Bloomington Historic Preservation Commission Showers City Hall McCloskey Room, Thursday December 13, 2018, 5:00 P.M. Minutes

I. CALL TO ORDER

Meeting was called to order by Chair, Jeff Goldin, at 5:00pm.

II. ROLL CALL

Commissioners

Flavia Burrell

Sam DeSollar

Jeff Goldin

Deb Hutton

Chris Sturbaum

Doug Bruce

Absent:

Leslie Abshier

Lee Sandweiss

John Saunders

Advisory

Derek Richey

Absent: Duncan Campbell

Staff

Conor Herterich, HAND
Eddie Wright, HAND
Eric Sader, HAND
Doris Sims, HAND
Phillipa Guthrie, Legal
Mary Catherine Carmichael, Office of the Mayor

Guests

Ricardo Sanchez Jim Harvey Sally Harvey Angie Ricketts Asa Palley Jenny Southern Kristi Gaynor Mia Beach

III. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

A. November 8, 2018 Minutes

Sam DeSollar made a motion to approve November 8th, 2018 minutes, **Deb Hutton** seconded.

Motion carried 5-0-1 (Yes-No-Abstain) Doug Bruce abstained.

IV. CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

Staff Review

A. COA 18-85

720 W. 3rd (Greater Prospect Hill)

Petitioner: Chris Sturbaum

Remove rear chimney on the NW corner of the house.

Conor Herterich gave presentation. See packet for details.

Commission Review

A. COA 18-84

1113 E. Wylie (Elm Heights)

Petitioner: Asa Palley

Alter side porch by removing door and adding double hung and awning windows.

Conor Herterich gave presentation. See packet for details.

Discussion ensued

Petitioner **Asa Palley** was present and had nothing to add to the presentation.

Chris Sturbaum asked about cantilevering, it is not just an additional support.

Jenny Southern spoke on behalf of the neighborhood association. The association is undisturbed about the porch as the brick on the home is unaltered. They would like to see something that matches the front of the house.

Sam DeSollar made a motion to approve COA 18-84, Doug Bruce seconded. Motion carried 6-0-0.

B. COA 18-86

222 S. Rogers (Prospect Hill) Petitioner: Matt Murphy

Restoration of exterior siding, trim, and windows.

Chris Sturbaum made a motion to continue to the next meeting as the petitioner was not present, **Doug Bruce** seconded.

Motion carried 6-0-0

C. COA 18-87

923 E. University (Elm Heights)

Petitioner: Sandra Castro

Demolition of one car detached garage and construction of two car detached garage.

Conor Herterich gave presentation. See packet for details.

Discussion ensued

Ricardo Sanchez represented the petitioner who was not present.

Chris Sturbaum questioned representative about design of modifications to the garage. Also offered design changes. **Doug Bruce** asked about reusing existing brick in construction. **Deb Hutton** inquired as to the width of the current garage and expanding the garage in the rear.

Chris Sturbaum stated if they were keeping the present structure they could expand in the rear and to the side while keeping the present door. Doug Bruce stated this is modification to an existing structure reusing the bricks will keep the structure matching the home. Deb Hutton stated she agrees with Doug that they need a site plan. Sam DeSollar stated that he would have a hard time approving demolition if the present structure could be used. There are a number of ways the present structure could be used, and materials should be reused. Derek Richey stated they have seen demolition plans but no renovation plans. Jeff Goldin is not in favor of demolition and if it is demolished the flavor of the property is lost. Conor Herterich clarified that at the last HPC meeting the commission gave the petitioner guidelines on demolition and not renovation.

Jenny Southern spoke on behalf of the neighborhood association, she gave suggestions for renovations to the structure that would be acceptable to the association.

Mary Catherine Carmichael a former owner of the home gave a brief history and discussed the house and the garage and asked that they preserve the garage.

Chris Sturbaum, **Doug Bruce** and **Sam Desollar** sketched an alternate proposal for remodeling and submitted that to the representative for the petitioner.

Chris Sturbaum made a motion to deny and resubmit with a site plan, **Deb Hutton** seconded.

Motion carried 6-0-0

V. DEMOLITION DELAY

Commission Review

A. Demo Delay 18-39

321 N. Lincoln (The Stuart House)

Petitioner: Kristi Gaynor

Full replacement of roof. Replace wood shakes with asphalt shingles.

Conor Herterich gave presentation. See packet for details.

Discussion ensued

Kristi Gaynor stated she would love to hear the Commissions comments.

Deb Hutton asked about grants to replace the wood shakes. **Sam DeSollar** asked if contractors have been contacted to replace the shakes. **Kristi** stated she does not know of any locally and asked for recommendations. The **Commissioners** had none. **Chris Sturbaum** stated that the shakes were not vital to the house. **Doug Bruce** stated that shake could be put back on the house in the future **Sam DeSollar** agreed. **Commissioners** were in agreement that the preservation of the house is what's important.

Sam DeSollar made a motion to waive the Demo Delay waiting period Chris Sturbaum seconded.

Motion carried 6-0-0.

VI. NEW BUSINESS

- A. Courtesy Review: Chris Smith: 501 S. Mitchell Petitioner was not present.
- **B.** HPC Review of the Amended Staff Report and Map of Maple Heights Conservation District

Conor Herterich gave presentation. See packet for details.

Deb Hutton made a motion to reapprove amended map and staff report and send the map to the Common Council, **Sam DeSollar** seconded.

Motion carried 6-0-0

C. Historic Designation of 1175 S. Smith Rd. (Reapprove)

Sam DeSollar made a motion to reapprove and send to the Common Council, **Doug Bruce** seconded.

Motion carried 6-0-0

D. HPC Consulting Grant: Mia Beach- 611 W. 12th

Conor Herterich gave presentation. See packet for details.

Mia Beach further explained her plans for the property.

Discussion ensued

Doug Bruce made a motion to approve the \$400 Commission consulting grant, **Chris Sturbaum** seconded.

Motion carried 6-0-0

VII. OLD BUSINESS

VIII. COMMISSIONER COMMENTS

IX. PUBLIC COMMENTS

BRI is looking for suggestions for their awards program.

X. ANNOUNCEMENTS

XI. ADJOURNMENT

Meeting was adjourned at 6:23 pm.

END OF MINUTES