

**Bloomington Historic Preservation Commission Showers City Hall
McCloskey Room
Thursday August 9, 2018
5:00 P.M.
MINUTES**

I. CALL TO ORDER

Meeting was called to order by Chairman, Jeff Goldin, at 5:03 pm.

II. ROLL CALL

Commissioners

John Saunders
Flavia Burrell
Jeff Goldin
Chris Sturbaum
Sam DeSollar

Advisory

Duncan Campbell
Derek Richey

Staff

Vic Kelson – CBU
Alison Kimmel – HAND
Eric Sader – HAND
Doris Sims – HAND
Jackie Scanlan – Planning & Transportation
Philippa Guthrie – LEGAL
Dan Sherman – Council Office

Guests

Steve Wyatt
Brian Chelius
Richard Oram
Conna Oram
Susan Su
Adrienne Davis
Theodore Legler
Paul Langley
Ian Yarborough
Eleanor Kinser
Chris Valliant
Sarah Greene

III. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

A. July 12, 2018 Minutes

Sam DeSollar made a motion to approve July 12, 2018 minutes. **Chris Sturbaum** seconded. **Motion carried 4/0/1 (Yes/No/Abstain).**

IV. CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

Staff Review

A. COA 18-51

122 W. 6th Street: Courthouse Square

Petitioner: Jasjit Singh

Installation of new signage above the storefront and in the windows. Backlit channel letters with a white face.

Eric Sader gave presentation. **See packet for details.**

Commission Review

A. COA 18-52

503 S. Jordan Avenue: Elm Heights

Petitioner: Richard W. & Conna J. Oram

Construction of a free-standing car port on the rear of the lot.

Eric Sader gave presentation. **See packet for details.**

Chris Sturbaum stated he would like to see a wider board on the front under the roof-line, but that's the petitioner's choice.

Sam DeSollar made a suggestion to match the retaining wall at the base of the carport posts.

Eric Sader stated there was no neighborhood input received.

John Saunders made a motion to approve **COA 18-52**. **Flavia Burrell** seconded. **Motion carried 5/0/0.**

B. COA 18-53

122 S. College Avenue: Courthouse Square

Petitioner: Susan Su

Amendment to COA 16-40 (restoration of storefront): painting steel beam above storefront rainbow colors.

Eric Sader gave presentation. **See packet for details.**

John Saunders asked why the rainbow colors. **Susan Su** stated it would be good for Bloomington.

Chris Sturbaum asked if the metal beam would be the only thing painted. **Susan Su** stated yes it would be the only part painted. The beam is currently brown.

Duncan Campbell asked if the pattern was logo specific or related to something happening in the building. **Susan Su** stated it is good for Bloomington.

Derek Richey asked if the future business that leases this space would be able to change this if they want. **Susan Su** stated probably not.

Chris Sturbaum stated it is just paint and the restoration of the building has been great.

Duncan Campbell commented he also wanted to commend them on the restoration of the store-front.

Derek Richey stated the color is temporary, he doesn't have a problem with it.

Sam DeSollar commented this is re-paintable so he does not have a problem with it.

John Saunders made a motion to approve **COA 18-53**. **Sam DeSollar** seconded. **Motion carried 5/0/0**.

C. COA 18-54

410 W. 4th Street: Greater Prospect Hill

Petitioner: Adrienne Davis and Theodore Legler

Demolition of chimney and chimney stack.

Eric Sader gave presentation. **See packet for details**.

Duncan Campbell asked if there is anything wrong with the chimney. **Theodore Legler** stated there is no fireplace in the house and they are upgrading their furnace so there will be no further use of the chimney. The chimney is not visible from the interior of the house. The only part you see is on the roof. **Duncan Campbell** asked if it was functional, not whether or not it would be used. **Theodore Legler** stated it does not match the rest of the house. The previous owners had it tuck pointed and it was done differently than the rest of the brick on the house.

Derek Richey asked if this was the original chimney. **Theodore Legler** stated he believes it is, but when it was repaired, it did not match.

Jeff Goldin asked if there were any problems with leaks. **Theodore Legler** stated not that they know of. They just purchased the home.

