gov

ORDINANCE 2024-26

**TO FIX THE SALARIES OF ALL ELECTED CITY OFFICIALS
FOR THE CITY OF BLOOMINGTON FOR THE YEAR 2025**

BE IT HEREBY ORDAINED BY THE COMMON COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF BLOOMINGTON,
MONROE COUNTY, INDIANA, THAT:

SECTION 1. Pursuant to I.C. § 36-4-7-2, the annual salaries of elected officials of the City of
Bloomington for the year beginning January 1, 2025, and extending to December 31, 2025, shall be:

Mayor	\$151,410
Clerk	\$129,780
Council Members	\$ 45,423

SECTION 2. The City Council President shall receive an additional \$1,500 per year, and the City
Council Vice President shall receive \$800 per year.

SECTION 3. This ordinance shall be in full force and effect from and after its passage by the Common
Council and approval by the Mayor.

PASSED AND ADOPTED by the Common Council of the City of Bloomington, Monroe County,
Indiana, upon this _____ day of December, 2024.

ISABEL PIEDMONT-SMITH
President,
Bloomington Common Council

ATTEST:

NICOLE BOLDEN, Clerk
City of Bloomington

PRESENTED by me to the Mayor of the City of Bloomington, Monroe County, Indiana, upon this
_____ day of December, 2024.

NICOLE BOLDEN, Clerk
City of Bloomington

SIGNED and APPROVED by me upon this _____ day of December, 2024.

Kerry Thomson, Mayor
City of Bloomington

SYNOPSIS

This ordinance sets the maximum 2025 salary rate for all elected city officials for the City of
Bloomington.

To: Members of the Common Council

From: Ad Hoc Salary Committee

Date: November 22, 2024

Re: Ordinance 2024-26, An Ordinance Fixing the Salaries of Elected Officials for the City of Bloomington, Indiana, for the Year 2025

Summary

This memorandum summarizes the Ad Hoc Salary Committee's process and rationale for developing recommendations set forth in Ordinance 2024-26, which would set the 2025 salary for all Elected Officials of the City of Bloomington, Indiana as follows:

- Mayor: \$151,410
- Clerk: \$129,780
- Council: \$45,423

Additionally, the ordinance would pay the City Council President an additional \$1,500 per year and the City Council Vice President an additional \$800 per year. The fiscal impact of the ordinance is estimated to be \$275,089. (Based on prior guidance from the Human Resources department, we assume a flat amount for benefits, retirement contributions, and taxes—i.e., the proposed salaries would not impact those figures.)

Supporting Materials

- Elected Official Compensation Framework Summary Memorandum (Crowe)
- Elected Official Compensation Framework
- Ad Hoc Salary Committee Heat Map - Consensus Scores
- Weekly Working Hours for Councilmembers - Survey Responses
- Comments from Mayor Thomson
- Comments from Clerk Bolden
- 2025 Civil City Pay Ranges and Steps

Committee Recommendations

Indiana Code 36-4-7-2(b) sets forth the following obligation: "The city legislative body shall, by ordinance, fix the annual compensation of all elected city officers." As requested by the Common Council in September 2024, the Ad Hoc Salary Committee (Committee) developed recommendations for fixing the salaries of elected officials in the City of Bloomington and prepared Ordinance 2024-26.

The Committee consisted of Councilmembers Sydney Zulich (Chair), Kate Rosenbarger, Hopi Stosberg, and Matt Flaherty. Additional support was provided by a Crowe LLP consulting team, Clerk Nicole Bolden, and city staff including Sharr Pechac, Sam Roll, and Taylor Brown.

Process and Guiding Principles

The Committee met six times in October and November to develop an Elected Official Compensation Framework, which was then used to develop the recommended salaries. In addition to this memorandum, the Summary Memorandum from the Crowe team provides a helpful overview of the process.

Guided in the development process by the Crowe team, the Framework consists of four elements: Guiding Principles, Basis for Salary Setting, Relevant Information, and an Annual Process. The purpose was to create a values-based and repeatable method for setting salaries, departing from the recent past practice of making minor adjustments to salaries based primarily on whatever the salary was the year before plus a cost of living adjustment (COLA).

