Bloomington Historic Preservation Commission Meeting

In Person: 401 N Morton St., Ste. 135, Bloomington, IN 47404

Zoom: https://bloomington.zoom.us/j/95852185508? pwd=M3J2aDgrdjdXaWh1QUN3eWRKYThKQT09 **Meeting ID:** 958 5218 5508 **Passcode:** 082945

Thursday April 27, 2023, 5:00 P.M.

AGENDA

I. CALL TO ORDER

Meeting was called to order by **Chair John Saunders** @ 5:03 p.m.

II. ROLL CALL

Commissioners Present:

John Saunders (Present)

Sam DeSollar (Present)

Matthew Seddon (Present) (Left meeting @ 7:15 p.m.)

Elizabeth Mitchell (Zoom)

Daniel Schlegel (Present)

Reynard Cross (Present)

Marleen Newman (Present)

Advisory Members Present:

Chris Sturbaum

Staff Present:

Gloria Colom, HAND (Present)

John Zody (Zoom) (Entered meeting @ 5:32 p.m.)

Mike Rouker (Present) City Legal Department

Eric Greulich (Zoom) Senior Zoning Planner (Entered meeting @ 5:50 p.m.)

Guest Present:

CATS

Mary Girard (Zoom)

Jacob Bower-Bir (Zoom)

Jacob Holbrook (Present)

Daniel Weddle (Present)

III. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

A. April 13, 2023

Sam DeSollar made a motion to approve April 13, 2023 Minutes.

Daniel Schlegel seconded.

Motion Carries: 5 Yes (Schlegel, DeSollar, Saunders, Mitchell, Cross), 2 Abstain (Newman, Seddon), 0 No.

Gloria Colom announced that **Allison Chopra** asked for the Proposal to eliminate the **Hybrid** format for **Commissioners** to be removed from the **Agenda**.

IV. CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

Staff Review

A. COA 23-27

814 W 6th St. (Near West Side Historic District)

Petitioner: Elizabeth Barnhart and Alexander Lee Landerman

Replace a metal fence in the back yard with a wood fence that is four feet tall becoming a six foot privacy fence on the alley facing east.

Gloria Colom gave presentation. See packet for details.

Commission Review

B. COA 23-24

1017 W 6th St. (Near West Side Historic District)

Petitioner: Jacob Holbrook

Full Demolition of detached garage.

Gloria Colom gave presentation. See packet for details.

Sam DeSollar asked where the structure report came from. **Jacob Holbrook** stated that **Sherlock Holms** did the Inspection.

Sam DeSollar commented that he was sad to see this garage go, but understands why it needs to. **Chris Sturbaum** commented that once the owner takes this garage down, that he may not be able to put something back in its place.

Matthew Seddon made a motion to **approve COA 23-24.**

Daniel Schlegel seconded.

Motion Carries: 7 Yes (Cross, Mitchell, Saunders, Seddon, DeSollar, Schlegel, Newman), 0 Abstain, 0 No.

C. COA 23-26

908 W Howe St. (Greater Prospect Hill Historic District)

Petitioner: Mary G Girard

Relocate rear window to west side and replace east window with a clerestory, move the back door and put another clerestory, remove small window on rear west side, install solar panels on the east and west facing sides of the roof.

Gloria Colom gave presentation. See packet for details.

Mary Girard stated that she had intended to add on to this home but that it was no longer feasible. **Mary Girard** stated that the kitchen is the main focus. See packet for details.

Sam DeSollar asked about the material of the replacement windows and if they could be painted over. **Chris Sturbaum** stated that a simple division would be more in keeping with the house and also asked about the east window. Reynard Cross about the siding being carefully removed. More discussion ensued. See packet for details. **Sam DeSollar** asked if the solar panels were going to be flush to the slope of the roof.

