

**Bloomington Historic Preservation Commission Meeting
Hybrid Meeting**

In person: The McCloskey Room, 401 N Morton ST STE 135 Bloomington IN 47404

Zoom:

<https://bloomington.zoom.us/j/95852185508?pwd=M3J2aDgrdjdXaWh1QUN3eWRKYThKQT09>

Meeting ID: 958 5218 5508 Passcode: 082945

Thursday March 10, 2022, 5:00 P.M.

AGENDA

I. CALL TO ORDER

Meeting was called to order by Chair **John Saunders @ 5:02 p.m.**

II. ROLL CALL

Commissioners Present:

John Saunders
Sam DeSollar
Matthew Seddon
Daniel Schlegel
Allison Chopra

Advisory Members Present:

Duncan Campbell
Ernesto Castaneda
Chris Sturbaum

Staff Present:

Gloria Colom, HAND
John Zody, HAND
Brent Pierce, HAND
Dee Wills, HAND
Mike Arnold, HAND
Daniel Dixon, City Legal Department

Guests Present:

CATS

Joseph Patrick

Christine Bartlett

Ryan Cohen

Natalia Galvan

Noah Rogers

Blaine

Steve Wyatt

Jon Lawrence

John Fiedler

Lisa Freeman

Mike Cordaro

Janice Sorby

Sandi

Rob Council

Karen Duffy

Barre Klapper

Wes Biddle

Dam Dove

John Beirmann

Wayne Poole

Ian & Kathleen Bensberg

III. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

A. FEBRUARY 24, 2022

Matthew Seddon made a motion to approve **February 24, 2022 Minutes**.

Allison Chopra seconded.

Motion Carries: 5 Yes (Schlegel, DeSollar Seddon, Saunders, Chopra), 0 No, 0 Abstain

IV. CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

Staff Approval

A. COA 22-21

621 W 7th St. (NWS Conservation District)

Petitioner: Ian and Kathleen Bensberg

Fence Construction

Gloria Colom gave presentation. See packet for details.

Commission Review

B. COA 22-16

701 S Ballantine Rd. (Elm Heights Historic District)

Petitioner: Jonathan Fiedler

Partial Demolition - Remove chimney

Gloria Colom gave presentation. See packet for details.

Matthew Seddon stated that he would like to know why the **Petitioner** wants to remove the chimney, and also who condemned the chimney. **Jonathan Fiedler** stated that the chimney was inspected by **Ye Old Chimney Sweep** and it was condemned due to structural issues and the prior owners of the house had tried to fix the mortar issues, but they had apparently used bathroom caulk to do so, which caused chemical reactions. Duncan Campbell asked if the chimney flue was used for anything else. **Jonathan Fiedler** stated none of the flues were in use. **Chris Sturbaum** asked if there was a fireplace. **Jonathan Fiedler** stated that there are two fireplaces and the structural issues were found on both of the flues.

Matthew Seddon commented that since it sounds like a semi dangerous chimney, that poses a public threat to the occupants of the house and the public, then if the district is okay with it so was he. **Chris Sturbaum** commented the condition means that it needs repaired. **Chris Sturbaum** commented that he understands that the neighborhood is not concerned, so he is not concerned then.

Allison Chopra made a motion to approve **COA 22-16**.

Matthew Seddon seconded.

Motion Carries: 5 Yes (Schlegel, DeSollar, Seddon, Saunders, Chopra), 0 No, 0 Abstain.

C. COA 22-17

520 S Hawthorne St. (Elm Heights Historic District)

Petitioner: Wes Biddle

Solar Panel installation

Gloria Colom gave presentation. See packet for details.

Wes Biddle stated that they were going to use the nicest black panels, which are the LG line, use black railing and there would be no mechanical that would be seen. Everything would be integrated into the attic and down through the house.

Sam DeSollar asked the **Petitioner** to speak to the overall height of the assembly above the surface of the roof including the racks. **Wes Biddle** Replied that it was about 4 inches. More discussion ensued. See packet for details. **Allison Chopra** asked if the **Historic Preservation Body** of the **Neighborhood** made any remarks. **Gloria Colom** stated that the **Elm Heights Construction Sub-Committee** recommended approval with some recommendations. **Ernesto Castaneda** asked the **Petitioner** if there was preferred location for the panels. **Wes Biddle** replied that south was always preferred. In this case the roof line and amount of energy, south would be first, west would be second, east would be third. **Chris Sturbaum** stated that the computer rendering is what is a little concerning because it has the panels sticking over the edge. More discussion ensued. See panel for details.

Sam DeSollar commented that he was a big proponent of Solar and that he appreciates the **Petitioner** is installing this now before net metering sun sets on June 30th. **Sam DeSollar** commented that he would love to approve this with the caveat that it gets installed such that no panels overhang ridges and contained within the roof on which it sits as well as minimizing the height.

