Bloomington Historic Preservation Commission
Showers City Hall
McCloskey Room
Thursday November 9, 2017
5:00 PM
MINUTES

I. CALL TO ORDER

Meeting was called to order at 5:03 pm.

II. ROLL CALL

Commissioners
Leslie Abshier
Flavia Burrell
Jeannine Butler
Jeff Goldin
John Saunders

Advisory
Duncan Campbell
Deb Hutton

Staff
Rachel Ellenson
Alison Kimmel
Barbara McKinney
Anahit Behjou
Doris Sims
Adam Wason
Brian Payne

Guests
Alex Jarvis
Steve Wyatt
Nicholas Carder
Jason Banach
Leighla Taylor
Marc Cornett
Matt Ellenwood

III. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

A. October 26, 2017

Jeff Goldin made a motion to approve the minutes. **Jeannine Butler** seconded. **Motion carried 5-0.**

IV. CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

Staff Review

A. COA 17-82
350 S. Madison Street: Greater Prospect Hill
Rachel Ellenson gave presentation. See packet for details.

Petitioner: Brian O'Quinn
Replacement of failing roof shingles with charcoal/gray imperial rib metal roof.

B. COA 17-85
101 W. Kirkwood Avenue: Courthouse Square
Petitioner: Everywhere Signs
Installation of a 1" thick stud mounted PVC sign above storefront.

Rachel Ellenson gave presentation. See packet for details.

Commission Review

A. COA 17-77 (Continued from October 26, 2017)
209 S. Dunn Street: Restaurant Row
Petitioner: City of Bloomington Pubic Works
Removal of pioneer sidewalk by Bloomington Restorations, Inc. (BRI) and relocation to BRI's Hinkle-Garton Farmstead.

Rachel Ellenson gave presentation. See packet for details.

Jeannine Butler asked for clarification that BRI will keep the sidewalks original integrity. **Rachel Ellenson** stated it will be in the same pattern, but curved.

Deb Hutton asked to confirm that the sidewalk would not cover the entire length of the walkway needed. **Steve Wyatt** explained there would be other pavers finishing the length of the sidewalk near the house.

Leslie Abshier asked what the reasoning for continuance was. **Jeff Goldin** stated there was no guarantee the sidewalk would be kept together, but used in various places.

Duncan Campbell asked the Legal Department if other options were looked at regarding ADA alternatives. **Barbara McKinney** stated ADA requires public surfaces be accessible, which includes sidewalks. With a historic structure, if you can make a surface ADA compliant without altering the historic significance of a structure then one should do so. If there is no way to make a surface ADA compliant without altering the historic significance of the site, one should do what they can to make it accessible as possible. An example would be to place a sidewalk next to the pioneer sidewalk, but

it would still need to meet a minimal level of access. **Adam Wason** clarified there was not enough width to make an ADA accessible sidewalk. **Barbara McKinney** stated there were two examples given by a commissioner. One would require a tree to be taken down and a water meter to be moved, but it would then meet the minimal width required by the ADA. **Adam Wason** stated they looked into that option as well, but due to the street tree, water meter and parking meter, those items would not allow them to put a sidewalk there. **Duncan Campbell** asked if it was because they didn't want to move them. **Adam Wason** stated yes.

Leslie Abshier asked who the owner of the property was. **Adam Wason** stated the sidewalk is City of Bloomington property, but the maintenance of sidewalks are the responsibility of the adjacent property owner, who is Indiana University.

Leslie Campbell stated the sidewalk is no longer historic once it is moved.

Duncan Campbell stated his frustration with the city. The same group of people who designated the sidewalk when ADA was in effect, now wants to destroy the sidewalk because it isn't ADA compliant.

Jeannine Butler asked if the commission turned down the COA. Does the commission have any way of forcing the city to create a new sidewalk adjacent to the historic sidewalk. **Anahit Behjou** stated she would have to look into that.

Deb Hutton asked who would be responsible for putting in a new sidewalk. **Adam Wason** stated Indiana University would be responsible for that.

Adam Wason stated his guess would be the commission does not have the authority to force the City to put in a sidewalk.