Through an interactive process across several meetings, the Committee established the following Guiding Principles:

1. **Accessibility of Public Service** - The level of compensation makes elected office attainable for community members of all socioeconomic statuses.
2. **Equitable Pay** - Elected officials are compensated equitably according to their respective levels of responsibility and relative to other Bloomington elected officials and departmental leadership.
3. **Quality Community Service** - Compensation enables elected officials to meaningfully engage with and serve the Bloomington community.
4. **Informed Decisions** - Council makes informed decisions about elected official compensation in alignment with these Guiding Principles and based on relevant objective data.
5. **Transparent and Documented Process** - A transparent, repeatable process guides compensation decisions for elected officials, and results are clearly communicated.

Significant deliberation went into each principle, and the Committee would be glad to answer questions about these values. Here and throughout the Committee's work, the Crowe team was proactive and invaluable in structuring conversation and facilitating decision-making.

Basis of Salary Setting

Once it had established a set of values or principles to guide decision-making, the Committee and the Crowe team brainstormed many potential bases of salary setting while also discussing how to account for important differences in the three elected offices (City Councilmembers, City Clerk, and Mayor). The goal was to get many ideas on the table without pre-judging their advisability.

The Crowe team facilitated a process for Committee members to anonymously score each potential basis of salary setting based on the Guiding Principles. Scores were aggregated in a "heat map" tool. Consistent trends were observable, and several potential bases were ruled out for poor alignment with the established Guiding Principles, including the past practice of setting pay primarily based on the previous year's salary. (For more detail, see *Ad Hoc Salary Committee Heat Map - Consensus Scores*.)

The potential basis of salary setting with the highest score, which the Committee decided to workshop and advance, was to first set the Mayor's salary equal to a Department Head or within the Civil City Grade 14 pay range and then set Clerk and Councilmember salaries at a percentage of the Mayor's salary. This preliminary basis of salary setting was refined and finalized through

subsequent, iterative discussions and documented in the Elected Official Compensation Framework.

Specifically, the final Basis of Salary Setting for each elected position is summarized in the Framework as follows (with greater detail outlined below):

Mayor: Set salary at a level similar to compensation for Civil City senior leadership positions. The presumptive salary is the midpoint of the salary range for the highest Civil City pay grade.

City Clerk: Set salary at a level similar to compensation for Civil City senior leadership positions. The presumptive salary is the midpoint of the salary range for leaders of Civil City departments.

Councilmember: As a coequal branch of government, yet given the part-time nature of the role, salary to be set at a percentage of the mayor's salary. Percentage to be determined based on number of hours required to meet expectations.

This basis for salary setting provided guidance for arriving at final salary figures, but each decision was subject to additional review and assessment, again through the lens of the five Guiding Principles.

Mayoral Salary

In setting the Mayor's salary, the Committee invited and reviewed input from Mayor Thomson about how the Mayor's salary should be set (see *Comments from Mayor Thomson*). We found her comments helpful and broadly aligned with the Committee's perspective. She noted the "on-call" nature of the job and the relevance of principles like market competitiveness and a set of rubric factors used in grading Civil City positions (while noting these comparisons had limits in the context of an elected position). The Committee had similarly reviewed these attributes and found them helpful for discussing the "equitable pay" principle in particular.

The Committee concluded that the Mayor need not be the highest-paid person in city government (which has been the recent practice, and is an arbitrary way to set a salary), but that the role should be compensated at a level similar to the highest-paid senior leadership positions. To align with the goal of making objective, consistent decisions, the Committee identified the midpoint of the Civil City pay grade 14 as a potential base Mayoral salary. Upon full review, we concluded that this aligned well with the Guiding Principles. **For 2025, this leads to a proposed Mayoral Salary of \$151,410.**

Clerk Salary

In setting the Clerk's salary, the Committee invited and reviewed input from Clerk Bolden about how the Clerk's salary should be set (see *Comments from Clerk Bolden*). Having attended Committee meetings, the Clerk framed her comments in the context of approaches the Committee considered. We found her comments helpful and broadly aligned with the Committee's perspective.

