



**CITY OF
BLOOMINGTON**
HOUSING AND NEIGHBORHOOD DEVELOPMENT

BHPC MEETING PACKET

Thursday April 11, 2024

5:00 p.m. EST

Prepared by HAND Staff

In Person: The McCloskey Room, 401 N Morton St., Ste. 135, Bloomington, IN 47404

Zoom:

<https://bloomington.zoom.us/j/83493457697?pwd=LIH59QaYl2eJFbzrkmItorJGb8b3fH.1>

[Meeting ID: 834 9345 7697](#)

[Passcode: 700464](#)

One tap mobile

+13052241968,,83493457697# US

+13092053325,,83493457697# US

Dial by your location

- +1 312 626 6799 US (Chicago)
- +1 929 205 6099 US (New York)
- +1 301 715 8592 US (Washington DC)

- +1 253 215 8782 US (Tacoma)
- +1 346 248 7799 US (Houston)
- +1 669 900 6833 US (San Jose)

Table of Contents

AGENDA	4
March 28 Minutes	5
COA 24-08.....	11
DD 24-11.....	15
DD 24-12	17

Accessibility Statement

The City is committed to providing equal access to information. However, despite our efforts, at times, portions of our board and commission packets are not accessible for some individuals.

If you encounter difficulties accessing material in this packet, please contact Anna Killion-Hanson at the Housing and Neighborhood Development Department at anna.killionhanson@bloomington.in.gov or 813-349-3582 and provide your name, contact information, and a link to or description of the document or web page you are having problems with.

Auxiliary aids for people with disabilities are available upon request with adequate notice. Please call 812-349-3429 or email, human.rights@bloomington.in.gov.

Bloomington Historic Preservation Commission Meeting

Hybrid Meeting

In person: McCloskey Room, 401 N Morton ST STE 135, Bloomington IN 47404

Zoom: <https://bloomington.zoom.us/j/83493457697?pwd=LIH59QaYI2eJFbzrkmItoRjG8b3fH.1>

Meeting ID: 834 9345 7697 **Passcode:** 700464

AGENDA

- I. **CALL TO ORDER**
- II. **ROLL CALL**
- III. **APPROVAL OF MINUTES**
 - A. March 28, 2024
- IV. **CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS**
 - Commission Review**
 - A. **COA 24-08**

510 S Hawthorne Dr (Elm Heights HD)
Petitioner: Stephanie Biehn
Roofing replacement.
- V. **DEMOLITION DELAY**
 - A. **DD 24-11**

526 N Lincoln St (Contributing)
Petitioner: Justin Sullivan
Full Demolition
 - B. **DD 24-12**

1504 W 17th Street (Contributing outbuilding)
Petitioner: Kevin Treacy
Full Demolition
- VI. **NEW BUSINESS**
 - A. **World Courier BUEA presentation**
- VII. **OLD BUSINESS**
 - A. **615 N Lincoln HD vote**
 - B. **605 S Fess Violation Discussion of Compliance with the Bloomington Municipal Code**
- VIII. **COMMISSIONER COMMENTS**
- IX. **PUBLIC COMMENTS ANNOUNCEMENTS**
- X. **ADJOURNMENT**

Next meeting date is April 25, 2024 at 5:00 P.M. and will be held in a hybrid manner, both in person and via Zoom.

Bloomington Historic Preservation Commission

Meeting Hybrid Meeting

McCloskey Room, 401 N Morton ST STE 135, Bloomington IN 47404

MINUTES

I. CALL TO ORDER

Meeting was called to order by Chair **John Saunders @ 5:15 p.m.**

II. ROLL CALL

Commissioners:

John Saunders (Present)
Daniel Schlegel (Present)
Sam DeSollar (Present)
Ashley Johnson (Present)
William Fulk (Present)
Reynard Cross (Virtual)

Advisory Members:

Duncan Campbell (Present)
Karen Duffy (Present)
Jeremy Hackard (Present)

Staff:

Anna Killion-Hanson HAND (Present)
Noah Sandweiss HAND (Present)
Eddie Wright, HAND (Present)
Margie Rice, City Legal (Present)

Guests:

Tim Cover (Present)
Katherine Novotny (Present)
Candi Sipes (Present)
Dana Biddle (Present)
Randy Cassidy (Present)

III. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

A. February 22, 2024

Duncan Campbell asked if the minutes are now being written by AI. **Noah Sandweiss** clarified that there has been a turnover of staff and some tasks have been taken over by other staff members.

