

BHPC MEETING PACKET

Thursday February 27, 2025 5:00 p.m. EST Prepared by HAND Staff

In Person: The McCloskey Room, 401 N Morton St., Ste. 135, Bloomington, IN 47404

Zoom:

https://bloomington.zoom.us/j/86470652637?pwd=rX9vgWIboM2cZXBEPnhokqtzRhtKi4.1

Meeting ID: 864 7065 2637 Passcode: 719258

Table of Contents

AGENDA	
MINUTES December 12	6
COA 25-09	11
COA 25-10	20
COA 25-11	32
DD 25-02	36

Accessibility Statement

The City is committed to providing equal access to information. However, despite our efforts, at times, portions of our board and commission packets are not accessible for some individuals.

If you encounter difficulties accessing material in this packet, please contact Anna Killion-Hanson at the Housing and Neighborhood Development Department at <u>anna.killionhanson@bloomington.in.gov</u> or 813-349-3582 and provide your name, contact information, and a link to or description of the document or web page you are having problems with.

Auxiliary aids for people with disabilities are available upon request with adequate notice. Please call 812-349-3429 or email, human.rights@bloomington.in.gov.

Bloomington Historic Preservation Commission Meeting Thursday February 27th, 2025, 5:00 P.M.

In Person:

The McCloskey Room, 401 N Morton St., Ste. 135, Bloomington, IN 47404 Zoom: Housing & Neighborhood Development is inviting you to a scheduled Zoom meeting. Join Zoom Meeting https://bloomington.zoom.us/j/86470652637?pwd=rX9vgWIboM2cZXBEPnhokqtzRhtKi4.1

> Meeting ID: 864 7065 2637 Passcode: 719258



The City is committed to providing equal access to information. However, despite our efforts, at times, portions of our board and commission packets are not accessible for some individuals. If you encounter difficulties accessing material in this packet, please contact Anna Killion-Hanson at the Housing and Neighborhood Development Department at <u>anna.killionhanson@bloomington.in.gov</u> or 812-349-3577 and provide your name, contact information, and a link to or description of the document or web page you are having problems with. Auxiliary aids for people with disabilities are available upon request with adequate notice. Please call 812-349-3429 or email <u>human.rights@bloomington.in.gov</u>.

- I. CALL TO ORDER
- II. ROLL CALL

III. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

A. February 13th

IV. CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

Commission Review

A. COA 25-09

803 N Maple St (Maple Heights HD) Linda Jean Camp *Two story rear addition*

B. COA 25-10

1200 N Lincoln St (Garden Hill HD) David Parsch *Two story rebuild*

C. COA 25-11

601 N Morton St (Showers Furniture HD) Shawn Eurton *Replace non-original side door*

V. DEMOLITION DELAY

A. DD 25-04 1108 N Woodburn Ave Valubuilt Construction

VI. OLD BUSINESS

- A. Dunn St Sidewalk
- VII. NEW BUSINESS
- VIII. COMMISSIONER COMMENTS
 - IX. PUBLIC COMMENTS
 - X. ADJOURNMENT

Next meeting date is March 13th, 2025 at 5:00 P.M. and will be held in a hybrid manner, both in person and via Zoom.

Bloomington Historic Preservation Commission Meeting Thursday February 13th, 2025 **Minutes**

I. CALL TO ORDER

Meeting was called to order by Noah Sandweiss @ 5:03 p.m.

II. ROLL CALL

Commissioners:

Sam DeSollar (Present) Reynard Cross (Present) Jeremy Hackerd (Present) Daniel Schlegel (Present) Melody Duesner (Present)

Advisory Members:

Karen Duffy (Present) Duncan Campbell (Present)

Staff:

Noah Sandweiss, HAND (Present) Eddie Wright, HAND (Present) Anna Killion-Hansen, HAND (Present) Anna Holmes, City Legal (Present) Joe Patterson, Planning (Present)

Guests:

Eric Ast (Present) Tom Doak (Present) Phil Worthington (Present) Linda Jean Camp (Present) Chaimar Moukhtar (Virtual) David Parsch (Virtual) Kerry Slough (Virtual) Matthew Muehling (Virtual)