Chris Sturbaum commented he never noticed the chimney before. He doesn't think he will miss it.

Duncan Campbell commented he asked the question he did because they will not be the owners of this property forever. The fact the current owners don't have a use for the chimney doesn't mean future owners won't. The chimney not matching the rest of the house isn't a legitimate reason to take it off, especially since it is almost invisible. He would recommend keeping it.

Sam DeSollar stated he is going to disagree with Duncan. Furnace systems are now about 98% efficient so the chimney being used as a vent system is not likely and the same for a kitchen hood.

Derek Richey asked if this would open up space on the interior. **Theodore Legler** commented it will open up space both on the first and second floors expanding a bathroom and kitchen.

John Saunders made a motion to approve **COA 18-54**. **Chris Sturbaum** seconded. **Motion carried 4/0/1 (Yes/No/Abstain)**.

D. COA 18-55

1111 E. 1st Street: Elm Heights

Petitioner: Paul Langley

Replacement of existing concrete walkway from the house to the sidewalk with limestone pavers.

Eric Sader gave presentation. **See packet for details**.

Paul Langley commented the current sidewalk has broken joints and is not safe to walk on. The first stone is limestone, the rest is concrete.

John Saunders stated he thinks it is a good project.

Chris Sturbaum asked for clarification as to where the sidewalk was leading to. **Paul Langley** explained it would have the exact same foot-print it does now, just different material.

Duncan Campbell asked if the stone dust, the application mentions, is like quarter minus. **Paul Langley** stated it is aggregate from stone. Sand won't compact. **Duncan Campbell** commented he was once told to use limestone dust to set pavers in. When it rained, the water turned the dust back in to limestone, losing the drainage.

Sam DeSollar asked if the first piece of limestone was going to be kept. **Paul Langley** stated it was.

Sam DeSollar made a motion to approve **COA 18-55**. **John Saunders** seconded. **Motion carried 5/0/0**.

E. COA 18-56

2500 N. Fritz Drive: Matlock Heights

Petitioner: Ian Yarbough

Replacement of vinyl windows on front of house and expansion of window openings to meet egress requirements. Replacement of siding under existing windows with hardy board siding.

Eric Sader gave presentation. **See packet for details**. Neighborhood was supportive of this petition.

Ian Yarborough commented stated they would have only done egress on the side of the house to address the issue, but one of the front windows on the house is the only window in a bedroom so they don't want to change one and not the other to match.

John Saunders asked if the new window on the right side of the façade would be bigger. **Ian Yarborough** stated it would be to meet egress. They are wanting to install sliders rather than double hung windows.

Chris Sturbaum asked if there was ever limestone where the horizontal siding is. **Ian Yarborough** stated no.

Duncan Campbell asked if the siding was deteriorating. **Ian Yarborough** stated it was. The siding has holes in it and is rotting in a couple of places.

Chris Sturbaum asked what the current vertical siding material is and what he wanted to replace it with. **Ian Yarborough** stated it is aluminum siding. They want to replace it with hardy board siding, but they have not committed to anything yet and are open to ideas.

Duncan Campbell asked if that part of the siding was included in the COA application. **Ian Yarborough** stated it was.

Sam DeSollar asked what the mutton pattern is going to be in the window. **Ian Yarborough** stated it will stay open, with no grids. The 3x3 window is going to be replaced with three double hung windows that are off-set. The top can slide down for a 1/3 opening and the bottom can rise 2/3, to help keep the window pattern.

John Saunders stated it bothered him that the front window replacements were not going to be in thirds.

Duncan Campbell stated with this house, we are more interested in keeping the look of the house, rather than the material. He stated he has an issue with replacing the 3x3 window in the front.

Sam DeSollar stated he liked the way the petitioner was trying to keep the characteristics of the house. He asked Duncan, if they did the double hung windows, but then put a horizontal down the middle of it, it may not help the operation of the window, but it could be a compromise to keep the character of the house. **Duncan Campbell** agreed with the suggestion, but he would like to see a rendering before it is installed.

