

BLOOMINGTON HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

Showers City Hall

McCloskey Room

Thursday, June 8, 2017

5:00 P.M.

Minutes

I. CALL TO ORDER

Meeting was called to order by Chairman, John Saunders, at 5:00pm.

II. ROLL CALL

Commissioners

Lee Sandweiss

Jeannine Butler

Jeff Goldin

Leslie Abshier – arrived at 5:05 pm

Flavia Burrell – arrived at 5:04 pm

Kelsey Maas

John Saunders

Chris Sturbaum

Advisory

Duncan Campbell

Derek Richey

Marjorie Hudgins

Deb Hutton

Staff

Bethany Emenhiser – HAND

Alison Kimmel – HAND

Jaqueline Scanlan – Planning

Anahit Behjou – Legal

Doris Sims – HAND

Mary-Catherine Carmichael – OOTM

Guests

Jessica Messmer

Kayla Maldonado

Nicholas Carder

Jeff Brawley

Derek Hartman
Marilyn Hartman
Doug Horn
Cappy Phillips
Jenny Southern
Jody Wintsch
Homer Hoakle

III. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

A. May 11, 2017

Jeff Goldin made a motion to approve the minutes from May 11, 2017. **Jeannine Butler** seconded. **Motion carried 6/0/0. (Yes/No/Abstain)**

IV. CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

Staff Review

A. COA-17-29

623 S. Woodlawn Ave.: Elm Heights

Petitioner: Leslie and Austen Parrish

Construct a 13'x22' screened-in porch on existing concrete pad in rear north side of house off an addition. Install a privacy fence to begin midway back from front of house and Woodlawn fronting maximum height not to exceed 4'.

Bethany Emehiser gave presentation. See packet for details.

B. COA-17-34

503 W. Dixie St.: McDoel Gardens

Petitioner: Mike Arnold

Removal of a non-original metal awning and decorative supports over front stoop. Installation of an enlarged and more substantial, gable front, porch covering. The concrete stoop will be expanded from 8' to 12' to the eastern edge of the house.

Bethany Emehiser gave presentation. See packet for details.

C. COA-17-35

918 W. 3rd St.: Greater Prospect Hill

Petitioner: Sherry Lifer and Margaret Emmert

Installation of 14 solar panels on south facing roof of garage off the alley.

Bethany Emehiser gave presentation. See packet for details.

D. COA-17-36

344 S. Rogers St.: Prospect Hill

Petitioner: Keith Solberg

Installation of 11 solar panels on south facing roof. Note only a portion of the panels will be visible

Bethany Emehiser gave presentation. See packet for details.

E. COA-17-37

910 E. 2nd St.: Elm Heights

Petitioner: Tim Mueller

Installation of a 6' tall manufactured trellis between house, alley and garage.

Bethany Emehiser gave presentation. See packet for details.

F. COA-17-38

341 S. Buckner St.: Greater Prospect Hill

Petitioner: Cybil Cole

Installation of 4" fiber cement siding in replacement of existing aluminum siding.

Bethany Emehiser gave presentation. See packet for details.

G. COA-17-39

416 E. 4th St.: Greater Restaurant Row

Petitioner: Sib Sheikh

Removal of vinyl siding and rotted original wood siding and replacement with 4" cement board siding.

Commission Review

A. COA-17-40

208 N. Walnut St.: Courthouse Square

Petitioner: Kayla Maldonado

Request to install a 21.5" x 19.5" metal blade sign.

Bethany Emehiser gave presentation. See packet for details.

Jessica Messmer presented to the commission why they want to use a blade sign and displayed blade signs that have historically been used around the square. **Kayla Maldonado** reiterated there have been similar signs in the area in which their business is.

Marjorie Hudgins asked if they had a plan B if this was not approved. **Kayla Maldonado** stated they did not.

Jeannine Butler asked Bethany to clarify where the holes are.

Leslie Abshier asked if the weight of the sign would damage the siding. **Bethany Emehiser** stated Ron Walker with CFC Properties had engineers verify the weight would not cause any damage.

Deb Hutton asked if there were currently any signs in the overlay district like the one being proposed. **Bethany Emehiser** stated there are not any in the historic district, but there is one in the overlay.