While the Committee initially considered setting the Clerk’s salary as a percentage of the Mayor’s salary, the “equitable pay” Guiding Principle—along with input from the Clerk—led to an updated conclusion. Namely, aligning the Clerk’s salary with the leaders of other city departments (colloquially, department heads) was the best approach based on the responsibilities and nature of the Clerk’s role. Virtually all department heads are currently classified as Grade 13 or Grade 14. The Committee identified the mid-point of the Civil City pay grade 13 as a base Clerk salary that aligned well with the five Guiding Principles. **For 2025, this leads to a proposed Clerk salary of \$129,780.**

For both the Mayor and the Clerk, the mid-points of relevant pay grades were deemed a sound approach since elected officials do not receive longevity pay in the same way that Civil City staff now do through a step system (see *2025 Civil City Pay Ranges and Steps*). While the Committee considered the possibility of longevity bonuses on top of lower base salaries for these positions, it ultimately concluded this was not an optimal approach under the Guiding Principles.

Councilmember Salary

To determine what percentage of the Mayor’s salary should be used to set Councilmember salaries, the Committee considered what level of effort is needed from part-time Councilmembers to deliver the “quality community service” identified as a central value in the Guiding Principles. To aid in this inquiry, the Committee utilized an anonymous survey of all nine Councilmembers asking how many hours per week (on average) they believed councilmembers *should* spend or would need to spend in order to provide quality community service.

The question was subdivided into four categories (plus a fifth “other” category) as follows:

- **Time preparing for meetings** (reading packet materials, emails and calls to staff and colleagues, individual research, meetings with colleagues or council staff, meetings with community members)
- **Constituent and community services** (reading and responding to constituent emails, holding or attending constituent meetings, attending neighborhood meetings, other public events in your council capacity, etc.)
- **Hours in noticed meetings** (regular and special sessions, executive sessions, budget meetings, consensus building activities, committee meetings, board and commission meetings, meetings called by the mayor, etc.)
- **Legislative and policy development, review, and refinement** (council-initiated legislation, review of city plans, working with staff to better understand or help initiate shifts in policy implementation, etc.)

Response	Time preparing for meetings	Constituent and community services	Hours in noticed meetings	Legislative and policy development, review, and refinement	Other	
How much time per week on average councilmembers should spend on the following five categories in order to provide high-quality community service.	Reading packet materials, emails and calls to staff and colleagues, individual research, meetings with colleagues or council staff, meetings with community members	Reading and responding to constituent emails, holding or attending constituent meetings, attending neighborhood meetings, other public events in your council capacity, etc.	Regular and special sessions, executive sessions, budget meetings, consensus building activities, committee meetings, board and commission meetings, meetings called by the mayor, etc.	Council-initiated legislation, review of city plans, working with staff to better understand or help initiate shifts in policy implementation, etc.	Please explain!	Total Hours
Member A	3	2	5	2		12
Member B	4	3	4	1		12
Member C	3	4	2	4		13
Member D	5	3	4	2		14
Member E	4	3	7	3		17
Member F	4	4	5	4		17
Member G	4	3	6	5	Always on call ...	19
Member H	5	5	6	4		20
Member I	7	7	5	7		26
Average Hours	3.56	3.22	3.89	3.22		16.67

Table 1. Weekly Working Hours for Councilmembers - Survey Responses

The average response for total hours was 16.67 hours (or 42% of a full-time work week), with a response of 12 hours (30% of a full-time work week) at the low end and a response of 26 hours (65% of a full-time work week) at the high end. The median was 17 hours. Like the Mayor and Clerk, Councilmembers serve in a role that is “on call” to a significant degree by its nature. This dimension was not explicitly considered within the survey categories, although one respondent noted this fact and estimated one extra hour per week accordingly. (This response corresponds with Member G in Table 1, and the one additional hour they attributed is accounted for in the 19-hour total for that response.)

Interestingly, while there was considerable variety in responses *within* some categories, the *total* hours were relatively consistent. As noted, the questionnaire was normative and not descriptive. In other words, because the Committee is recommending salaries based on a set of Guiding Principles, the relevant question here was *what is the necessary effort to deliver quality community service*—i.e., what is the necessary effort to align with our values and expectations of Councilmembers.

For the purpose of this survey, the level of expectations and effort were defined by current Councilmembers themselves. This is reasonable based on: (1) it being the statutory responsibility of the Council to set the elected official salaries; and (2) the depth and diversity of experience, perspectives, and longevity among Councilmembers allowing for informed responses. While the Committee supports further inquiry and deliberation on the question of Councilmember expectations in the coming year and beyond, the relative consistency of aggregate hours in the responses provided by all nine Councilmembers gives the Committee confidence in weighing this factor in the Councilmember salary inquiry.

