

Bloomington Historic Preservation Commission Meeting

In Person: 401 N Morton St., Ste. 135, Bloomington, IN 47404

Zoom: <https://bloomington.zoom.us/j/95852185508?pwd=M3J2aDgrdjdXaWh1QUN3eWRKYThKQT09>

Meeting ID: 958 5218 5508 **Passcode:** 082945

May 25, 2023, 5:00 P.M.

MINUTES

The City is committed to providing equal access to information. However, despite our efforts, at times, portions of our board and commission packets are not accessible for some individuals. If you encounter difficulties accessing material in this packet, please contact John Zody at the Housing and Neighborhood Development Department at john.zody@bloomington.in.gov or 813-349-3582 and provide your name, contact information, and a link to or description of the document or web page you are having problems with. Auxiliary aids for people with disabilities are available upon request with adequate notice. Please call 812-349-3429 or email, human.rights@bloomington.in.gov.

I. CALL TO ORDER

Meeting was called to order by **Chair John Saunders @ 5:00 p.m.**

II. ROLL CALL

Commissioners Present:

John Saunders (Present)
Matthew Seddon (Present)
Sam DeSollar (Present)
Reynard Cross (Present)
Daniel Schlegel (Present)
Alison Chopra (Present)
Marleen Newman (Zoom)

Advisory Members Present:

Ernesto Castaneda (Present)
Chris Sturbaum (Present)

Staff Present:

Gloria Colom (Present), HAND
John Zody (Zoom), HAND
Dee Wills (Zoom), HAND
Beth Rosenbarger (Present) Assistant Director, City Planning Department
Gabriel Holbrow (Present) City Zoning Planner
Colleen Newbill (Present) City Legal Department

Guests Present:

Jacob Bower-Bir (Present)
Daniel Joseph Weddle (Present)
Justin Meschter (Present)
Richard Lewis (Zoom)
Janelle Curry (Zoom)
Lucy Schaich (Present)
Tom Doak (Present)
Paul Ash (Present)
Elizabeth Cox Ash (Present)
Linda Napier (Present)
Hugh Farrell (Present)

III. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

A. April 27, 2023

Matthew Seddon made a motion to approve **April 27, 2023 Minutes**.

Daniel Schlegel seconded.

Motion Carries: 6 Yes (Newman, Schlegel, DeSollar, Seddon, Saunders, Cross), 0 No, 1 Abstain (Chopra)

IV. NEW BUSINESS

A. "College and Walnut Corridor Study" Presentation by Beth Rosenbarger

Beth Rosenbarger gave presentation. See packet for details.

B. Proposal to create a subcommittee to evaluate new roofing materials on the market and their appropriateness/viability for historic buildings.

Discussion ensued about creating a subcommittee. See packet for details

C. Proposal to eliminate the hybrid format for commissioners but maintain the format for the public

Allison Chopra made a proposal and make a motion to eliminate the **Hybrid** portion format for the meetings. **Allison Chopra** stated that they have had attendance issues that have caused a problem with getting a quorum, and thinks that the **Voting Commissioners** should attend in person.

Discussion ensued. See packet for details.

To Clarify the vote is to eliminate the Hybrid format for **Voting Commissioners**, but not for the **Advisory Board Members, Staff** or the **Public**.

Allison Chopra made a motion to eliminate the **Hybrid Format** for Voting Commissioners. **Daniel Schlegel** seconded.

Motion Carries: 4 yes (Schlegel, Seddon, Chopra, Cross), 3 No (Newman, DeSollar, Saunders), 0 Abstain.

V. CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

Staff Review

A. COA 23-30

909 E University St. (Elm Heights Historic District)

Petitioner: Veronika Baradonner

Removal of five trees.

Gloria Colom gave presentation. See packet for details.

B. COA 23-32

412 W Howe St. (Greater Prospect Hill Historic District)

Petitioner: Kelly Rauch

Build a retaining wall.

Gloria Colom gave presentation. See packet for details.

C. COA 23-33

613 W 4th St. (Greater Prospect Hill Historic District)

Petitioner: Sandra Washburn

Replacing 10 windows.