III. ELECTION OF OFFICES

Jack Baker nominated himself for chairman via letter. Per **Anna Holmes** this is a soft nomination and a motion or second is not needed. A vote was taken. The nomination failed by a vote of **1-3-1 (Yes-No-Abstain)**

Reynard Cross nominated **Sam DeSollar** for 2025 Commission chair, **Jeremy Hackerd** seconded. Nomination carried **4-0-1 (Yes-No-Abstain)**

Sam DeSollar nominated Jeremy Hackerd for 2025 Vice-Chair, Jeremy Hackerd seconded. Nomination carried 4-0-1 (Yes-No-Abstain)

- A. 2025 Chair: Sam DeSollar
- B. 2025 Vice-Chair: Jeremy Hackerd

IV. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

A. January 23rd

Jeremy Hackerd noted an error in who read the Demo Delay statement in the January 23rd minutes. **Melody Deusner** noted a typo. **Reynard Cross** made a motion to accept the January 23rd minutes with noted changes. **Jeremy Hackerd** seconded. **Motion carried 5-0-0 (Yes-No-Abstain)**

V. CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

Commission Review

A. COA 25-06

215 E 16^₅ St (Garden Hill HD) Eric Ast *Rear addition and open front porch*

Noah Sandweiss gave presentation. See packet for details.

Eric Ast discussed the changes he made to the design per recommendations from the board during the previous meeting.

Sam DeSollar asked about the siding being used. **Eric** stated the changes for the siding.

Phil Worthington from the Garden Hill neighborhood spoke and stated that the property looks like another student rental. He has concerns because the neighborhood zoning was upgraded during the last administration, that the neighborhood will become filled with student rentals.

Jeremy Hackerd made a motion approve COA 25-06. Reynard Cross seconded. Motion carried 5-0-0 (Yes-No-Abstain)

B. COA 25-07

207 E 16^₅ St (Garden Hill HD) Eric Ast *Second story addition*

Noah Sandweiss gave presentation. See packet for details.

Eric Ast discussed the changes he made to the design per recommendations from the board during the previous meeting.

Reynard Cross asked about the design and slope of the roof. **Eric Ast** explained the design, and slope. **Sam DeSollar** asked about the condition of the windows presently in the house. They are deteriorated to the point of replacement.

The **Commissioners** like the changes and design of the addition.

Kerry Slough spoke about the changes to the design. The neighborhood likes the changes made to the design.

Reynard Cross made a motion approve **COA 25-07**. **Daniel Schlegel** seconded. **Motion carried 5-0-0 (Yes-No-Abstain)**

C. COA 25-09

803 N Maple St (Maple Heights HD) Linda Jean Camp *Two story rear addition*

Noah Sandweiss gave presentation. See packet for details.

Linda Jean Camp discussed the different designs that she sent to the commission. She stated that the differences were to keep the house more consistent with the original 50's design. **Sam DeSollar** asked for clarification as to the differences in the designs. The commission had not reviewed the second design before the meeting. He summed up the differences. He also stated which design might be approved.

Melanie Deusner asked if the neighborhood approved. **Duncan Campbell** asked what type of siding is being used. Horizontal and matching the house. **Karen Duffy** asked about design guidelines as listed in the packet. Reynard Cross asked about measurements and the drawings to scale. **Linda Jean Camp** stated that it is to scale. **Reynard** has concerns about the slope of the roof. But he can't see the measurements on the drawings. **Linda** discussed the location of the house in reference to the street and the rest of the neighborhood. **Reynard** needs to know the height of the second story to consider the changes. **Sam DeSollar** asked about the slope of the roof on the addition in reference to the house. **Linda** stated that the slope would match the rest of the house. **Duncan Campbell** stated that due to the slope of the ground the pitch of the roof will not look the same as the drawing.

Tom Doak from the Maple Heights neighborhood stated that Noah has represented the neighborhood well. They are okay with the changes and addition to the house.