Even so, out of an abundance of caution, the Committee decided to recommend a salary informed (in part) by the *lowest number of hours* given by any Councilmember, namely 12

hours or approximately 30% of a full-time work week. It is important to note here that under IC 36-4-7-2(b), elected officers are not required to report hours worked and may not be compensated based on the number of hours worked. Ordinance 2024-26 does not establish Councilmember compensation based on hours worked. Rather, estimating the minimum requirements to provide quality community service was one factor among multiple factors considered in finalizing a recommended Councilmember salary set at 30% of the Mayor's salary. As with the Mayor and Clerk positions, the Committee arrived at this number through a deliberative process, weighing each of the five Guiding Principles in the Elected Official Compensation Framework and seeking optimal alignment. **For 2025, this leads to a proposed Councilmember salary of \$45,423.**

There are two additional issues worth examining in the context of the proposed salary increases for all elected official positions, which are greater in magnitude for all positions than typically seen through the annual cost of living adjustments.

- First, the Committee reached the consensus view that both the Councilmember and Clerk positions have been significantly undervalued and inequitably compensated based on the nature and responsibilities of the roles within the context of Bloomington city government. Correcting this inequity necessarily requires a more significant adjustment for these positions. (Note, however, that the Mayor's salary is also recommended to increase by \$13,379.)
- Second, the city is in the process of implementing major changes to its compensation structure and classification system, which has led many pay ranges to increase considerably. For example, in 2024 the midpoint for the highest Civil City pay grade was \$117,388, while in 2025 it is \$151,410—a difference of \$34,022. These major changes to our compensation system have led to significant adjustments to the salaries of many positions across city government.

The Committee's recommendations should be reviewed in light of these two conditions.

Conclusion

The Committee has proposed a process and a proposed outcome rooted in the following Guiding Principles: Accessibility of Public Service; Equitable Pay; Quality Community Service; Informed Decisions; and a Transparent and Documented Process.

As noted, the Committee concluded that the prior method for setting elected official salaries (rooted primarily in the status quo; i.e., what was the salary the previous year?) was *very* poorly aligned with the Guiding Principles of the Elected Official Compensation Framework. Irrespective of what salaries are adopted in Ordinance 2024-26, the Committee hopes Councilmembers will take to heart the process and framework used to recommend elected official salaries and support a clear, values-based approach going forward.

Finally, as part of establishing a transparent and repeatable process in line with the Guiding Principles, the framework document recommends the following steps be conducted annually by a newly constituted Ad Hoc Salary Committee:

- April: Committee validates/updates the Elected Official Compensation Framework
- May-June: Committee gathers and analyzes relevant information

- August: Chair drafts elected official salary ordinance
- October: Ordinance vote and passage

These recommendations reflect the Committee's best effort to establish and document a transparent, repeatable process informed by objective data *and* a set of values we believe are aligned with Bloomington city government and community expectations.

City of Bloomington City Council Ad Hoc Salary Committee Elected Official Compensation Framework Summary Memorandum

To: Office of the Common Council Ad Hoc Salary Committee, City of Bloomington

From: Crowe LLP

Date: November 18, 2024

Subject: Summary of Facilitated Committee Meetings to Develop the Elected Official Compensation Framework for the Bloomington City Council

Introduction

In October 2024, Crowe LLP (Crowe) was engaged by the City of Bloomington, Indiana (City) to facilitate a series of discussions to support City Council's Ad Hoc Salary Committee (Committee) in developing the Committee's strategy for elected official compensation.

In the months prior to Crowe's involvement, the City independently gathered data and began discussing potential salary adjustments for the City's elected officials: City Mayor, City Clerk, and City Councilmember. Through this process, the City Council identified a need to define its guiding principles and develop a strategy by which City Council will determine elected official compensation. The City engaged Crowe to facilitate a series of discussions among Committee members to accomplish this goal.

Summary of Approach and Outputs

To support City Council in developing a strategy for elected official compensation, Crowe facilitated three 1-2-hour strategy sessions with the Ad Hoc Salary Committee on October 29, November 7, and November 8, 2024. The Committee was comprised of Committee Chair Sydney Zulich and Councilmembers Matthew Flaherty, Kate Rosenbarger, and Hopi Stosberg. Per Indiana Code 36-5-6-6(9), the City Clerk attended all meetings to record the proceedings.

