BLOOMINGTON HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
Showers City Hall
McCloskey Room
Thursday September 14, 2017
5:00 P.M.
AGENDA

I. CALL TO ORDER

II. ROLL CALL

III. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

A. August 24, 2017

IV. COURTESY REVIEW

W. 3rd St. and S. Walker St. (SW corner)
Petitioner: Life Designs Bloomington
Construction of new three-story building containing apartments; renovation of existing church building on site to include fitness center, leasing office, community room, and two micro-apartments. Total units: 40. Total beds: 52. Total parking spaces: 41 in on-site lot; 9 on street. Site size: 1.25 acres

V. CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

Commission Review

A. COA 17-63

808 W. 2nd Street: Greater Prospect Hill
Petitioner: Matthew Anderson
Construction of shed in fenced rear yard

B. COA 17-64

818 W. 4th Street: Prospect Hill
Petitioner: Wes Biddle on behalf of owner Jacob Emery
Addition of photovoltaic panels to the roof of a historic home

C. COA 17-65

212 S. Grant St.: Greater Restaurant Row
Petitioner: Annex Bloomington (Craig Pryde)
Phase I of mixed-use project including construction of a new one-story commercial building within the historic district.

D. COA 17-66
325 S. Fairview Street: Greater Prospect Hill
Petitioner: Jeff Goldin
Construction of rear master suite and library addition; new roof and repair or replacement of siding on existing house.

Staff Review
NONE

VI. DEMOLITION DELAY
Commission Review
A. Demo Delay 17-14
702 E. 1st St.: Elm Heights area (not in historic district)
Petitioner: Rusty Peterson Construction, LLC on behalf of owners, Matthew Allen and Eva Sanders
Removal of historic porch roof/canopy over side door to accommodate new screened porch construction

Staff Review
NONE

VII. NEW BUSINESS
Historic tax credit support letter to Congress

VIII. OLD BUSINESS

IX. COMMISSIONERS' COMMENTS

X. PUBLIC COMMENTS

XI. ANNOUNCEMENTS

XII. ADJOURNMENT

BLOOMINGTON HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
Showers City Hall

Auxiliary aids for people with disabilities are available upon request with adequate notice. Please call 812-349-3429 or e-mail human.rights@bloomington.in.gov.

Next meeting date is Thursday September 28, 2017 at 5:00 p.m. in the McCloskey Room
Posted:

McCloskey Room
Thursday, August 24, 2017
5:00 P.M.
AMENDED AGENDA

I. CALL TO ORDER

John Saunders called meeting to order at 5:00pm

II. ROLL CALL

Commissioners
Jeff Goldin
Jeannine Butler
Chris Sturbaum
Kelsey Maas
Lee Sandweiss
Flavia Burrell
Sam DeSollar
John Saunders

Advisory
Deb Hutton

Staff
Eric Sader – HAND
Alison Kimmel – HAND
Philippa Guthrie – Legal
Jaqueline Scanlan – Planning & Transportation

Guests
Marc Cornett
Joseph Anderson
Nicholas Carder
Maria Pazos
Loren Wood
Matt Ellenwood

III. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

A. August 10, 2017
Jeannine Butler made a motion to approve the minutes from August 10, 2017. **Jeff Goldin** seconded. **Motion carried 6/0/2 (Yes/No/Abstain)**

IV. CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

Staff Review
Commission Review

Auxiliary aids for people with disabilities are available upon request with adequate notice. Please call 812-349-3429 or e-mail human.rights@bloomington.in.gov.

Next meeting date is Thursday September 28, 2017 at 5:00 p.m. in the McCloskey Room
Posted: September 11, 2017

A. COA-17-60
508 S. Maple Street: Greater Prospect Hill
Petitioner: Maria Karina Pazos
Extension of kitchen window to return to original opening size. Addition of two aluminum awnings on north façade to match other windows of home. Leveling of driveway with concrete and limestone.

Eric Sader gave presentation. See packet for details.

Maria Pazos mentioned they also wanted to level the driveway and add a retaining wall along the garden.

Jeff Goldin asked what material the replacement window would be. **Maria Pazos** stated it would be wood.

Chris Sturbaum asked if the new retaining wall would be for the garden. **Maria Pazos** stated it is for the garden, so the soil does not spill into the alley.

Sam DeSollar asked if the trim on the new window would match the other windows. **Maria Pazos** stated they would match it as closely as possible.

Sam DeSollar commented the petitioner should not have any problems finding limestone to match the current retaining wall, considering we live in Indiana.