Sam DeSollar made a motion to approve the minutes, provided a question from the February 22 meeting is corrected to show that it was asked by **Jeremy Hackard** and not himself. **Ashley Johnson** seconded.
Motion carried 5-0-0 (Yes-No-Abstain)

IV. CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

Staff Review

A. COA 24-05

620 S Ballantine (Elm Heights Historic District)

Petitioner: Eric Kahrs

Fencing.

Noah Sandweiss gave a presentation. See packet for details. Noah clarified that **COA 24-05** was approved conditionally by the Commission pending zoning compliance which has since been resolved.

Commission Review

B. COA 24-06

913 W. 4th Street (Prospect Hill HD)

Petitioner: Sam DeSollar

Rear addition.

Noah Sandweiss gave a presentation. See packet for details.

Sam DeSollar stated that the main façade is untouched keeping the main profile. Just removing the back porch & stoop.

John Saunders asked if the roofing materials would match. **Sam DeSollar** stated that they would match.

Duncan Campbell stated that it's a clean presentation, simple and straightforward. Exactly what we want to see.

Daniel Schlegel made a motion to approve **COA 24-06**, **William Fulk** seconded.

Motion carried 5-0-1 (Yes-No-Abstain) With **Sam DeSollar** abstaining.

C. COA 24-07

200 E Kirkwood

Petitioner: Tim Cover

*Amendment to COA 23-84. Multiple changes including additional story.
Additional window proposed.*

Noah Sandweiss gave a presentation. See packet for details.

Tim Cover stated they are working on creating a boutique hotel, and propose adding two windows to a historic secondary facade to provide more daylight to the lobby and a second floor hotel room. They would remove panels, cut the windows then put the panels back in place. The top panels would remain the same but cut the top panels. All of the windows will be replaced with replica aluminum windows. All the windows will match. The petitioner is open to any changes the Commissioners would like to see.

Jeremy Hackerd asked about damage to the limestone. **Tim Cover** stated that they will gut the grout and salvage the panels to eliminate any damages. The limestone would be cleaned once they are finished.

Duncan Campbell stated the rule to make the windows the same material only applies if historic material is removed. **Karen Duffy** stated that it looks very nice and satisfies the need for balance. **Daniel Schlegel, William Fulk, Jeremy Hackerd & Ashley Johnson** all agree. **Sam DeSollar** stated this is a chance for a historic building to survive.

William Fulk made a motion to approve **COA 24-07, Sam DeSollar** seconded.

Motion carried 6-0-0 (Yes-No-Abstain)

V. DEMOLITION DELAYS

Noah Sandweiss stated that a building permit was not obtained in time for the demo delay to be posted on the property. Therefore **DD 24-11** would be delayed until the next meeting.

A. DD 24-10

2303 S Rockport Rd (Contributing)

Petitioner: Candi Sipes

Full Demolition

Noah Sandweiss gave a presentation. See packet for details.

Ashley Johnson asked if the barn can be seen from behind the car shed. Noah stated that it is not easily visible from the street or from behind the

car shed. **Jeremy Hackerd** asked if this is in a historic district. Noah stated that it is contributing but not located within a district.

Daniel Schlegel stated that these types of buildings keep the character of the town alive.

John Saunders made a motion to approve and waive the demo delay period for DD 24-10, **Ashley Johnson** seconded.

Motion carried 6-0-0 (Yes-No-Abstain)

VI. NEW BUSINESS

A. Rosemary Miller lecture

The Speaker will be **Duncan Campbell** on May 24, 2024 in the City Hall Council Chambers. **Noah Sandweiss** encourages everyone to attend.

B. Photo contest subcommittee

Noah asked for a subcommittee for the contest, and for ideas for the contest. **Jeremy Hackerd** asked about themes. No themes are necessary, but the photos need to be historic. Noah will print out flyers for the contest and will broadcast on social media. They will also advertise in the paper and on the city website. He will also reach out to other departments in the city. **Daniel Schlegel** asked about partner institutions. Prizes will be canvas prints. **Ashley Johnson & Jeremy Hackerd** volunteered for the committee.

VII. OLD BUSINESS

A. 605 S Fess Violation

In 2018 the building was listed as a local district. In 2020 a notice of violation was sent to the owner due the roof being removed and replaced without ever obtaining a COA. Several notices have been sent but no action has taken place. **Noah Sandweiss & Margie Rice** recently had a conversation with the owner's legal counsel and sent them an email describing the timeline of the violation and the Commission's expectation for compliance with the Bloomington Municipal Code.

