

BHPC MEETING PACKET

Thursday May 8, 2025 5:00 p.m. EST Prepared by HAND Staff

In Person: The McCloskey Room, 401 N Morton St., Ste. 135, Bloomington, IN 47404

Zoom:

Join Zoom Meeting

https://bloomington.zoom.us/j/84269673454?pwd=dupS9LsxFZck6JsGNk3Yh6CNCCv6LS.1

Meeting ID: 842 6967 3454 Passcode: 711912

Table of Contents

AGENDA	4
MINUTES April 24	6
COA 25-15	10
DD 25-09	19

Accessibility Statement

The City is committed to providing equal access to information. However, despite our efforts, at times, portions of our board and commission packets are not accessible for some individuals.

If you encounter difficulties accessing material in this packet, please contact Anna Killion-Hanson at the Housing and Neighborhood Development Department at <u>anna.killionhanson@bloomington.in.gov</u> or 813-349-3582 and provide your name, contact information, and a link to or description of the document or web page you are having problems with.

Auxiliary aids for people with disabilities are available upon request with adequate notice. Please call 812-349-3429 or email, human.rights@bloomington.in.gov.

Procedure for Certificates of Appropriateness and Demolition Delays

For each item the Historic Preservation Program Manager will first present a staff report. We will then hear if the Petitioner has any additional information, followed by a round of questions from each Commissioner. We ask that petitioners, the public, and Commissioners refrain from speaking until addressed by the Chair, unless a question is directly addressed to them. If a member of the public or a petitioner wishes to comment, please raise your hand until recognized by the Chair. Once a motion is made we will then open up a discussion of the item for Members of the Commission. We encourage all Commissioners, Petitioners, and members of the public to be civil and respectful at all times.

Bloomington Historic Preservation Commission Meeting Thursday May 8th, 2025, 5:00 P.M.

In Person:

The McCloskey Room, 401 N Morton St., Ste. 135, Bloomington, IN 47404

Zoom: Housing & Neighborhood Development is inviting you to a scheduled Zoom meeting.

Join Zoom Meeting

https://bloomington.zoom.us/j/84269673454?pwd=dupS9LsxFZck6JsGNk3Yh6CNCCv6LS.1

Meeting ID: 842 6967 3454

Passcode: 711912



The City is committed to providing equal access to information. However, despite our efforts, at times, portions of our board and commission packets are not accessible for some individuals. If you encounter difficulties accessing material in this packet, please contact Anna Killion-Hanson at the Housing and Neighborhood Development Department at <u>anna.killionhanson@bloomington.in.gov</u> or 812-349-3577 and provide your name, contact information, and a link to or description of the document or web page you are having problems with. Auxiliary aids for people with disabilities are available upon request with adequate notice. Please call 812-349-3429 or email <u>human.rights@bloomington.in.gov</u>.

- I. CALL TO ORDER
- II. ROLL CALL
- III. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

A. April 24th

IV. CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

Commission Review

A. COA 25-15

1104 N Grant St (Garden Hill HD) Tyler Martin

- New construction
- DEMOLITION DELAY

A. DD 25-09

208 S Jefferson St Valubuilt Construction

VI. OLD BUSINESS

V.

VII. NEW BUSINESS

VIII. COMMISSIONER COMMENTS

- IX. PUBLIC COMMENTS
- X. ADJOURNMENT

Next meeting date is May 22nd, 2025 at 5:00 P.M. and will be held in a hybrid manner, both in person and via Zoom.

Bloomington Historic Preservation Commission Meeting Thursday April 24th, 2025 **Minutes**

I. CALL TO ORDER

Meeting was called to order by Sam DeSollar @ 5:00 p.m.