The objective of these sessions was to iteratively discuss, debate, and develop the strategic framework which the Committee intends to recommend to the City Council. Crowe documented the Committee's agreed-upon approach in the resulting **Elected Official Compensation Framework (Framework)**, which we provide as an appendix to this memorandum. Key components of the Elected Official Compensation Framework and supporting process are explained below:

Guiding Principles: The Ad Hoc Salary Committee identified and refined Guiding Principles, or those values that guide how the City Council makes decisions regarding elected official compensation. Over the course of the first two sessions, Councilmembers and Crowe iteratively refined Guiding Principles and supporting definitions. The Committee selected five Guiding Principles to guide their decision-making: (1) *Accessibility of Public Service*, (2) *Equitable Pay*, (3) *Quality Community Service*, (4) *Informed Decisions*, (5) *Transparent and Documented Process*.

Basis of Salary Setting: After selecting the Guiding Principles, the Committee debated approaches for determining annual salaries for elected officials. With support from Crowe, the Committee first compiled a list of potential approaches for setting elected official salaries. The Committee's initial goal was to identify all feasible alternatives, even those not necessarily supported by Committee members. Then, to build consensus and gauge how well each alternative aligned with the Guiding Principles, Committee members anonymously and individually scored each alternative against each individual Guiding Principle using a

heat map visualization tool. This exercise produced a score to quantify how well each alternative aligned with Guiding Principles. Crowe compiled the heat map results from individual Committee members and created a consolidated view of all Committee member scores.

There was general consensus across the Committee about the leading alternative (that which scored the highest based on the Guiding Principles). It was discussed that the heat map was intended to be one tool, rather than the sole factor that would determine the Committee's final recommended strategy. Committee members opted to further refine the leading alternative to determine how it would be operationalized.

The Committee ultimately selected a basis for salary setting, which is documented in the Elected Official Compensation Framework. The Committee stated it intends to share this information with the larger City Council in November 2024.

Relevant Information / Data: During the Committee's sessions and refinement of the recommended basis for salary setting, Committee members identified various data points and information needed to enable the City Council to make informed decisions about compensation. Committee members discussed data needed to support decision making, and Crowe documented these inputs within the Framework. This included City Civil Pay Ranges, City Budget constraints, consultation with Bloomington elected officials, and input from Councilmembers on hours required to meet expectations.

Annual Process: Based on City input throughout the sessions, Crowe drafted a high-level timeline of annual activities to support elected official salaries in future years. These include yearly review and validation of the Framework, gathering/analyzing necessary information, and developing the City's Salary Ordinance for the following fiscal year.

Next Steps and Considerations for Council

Crowe understands that the Committee plans to review the Framework on November 18, 2024. The Committee requested that Crowe attend this meeting to assist in answering questions and finalizing the outputs of this process.

Crowe also understands that the Ad Hoc Salary Committee will share the Committee's recommendations with the rest of City Council and make decisions on currently undecided aspects of salary setting, including the following:

1. **Confirm Mayor and City Clerk salaries within the selected ranges.** The Committee's tentative recommendation to set the Mayor's and City Clerk's salary as the midpoint of their relevant ranges was documented in the Elected Official Compensation Framework. However, finalizing this decision is a critical next step for moving forward with other open compensation decisions. Councilmember salaries are dependent on first establishing the Mayor's salary – see more below.
2. **Set Councilmember salaries at a to-be-determined percentage of the Mayor's salary.** The Committee's view is that Councilmember salaries should recognize the City Council as a coequal branch of government and reflect the part-time nature of the role (as compared to the Mayor, which is a full-time position). To help inform the appropriate percentage, Crowe understands that the Committee has administered an internal survey to Councilmembers to collect input on the hours necessary to meet expectations of the Councilmember role. Crowe understands that the Committee intends to use this information to select a reasonable data point for hours worked, which will in turn inform the percentage used to calculate Councilmember salaries.
3. **Determine whether supplemental pay should be a component of City Clerk compensation.** During strategy sessions, Committee members discussed the possibility of including a form of supplemental pay to reward professional certification attainment. If the Council chooses to pursue this route, Council should identify and document certifications which would be eligible for the additional pay, in addition to establishing the pay amount and frequency (e.g., one-time bonus, yearly supplemental pay, etc.).

4. **Determine Implementation Approach.** Depending on the nature and dollar value of compensation adjustments, City Council must determine whether to implement the full value of salary adjustments in the next fiscal year or to pursue a phased implementation approach.