Jeannine Butler made a motion to approve COA-17-60. **Sam DeSollar** seconded. **Motion carried 8-0-0.**

B. COA-17-61
335 S. Euclid: Greater Prospect Hill
Petitioner: Chris Sturbaum
South-side window work. Shortening of kitchen window; 30" x 24" space beneath to be replaced with matching aluminum siding. Bath window to be replaced with vinyl window of same size.

Eric Sader gave presentation. See packet for details.

Chris Sturbaum commented the small one is in the shower and not holding up well. The other window being shortened is in the kitchen so a counter top can run to the wall below it.

Jeff Goldin asked if the material on the kitchen window would be vinyl as well. **Chris Sturbaum** stated yes.

Jeannine Butler commented she does not understand the vinyl material for the kitchen window.
Jeff Goldin commented vinyl is acceptable in the guidelines, but wood is preferred.

Auxiliary aids for people with disabilities are available upon request with adequate notice. Please call 812-349-3429 or e-mail human.rights@bloomington.in.gov.

Next meeting date is Thursday September 28, 2017 at 5:00 p.m. in the McCloskey Room
Posted:

Sam DeSollar asked if Chris would consider fiberglass rather than a vinyl window. **Chris Sturbaum** stated he would.

Chris Sturbaum left the room during commissioner comments.

Jeff Goldin stated he would support a wood window for the kitchen and a fiberglass window for the bathroom window.

Sam DeSollar stated since vinyl is acceptable, he can make a strong recommendation, but cannot force him to do anything that is accepted in the guidelines.

Sam DeSollar made a motion to approve **COA 17-61** with recommendations that the petitioner uses a wood window for the kitchen and fiberglass for the bathroom. **Jeff Goldin** seconded. **Motion carried 7/1/0 (Yes/No/Abstain)**

C. COA-17-62
629 S. Woodlawn Avenue: Elm Heights
Petitioner: Jon C. Thompson
Replacement of all second floor windows with solid wood Pella windows matched to original dimensions and character. Trim will be saved when possible, but replaced to same cedar dimensions and character where necessary.

Eric Sader gave presentation. See packet for details.

Jon Thompson stated they plan on making the house a family home which is the reason for the replacements. It had been a rental for over thirty years and did not have proper maintenance.

Sam DeSollar asked if the small window in the center would be replaced. **Jon Thompson** stated he did not know if it would be replaced or not yet. He has not looked into that specific window. **Sam DeSollar** asked the petitioners if they had picked a specific option of how the windows are manufactured regarding muntin width. **Jon Thompson** stated they had not researched a specific option yet, they want to receive approval of the COA before getting into the specifics.

Lee Sandweiss commented she is excited for the project.

Jeff Goldin made a motion to approve **COA-17-62** with the provision that the windows they replace match as closely as possible. **Lee Sandweiss** seconded. **Motion carried 8/0/0 (Yes/No/Abstain)**

DEMOLITION DELAY
Staff Review
Commission Review

Auxiliary aids for people with disabilities are available upon request with adequate notice. Please call 812-349-3429 or e-mail human.rights@bloomington.in.gov.

Next meeting date is Thursday September 28, 2017 at 5:00 p.m. in the McCloskey Room
Posted: September 11, 2017

NONE

IV. NEW BUSINESS

NONE

V. OLD BUSINESS

COA-17-59 – approved 08/10/2017
1008 S. Rogers review – Marc Cornett

Eric Sader gave presentation. See packet for details.

Marc Cornett explained his rendering of the limestone wall added to the plan.

Deb Hutton asked why have the wall if it is going to be covered by bushes. **Marc Cornett** commented he would imagine it would go towards the landscaping count. **Jaqueline Scanlan** stated landscaping would need to be located within 5 feet of the parking lot so theses bushes would not count towards the landscaping plans.

Chris Sturbaum asked if the wall could be any taller. **Marc Cornett** stated it is drawn at 3 feet. **Jaqueline Scanlan** commented the wall could not be taller than 4 foot for planning.

Marc Cornett asked if the commission would be open to large limestone boulders to replace the wall so it could exceed the 4 foot wall maximum. The commission was open to the idea.

Jeff Goldin commented he liked the boulder idea.

Kelsey Maas agreed. The lines of the buildings would be broken up with the boulders.

Sam DeSollar commented he would be fine if the bushes were gotten rid of. He also stated not to space the rocks too far apart because you will see the building too much. There will be a fine line of too close and too far apart.

VII. COMMISSIONERS' COMMENTS
217 W. 6th Street

Jaqueline Scanlan stated this project is not in a historic district, but directly adjacent to it. The architect is submitting the plans as a courtesy review.