II. **ROLL CALL**

Commissioners:

Sam DeSollar (Present) Reynard Cross (Present) Jeremy Hackerd (Present) Daniel Schlegel (Present) Melody Duesner (Present) Jack Baker (Present)

Advisory Members:

Karen Duffy (Present) Duncan Campbell (Present)

Staff:

Noah Sandweiss, HAND (Present) Eddie Wright, HAND (Present) Anna Killion-Hansen, HAND (Present) Anna Holmes, City Legal (Present)

Guests:

JD Boruff, City of Bloomington Facilities Katherine McIntosh Ernest Xi

III. **APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

Α. April 10th

> Jeremy Hackerd made a motion to approve April 10th minutes, Jack Baker seconded. Motion carried 6-0-0. (Yes-No-Abstain)

Sam DeSollar (Y)

Reynard Cross (Y) Jeremy Hackerd (Y) **Daniel Schlegel** (Y) Melody Duesner (Y) Jack Baker (Y)

Jeremy Hackerd noted that the minutes should reflect the individual voting tally per Commission bylaws. Staff liaison Eddie Wright stated that Noah Sandweiss has discussed this with both liaisons and the minutes will reflect this going forward.

The agenda was altered to hear COA 25-25 at the beginning of the COA review.

IV. **CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS Staff Review**

Α. COA 25-23 2304 N Martha St (Matlock Heights HD) Kitty McIntosh Side privacy fence Noah Sandweiss gave presentation. See packet for details.

Sam DeSollar read the Commission procedural statement. **Commission Review**

B. COA 25-15

1104 N Grant St (Garden Hill HD) Tvler Martin New construction

COA 25-15 was not heard as the petitioner had stated to Noah Sandweiss that he would not be able to attend the meeting and was not present.

Reynard Cross made a motion to continue COA 25-15 to the next meeting, Daniel Schlegel seconded.

Motion carried 6-0-0. (Yes-No-Abstain)

Sam DeSollar (Y) **Reynard Cross** (Y) Jeremy Hackerd (Y) **Daniel Schlegel** (Y) Melody Duesner (Y) Jack Baker (Y)

C. COA 25-16

1101 N Lincoln St (Garden Hill HD) Sherri Hillenburg New construction at site of non-contributing house

COA 25-16 was withdrawn by the petitioner.

D. COA 25-24

600 W 6th St (Near West Side HD) Leighla Taylor (Fastsigns) *New signage*

The petitioner was not present when this COA came up for discussion and vote. It was moved to the end of the meeting to give the petitioner time to arrive.

COA 25-24 was, per procedure, automatically continued to the next meeting as the petitioner did not appear.

E. COA 25-25

642 N Madison St (Showers Furniture HD) Bloomington Redevelopment Commission *Reconstruction of south wall on Mill* **Noah Sandweiss** gave presentation. See packet for details.

Jack Baker asked about the failure of the wall. JD Boruff stated it began failing in the corners, but the overall the mortar is in good shape. But they are not sure what they will find when they begin repairs. Due to the age they may not fully know what caused the decay. **Sam DeSollar** asked about the pilasters and placement of the wall to the eaves. The walls will be plumb. **Anna Killion-Hanson** added that the Redevelopment Commission voted to add funding for the repairs. The Mill is missing out on a lot of potential income at this time of the year due to these issues. The estimate for repairs is 12 weeks. The estimates are on the high side so it's likely the project may finish under budget.

Daniel Schlegel made a motion to approve **COA 25-25**, **Jeremy Hackerd** seconded.

Motion carried 6-0-0. (Yes-No-Abstain)

Sam DeSollar (Y) Reynard Cross (Y) Jeremy Hackerd (Y) Daniel Schlegel (Y)

Melody Duesner (Y) Jack Baker (Y)

V. DEMOLITION DELAY

A. DD 25-07

411 E 10th St Valubuilt Construction **Noah Sandweiss** gave presentation. See packet for details.

Karen Duffy asked about the limestone foundations. **Sam DeSollar** asked if the petitioner is familiar with BRI. Ernest XI stated that he is and he will make anything worth saving available.

Jeremy Hackerd made a motion to waive the Demo Delay period for DD 25-07, Reynard Cross seconded. Motion carried 6-0-0. (Yes-No-Abstain)

Sam DeSollar (Y) Reynard Cross (Y) Jeremy Hackerd (Y) Daniel Schlegel (Y) Melody Duesner (Y) Jack Baker (Y)

Jeremy Hackerd read the statement releasing the Demo Delay.