Derek Richey asked if there was a certain time period when these signs became significant. **Bethany Emehiser** commented signs were mainly a twentieth century phenomenon. **Derek Richey** asked what deciding factor made the City of Bloomington wants the 1930's feel rather and the 1950's or 1960's. **Bethany Emehiser** stated blade signs were discussed as a historic sign type, but they did not want to recommend a sign type that would contradict city ordinances.

Chris Sturbaum asked if the petitioners thought about moving the sign up to line it up with the top of the door. **Bethany Emehiser** presented pictures of other businesses and where their signs were.

Duncan Campbell asked why the UDO does not want the blade signs. **Jacqueline Scanlan** stated the Planning Courthouse Square Overlay, projecting signs are strictly prohibited. It was a part of the UDO update in 2006. She stated her understanding is they were prohibited to have a cleaner view of the street-scapes. She also stated if HPC were to approve this, the petitioners would have to be approved by the Board of Zoning Appeals, and by the Board of Public Works.

Chris Sturbaum asked if a recommendation from the HPC would help during the Board of Zoning Appeals meeting. **Jacqueline Scanlan** stated recommendations are always welcomed.

Lee Sandweiss asked what material the sign would be made of. **Kayla Maldonado** stated the sign would be steel with a copper metallic coating.

Marjorie Hudgins asked if sandwich boards were allowed in this area. **Jacqueline Scanlan** stated they are allowed.

Jeannine Butler commented she would raise the sign compared to where they are proposing it be. She understood if you raised it any higher, the tree may block the sign.

Jeff Goldin stated he thinks the sign is tasteful and fits well with the building.

Leslie Abshier commented she likes the sign. She stated a large awning with a sign above would hide the building more than any sign like this. She commented this is one of the first things the board is seeing for this district. It is a small, tasteful sign. It would send a good message for the commission to support something like this, as long as it seems appropriate, rather than putting up fights with this district, we should be working with the community and trying to support them in any way possible.

Deb Hutton commented she liked the sign.

Kelsey Maas stated she is in support of the sign.

Flavia Burrell commented she agrees with **Jeff Goldin**, stating the sign goes well with the building. She would not want to see a large sign covering the limestone.

Derek Richey stated he is in favor of the sign, he thinks the petitioners are going to have some difficulties ahead while facing the other boards, but he would vote in favor of this sign.

Duncan Campbell stated if you look at storefronts across the decades, signage changes a lot. It is a lot to ask for the signage to not impact the historic character of the building. The tenants change, the buildings change, and the sign will not be there forever. Buildings' character changes with time, so he saw no problem with this sign.

Chris Sturbaum stated there is a hardship for this property due to the limited visibility because of the tree blocking the property. Also, the UDO rules came before there was a historic district downtown. This business has to go to 3 or 4 meetings that could take months just to have a sign approved. He thinks the sign decisions should be the commission's responsibility now that this district exists. He fully supports the sign.

Jeannine Butler made a motion to approve **COA-17-40**, with the requirement if the current holes do not work when hanging the sign, they need to come back for another approval to the commission. **Jeff Goldin** seconded. **Motion carried 8/0/0 (Yes/No/Abstain)**

Jeannine Butler made a motion the Historic Preservation Commission writes a letter of support to all boards and commissions the petitioners will have to present to in the future. **Chris Sturbaum** seconded. **Motion carried 8/0/0 (Yes/No/Abstain)**

V. DEMOLITION DELAY

Staff Review

NONE

Commission Review

A. Demo Delay 17-10

425 ½ E. 11th St.

Petitioner: Stasny & Horn

Full demolition.

Bethany Emenhiser gave presentation. See packet for details.

Doug Horn presented the current condition and the history of the house to the commission.

Derek Richey asked if any materials in the house are worth saving. **Doug Horn** stated in order to have any work on the house, the house would need to be brought up to code, which would cost too much

Chris Sturbaum asked if any plans were brought regarding what will be there in the future. **Doug Horn** stated nothing was brought. They have no current plans. He stated they purchased the property to protect the surrounding properties they own.

Lee Sandweiss commented she would not want to save a house that is dangerous.

Marjorie Hudins stated it would be better for the neighborhood if they house came down.

Jeannine Butler commented she will follow staff recommendation.

Derek Richey stated he does not want to see these homes come down, but when they are in this state, there is not much you can do about it.

Duncan Campbell stated if the commission is making a decision for full demolition, he would like to see inside pictures of the house if possible.

Chris Sturbaum commented an issue that will come up in the future for the commission is demolition because of the house. The condition is not the history of the house. If this were in a different neighborhood these items would have been fixed. These homes can and should be fixed.