Gloria Colom gave presentation. See packet for details.

Commission Review

D. COA 23-29

917 N Fairview St. (Maple Heights Historic District)

Petitioner: Jacob S. Bower-Bir and Daniel Joseph Weddle

Build an ADU.

Gloria Colom gave presentation. See packet for details.

Jacob Bower-Bir and **Daniel Joseph Weddle** gave presentation for a new design of the project. See packet for details.

Chris Sturbaum asked how they would justify this with the **Neighborhood Guidelines** and the **Secretary of Interior Guidelines**. **Gloria Colom** explained that the **Guidelines** provide a guide of best practices but every single case is unique and every single building or lot has its own story and you have to weigh the pros and the cons. Take into consideration every single factor. **Ernesto Castaneda** asked the **Petitioners** if they thought the collaboration they have with the **Neighborhood Association** compromised any of their designing intents. The **Petitioner** stated that it was different but that it in some ways works better, and that it is less of a bold statement. **Reynard Cross** stated that one of his main issues is with the proposed finishes and asked about the earthen material. More discussion ensued. See packet for details. **Sam DeSollar** asked to hear what the **Neighborhood** has to say. **Janelle Curry** stated that she has been in the **Neighborhood** for about 3 years and has seen a lot of **Daniel Weddle's** work. **Janelle Curry** thought the project was great and could not wait to see the finished product. **Lucy Schaich** stated that in looking at the designs that they were just given yesterday, that they were different than the ones online. **Lucy Schaich** read aloud their concerns and issues with the design. More discussion ensued with **Neighborhood Residents**. See packet for details. **Sam DeSollar** asked about what kind of materials for the roof, fascia and soffit. **Marlene Newman** commented about the roof appearing to be flat and the height and location of the new building. More discussion ensued. See packet for details.

Chris Sturbaum commented that they need to think about the president that they are setting and sees this as largely incompatible. **Matthew Seddon** commented that he was impressed with the efforts to adjust and make changes on the part of the **Petitioners** and thinks this project is eclectic enough to meet the general overall diversity of the neighborhood. **Ernesto Castaneda** commented that he was really glad to see that the **Petitioners** made the effort to collaborate with the **Neighborhood** and thinks this is a good project. **Daniel Schlegel** commented that he thought this was a unique project and could go either way. **Reynard Cross** made comments about the term "Eclectic" and the definition of, along with his perception of the building and that he still does not see how this fits in the neighborhood. See packet for details. **Sam DeSollar** read from the **Design Guidelines** about accessory dwellings. More discussion ensued. See packet for details.

Matthew Seddon made a motion to approve **COA 23-29**.

Allison Chopra seconded.

Motion Carries: 6 Yes (Newman, Schlegel, DeSollar, Seddon, Saunders, Chopra), 1 No (Reynard Cross), 0 Abstain

E. COA 23-31

1108 S Madison St. (McDoel Historic District)

Petitioner: Linda Napier

Build a Detached Garage.

Gloria Colom gave presentation. See packet for details.

Linda Napier gave details about the project and why she needs to go this direction.

Elizabeth Cox Ash stated that their **Neighborhood** approved this project.

Chris Sturbaum asked what kind of siding was being used. **Allison Chopra** asked if the shed was staying on the property. **Linda Napier** stated that eventually would like to turn this into a four season room. **Allison Chopra** asked more questions about the shed in relation to the new structure.

Matthew Seddon made a motion to **approve COA 23-31**.

Daniel Schlegel seconded.

Motion Carries: 7 Yes (Cross, Chopra, Saunders, Seddon, DeSollar, Schlegel, Newman), 0 No, 0 Abstain.

VI. DEMOLITION DELAY

A. DD 23-03

2201 E Moores Pike (Outstanding)

Petitioner: Kevin Whirter

Partial Demolition.

This **Petition** was retracted from the **Agenda**.

VII. OLD BUSINESS

VIII. COMMISSIONER COMMENTS

IX. PUBLIC COMMENTS ANNOUNCEMENTS

X. ADJOURNMENT

Meeting was adjourned by John Saunders @ 7:15 p.m.

END OF MINUTES

Video record of meeting available upon request.