Derek Richey commented the problem with the proposal is there is “so much maybe” in the proposal. He would like for the petitioner to come back with a solid rendering of what is going to happen. He appreciates the petitioner being open to ideas, but there is no definite of what is actually going to change.

Chris Sturbaum stated the window on the right should be made into 4 casements, then they would match the two casements right beside them. Consider replicating the awning three over three, using the pattern of the batten you discover. **Ian Yarborough** commented although they have not started yet, they would have to change their order with the construction company and the price would probably be different. **Sam DeSollar** commented if they do change to casements, measurements will need to be checked because the openings with sliders are larger than casements. **Chris Sturbaum** asked how they felt about just replicating the 3x3 window rather than changing it. **Ian Yarborough** stated it isn't the worst idea in the world.

Sarah Greene stated she walks by this house quite a bit and she appreciates what they are trying to do to the house.

Duncan Campbell stated it is more difficult to deal with mid-century homes because there are so many variations. He is not necessarily comfortable letting going of the large 3x3 window just because it is a mid-century house.

Chris Sturbaum stated he has seen many of these windows replaced, they are strong characteristics of this style home.

Chris Sturbaum made a motion to approve **COA 18-56** with a requirement to replicate the 9-light window, to make the sliders have 4 panels while meeting egress requirements, and use the exposed board and batten pattern underneath the current siding. **John Saunders** seconded. **Motion carried 5/0/0.**

E. COA 18-57

618 E. 3rd Street

Petitioner: Eleanor Kinser

Replacement of garage door.

Eric Sader gave presentation. **See packet for details.**

Duncan Campbell asked if the current door is functioning at all. **Eleanor Kinser** stated the door is falling apart, the mechanism is fine.

Sam DeSollar asked why there would not be windows in the replacement door. **Eleanor Kinser** stated for expense reasons.

Sam DeSollar stated these garage doors are almost impossible to get. They are now one of the most expensive and they don't perform as well.

Jeff Goldin stated he had reservations, but after listening to the commission, he is okay with it.

John Saunders made a motion to approve **COA 18-57**. **Chris Sturbaum** seconded. **Motion carried 5/0/0.**

V. DEMOLITION DELAY

Staff Review

A. Demo Delay 18-28

112 E. Cottage Grove Road

Petitioner: Chickering Rentals

Partial demolition – construction of a deck on the rear of the house.

Eric Sader gave presentation. **See packet for details.**

Commission Review

A. Demo Delay 18-29

106-108 W. Clubhouse Drive

Petitioner: John Turnbull

Full demolition – two apartment buildings.

Eric Sader gave presentation. **See packet for details.**

Philippa Guthrie clarified where this property is located. These homes are at the former monastery near the golf course.

John Turnbull stated the city acquired this property because the group living in them moved. They are vacant and the city has the funds available to encapsulate them and make them flush with ground level since there is no other use for them.

John Saunders asked why the city is taking them down and why the city acquired them. **John Turnbull** stated the city is not in the business to lease apartments. The monastery group desired the money, and with the homes being part of the park, the city strives for as much green space as possible. He also stated the pictures shown have to be fairly old, because the homes are not in that great a condition. **Philippa Guthrie** stated the homes are completely surrounded by park.

Chris Sturbaum stated he understands it is returning to park space and the city's vision.

Chris Sturbaum asked what is going to happen to the monastery. **John Turnbull** stated there are no current plans for it, but he predicts it will have to be demolished.

Duncan Campbell stated Tom Canada built these apartments and donated the land for the monastery as well. He was a prominent figure in Bloomington. There is definitely some historic significance to this site, but he is also fine with it returning to park.

Sam DeSollar made a motion to release **Demo Delay 18-29**. **John Saunders** seconded. **Motion carried 5/0/0.**

B. Demo Delay 18-30

307 S. Muller Parkway

Petitioner: Chris Valliant

Full demolition – moving house from current address.

Eric Sader gave presentation. **See packet for details.**

Chris Valliant stated he is wanting to move the house to property he owns in the Broadview neighborhood.

Sam DeSollar stated he supports this move.