Jeremy Hackerd asked exactly what they are considering, in reference to the drawings. The second design is what they are looking to approve. **Reynard Cross** stated that he would have difficulty approving this with so much information missing and questions unanswered. **Melody Deusner** would feel more comfortable if they got some final numbers on the design. She wants to make sure she's voting on something she fully understands. **Sam DeSollar** explained the process and what the commission asks of all petitioners for before the meetings. **Noah Sandweiss** obtained a different set of drawing for the commissioners to review with measurements for the roof. **Reynard** explained the intent of the commission and what they require for approval. **Linda Jean Camp** stated that the drawings were modified per the recommendation of the neighborhood and the neighborhood guidelines. **Sam** further clarified what the commission needs before they can take a vote. **Duncan Campbell** stated that the commission doesn't go on word of mouth, they work off of written drawings and measurements.

Jeremy Hackerd made a motion table COA 25-09 until the next meeting. So the commission can get more information on the proposed additions. Daniel Schlegel seconded. Motion carried 5-0-0 (Yes-No-Abstain)

D. COA 25-10

1200 N Lincoln St (Garden Hill HD) David Parsch *Two story rebuild*

Noah Sandweiss gave presentation. See packet for details.

David Parsch further expanded upon the design and changes. He is comfortable with tabling to make necessary changes to get approval from the commission.

Melody Deusner inquired of the window design. **Daniel Schlegel** asked about additional comments from the neighborhood. **Reynard Cross** asked if there were additional designs not in the packet. **Sam DeSollar** asked about additional drawings in reference to placement of the structure on the lot. **Sam** also asked about the foundation. It will be a block foundation, 18 inches off the ground. Windows are double hung windows. **Sam** asked they update the drawings with the changes and return to the commission with the changes.

Jeremy Hackerd made a motion continue COA 25-10 until the next meeting. Reynard Cross seconded. Motion carried 5-0-0 (Yes-No-Abstain)

E. COA 25-11

601 N Morton St (Showers Furniture HD) Shawn Eurton *Replace non-original side door*

Petitioner was not present so **COA 25-11** was tabled until the next meeting by default.

VI. DEMOLITION DELAY

A. DD 25-03

801 N Oolitic Dr Marie Arnold

Noah Sandweiss gave presentation. See packet for details.

Sam DeSollar read the statement releasing the demo delay.

Jeremy Hackerd made a motion to release DD 25-03. Reynard Cross seconded. Motion carried 5-0-0 (Yes-No-Abstain)

At this point **Jeremy Hackerd** left the meeting and quorum was lost. **DD 25-04** will be heard at the February 27th meeting. No further business was conducted.

Sam DeSollar adjourned the meeting @ 6:30

Video record of meeting available upon request.

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS	Address: 803 N Maple St (Maple Heights HD)
COA 25-09	Petitioner: Linda Jean Camp
Start Date: 1/9/2025	Parcel: 53-05-32-100-001.000-005
RATING: CONTRIBUTING	Slightly altered massed ranch c. 1960



Background:

I would like to add a bedroom and an entertainment area over the garage and expand the garage for three reasons. First, it will enable me to house my adult children and their partners when the visit. Second, it will provide a small area for entertaining. Third, should I develop mobility problems it will be easy to make it accessible. The garage needs to be larger for this purpose also. I wanted to add a second floor but the house is concrete block and it is not strong enough to be a second floor."

Request:

Rear two-story addition

Guidelines: Maple Heights

Siding materials

Recommended:

1. When fiber cement board siding is used to simulate wood clapboard siding, it should reflect the directional and dimensional characteristics found historically in the neighborhood. No products imitating the "grain" of wood should be used.

2. Brick, limestone, clapboard, cement board, wood, wood shingles/shakes used decoratively

When hardboard or concrete board siding is simulate wood

Typical Siding Yes!





Simulated grain NO!



Building height

Recommended:

1. New construction at the end of a block should take into account building heights on adjacent blocks.

5. Foundation and floor line heights should be consistent with contiguous properties.

Non recommended:

1. Any building height that appears either diminutive or overscale in relation to its context.

Outline

Recommended:

1. The basic outline of a new building should reflect building outlines typical of the area.

2. The outline of new construction should reflect the directional orientations characteristic of the existing buildings in its context.