B. DD 25-08

413 E 10th St Valubuilt Construction **Noah Sandweiss** gave presentation. See packet for details.

Jeremy Hackerd made a motion to waive the Demo Delay period for DD 25-08, Reynard Cross seconded. Motion carried 6-0-0. (Yes-No-Abstain)

> Sam DeSollar (Y) Reynard Cross (Y) Jeremy Hackerd (Y) Daniel Schlegel (Y) Melody Duesner (Y) Jack Baker (Y)

Jeremy Hackerd read the statement releasing the Demo Delay.

VI. OLD BUSINESS

Noah Sandweiss gave a brief update on sidewalks & Willow Terrace. **Duncan Campbell** asked about ownership of historic sidewalks on campus, City vs IU.

VII. NEW BUSINESS

Noah Sandweiss noted that Housing and Neighborhood Development is partnering with Cicada Cinema to show a movie called The Cruise. More info is available on the Cicada Cinema webpage. The showing will be Friday May 9° at 8pm at 601 N Morton St. Which is the Showers Administration Building. Which has just completed restoration.

VIII. COMMISSIONER COMMENTS

Duncan Campbell asked if notification is being sent to the Petitioners concerning the upcoming meetings. **Noah Sandweiss** stated that they receive notification when the packet is sent out. **Duncan** asked if they could be sent reminders.

IX. PUBLIC COMMENTS

X. ADJOURNMENT

Sam DeSollar adjourned the meeting @ 5:35 pm

Video record of meeting available upon request.

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS Address: 1104 N Grant St (Garden Hill HD)		
COA 25-15	Petitioner: Tyler Martin	
Start Date: 3/13/2025	Parcel: 53-05-33-203-007.000-005	
RATING: NON-CONTRIBUTING Significantly altered 1940 minimal ranch		



Background:

On November 14th 2024, the Historic Preservation Commission voted to approve the demolition of a non-contributing building at 1104 N Grant St. Subsequently, Subsequently, two designs have been previously submitted for Commission review on December 12th and March 27th. The March 27th design received a mixed reception with questions raised about height, foundation, and paved parking areas. This new design aims to address these comments.

Request:

New construction of two-story house. The proposal calls for the use of asphalt shingle roofing, 7" reveal LP siding, double hung vinyl windows, a split-face CMU foundation, and painted wooden posts and brackets.

Guidelines: Garden Hill HD

CONTEXT FOR NEW CONSTRUCTION

Standards and guidelines serve as aids in designing new construction that relates sensitively to the surrounding context. Therefore, the most important first step in designing new construction in any historic district is to determine just what that context is. "Contributing" properties are important to the density and continuity of the historic neighborhood, but are not individually outstanding or notable architecturally. These classifications will be available on-line. Each property in the Garden Hill Study Area is described.

Each site presents a unique context. This is comprised of "contributing" buildings immediately adjacent, the nearby area (often the surrounding block), a unique sub-area within the district, and the district as a whole.

2. ISOLATED LOT. This is usually a single vacant lot (sometimes two very small lots combined) which exists in a highly developed area with very few if any other vacant lots in view.

Context: The existing contributing buildings immediately adjacent and in the same block, and the facing block provide a very strong context to which any new construction must primarily relate.

MATERIALS

RECOMMENDED

1. Building materials, whether natural or manmade, should be visually compatible with surrounding historic buildings.

2. When hardboard or concrete board siding is used to simulate wood clapboard siding, it should reflect the general directional and dimensional characteristics found historically in the neighborhood. No products imitating the "grain" of wood should be used.

3. Brick, limestone, clapboard, cement board, wood, shingles and stucco are appropriate materials.

SETBACK

1. A new building's setback should conform to the set-back pattern established by the existing block context. If the development standards for the particular zoning district do not allow appropriate setbacks, a variance may be needed.

2. On corner sites, the setbacks from both streets must conform to the context.

3. Structures that are much closer or further from the street than the vast majority of houses in a given block should not be used to determine appropriate setback.

BUILDING ENTRY

Entrances may characteristically be formal or friendly, recessed or flush, grand or common place, narrow or wide. New buildings should reflect a

similar sense of entry to that which is expressed by surrounding historic buildings.

SPACING

New construction that reflects and reinforces the spacing found in its block. New construction should maintain the perceived regularity or lack of regularity of spacing on the block.