Chris Sturbaum commented that he did not think this would impact the neighborhood, and was supportive about the windows the **Petitioner** wants to use. **Matthew Seddon** commented that he was having trouble with the illustrations and it was very hard to tell what is going to be changed and what is not. **Sam DeSollar** described what kind of window would work better with the house than the craftsman windows. **Marleen Newman** agreed with Sam **DeSollar** about the windows. **John Saunders** asked if the muttons were going to be removable.

Sam DeSollar made a motion to **approve COA 23-26** with the advocate that if they want to use double-hung windows that this would be okay as well.

Daniel Schlegel seconded.

Motion Carries: 6 Yes (Cross, Mitchell, Saunders, DeSollar Schlegel, Newman), 1 Abstain (Seddon), 0 No.

D. COA 23-28

2521 N Fritz Dr. (Matlock Heights Historic District)

Petitioner: Tucker Jaroll

Removing a three season room and concrete pad. Building a larger room with

heating.

Gloria Colom gave presentation. See packet for detail.

Chris Sturbaum asked if the back wall was all stone. **Sam DeSollar** asked about the peak of the addition and the height. **Tucker Jaroll** stated that they would match at the point and mesh.

Matthew Seddon commented that this was very nice and had no problem. **Chris Sturbaum** supports staff. **Sam DeSollar** commented about the drawings and how clear they were. **Sam DeSollar** commented that he would encourage the **Petitioner** to install some horizontal muttons and explained why. More examples were suggested from the **Commisssioners.** See packet for details.

Matthew Seddon made a motion to **approve COA 23-28.**

Daniel Schlegel seconded.

Motion Carries: 7 Yes (Cross, Mitchell, Saunders, Seddon, DeSollar, Schlegel, Newman), 0 Abstain, 0 No.

E. COA 23-29

917 N Fairview St. (Maple Heights Historic District)

Petitioner: Jacob S. Bower-Bir and Daniel Joseph Weddle

Build an ADU.

Gloria Colom gave presentation. See packet for details.

Gloria Colom stated that there were mixed feelings from the neighborhood about this project.

The **Petitioner** explained the issues he had with getting his building permit. **Daniel Weddle** along with **Jacob Bower-Bir** explained the project in more detail with

illustrations. **Reynard Cross** asked what was on top of the garage and what the space will be used for, and what would be underneath the Tiny House. More discussion ensued between the Commissioners and Petitioners about the design of the Project. See packet for details. Eric Greulich stated that the setbacks and the height do meet the requirements. In the terms of the exterior materials, the **UDO** does accept stucco. More discussion ensued. See packet for details.

Reynard Cross commented that he had an issue with the presentation itself and that it needs a lot of work. **Reynard Cross** commented that he needed to see exactly what they are approving and explained why. **Jacob Bower-Bir** stated that they did not expect a decision from the **Commission** at this meeting. **Matthew Seddon** commented that it was different, but did not think it would be vastly visible from the street, and that it had the spirit of the neighborhood. **Chris Sturbaum** questioned how they would justify this as a compatible structure. More comments from **Commissioners**. See packet for details.

Matthew Seddon made a motion to continue COA 23-29 with more detailed plans to the May 11, 2023 Historic Preservation Meeting.

Daniel Schlegel seconded.

Motion Carries: 6 Yes (Cross, Saunders, Seddon, DeSollar, Schlegel, Newman), 0 Abstain, 0 No.

V. NEW BUSINESS

A. Proposal to create a subcommittee to evaluate new roofing materials on the market and their appropriateness/viability for historic buildings.

The **Commissioners** decided to move this discussion to the next meeting on May 11, 2023.

B. Proposal to eliminate the hybrid format for commissioners but maintain the format for the public.

Discussion ensued about the hybrid format. The **Commissioners** decided to move this discussion to the next meeting on May 11, 2023.

VI. OLD BUSINESS

- VII. COMMISSIONER COMMENTS
- VIII. PUBLIC COMMENTS ANNOUNCEMENTS
 - IX. ADJOURNMENT

Meeting was adjourned by John Saunders @ 7:45 p.m.

END OF MINUTES

Video record of meeting available upon request.