Not recommended

1. Roof shapes that create uncharacteristic shapes, slopes and patterns.

Mass

Recommended

1. The perceived total mass and site coverage of a new building should be consistent with surrounding buildings.

2. A larger than typical mass might be appropriate if it is broken into elements that are visually compatible with the mass of the surrounding buildings.

Fenestration

Recommended

1. Creative expression with fenestration is not precluded provided the result does not conflict with or draw attention from surrounding historic buildings.

2. Windows and doors should be arranged on the building so as not to conflict with the basic fenestration pattern in the area.

3. The basic proportions of glass to solid which is found on surrounding contributing buildings should be reflected in new construction.

4. Window openings should reflect the basic proportionality and directionality of those typically found on surrounding historic buildings.



Staff does not recommend approval of COA 25-09

The proposed addition would not significantly change the footprint of the existing house, extending the garage area slightly further back. Most of the surrounding buildings are one story, however the building across the street at

720 W 12th St has two floors. Therefor the overall size and height of the addition appears consistent with neighborhood guidelines. Aside from the attached garage and rear roofline, alterations to existing materials are minimal.

The three noticeable discrepancies between Maple heights guidelines concern the orientation of the cement board siding, fenestration on facing east toward the primary façade, and the pitch of the roof on the addition. District guidelines recommend vertical siding, gabled pyramidal or complex roof shapes more typical of existing historic buildings in the district, and proportions of window to solid wall more typical of this context. As part of a contemporary addition on a modern house, the proposed polygonal windows on the east end of the addition do not conflict with the building's design, but the addition of one or two more windows visible from this elevation would bring the ratio of window to wall closer to those of the existing home and surrounding buildings.











STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS	IS Address: 1200 N Lincoln St (Garden Hill HD)	
COA 25-10	Petitioner: David Parsch	
Start Date: 1/30/2025	Parcel: 53-05-33-201-008.000-005	
RATING: NON-CONTRIBUTING	Altered gabled-el with enclosed front porch	



Background: 1200 N Lincoln is an altered gabled-el cottage with an enclosed front porch. Part of the limestone retaining wall has been replaced with cement block and most original exterior materials appear to be missing. This item has been continued from February 13th, and new windows have been added along with alterations to the interior floorplan.

Request: Project Overview

This proposal outlines the addition of a second story to an existing single-story home, expanding the living space and increasing the number of bedrooms and bathrooms to five each. The project aims to achieve this while maintaining the home's existing footprint, using similar exterior materials, and ensuring the design remains consistent with the architectural style of the surrounding neighborhood.

Project Goals

- **Expand Living Space:** Add a second story to the home to significantly increase the square footage of living space.
- **Increase Bedrooms and Bathrooms:** Convert the home into a 5-bedroom, 5-bathroom residence to accommodate a larger family or guests.
- **Maintain Existing Footprint:** Preserve the home's current foundation and footprint to minimize disruption to the property and surrounding landscape.
- Use Like Materials: Utilize exterior materials that are similar in appearance and quality to the existing materials to ensure a cohesive and aesthetically pleasing design.
- **Neighborhood Harmony:** Design the second story addition to complement the architectural style of the neighborhood, ensuring the home blends seamlessly with its surroundings.

Design and Construction

- **Architectural Design:** Have engaged with an architect to design the second story addition, taking into consideration the existing home's structure, style, and the neighborhood's architectural surroundings.
- **Permits and Approvals:** Obtain all necessary permits and approvals from local authorities before commencing construction.
- **Construction:** Hire a qualified contractor to oversee and execute the construction of the second story addition, ensuring adherence to the design plans, building codes, and safety regulations.
- **Material Selection:** Select exterior materials that are similar in color, texture, and quality to the existing materials to maintain the home's visual appeal and consistency with the neighborhood.

Conclusion

This proposal outlines our plan for adding a second story to an existing home and converting it into a 5-bedroom, 5-bathroom residence. The project prioritizes maintaining the home's existing footprint, using similar exterior materials, and ensuring the design complements the neighborhood's architectural style. By following

this plan, the homeowner can achieve a significant expansion of living space while preserving the home's character and value.