HEIGHT

1. Generally, the height of a new building should fall within a range set by the highest and lowest contiguous buildings if the block has uniform heights. Uncharacteristically high or low buildings should not be considered when determining the appropriate range.

2. Cornice heights, porch heights and foundation heights in the same block face and opposing block face should be considered when designing new construction.

3. Consider the grade of the lot against the grade of the adjacent sidewalk as well as the grade of the adjacent neighbor.

HEIGHT AND SETBACK

1. A new house of the same height as existing houses may be as close to them as they are to each other.

2. A new house which is taller than the house next to it must be set back further from the side property line than existing houses.

OUTLINE

1. The basic outline of a new building, including general roof shape, should reflect building outlines typical of the area.

2. The outline of new construction should reflect the directional orientations characteristic of the existing building in its context.



1. The total mass and site coverage of a new building should be consistent with surrounding buildings.

2. The massing of the various parts of a new building should be characteristic of surrounding buildings.

FOUNDATION/FIRST FLOOR ELEVATION

New construction first floor elevation and foundation height should be consistent with contiguous buildings.

FENESTRATION

1. Creative expression with fenestration is not precluded provided the result does not conflict with or draw attention from surrounding historic buildings

2. Windows and doors should be arranged on the building so as not to conflict with the basic fenestration pattern in the area.

3. The basic proportions of glass to solid which is found on surrounding contributing buildings should be reflected in new construction.

4. Window openings should reflect the basic proportionality and directionality of those typically found on surrounding historic buildings.

Staff recommends approval of COA 25-15

Materials: The proposed materials including LP siding (provided it does not have an imitation grain), brick veneer, asphalt roof shingles, split-face CMU foundation, and painted wood architectural details are consistent with district guidelines.

Setback: The 30' front setback matches that of the neighboring house and other buildings on the block. Likewise the 15' and 9' side setbacks match the nearby buildings on Grant.

Entry: The one story front porch with tapered posts is reflects similar porches found on contributing buildings throughout the district. The addition of a side entrance on Grant Street contributes to a pattern of fenestration typical of buildings in the district and relates the building to the surrounding neighborhood context.

Height: Two story buildings are unusual in Garden Hill and "generally, the height of a new building should fall within a range set by the highest and lowest contiguous buildings if the block has uniform heights." Sitting on a corner lot on 15th Street, the two buildings directly to the east of the proposed new construction are approximately 25' high. While this design presents a 21' 10.3" ridge height, this is lower than the neighboring contiguous buildings on the block. Additionally, the revised second story dormers and roof pitch diminish the appearance of height and overall massing.

Outline: The gabled front entrance and full width single-story porch on the south elevation match outlines recommended in the district guidelines.

Mass: The footprint of 26' x 49' is similar in site coverage to neighboring buildings on the 400 block of E 15th Street and the 1100 block of N Grant Street, and the overall mass is similar to contributing buildings in the district.

Fenestration: The regular fenestration patterns presented on the street-facing facades are fairly typical of buildings in the district. The use of double hung windows is consistent with many of the surrounding historic buildings and the new build's stylistic influences.

This latest iteration of 1104 N Grant has many features that reflect the California bungalow form found in the Garden Hill Historic District. Its height, mass, and footprint fit the context of the block and the proposed design elements fit district guidelines and reference architectural features found on historic buildings in the district. Both street facing facades convey a similar sense of entry to that which is expressed by surrounding historic buildings.