Following the meeting on November 18, 2024, Crowe expects to formally close our engagement with the Committee, unless there are additional requests for support related to this effort.

Crowe thanks the City of Bloomington and Ad Hoc Salary Committee for the opportunity to support this important effort. For questions related to this memorandum, please do not hesitate to contact our team.

Susannah Heitger

Engagement Principal

Susannah.Heitger@crowe.com

Shannon Madden

Subject Matter Advisor

Shannon.Madden@crowe.com

Renae Peden

Project Manager

Renae.Peden@crowe.com

City Council of Bloomington, Indiana

Elected Official Compensation Framework

Guiding Principles

Values to guide how the City Council makes decisions regarding elected official compensation.

1	Accessibility of Public Service The level of compensation makes elected office attainable for community members of all socioeconomic statuses.
2	Equitable Pay Elected officials are compensated equitably according to their respective levels of responsibility and relative to other Bloomington elected officials and departmental leadership.
3	Quality Community Service Compensation enables elected officials to meaningfully engage with and serve the Bloomington community.
4	Informed Decisions Council makes informed decisions about elected official compensation in alignment with these Guiding Principles and based on relevant objective data.
5	Transparent and Documented Process A transparent, repeatable process guides compensation decisions for elected officials, and results are clearly communicated.

Annual Process

April	Committee validates/updates this Framework
May-June	Committee gathers and analyzes relevant information
August	Chair drafts elected official salary ordinance
October	Ordinance vote and passage

Mandate

“The city legislative body shall, by ordinance, fix the annual compensation of all elected city officers.” IC 36-4-7-2

Basis of Salary Setting

City Council will use the following approach to determine annual salaries for elected officials.

Elected Official roles are not Civil City positions and are not assigned pay grades. Nonetheless, the ranges established for Civil City leaders are useful points of reference for the following:

- Mayor:** Set salary at a level similar to compensation for Civil City senior leadership positions. The presumptive salary is the midpoint of the salary range for the highest Civil City pay grade.
- City Clerk:** Set salary at a level similar to compensation for Civil City senior leadership positions. The presumptive salary is the midpoint of the salary range for leaders of Civil City departments.
- Council Member:** As a coequal branch of government, yet given the part-time nature of the role, salary to be set at a percentage of the mayor’s salary. Percentage to be determined based on number of hours required to meet expectations.

Relevant Information / Data

Information relevant to enable the City Council to make informed decisions:

- Civil City Pay Ranges
- City Budget Constraints/Capacity
- Consultation with Bloomington Elected Officials
- Input from Councilmembers on hours required to meet expectations

Contextual information for reasonableness check:

- Elected official salaries for Monroe County and other Indiana Second Class Cities
- Bloomington Area Median Income and Cost of Living

City of Bloomington, IN - City Council Ad Hoc Salary Committee

Basis of Salary Setting - Heat Map

Illustrative Scoring Template and Committee Scoring Results

Legend:

High
(3)

Medium
(2)

Low
(1)

Scoring Template

Guiding Principles					Score
Accessibility of Public Service	Equitable Pay	Quality Community Service	Informed Decisions	Transparent & Documented Process	Alignment to Guiding Principles

Council Member Scoring Results

Score	Score	Score	Score
Alignment to Guiding Principles	Alignment to Guiding Principles	Alignment to Guiding Principles	Alignment to Guiding Principles