The proposed materials for adding a second story to the house at 1200 N Lincoln St include:

- **Structural framing:**Treated lumber wood beams and joists for the floor system and roof framing.
- **Exterior walls:** Standard OSB sheathing and tyvec wrapping. Fiber cement or hardboard siding for exterior cladding, providing durability and low maintenance. 12" Hardboard siding is the existing material.
- **Roofing:** Asphalt shingles for water resistance and durability. Would maintain color of current asphalt shingles.
- **Windows and doors:** Energy-efficient double-paned windows for natural light and ventilation. Matching to existing double hung double paned windows.
- **Insulation:** Closed-cell spray foam insulation for the walls and roof, providing superior insulation and air sealing.
- Interior finishes: Drywall for interior walls and ceilings, providing a smooth surface for painting or wallpaper. LVP flooring for durability and easy maintenance.
- **Electrical and plumbing:** Insulated copper wiring and PEX piping for electrical and plumbing systems, respectively, ensuring longevity and reliability.

Guidelines: Garden Hill Historic District

CHANGES TO THE PUBLIC-WAY FACADE

The public-way façade is defined as the side of the house that faces the street to which the house has a public postal address. In the case of corner lots, both the postal street as well as the cross street are considered public-way façades. As noted in the Purpose section, the most important part of the facade is the front third of the building. More flexible review is suggested for modifications directly at the rear or to the obscured parts of side elevations.

Existing architectural details (specifically original historic elements) for windows, porches, doors, and eaves on the public-way façade shall be retained or replaced in the same style or in a design appropriate to the character of the house or streetscape.

Retain historical character-defining architectural features and detailing, and retain detailing on the public way façade such as brackets, cornices, dormer windows, and gable-end shingles.

1. Retain the proportion of original openings. Replacement of windows and doors determined to be original must duplicate the original in size and scale in ways that do not visually impact the public way façade of the house and continue to reflect the period of the house.

3. Retain siding determined to be original. If using alternative materials as siding, the homeowner should use materials that are compatible with the original material's character. For example, horizontal fiber cement siding with identical lap reveal is appropriate. When hardboard or concrete board siding is used to simulate wood clapboard siding, it should reflect the general directional and dimensional characteristics found historically in the neighborhood. No products imitating the "grain" of wood should be used. Brick, limestone, clapboard, cement board, wood, shingles, stucco are recommended.

5. Prioritize retention of the roof's original shape as viewed from the public way façade. Chimneys may be removed unless they are an outstanding characteristic of the property.

HEIGHT

1. Generally, the height of a new building should fall within a range set by the highest and lowest contiguous buildings if the block has uniform heights. Uncharacteristically high or low buildings should not be considered when determining the appropriate range.

2. Cornice heights, porch heights and foundation heights in the same block face and opposing block face should be considered when designing new construction.

3. Consider the grade of the lot against the grade of the adjacent sidewalk as well as the grade of the adjacent neighbor.

HEIGHT AND SETBACK

1. A new house of the same height as existing houses may be as close to them as they are to each other.

2. A new house which is taller than the house next to it must be set back further from the side property line than existing houses.

OUTLINE

1. The basic outline of a new building, including general roof shape, should reflect building outlines typical of the area.

2. The outline of new construction should reflect the directional orientations characteristic of the existing building in its context.

MASS

1. The total mass and site coverage of a new building should be consistent with surrounding buildings.

2. The massing of the various parts of a new building should be characteristic of surrounding buildings.

WINDOWS AND DOORS

1. Creative expression with fenestration is not precluded provided the result does not conflict with or draw attention from surrounding historic buildings

2. Windows and doors should be arranged on the building so as not to conflict with the basic fenestration pattern in the area.

3. The basic proportions of glass to solid which is found on surrounding contributing buildings should be reflected in new construction.

4. Window openings should reflect the basic proportionality and directionality of those typically found on surrounding historic buildings.



Staff recommends approval of COA 25-10

Because the proposed changes are extensive, this application has been reviewed in the context of a new build. The existing building was not a contributing resource at the time of the district's designation, and although its original character is identifiable, it has been significantly altered. There is a one-and-a-half story ADU located behind the property, and a two-story building across the street.