Sam DeSollar made a motion to approve **COA 22-17 with the caveat that the panels be installed with no overhang over the eaves or ridges.**

Daniel Schlegel seconded.

Motion Carries: 5 Yes (Schlegel, DeSollar, Seddon, Saunders, Chopra), 0 No, 0 Abstain.

D. COA 22-18

1000 E Atwater Ave. (Elm Heights Historic District)

Petitioner: John Biermann

Full Window Change

Gloria Colom gave presentation. See packet for details.

Sam DeSollar asked if the **Petitioner** could speak to which windows belonged to which openings because it was difficult for the **Commission** to determine if you are maintaining the operation and size. **John Biermann** replied that the plan was to keep all window openings the same size dimensions and as close to original as possible along with the functionality. **Matthew Seddon** stated that he was looking at the guidelines which states if original windows, doors and hardware can be restored and reused, they should not be replaced. **Matt Seddon** asked the **Petitioner** if he could elaborate on why they could not be restored or reused.

John Biermann stated that they had been restored multiple times and that they are looking for something more durable. The objective is to get something that looks historically accurate but lasts a lot longer. **Allison Chopra** asked about the cost difference between restoration and replacement. **Ernesto Castaneda** asked what type of windows that **Petitioner** would use to replace the current original windows. John Biermann stated that one is a vinyl wrapped wooden window and the other is wood windows. There is about a 5,000 dollar difference between the two. **Ernesto Castaneda** asked the **Petitioner** if he had an assessment of the condition of the windows by a professional. **John Biermann** stated that **Tommy D's** and **Brawley Property Group** both have looked at them and have recommended replacement. **Chris Sturbaum** asked if the windows had muttons between the glass.

Matthew Seddon commented that the original windows can be restored and reused as they have been before and that adding the appropriate storms would cut down on the frequency of repairs, and the district is not in favor of this so, at the moment I am not in favor either. **Daniel Schlegel** commented that he agreed with both recommendations being against it. **Sam DeSollar** commented that he thinks the guidelines for **Elm Heights** is very clear that you need to repair those before you replace them, but that there are a couple of windows on here that the Neighborhood did point out, are not original. **Allison Chopra** commented that she was inclined to approve this because it appears that they Petitioner has multiple times tried to repair these and it is costing them thousands of dollars each year. **Duncan Campbell** commented that the normal standard is to have a window surveyed to document the condition. **Ernesto Castaneda** commented that he agrees with the **Staff** recommendation. **John Saunders** commented that he also agreed with the **Commissioners**, and that he would like to see them restored. **Chris Sturbaum** commented that the windows are approaching 100 years old and they need to be maintained.

Sam DeSollar made a motion to Deny COA 22-18.

Matt Seddon seconded.

Motion Carries: 4 Yes (Schlegel, DeSollar, Seddon, Saunders), 1 No (Chopra), 0 Abstain.

E. COA 22-19

208 E 16th St. (Garden Hill Historic District)

Petitioner: Lisa Freeman

Addition

Gloria Colom gave presentation. See packet for details.

Duncan Campbell asked if there was a second story being added. **Lisa Freeman** stated that there would be a half story dormer. **Chris Sturbaum** asked about the parking.

Sam DeSollar commented that he thought this was a great improvement over the last iteration. **Duncan Campbell** commented that he would support this. **Ernesto Castaneda** also agreed. **Chris Sturbaum** commented that he thought cement siding was a better fit.

Allison Chopra made a motion to approve **COA 22-19**.

Matthew Seddon seconded.

Motion Carries: 5 Yes (Schlegel, DeSollar, Seddon, Saunders, Chopra), 0 No, 0 Abstain.

F. COA 22-20

916 S Morton St. (McDoel Historic District)

Petitioner: Barre Klapper, Springpoint Architects

Addition

Gloria Colom gave presentation. See packet for details.

Duncan Campbell asked how much farther out the porch was being extended. **Barre Klapper** replied 4 feet for about 2/3rds of the width. **Ernesto Castaneda** asked about the height of the garage. **Barre Klapper** replied 5 feet taller than the ridge of the original house. **Chris Sturbaum** asked about the change in the transition material.

Sam DeSollar commented that the Petitioner has done a nice job. **John Saunders** commented that it was a great project. **Ernesto Castaneda** commented that he thought this looked great. **Chris Sturbaum** commented that this was another good example of the interaction of an owner and an architect and the historic designation that brings about a good project.

Sam DeSollar made a motion to approve **COA 22-20**.

Allison Chopra seconded.

Motion Carries: 5 Yes (Schlegel, DeSollar, Seddon, Saunders, Chopra), 0 No, 0 Yes.