ID	Potential Basis of Determining Base Salary
1	Base Salary on What We Were Paid Last Year (prior year salary, with or without a percentage adjustment)
2	Hourly Rate Basis (establish hourly rate and multiply by a TBD number of hours)
3	3a. Set Mayor Salary Equal to Department Head, and Set Council and Clerk Salaries at a Percentage of Mayor (e.g. base the percentage on 1) level of responsibility for each role and 2) percentage of time/FTE) 3b. Set Mayor Salary Relative to City Civil Grade 14 Range; Set Clerk Salary Relative to City Civil Grade 13 Range; Set Council Salary Based as a % of Mayor. (Note: Option added/revised on 11/8.)
4	Set Clerk Salary Equal to Department Head, and Set Council and Mayor Salaries at a Percentage of Clerk (e.g. base the percentage on 1) level of responsibility for each role and 2) percentage of time/FTE)
5	Use Point Factor Rubric to Determine Equivalent Civil City Pay Grade and Corresponding Salary Range Note: As the rubric was not designed for Elected Officials, certain factors will not apply and points will need to be redistributed. The maximum potential result using the City's current rubric is a Grade 14; therefore potential outcomes are limited to 1) Grade 14 (equal to highest-earning COB Civil City jobs) or 2) less than 14.
6	Benchmarking - Other Indiana Second Class Cities, the State of Indiana Government, or Monroe County - Peer cities nationwide with similar form of government - Peer cities nationwide with similar cost of living - Local private sector employers
7	Base Salary on Local Economic Factors - Area Median Income - Average Community Income - Cost of Living Note: Further discussion required. Which EO salary(ies) would be set equal to the AMI (or other metric)?
ID	Potential Basis of Determining Supplemental Pay
8	Market Responsiveness (e.g. adjustments to incentivize increased candidate pool)
9	Supplemental Salary Adjustments / Bonus Pay - Additional degrees or certifications - Onboarding / learning period - Tenure
Other Considerations	
a.	Indiana Code § 36-4-7-2(c) - compensation of an elected city officer cannot be reduced below the amount fixed for the previous year, nor can it be changed in the year for which it is fixed
b.	Consultation with incumbents - potential future aspiration to survey community to understand expectations of Council Members (which may drive salary setting)

[1-3]	[1-3]	[1-3]	[1-3]	[1-3]	[SUM]
[1-3]	[1-3]	[1-3]	[1-3]	[1-3]	[SUM]
[1-3]	[1-3]	[1-3]	[1-3]	[1-3]	[SUM]
[1-3]	[1-3]	[1-3]	[1-3]	[1-3]	[SUM]
[1-3]	[1-3]	[1-3]	[1-3]	[1-3]	[SUM]
[1-3]	[1-3]	[1-3]	[1-3]	[1-3]	[SUM]
[1-3]	[1-3]	[1-3]	[1-3]	[1-3]	[SUM]
[1-3]	[1-3]	[1-3]	[1-3]	[1-3]	[SUM]

6	7	5	7
10	9	7	9
11	15	13	15
8	14	13	14
11	8	6	12
8	9	10	8
13	9	11	10
9	10	12	9
11	11	9	12

Sum Top 3

25

35

54

#1

49

#2

37

35

43

#3

40

43

Comments from Mayor Thomson

at the request of the City Council Ad Hoc Salary Committee

November 18, 2024

Thank you for the opportunity to provide my comments as the City Council Ad Hoc Salary Committee considers options for setting salaries for elected officials, including the Mayor of the City of Bloomington.

Considerations for Mayor's Salary

The Mayor's salary should reflect the level of responsibility required to lead and make decisions for the human and real resources of the entire city, the complexity of the job, the requirement to be on call 24 hours, 7 days a week, 365 days a year, and also the impact of decisions on the community and the region. While elected officials do not fall within the standard salary grade structure, as the chief executive of the city, the mayor's salary ought to be set at the highest level of grade-related salaries, in keeping with the city's principle of meeting the market for similar positions. The philosophy used to determine salaries for elected officials should align, generally, with the philosophy for other employees.

The philosophy for determining staff salaries was based on 1) rubric factors for the position itself (not the current individual holding it) and 2) market value for similar positions. While elected officials do not "shop" for jobs in different locations, similar positions in the community and in Indiana should still be considered relevant, and cost of living incorporated into pay.

The rubric factors, to review, were:

- **Complexity**, with the highest level "Multifaceted - Work is broad in scope covering several departments within the Organization. Policy, procedure, and precedent are created and/or approved by this job. Independent judgment is required to review and approve major recommendations, establish organizational policy, and coordinate technical and administrative recommendations with organization-wide policies and procedures."
- **Experience required**
- **Education required**
- **Direction of Others/Direction of Resources**
- **Environmental Strain**: This could be physical strain or mental strain: "This fatigue is normally produced by the need to concentrate on the task being performed, to pay attention to detail, to perform a high volume of work, and/or to work under time constraints or to perform physically unpleasant or hazardous work."
- **Independent Judgment**
- **Consequence of Errors**: "Consider the extent to which an error in judgment on the employee's part is likely to be detrimental to the organization's financial, customer, or employee relations posture in the long term."
- **Frequency of External Work Relationships/External Communication**: "Consider the types and frequency of work relationships the job has responsibility for outside of the City of Bloomington organizational structure. This work might be with individuals or with entire organizations or entities."