The choice of proposed materials meet district guidelines, and the footprint of the property would not significantly change in size, although the mass would. Since this petition was last reviewed on February 13th, the addition of windows on the north and south ends of the forewardmost block of the house has brought the proportion of windows to wall visible from the public right of way closer to that of surrounding buildings.













STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS Address: 601 N Morton St (Showers Furniture HD)	
COA 25-11	Petitioner: Shawn Eurton
Start Date: 1/31/2025	Parcel: 53-05-33-206-019.000-005
RATING: OUTSTANDING	Showers Brother Admin Building 1916



Background: The Showers Furniture Company Administrative building is a 1916 office building designed by Bloomington Architect J.L. Nichols. The building is currently undergoing a substantial interior restoration, and a new set of entry doors are being proposed for the secondary south elevation.

Request: Replacement of an unoriginal set of aluminum double doors with fullwindow black-anodized aluminum double doors.

Note that while the attached image depicts an arched window over the aluminum replacement doors, the applicant intend to keep the existing divided light rectangular window.

Guidelines: Showers Furniture Historic District

General guidelines

E. New materials should, whenever possible, match the material being replaced in physical properties and should be compatible with the size, scale, color, material and character of the property and its environment.

F. New additions or alterations should not disrupt the essential form and integrity of the building and should be compatible with the size, scale, color, material and character of the building and its environment.

G. New additions or related new construction should be differentiated from the existing fabric, thus should not necessarily be imitative of an earlier style or period.

Entrances/Doors

1. All contributing entrances, doors, and loading docks and their elements, materials, and features (functional and decorative), should be preserved and repaired using recognized preservation methods, rather than replaced. Where they survive, original doors and door fittings are significant architectural features that lend distinctive historical character to the area. Where fabric has been removed, appropriate infill designs will be considered.

6. Proposals for new doors or entrances will be reviewed on a case-by-case basis.

Staff recommends approval of COA 25-11

The proposed doors match the size and materials of the existing replacement doors on the south elevation, and their modern design neither disrupts the building's historic characteristics nor conveys a false sense of history.





STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS	TAFF RECOMMENDATIONS Address: 1108 N Woodburn	
DD 25-04	Petitioner: Valubuilt Construction	
Start Date: 1/30/2025	Parcel: 53-05-33-204-150.000-005	
RATING: CONTRIBUTING	Slightly altered pyramid roof cottage c. 1900	



Background: 1108 N Woodburn is a pyramidal roofed cottage with a front-gabled el and a 2/3rds screened front porch. The house first appears in City Directories in 1916 under the ownership of electric-company foreman, Vint Vines. In 1930 the house was bought by Milford Chitwood, a carpenter and former farmer, and his wife Myrtle. After Milford's death in 1935 Myrtle remarried Jason Payne, owner of an Ellettsville grocery. Jason died in 1945, and myrtle rented to IU students until she sold the house in 1955. Myrtle had no children, but cared for babies after the death of her second husband. In the mid-50s the house was briefly occupied by teacher Robert Medcalf and furniture salesman Jason Hendricks. From 1958 to 1964 the house was owned by realtors Merlin and Mary Swarthout. In Jr. high the 5' Merlin made the paper for winning a basketball game for Buttlerville High by climbing onto the back of his 6'4" teammate. By the time he was drafted in 1940, Merlin had grown ten inches. Moving to Florida, the couple sold the house to Canadian maintenance worker Philip Gandier and his wife Ruth. Philip died at 31, and his wife Ruth sold the house to Louis and Ruth Slessinger in 1970. This couple owned the house until Louis' death in 1975.

Since the notice of demolition delay was posted in the yard of 1108 N Woodburn, two neighbors have called the Historic Preservation Program Manager expressing disappointment at the potential demolition.

Request: Full demolition

Guidelines: According to the demolition delay ordinance, BHPC has 90 days to review the demolition permit application from the time it is forwarded to the Commission for review.

Staff Recommendation: Staff Recommends release of DD 25-04.