Jeannine Butler made a motion to approve **COA-17-77. Flavia Burrell** seconded. **Motion did not carry 2-3-0. (Yes/No/Abstain)**

B. COA 17-83
208 N. Walnut Street: Courthouse Square
Petitioner: Leighla Taylor, on behalf of Ethos Student Housing Community
Installation of one, 11 sq. foot blade sign onto the side of one white pillar near the entry door.

Rachel Ellenson gave presentation. See packet for details.

Jeannine Butler asked where the sign would be mounted. **Leighla Taylor** stated in the mortar.

Jeff Goldin made a motion to approve **COA-17-83. Leslie Abshier** seconded. **Motion carried 5-0.**

C. COA 17-84
410 S. Rogers Street: Greater Prospect Hill

Petitioner: Alex Jarvis
Installation of 12 solar collectors to the South roof face.

Rachel Ellenson gave presentation. See packet for details.

John Saunders asked if the neighborhood was supportive. **Jeff Goldin** stated they were.

Jeff Goldin made a motion to approve **COA-17-84. Leslie Abshier** seconded. **Motion carried 5-0.**

V. DEMOLITION DELAY

NONE

VI. NEW BUSINESS

Showers Brothers Furniture Factory Kiln Renovation – Design Discussion

Brian Payne gave presentation. He wanted the opinions of and feedback from the commission for how to make a strong COA presentation. He stated the five factors for reason of demolition, and he stated they believe three are valid.

Jeannine Butler asked what materials would be recycled. **Brian Payne** stated the brick and possibly timbers.

Flavia Burrell asked if there has been any other considerations for uses of the Kiln building. **Brian Payne** stated there has been some consideration from the city, but demolishing the Kiln is the most economic answer.

Jeff Goldin stated Brian made a compelling economic argument.

Duncan Campbell stated ESD needs to read Economics of Historic Preservation. He stated most things that Brian have argued for why the Kiln should be demolished are easily argued and contradictive reasons to keep the Kiln. The commission just turned down the request to tear out a sidewalk. The likelihood of the commission approving this COA is low.

Leslie Abshier stated the comment about historical *or* architectural significance is not significant, because it does have historical significance. The argument the building cannot be put to any reasonable economically beneficial use is highly debatable. **Duncan Campbell** stated the City of Bloomington would have to claim hardship. **Leslie Abshier** stated her opinion is to focus on the criterion stating the demolition is necessary to allow development.

VII. COURTESY REVIEW

A. 121 E Kirkwood Avenue
Bynum Fanyo & Associates, Inc.

Jeff Goldin stated he was disturbed by the context of the building.

Jeannine Butler stated it looks too large for its location.

Leslie Abshier commented the windows don't go with the rest of the surrounding buildings. The materials do not blend with the area.

Duncan Campbell stated it is hard to give a contextual comment, when the adjacent buildings are blacked out and not shown in the drawings.

B. 408 E. 6th Street
Bynum Fanyo & Associates, Inc.

Jeannine Butler asked how many stories above ground the building is. **Matt Ellenwood** stated it is 4 stories.
Flavia Burrell commented it is too tall for the area.

Leslie Abshier commented she was opposed to the new Bloomington Bagel building, so to use the argument, the Bloomington Bagel building is already there as well, is not a good one. It does not belong there, and it is clear that it is not compatible with the neighborhood.

Overall, the commissioners thought it was a good looking building, but did not belong where they are proposing to build it.

VIII. OLD BUSINESS

A. COA 17-67 – extended an offer to the petitioner to come back to the Commission, no response.

   Rachel Ellenson stated there was no response from the owner. COA stands.

B. Batman House Historic Designation – Chris

   Chris Sturbaum was not in attendance to give the commission an update.

Duncan Campbell asked what the status of the vacancy was for the commission.

IX. COMMISSIONER' COMMENTS

NONE

X. PUBLIC COMMENTS

Marc Cornett wanted the commission's comments regarding 223 N. Morton. The commission was in full support of the project.

XI. ANNOUNCEMENTS

Reminder of meeting schedule – only two more meetings for 2017 (November 9 and December 14), so any tabled petitions will be automatically approved after 30 days if they are not voted on at the meeting.

John Saunders stated his term ends in January, and he would like for the commission to think about they would like to have as Vice Chair. Jeff Goldin has been recommended previously for Chair. This vote will happen in January.

XII. ADJOURNMENT

Meeting was adjourned at 7:10pm.