Margie Rice stated that she reached out to the owner attorney and he thought this had been dropped. The owner had considered selling the building because restoration was seen as cost prohibitive. Legal asked about replacing the clay tiles. They asked the owner to come to the April 11th meeting to address the commissioners. Owner asked about grant opportunities. Legal stated they want to work with property owners so the money is spent on the building and not fines. The owner had wanted to get

something on the roof right away to stop the leaks when applying for the initial COA. Historic Rehabilitation Tax Credits and affordable housing credits had been discussed as potential financing options. The owner stated that to put the clay back up it would be 50 to 75k. Legal just wants to get the building into compliance. **Duncan Campbell** stated they would have to ask for a COA no matter what they want to do. **Sam DeSollar** noted a previous similar issue. But he stated the commission would have a problem with a fine to the max, even taking the building. Margie suggested they invite the owner to a meeting to give a report. **Anna Hanson** gave an update on Gloria Colom's unsuccessful efforts to contact the owners. **William Fulk** stated that the time for discussion has passed and something needs to be done. John Saunders suggested that a substantial fine needs to be established and 120 days given to pay the fine. **Sam DeSollar** wants to be clear that even though a fine may be imposed, the owners still need to fix the roof. Anna reminded the commissioners that they need to be concerned about degradation of the building. **John Saunders** clarified that the HPC approved the rubber roof to prevent any damages to the building. **Reynard Cross** appreciates the work the commission has done, but it's been 6 years and that's above and beyond. They need to be honest about the process. There have been no changes in 6 years and nothing has been done. There need to be consequences for the owner's failure to comply. Margie told the owners attorney there would be no action today. She asked to allow the Owner & Attorney to come before the board before setting a fine. **Ashley Johnson** stated she would be more comfortable hearing from the owner before deciding anything. **Sam DeSollar** stated that having the petitioner come forward to give an explanation is the best way to go, and they should have a good reason for not complying. **Reynard Cross** stated that the commission is almost begging the petitioners to comply and they don't until a fine is involved. Margie wants to move forward, but she wants to do it right, in case she has to go before a judge. **Daniel Schlegel** stated if they come before the commission that it's made clear there will be a substantial fine. **John Saunders** agrees, but they need to remind the petitioner that the outside of the building is under Commission purview. **Noah Sandweiss** stated they need to establish consistency, and he appreciates the opinions of the Commissioners. He would like to add the building to the next agenda. Margie stated that the petitioners would likely show up for the next meeting.

VIII. COMMISSIONER COMMENTS

John Saunders would like to invite the city council to an HPC meeting to see how the commission operates. As there are some misconceptions about the HPC. **Margie Rice** suggested a work session for the Cascades

nomination. **Duncan Campbell** stated that there is no reason to write any guidelines if there is no designation. He feels like the previous city council meeting really hurt the HPC image. Duncan urged the commissioners to attend the meetings. He stated that the HPC has an image problem. **Margie Rice** will suggest a work session next week.

IX. PUBLIC COMMENTS AND ANNOUNCEMENTS

Randy Cassidy spoke about Lower Cascades Park and asked if they would get another chance at designating Cascade. **John Saunders** stated that they have to wait a bit for trying to designate again. Randy stated that cleaning up and preserving the park should be a priority.

X. ADJOURNMENT

John Saunders adjourned the meeting @ 6:55

Video record of meeting available upon request.

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS	Address: 510 S Hawthorne Dr (Elm Heights HD)
COA 24-08	Petitioner: Stephanie Biehn
Application Date: 2/27/2024	Parcel: 53-08-04-102-042.000-009
RATING: Notable	Survey: Colonial Revival c. 1920



Background: Built in 1926, the colonial revival home at 510 S Hawthorne is a Notable property in the Elm Heights Neighborhood. The house is described as unaltered in the 2015 IHSSI survey, but the faded roof material was misidentified as asphalt shingle. Prior to its purchase by the current owners, the house was a long-time residence of dentist Hollis Sears and physical therapist Carol Sears.

Request: “The roof on our home needs to be replaced. The current roofing is French style interlocking concrete tile. This type of tile material is rarely used today and is difficult to find. We are proposing to replace the roof with interlocking clay tile in the French style. We are also proposing to return the roof to its original color of a muted green color—it is currently so worn, that most of the color coating has been worn off to the concrete interior material. We are not making any changes to the roof line or structure.”

Written Description of all Proposed Materials to be Used:

- Ludowici Interlocking Clay tiles in the French style
- Copper Nails
- Hot temp ice and water shield underlayment
- 24 Gauge (16oz) Copper flashing

Guidelines for Roofs:

I. A change in the appearance, either shape or materials, of a roof or roof feature, including guttering.

- Replace only the deteriorated portion of a historic roof and use substitute materials only if using the original material is not technically feasible. If full replacement is necessary, replace it “in kind,” matching the original in materials, scale, detail, pattern, and design.