V. NEW BUSINESS

VI. OLD BUSINESS

Johnson Creamery Nomination

Public comment opportunity

Gloria Colom gave presentation. See packet for details.

Michael Cordaro updated the **Commissioners** and **Staff** on their progress and what they are proposing for the **Johnson Creamery Smoke Stack**. **Michael Cordaro** had several questions as well for the **Commissioners** and **Staff**. See packet for details. **Daniel Dixon** stated that this was a time for **Public** comment on the question of designation and then the standard question and comment period. **Karen Duffy** stated that as a member of the executive board for the **Near West Side Neighborhood Association**, and have a letter form the executive board which consists of 7 people. **Karen Duffy** stated that she is one of the executives at large so she is reading the letter for **Peter Dorfman** who could not attend. See Packet for details. **Peter Dorfman** stated that he actually did make it to the meeting and wanted to reinforce everything that **Karen Duffy** said. **Peter Dorfman** stated that he has not lived in **Bloomington** as long as some of the members, but that he views the **Smoke Stack** as a true landmark representative of **Bloomington**, and strongly oppose bringing down the height. **Janice Sorby** commented that there are very few industrial buildings left in **Bloomington**, and there is nothing like this building at all, which makes this more precious to most people in **Bloomington**. It is our skyline and what we see. **Janice Sorby** stated that if they cut this down it is going to lose all of its beautiful elegance, and really support the **Neighborhood Associations** view. **Michael Cordaro** commented that he would be happy to sell it to the **City of Bloomington** for one dollar, and please keep it up as a part of the landmark skyline structure. **Rob Council** agreed with what everyone said. **Rob Council** commented that this is a landmark in our city. To have somebody who is not from **Bloomington** come in and chop it off, with no care, is frustrating and it is wrong to take a **Bloomington** Icon and Landmark and chop it off to 60 feet. **Daniel Dixon** stated that tonight, we are really just on the question of whether or not the **Commission** wants to make a recommendation to the **City Council** that this map be approved. We are not deciding anything about the height. **Duncan Campbell** favors the nomination of the building. More discussion ensued. See packet for details. **Ernesto Castaneda** and **Chris Sturbaum** also support the nomination. **Allison Chopra** asked for clarification on what they would be voting on. More discussion ensued about the **Nation Register Designation** and the boundaries.

See packet for details. **Sam DeSollar** commented that the boundaries should be the same. **Joseph Patrick** with **Peerless Development** stated that it was unclear exactly where the boundary line came from. **Gloria Colom** stated that they started by looking at the original boundaries of the **National Register** of historical places, which is the entire lot so that was taken into consideration, but the fact that there is already an approved project for the parking lot and not in having the whole lot in a nomination process would be very complicated. That sort of led to what seems like a very arbitrary division. To clarify most historic sites are districts so here in **Bloomington** we call individual building landmarks a single structure historic district as well, they usually include the entire lot. **Gloria Colom** stated that there is some flexibility in this. More discussion ensued. See packet for details. **John Zody** stated that he wanted to advise from **staff** and the **administration** that we are under some sense of urgency here due to the safety of the Smoke Stack, which is quite unsafe right now. We are trying to get this secured as fast as possible, and I worry quite frankly that if we wait and table this and don't determine a map tonight, some map that can be forwarded on to City Council for designation, I do worry about the public safety to the extent **Staff** can urge the **Commission** to act tonight, to make a recommendation if you choose a recommendation because we are under a gun here on public safety. John Zody commented that he thinks the study and the engineer report in the packet would reinforce that. More discussion ensued. See packet for details.

John Saunders made a motion to move the **Johnson Creamery Nomination** with the attached map.

Matthew Seddon seconded.

Motion Carries: 4 Yes (Schlegel, Seddon, Saunders, Chopra), 0 No, 1 Abstain (DeSollar)

John Saunders made a motion for Interim Protection for the **Johnson Creamery Nomination**.

Motion Carries: 5 Yes (Schlegel, DeSollar, Seddon, Saunders, Chopra), 0 No, 0 Abstain.

10th Street/ Bypass Construction - Hinkle Garton Farmstead

Gloria Colom updated the **Commissioners** about this project. See packet for details.

VII. COMMISSIONER COMMENTS

Chris Sturbaum made some comments. See packet for details.

VIII. PUBLIC COMMENTS ANNOUNCEMENTS

The demolition delay DD 22-09 for the proposed full demolition of 200 E Kirkwood Ave. (Contributing) will be revisited during the HPC Meeting scheduled for March 24, 2022.

IX. ADJOURNMENT

Meeting was adjourned by **John Saunders @ 7:10 p.m.**

END OF MINUTES

Video record of meeting available upon request.