Jeff Goldin asked what the materials are. **Matt Ellenwood** stated limestone, wood finish, and metal paneling.

Auxiliary aids for people with disabilities are available upon request with adequate notice. Please call 812-349-3429 or e-mail human.rights@bloomington.in.gov.

Next meeting date is Thursday September 28, 2017 at 5:00 p.m. in the McCloskey Room
Posted:

Deb Hutton asked what the material on the cab building would be. **Matt Ellenwood** stated it is a metal panel.

Matt Ellenwood stated the bottom floor would be live-work spaces.

Chris Sturbaum asked if the entire building was new construction. **Matt Ellenwood** stated half of the building would be added on and the other half would be built on top of.

Kelsey Maas asked if there is currently space between Janko's and the yellow cab building. **Matt Ellenwood** stated that was already there and windows would not be added.

Sam DeSollar asked what the depth difference is in the metal paneling on the cab building. **Matt Ellenwood** stated it is rendered at about 6 inches. They will need an encroachment approval for the bump out. **Sam DeSollar** asked what the set back is on the 4th floor from the street. **Matt Ellenwood** stated about 16 feet.

Jeff Goldin asked if any variances were going to be needed for this building. **Jaqueline Scanlan** stated they will need waivers, not variances.

Chris Sturbaum stated he likes the massing of the building but is not a fan of the façade of the new construction.

Lee Sandweiss commented she likes all of it. She stated it goes well with the district.

Flavia Burrell agreed with Lee.

Sam DeSollar stated the building is very respectful of the adjacent buildings. He is very excited to see live-work buildings come to Bloomington.

325 S. Fairview – Jeff Goldin

Jeff Goldin proposed plans of an addition to his house to the commission. He stated the original house will not change. There will be a connecting hall with a 1 ½ story addition.

VIII. PUBLIC COMMENTS

NONE

IX. ANNOUNCEMENTS

Historic Preservation retreat, August 25 at 9:00am at the Wylie House.

Indiana Landmarks contract has started.

Auxiliary aids for people with disabilities are available upon request with adequate notice. Please call 812-349-3429 or e-mail human.rights@bloomington.in.gov.

Next meeting date is Thursday September 28, 2017 at 5:00 p.m. in the McCloskey Room
Posted: September 11, 2017

X. ADJOURNMENT

John Saunders adjourned meeting at 6:20 pm.

Auxiliary aids for people with disabilities are available upon request with adequate notice. Please call 812-349-3429 or e-mail human.rights@bloomington.in.gov.

Next meeting date is Thursday September 28, 2017 at 5:00 p.m. in the McCloskey Room

Posted:

SUMMARY

COURTESY REVIEW

W. 3rd St. and S. Walker St. (SW Corner)

Developer: Life Designs Bloomington

Adjacent to Greater Prospect Hill Historic District

Plan: Construction of new three-story building containing apartments; renovation of existing church building on site to include fitness center, leasing office, community room, and two micro-apartments. Total units: 40. Total beds: 52. Total parking spaces: 41 in on-site lot; 9 on street. Site size: 1.25 acres.

Staff Comments: The proposed location of the new building at the west end of the site creates a visual and spatial buffer between the new construction and the Greater Prospect Hill Historic District. Staff would suggest upgrading the exterior materials to a higher-quality masonry and using windows with lights that have a primarily vertical orientation.

Auxiliary aids for people with disabilities are available upon request with adequate notice. Please call 812-349-3429 or e-mail human.rights@bloomington.in.gov.

Next meeting date is Thursday September 28, 2017 at 5:00 p.m. in the McCloskey Room

Posted: September 11, 2017

SUMMARY

COA-17-63

808 W. 2nd Street: Greater Prospect Hill

Petitioner: Matthew Anderson

Contributing 105-055-54244 c. 1920

Background: 105-055-54244 is an early 20th century Craftsman bungalow. It is slightly altered but in good condition. At least some of are replacements, but early asbestos siding remains intact.

Owner began construction without a city building permit or certificate of appropriateness.

Request: Construct an 8'X16' shed in fenced rear yard.

Guidelines: "New structures accessory to primary buildings should be visually compatible with existing historic neighborhood patterns for accessory structures and of material consistent with the historic neighborhood pattern" (21). The guidelines also specify that "New structures should be placed, where possible, in a subordinate position to the primary building on the lot."

Recommendations: Shed was already 80-90% complete upon staff site inspection on September 8, 2017. Owner will be issued a notice of violation. The Commission has the ability to work with legal counsel to ask that the applicant dismantle and remove the illegal structure from the site. Staff recommends issuing a retroactive COA contingent upon owner working with staff to select a shed door that is more compatible with the design of the structure and modify the design that is more compatible with the Craftsman style of the home. This would include selecting a more appropriate door design; upgrading existing siding from T111 to a more appropriate material for the neighborhood; and painting shed exterior to complement the house.