The rubric and market benchmarks fed into the creation of the new 14 grade levels and guide how non-union, non-elected officials at the highest grade levels are compensated.

While the grade levels themselves do not apply to elected officials per the study parameters, as data on elected officials was not included in the study or in calculating those salary ranges, it may be helpful to know that for 2025, grade 14 salaries have been capped for tenure at Step 3 (\$151,410), regardless of actual tenure, to ensure that all employees at other levels will receive full benefit of the implementation in year one.

Comments from Clerk Bolden

at the request of the City Council Ad Hoc Salary Committee

November 18, 2024

Thank you for the opportunity to provide my comments as the City Council Ad Hoc Salary Committee considers options for setting salaries for elected officials, including the elected City Clerk. Below I provide my comments on several of the approaches the Committee has discussed during the recent sessions that I attended in the course of my duties documenting the proceedings.

Comments on Approaches Considered by the Committee

1. Clerk Salary as a Percentage of Mayoral Salary

- An advantage is that this is an easy-to-understand approach.
- The percentage may be somewhat arbitrary. An 85% level would have the effect of aligning the City Clerk salary with most other department heads, which serves as recognition of the role as both department head and an elected official.

2. Benchmarking Salaries to other Indiana Second Class Cities

- An advantage is that this is an easy-to-understand approach.
- A disadvantage is that this approach is rooted in the historic and systematic devaluation of a role predominantly filled by women.

3. Salary Commensurate with Department Heads

- The preferred method would be to align the City Clerk salary with the salary range established for Civil City grade 13 department heads.
- An advantage is that this is an easy-to-understand approach and is consistent with other City employers, making it easier to defend and explain.
- It should be communicated that there is a reference to the City's salary schedule, while also indicating that this salary is for an Elected Official Role, which has distinct considerations from other City staff.
- It will be important to communicate that the City Clerk and Clerk staff are a separate branch of government, though part of the same City organization.
- Setting the Clerk salary at the midpoint of the pay range is not equitable with other City Department Heads. Some Department Heads with long tenure at the City may earn the same salary as the City Clerk, who has been with the City longer overall and in the current role.
- I suggest providing a similar longevity-based pay structure, which may enable keeping the base salary lower than a midpoint. While there may be political or perception concerns about a longevity-based approach encouraging people to continue to run for office, this may be offset by the advantage that every four years, there is an opportunity for new individuals to run for and be elected to office.

Salary Implications Related to Clerk Staff

It is important to me that the impact on salaries for my staff be considered. I note the following:

- Clerk staff roles and job descriptions will be reviewed in the WERC process early next year.
- I remain interested in certification pay for Clerk staff. I am not in favor of providing certification pay for the City Clerk when this same form of compensation is not available to Clerk staff.

City of Bloomington 2025 Salary Pay Grades and Steps

Grade	Step 1 (Starting Salary)	Step 2 (After 1 Year)	Step 3 (After 3 Years)	Step 4 (After 5 Years)	Step 5 (After 10 Years)
1	\$35,430	\$37,201.44	\$38,973	\$40,744.43	\$42,516
2	\$37,204	\$39,063.78	\$40,924	\$42,784.14	\$44,644
3	\$39,809	\$41,799.43	\$43,790	\$45,780.44	\$47,771
4	\$42,105	\$45,262.94	\$48,421	\$51,578.90	\$54,737
5	\$48,953	\$52,624.71	\$56,296	\$59,968.09	\$63,640
6	\$55,802	\$59,987.02	\$64,172	\$68,356.75	\$72,542
7	\$62,650	\$67,348.79	\$72,047	\$76,745.94	\$81,445
8	\$69,498	\$74,710.56	\$79,923	\$85,135.14	\$90,347
9	\$76,346	\$82,072.33	\$87,798	\$93,524.33	\$99,250
10	\$83,194	\$89,434.10	\$95,674	\$101,913.53	\$108,153
11	\$90,042	\$96,795.87	\$103,549	\$110,302.73	\$117,056
12	\$98,745	\$106,151.39	\$113,558	\$120,963.61	\$128,370
13	\$112,852	\$121,316.18	\$129,780	\$138,243.82	\$146,708
14	\$131,661	\$141,535.36	\$151,410	\$161,284.64	\$171,159