Staff Recommendation: Staff recommends approval of COA 24-08. The original roofing tile is 98 years old, well past the life expectancy for concrete tile roofs. Individual tiles appear to have been replaced in the past with interlocking French ceramic tiles. While the applicant has searched for concrete tiles that can replace the roof in kind, their declining popularity has made it difficult to find replacements that match the original in color and design. The new material proposed closely matches the original color and form of the existing tiles, and are a historic material that can be found on the roofs of contemporaneous buildings in the district. Ceramic tiles are somewhat lighter than concrete, and should not compromise the substructure of the roof.

Between 3 to 5 photographs of historic site and/or structure before changes.

Front of residence and rear of garage and residence.



Hints of original tile color.

FRENCH INTERLOCKING TILE



Introduced in the 1890s, Ludowici's French low profile interlocking tile is a favorite of discriminating architects and one of the most sculptured and dimensional products in our product offering. Large and durable, French terra cotta tile has deep locks on all four sides, plus two prominent flutes on the surface for both a dramatic aesthetic and superior drainage. When applied to a roof, these flutes produce a shadow effect for a highly refined, distinctive appearance.

PHYSICAL CHARACTERISTICS

CHARACTERISTIC	FRENCH INTERLOCKING TILE	PROFILE
Weight Per Square	1025 lbs.	
Pieces Per Square	133 pcs.	
Overall Size	9" x 16 1/2"	
Exposure	8 1/4" x 15 1/4"	
Minimum Slope	3:12	
Color Blends	Available in more standard and custom colors.* For more information about Ludowici's color program, please see the Color of Custom brochure.	
Base Textures	Smooth Also available in custom textures.* Please see the Terra Cotta Systems brochure for more information.	

APPROVALS & CERTIFICATIONS

- Miami-Dade NOA No. 12-090436
- State of Florida Approval No. FL 13777
- ASTM C1167 Grade 1 Roof Tile With Water Absorption Less Than 2%
- Class A Fire Rated
- IAPMO UES ER-452

LUDOWICI WARRANTY

All Ludowici tiles are manufactured in the United States and carry a 75-year warranty against color fading and manufacturing defects. For complete warranty details, please visit www.ludowici.com



GREEN ATTRIBUTES

Ludowici terra cotta is an energy-efficient, sustainable choice for your new roof. Learn more about our green story in the Ludowici Green Promise brochure.



Proposed replacement tile



Found original tile

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS	Address: 526 N Lincoln St
DD 24-11	Petitioner: Justin Sullivan
Start Date: 4/1/2024	Parcel: 013-39540-00
RATING: Contributing	Survey: Contributing in local survey



Background: Built 1930, this American foursquare is rated as a contributing building in the Bloomington Historic Sites and Structures Survey but does not appear, however, in the state survey. The five bedroom rental property was substantially renovated in 1999 including the installation of replacement windows and doors. Some of the house’s historic character-defining materials remain, including an ashlar limestone porch and foundation. This building is a relatively late example of the style, which is common in some parts of Bloomington, like the Brian Park neighborhood, and was popular in the 1890s-1930s. The 300-500 blocks of N. Lincoln were built out in the late 1800s with small houses, some of which still stand.

Request: Full demolition

Guidelines: According to the demolition delay ordinance, BHPC has 90 days to review the demolition permit application from the time it is forwarded to the Commission for review.

Staff Recommendation: Staff Recommends release of DD. 526 N Lincoln St is not located in a historic district and represents a building type that is not currently endangered. Although the house is not listed in the IHSSI, staff believes that this was an oversight as the house clearly retains most of its historic character-defining features.

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS	Address: 1504 W 17th Street (Contributing outbuilding)
DD 24-12	Petitioner: Kevin Treacy
Start Date: 4/2/2024	Parcel: 53-05-29-300-014.000-005
RATING: Contributing	Survey: Traverse frame barn c. 1910



Background: The barn at 1504 W 17th St is one of three contributing structures on the lot, and is likely contemporaneous with the utility shed and house, built in 1930. It is referenced in the Indiana Historic Sites and Structures Inventory, but appears to be neglected by the county property report which references the utility shed closer to the road, and a 1960s car shed added to the house. The barn is heavily deteriorated and though elements may be salvageable, the structure can most likely not be saved.

Request: Full demolition

Guidelines: According to the demolition delay ordinance, BHPC has 90 days to review the demolition permit application from the time it is forwarded to the Commission for review.

Staff Recommendation: Staff Recommends release of DD 24-12.