John Saunders stated when the petitioner comes back, he would like to see something fitting for the neighborhood. **Bethany Emehiser** stated since it is demolition delay, it will not come before the board. **Doug Horn** commented he would be happy to bring it to the board for opinions.

Jeff Goldin read demolition delay paper. **Jeannine Butler** seconded. **Motion carried 8/0/0 (Yes/no/abstain)**

VI. NEW BUSINESS

A. 1000-1002 E. Atwater Ave.

Bethany Emehiser gave presentation. See packet for details.

Jeff Brawley presented the past situation of the fence and what he wants to propose to the commission.

Lee Sandweiss asked if the commission would be seeing this again before the fence was built. **Bethany Emehiser** stated yes.

Majorie Hudgins asked what the purpose of the fence is. **Jeff Brawley** replied, the fence is so tenants can have outdoor gatherings.

Deb Hutton asked if the fence would look the same when it was rebuilt.

Duncan Campbell asked if there were any proposed drawings. **Bethany Emehiser** stated there was not.

Chris Sturbaum asked if the fence could be set back by the side deck. **Jeff Brawley** stated they're open to opinions.

Cappy Phillips stated they have lived at their property for 36 years, they are familiar with students living in the neighborhood, but have never had problems with students until this last year. By erecting the fence, it does nothing but provide a party area. There were 250-300 kids at the first tailgate party last year with underage drinking and loud music. Trash from the parties

became an issue, causing a rat problem. She stated they have worked with multiple departments, including the mayor. If the petition comes before the commission she would ask for it to be denied.

Jenny Southern asked why the homes were allowed to be connected when they are two different properties from different eras. The fence proposed is not appropriate for either house. 1000 E Atwater is one of the first homes you see in the Elm Heights neighborhood and has a lot of potential.

Jody Wintsch introduced herself. She spoke of the trash and rats that became a problem last year. The tenants vandalized a fence of hers. If a fence is put up, even if it is set back to where it is allowed, the students will funnel into the public alley behind the properties. Elm Heights is not a place for fraternities, it is a quiet residential neighborhood.

Homer Hoakle stated he lives near the Brawley homes. The noise and the parties are heard sometimes at 3:00-4:00am. He has lived there for about 30 years, pays taxes to live a historic neighborhood, and is opposed to the fence.

Homer Hoakle asked if and when this come to the commission for approval, if the neighborhood will be notified. **Bethany Emenhiser** stated she notifies the neighborhood sub-committee.

Jeff Goldin asked **Jeff Brawley** why he wanted the fence. **Jeff Brawley** stated he agrees with many of the comments regarding the kids being rude to the neighbors, but the incoming students living there have a lot more structure in place than the previous tenants. The students have requested the fence.

Chris Sturbaum asked what the legal occupancy of the homes are. **Jeff Brawley** explained the houses are classified as sleeping rooms and have individual leases. **Duncan Campbell** commented it seems to be some sort of zoning violations.

Marjorie Hudgins asked if the University was aware of the fraternity. **Jeff Brawley** stated he is not aware if they know or not.

Anahit Behjou stated the purview of the commission is to comment about the fence.

B. Commission Retreat

Bethany Emenhiser brought up a commission retreat. Dates were considered. A survey of dates and the commission's availability will be taken.

VII. OLD BUSINESS

A. Preservation Month

Bethany Emenhiser reviewed preservation month. She stated the bike tour had about 40 people. The lecture was full as well. She was pleased with the attendance of events. She stated she is

working on a potential Cornelius Obrien lecture August 3rd. Also, the Citizen Jane movie about Jane Jacobs premiered in April. She suggested the film be played at the IU cinema and they will be playing it August 3rd – August 5th. The cemetery tour was cancelled due to weather. It may be rescheduled for October, which is Cemetery Month. The Vinegar Hill walking tour had about 15 people. **Deb Hutton** suggested touring a quarry as well during limestone month.

Duncan Campbell stated he will be giving a tour of the first quarries through Visit Bloomington.

VIII. COMMISSIONERS' COMMENTS

Chris Sturbaum commented Deb, Duncan, and Derek are official advisory members.

IX. PUBLIC COMMENTS

NONE

X. ANNOUNCEMENTS

NONE

XI. ADJOURNMENT

Meeting was adjourned at 6:45pm.