Sam DeSollar made a motion to release **Demo Delay 18-30**. **Chris Sturbaum** seconded. **Motion carried 5/0/0.**

C. Demo Delay 18-31

1405 S. Walnut Street

Petitioner: Sarah Greene

Partial demolition – addition of door at rear of home.

Eric Sader gave presentation. **See packet for details.**

Sarah Greene commented the door would be installed in the center of the addition in the back.

Derek Richey asked if there was ever a door. **Sarah Greene** stated she just purchased the house.

Sam DeSollar made a motion to release **Demo Delay 18-31**. **Chris Sturbaum** seconded. **Motion carried 5/0/0**.

VI. NEW BUSINESS

A. Griffy Water Treatment Plant Discussion – City Utilities, Vic Kelson

Vic Kelson gave a presentation on the Griffy Water Treatment plant. He stated the plant has had trespassers who have caused the release of mercury during the theft and vandalism of equipment and parts inside the plant. CBU currently has 24-hour security at the plant to prevent mercury being released more than it already is. CBU is interested in preserving the entryway, somehow turning it into a monument.

John Saunders asked what they would do with the entryway. **Vic Kelson** stated he has talked briefly with Sean Starowitz, but there is no plan as of right now.

Chris Sturbaum asked what their timeline was. **Vic Kelson** stated they have a contractor working on the asbestos removal, which should take about 4-8 weeks. They are going to take bids on the actual demolition of the building. He anticipates having to do some sort of ground or environmental remediation as well.

Chris Sturbaum asked if someone was to offer to purchase and take responsibility for the building, what would CBU's response be. **Vic Kelson** stated they would have to pay for the remediation and clean up. He stated dozens of people have told him they have an idea for the building, but nobody has offered the money.

Duncan Campbell asked if he has talked to Senator Mark Stoops. **Vic Kelson** stated he did speak to him one time about the building and Mark told him he had an idea and hasn't heard from him since. **Duncan Campbell** also asked if an environmental review has been done yet. **Vic Kelson** stated they are trying to focus on the building clean up first and then focus on the ground. **Duncan Campbell** stated he has been involved in many projects where environmental reviews and cleanups have taken place while a building has been cleaned and restored. At this time, he does not believe the building will be available for rehabilitation.

Sam DeSollar asked if there were funds or a process in place for the monument to do a RFQ. **Vic Kelson** stated it is not in the 2019 budget, but he is sure the board would be happy to support that. They should be able to use what they currently have from an expansion replacement fund.

Derek Richey commented the City of Bloomington is going to definitely hear about the demolition of this building because people have a strong love for this town.

Vic Kelson stated he will take all of this feedback from the commission and take it to the board.

B. Dimension Mill Update, i.e. Signage – ESD Brian Payne

Brian Payne gave an update on The Mill. He mentioned there is a font change on the signage. He also invited the commission to take a tour of the building.

Duncan Campbell stated this change needs to have a COA application. If there is a change from what the commission approved, it needs to be re-submitted as a COA. He also asked if they had planning approval.

Brian Payne stated they are working on the signage permitting process now. **Duncan Campbell** stated if there

is a glitch in planning, they will have to come back as a COA again, so he recommends completing that process first before turning in a COA application.

Philippa Guthrie asked Jackie Scanlan if she knew of any problems with the proposed sign receiving a permit. **Jackie Scanlan** stated she has been told the sign will go up without a building permit because it is a public sign. **Duncan Campbell** asked for clarification for the definition of a public sign. **Philippa Guthrie** stated a public sign is a City of Bloomington sign.

The commission stated they liked the change, but the application process still needs to be followed.

C. Final SHAARD Resurvey Data Presentation – Steve Wyatt

Steve Wyatt presented his final results of the City of Bloomington Resurvey. This will be added to next meeting's agenda to recommend adopting and send to council.

VIII. OLD BUSINESS

Chris Sturbaum gave an update on the historic sidewalk subcommittee. He mentioned using the old material in a small strip of the sidewalk as a memorial.

IX. COMMISSIONER COMMENTS

NONE

X. PUBLIC COMMENTS

NONE

XI. ANNOUNCEMENTS

NONE

XII. ADJOURNMENT

Meeting was adjourned at 7:15 p.m.