Auxiliary aids for people with disabilities are available upon request with adequate notice. Please call 812-349-3429 or e-mail human.rights@bloomington.in.gov.

Next meeting date is Thursday September 28, 2017 at 5:00 p.m. in the McCloskey Room

Posted:

SUMMARY

COA-17-64

818 W. 4th Street: Greater Prospect Hill
Petitioner: Wesley Biddle on behalf of owner Jacob Emery

Contributing 105-055-54057 c. 1905

Background:

105-055-54057 is an early 20th century pyramid roof cottage. It is slightly altered but in excellent condition. At least some of the windows are replacements.

Request: Installation of seven solar modules on south (front) face of pyramidal roof and five additional solar modules on west face of roof. Each panel is black with dimensions of 64.57" X 39.37" X 1.38." The solar collector model is LG300N1C, belonging to LG's MonoX NeoN series.

Guidelines: In general, "[t]he objective of the Greater Prospect Hill Historic District guidelines is to preserve the overall distinctive character of the Prospect Hill neighborhood by conserving its historic architectural fabric. We seek to maintain the economic diversity, affordability, sustainability and flexibility of the neighborhood as well as make it possible, reasonable and affordable for our neighbors to update or repair their homes." The guidelines state that the BHPC may consider making exceptions to the aesthetic regulations recommended therein in the interest of sustainability (p. 5). Guidelines concerning changes to roofs are brief, stating that alterations to the roof should "[p]rioritize the retention of the roof's original shape as viewed from the public way façade" (25). The solar collectors would not change the original shape of the roof.

Recommendations: Approve, contingent upon revision of the project proposal such that all solar panels will be placed on the west side of the roof and none on the south (street-facing) side of the roof. This change would require a configuration with a lower row of nine panels and an upper row of three panels along the west face of the roof. It is left to the Commission's discretion to approve the proposed number of solar collectors or a smaller number of collectors.

Auxiliary aids for people with disabilities are available upon request with adequate notice. Please call 812-349-3429 or e-mail human.rights@bloomington.in.gov.

Next meeting date is Thursday September 28, 2017 at 5:00 p.m. in the McCloskey Room
Posted: September 11, 2017

SUMMARY

COA-17-65

212 N. Grant Street – Phase 1: Greater Restaurant Row Historic District
Annex of Bloomington, LLC

Contributing 105-055-34668 c. 1925

Background: 105-055-34668 is a slightly altered American Foursquare in good condition. Its windows and outermost layer of siding are not original. The adjacent parcel to the south of the house (now containing a parking lot) is also included within the historic district and intended to be developed as a part of Phase 1.

Request: Keep existing house and develop adjacent parcel to the south of the house with a new single-story commercial structure with a sodded grassy passage between the historic house and the new building. The proposed new building would be clad in brick veneer with aluminum and plate glass storefront windows shaded by steel and glass canopies.

Guidelines: No guidelines are yet in place for the district, so the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties will be applied by default. The Secretary of the Interior recommends: 1) "Locating new construction far enough away from the historic building, when possible, where it will be minimally visible and will not negatively affect the building's character, the site, or setting"; 2) "Designing new construction on a historic site or in a historic setting [such] that it is compatible but differentiated from the historic building or buildings"; and 3) "Ensuring that new construction is secondary to the historic building and does not detract from its significance."

Recommendation: Approve, contingent upon revisions to design based on the following stipulations. 1) Achieve compatibility with the surrounding neighborhood by scaling new construction proposed under Phase I such that it does not overpower the historic structure on the property. Owing to the height of the proposed new structure in relation to the neighboring house, the vertical dimension of the project should be lessened with a reduction in the height of the parapet or floor-to-ceiling height. 2) Change design of the proposed glazing and canopies to make more compatible with the surroundings. The Secretary of the Interior's Standards allow for new construction that is differentiated from the old within historic districts, but they are not intended to sanction the use of lesser-quality materials. The proposed storefront could be elevated to a higher design standard with more traditional fenestration (e.g., slightly recessed shop windows resting on bulkheads and surmounted with transom windows, all trimmed in more refined moldings than currently proposed) or with higher-end modern materials. More traditional awnings would also be a more appropriate complement to the district than the canopies shown in the current design. 3) The new building should

be covered in a type of brick that is compatible in scale and quality with brick used in historic neighborhoods. Utility bricks are not appropriate for new construction in the district, and standard bricks would be most appropriate.