MIK	CITY OF BLOOMINGTON HOUSING AND NEIGHBORHOOD DEVELOPMENT
3.8	BLOOMINGTON
APPER	HOUSING AND NEIGHBORHOOD DEVELOPMENT

Bloomington Historic Preservation Commission

APPLICATION FORM FOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

	(OFFICE USE ONLY)
Address of Property: <u>1104 North Grant Street</u> Parcel Number(s): 53-05-33-203-007.000-005	Filing Date: Case Number:
	HPC Hearing Date:
Bloomington Historic District:	HPC Healing Date.
Courthouse Square Historic District	
Elm Heights Historic District	
Fairview Historic District	
Garden Hill Historic District	
Greater Prospect Hill Historic District	
Maple Heights Historic District	
Matlock Heights Historic District	
McDoel Historic District	
Near West Side Historic District	
Prospect Hill Historic District	
Restaurant Row Historic District	
Showers Brothers Furniture Factory Historic District	
University Courts Historic District	
Other:	
RATING (City of Bloomington Survey of Historic Sites a Outstanding Notable Contributing	ind Structures)
Non-Contributing	
APPLICANT INFORMATION:	E
APPLICANT INFORMATION:	Email: tyler.fieldstone@gmail.com
APPLICANT INFORMATION: Name: Tyler Martin	and a local state of the second state of the s
APPLICANT INFORMATION: Name: Tyler Martin	Email: <u>tyler.fieldstone@gmail.com</u> Phone: <u>8122407565</u>
APPLICANT INFORMATION: Name: <u>Tyler Martin</u> Address: <u>3703 Chaudion Court, Bloomington IN 47401</u>	n de la companya de la
APPLICANT INFORMATION: Name: Tyler Martin Address: 3703 Chaudion Court, Bloomington IN 47401 PROPERTY OWNER INFORMATION:	n de la companya de la
APPLICANT INFORMATION: Name: <u>Tyler Martin</u> Address: <u>3703 Chaudion Court, Bloomington IN 47401</u>	n de la companya de la
APPLICANT INFORMATION: Name: Tyler Martin Address: 3703 Chaudion Court, Bloomington IN 47401 PROPERTY OWNER INFORMATION: Check if the Applicant is the property owner	and a local state of the second state of the s

PROPOSED WORK (Check all that Apply):

X New construction

- Principal building
- Accessory building or structure
- Addition to existing building
- Demolition
 - Full Demolition
 - Partial Demolition
- Moving a building
- Alterations to the façade or exterior spaces of the property
 - Window replacement
 - Door replacement
 - □ Siding
 - Roof material
 - Foundation
 - Other façade element:
- New Signage
- Alterations to the yard
 - Alteration to fences, walls
 - Tree removal
- Other(s):

ADDITIONAL REQUIRED DOCUMENTS

- Written description of the nature of the proposal.
- Written description of all of the proposed materials to be used.
- Between 3 and 5 photographs of the historic site and/or structure before changes.
- Scaled drawings or sketches, manufacturer's brochures, and/or photographic precedents showing the proposed alterations to the exterior, additions, changes, or new construction.
- A map of the site with the site boundaries indicated.

CERTIFICATION

I am the owner or authorized agent responsible for compliance, and hereby acknowledge the following: 1. I have read this application and all related documentation and I represent that the information furnished is correct.

2. I agree to comply with all City ordinances and State statutes, which regulate construction, land use, occupancy, and historic preservation.

3. Any changes made to the project proposal shall be submitted to the City of Bloomington for review.

4. If any misrepresentation is made in this application, the City may revoke any Certificate issued based upon this misinformation.

Applicant's Signature:

Date: 3.13.25







STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS Address: 208 S Jefferson	
DD 25-09	Petitioner: Valubuilt Construction
Start Date: 4/28/2025 Parcel: 53-05-34-422-014.000-005	
RATING: CONTRIBUTING	1930 minimal traditional



Background: 208 S Jefferson is a 900 sqft brick house built in 1930. The building has two entrances facing the alley parallel to Jefferson St, and one on the secondary north elevation. The north end of the building and the east and west sides of the south half are gabled and the overall footprint is square. Aerial photographs show that part of the rear street-facing elevation was added between 1949 and 1961. Although the house's date of construction is listed by the recorder's office at 1930, it first appears in city directories in 1955 and does not appear on the 1940 or 1950 census. In 1955 the house was occupied by elderly florists Alva and Minnie Pryor. After their deaths, the house became a rental property, occupied mostly by IU graduate students. Some notable occupants include John Buckingham (1964) a future professor of transcendentalist poetry at Arizona State, Daniel Mato (1971-72) professor emeritus of African art at University of Calgary, and Daniel Shelley (1975) computer science professor at the Rochester Institute of Technology.

Request: Full demolition

Guidelines: According to the demolition delay ordinance, BHPC has 90 days to review the demolition permit application from the time it is forwarded to the Commission for review.

Staff Recommendation: Staff Recommends release of DD 25-09.