In addition to the above, to mitigate the effects of new construction on the historic character of the district, staff recommend that the Commission request that the developer restore the exterior of the historic house at 212 N. Grant Street per the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.

SUMMARY

COA-17-66

325 S. Fairview Street: Greater Prospect Historic District

Petitioner: Jeff Goldin

Contributing 105-055-54071 c. 1905

Background: 105-055-54071 is a slightly altered vernacular gabled-ell cottage. It is currently sided in insulbrick but retains many of its original features. It is listed as significant under the category of architecture as a contributing resource within a historic district.

Request: Construct a one-and-one-half-story addition in rear yard linked to original house by a breezeway. The addition will include a master suite on the ground level and a library/office on the upper level, totaling approx. 806 square feet. Replace new roof on existing house to match roof on addition. Repair or replace existing wood siding on original house, using fiber cement siding on addition and for any replacements. Addition will include double-hung one-over-one wood windows and wood or fiber cement trim, fascia, and soffit cut to match trim of existing house.

Guidelines: New buildings must "harmonize with the historic fabric that remains." Creativity in design is permitted, provided that new construction is sympathetic (p. 14). The addition is to be treated as a "primary building" per the guidelines (p. 14). Hardboard or concrete board siding should "reflect the general directional and dimensional characteristics found historically in the neighborhood" (p. 16). New construction and additions should be compatible with the historic context of the neighborhood with respect to massing, outline, setback, spacing, height, fenestration, and elevation (pp. 17-20). For the existing house, guidelines call for "retain[ing] siding determined to be original (25)." Horizontal fiber cement siding is listed as an appropriate replacement for wood siding, as long as the original lap is retained and the siding does not imitate wood grain (25).

Auxiliary aids for people with disabilities are available upon request with adequate notice. Please call 812-349-3429 or e-mail human.rights@bloomington.in.gov.

Next meeting date is Thursday September 28, 2017 at 5:00 p.m. in the McCloskey Room

Posted:

Recommendation: Approve, with stipulation that all salvageable original wood siding be retained on historic structure when insulbrick is removed. Commission strongly encourage owner to replace any unsalvageable original wood siding on existing house with wood rather than fiber cement.

Auxiliary aids for people with disabilities are available upon request with adequate notice. Please call 812-349-3429 or e-mail human.rights@bloomington.in.gov.

Next meeting date is Thursday September 28, 2017 at 5:00 p.m. in the McCloskey Room
Posted: September 11, 2017

SUMMARY

Demolition Delay 17-14

702 E. 1st Street
Petitioner: Rusty Peterson Construction, LLC on behalf of owners,
Matthew Allen and Eva Sanders

Contributing 105-055-51369 c. 1920

Background: 105-055-51369 is a slightly altered craftsman bungalow in good condition. It retains many of its original features, including historic windows, brick, and stucco.

Request: Remove historic porch roof over its east side entrance to accommodate the construction of a new screened porch over existing deck. The proposed project would qualify as a partial demolition.

Guidelines: According to the demolition delay ordinance, BHPC has 90 days to review the demolition permit application from the time it is forwarded to the Commission for review. Commission staff received the application on September 6, 2017. The BHPC may thus employ a demolition delay for 90 days from that date, and may request an additional 30 days if necessary for further investigation. During the demolition delay period, the BHPC must decide whether to apply Local Historic Designation to the property.

Recommendations: The property is an intact example of a gable-dormer craftsman bungalow. Although it does not appear to merit Local Historic Designation as an individual site, it would certainly warrant Local Historic Designation as a contributing property within a local historic district or conservation district. Plans currently on file for the project in question are lacking in detail and clarity. Staff recommends that the BHPC request more developed plans for the project before rendering a decision concerning the partial demolition permit, owing to the significance of the bracketed porch roof feature on the east side of the house.

Auxiliary aids for people with disabilities are available upon request with adequate notice. Please call 812-349-3429 or e-mail human.rights@bloomington.in.gov.

Next meeting date is Thursday September 28, 2017 at 5:00 p.m. in the McCloskey Room

Posted:

Attachment for Agenda Item VII.: Historic tax credit support letter to Congress

Please review organizational sign-on letter concerning the Federal Historic Tax Credit at the following link:

http://my.preservationnation.org/site/PageNavigator/HTC_SignOn.html

Auxiliary aids for people with disabilities are available upon request with adequate notice. Please call 812-349-3429 or e-mail human.rights@bloomington.in.gov.

Next meeting date is Thursday September 28, 2017 at 5:00 p.m. in the McCloskey Room
Posted: September 11, 2017