

**-Bloomington Historic Preservation Commission
Showers City Hall
McCloskey Room
Thursday December 14, 2017
5:00 PM
MINUTES**

I. CALL TO ORDER

Meeting was called to order at 5:00pm by Chairman, John Saunders.

II. ROLL CALL

Commissioners

Leslie Abshier – arrived at 5:15 pm.
Flavia Burrell
Jeannine Butler
Sam DeSollar
Jeff Goldin
Lee Sandweiss
John Saunders

Advisory

Duncan Campbell
Derek Richey – arrived at 5:05 pm.
Deb Hutton

Staff

Alison Kimmel
Philippa Guthrie
Jacqueline Scanlan
Rachel Ellenson
Doris Sims

Guests

Nicholas Carder
Sib Sheikh
Brian Chelius
David Rhodes
Matt Ellenwood
Daniel Oh
Deborah Myerson
Susan Dyer
David Howard
Linda Williamson

III. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

A. **Jeannine Butler** made a motion to approve November 9, 2017 minutes. **Jeff Goldin** seconded. **Motion carried 5/0/1** (Yes/No/Abstain).

IV. CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

Staff Review

A. COA 17-89

401 N. Morton Street: Showers Brothers Furniture Factory Complex

Petitioner: City of Bloomington

Installation of a brick colored conduit line on the south face of the City Hall Showers building.

Rachel Ellenson gave presentation. See packet for details.

B. COA 17-90

525 W. 3rd Street: Prospect Hill

Petitioner: Chris Sturbaum, on behalf of Patrick and Glenda Murray

Reconstruction of brick step surrounds and installation of 5 new limestone steps.

Rachel Ellenson gave presentation. See packet for details.

Commission Review

A. COA 17-86

2321 N. Fritz Drive: Matlock Heights

Petitioner: David Rhodes

Removal and replacement of aluminum windows with Insignia windows.

Rachel Ellenson gave presentation. See packet for details.

Leslie Abshier asked if the current windows would be replaced with the same size windows. **Rachel Ellenson** stated they would be the same size.

Jeannine Butler stated she liked the idea of the picture window.

Duncan Campbell stated he did not like the idea of replacing original fabric with vinyl windows.

Jeff Goldin made a motion to approve **COA 17-86**. **Jeannine Butler** seconded. Motion carried 7/0/0.

B. COA 17-87

416 E. 4th Street: Restaurant Row

Petitioner: Sib Sheikh

Retroactive request for approval to install trellising over the uncovered portion of the patio facing 4th Street.

Rachel Ellenson gave presentation. See packet for details.

Derek Richey asked if there were final plans for it. **Sib Sheikh** stated it is done, other than some greenery that is going to be added.

Deb Hutton asked if the deck was allowed to be on top of the sidewalk. **Sib Sheikh** stated they received Board of Public Works approval for it.

Sam DeSollar asked if the work was done with a building permit. **Sib Sheikh** stated it was. **Sam DeSollar** asked how it was attached. **Sib Sheikh** stated he was not positive, but it was approved by the building department inspectors.

Leslie Abshier asked if the covered porch was original. **Rachel Ellenson** stated it was not.

Jeff Goldin asked why this was not brought to the commission's attention if the petitioner received a building permit. **Sib Sheikh** stated it was added by his contractor. The covered porch received approval from the commission about a year ago.

Deb Hutton stated she feels the trellis hides the house.

Duncan Campbell asked if the commission would have approved this the first time around. The retroactive requests are frustrating for this reason.

Leslie Abshier stated she agrees with Duncan and Deb. She understood the functionality of it, but it is challenging when looking at it from a historic view.

Jeannine Butler made a motion to approve COA-17-87. **Jeff Goldin** seconded. **Motion carried 6/1/0 (Yes/No/Abstain)**

C. COA 17-88

202 E. 6th Street: Monroe Carnegie Library

Petitioner: Monroe County Historical Society

In-kind replacement of asphalt shingle roof of building addition. Installation of solar panels on new roof of the addition.

Rachel Ellenson gave presentation. See packet for details.

Derek Richey asked when the addition to the building was completed. **Linda Williamson** stated 1997.

Sam DeSollar asked what the height of the panels would be above the roof. **Rachel Ellenson** stated 2-3 inches.

Jeff Goldin made a motion to approve **COA 17-88**. **Lee Sandweiss** seconded. Motion carried 7/0/0.

V. DEMOLITION DELAY

A. Demo Delay 17-19

608 N. Dunn Street
Petitioner: Matt Ellenwood
Full demolition

Rachel Ellenson gave presentation. See packet for details.

David Howard stated the foundation is not stable, the walls constantly move and the limestone is deteriorating.

Jeff Goldin asked if the future plans fit into the city's development plan and would be affected by the proposed changes. **Matt Ellenwood** stated this property does not fall within the area of the proposed changes.

Deb Hutton asked if there are any other historic materials in the house other than the limestone. **David Howard** stated the house has been constantly remodeled due to necessary upkeep related to it being a student rental.

Jeff Goldin asked if there was going to be commercial on the first floor. **Matt Ellenwood** stated yes. The zoning is for mixed-use.

Derek Richey commented this house is one of the last remaining houses that shows this neighborhood was once a working-class neighborhood. He recommends not approving the demolition.

Jeff Goldin stated he has been in this house many times and it is not in good condition. He will support this demolition. The commission needs to pick their battles.

Jeannine Butler stated the plan for post-demolition was the ugliest building she has ever seen.

Sam DeSollar stated he agrees with Jeff Goldin.

Duncan Campbell stated the only choice the commission has is to designate it as a single designation or let it go. He doesn't like the plans for the property but he doesn't believe the house would stand for designation.

Jeff Goldin moved to release **Demolition Delay 17-19**. **Jeannine Butler** seconded. Motion carried 7/0/0.

B. Demo Delay 17-20

403 E. 20th Street
Petitioner: Matt Ellenwood

Full demolition

Rachel Ellenson gave presentation. See packet for details.

Jeff Goldin asked if the petitioner considered moving the house and donating. **David Howard** stated the materials would be donated to restore. He did not think it was worth moving.

Steve Wyatt stated this house is very movable, but the process takes about 6 months for finding a site, approvals and moving.

Jeff Goldin stated there is going to be a push for student housing in this area, so he would agree with the release of the permit.

Jeff Goldin released **Demolition Delay 17-19**. **Leslie Abshier** seconded. Motion carried 7/0/0.

C. Demo Delay 17-21

1901 S. Rogers Street

Petitioner: Deborah Myerson, on behalf of South Central Indiana Housing Opportunities

Full demolition

Derek Richey asked if the zoning changed on this property. **Deborah Myerson** stated it changed from residential to multi-family.

Duncan Campbell asked what the cross-street was. **Rachel Ellenson** stated Rogers and Rockport.

Derek Richey stated the house has been sitting vacant for quite some time. He is excited to see affordable housing go in, not student apartments.

Jeannine Butler stated if this was not intended for low-incoming housing, she would put up more of a fight to keep this house.

Sam DeSollar commented he liked how the petitioner put together her presentation and included the contributing structures in the neighborhood.

Leslie Abshier stated the house is not notable enough to individually designate. She asked the petitioner if materials could be saved. **Deborah Myerson** stated since limestone is so abundant in the area, there is not a high chance, but possibly the windows and doors could be saved.

Jeff Goldin moved to release **Demolition Delay 17-20**. **Sam DeSollar** seconded. Motion carried 7/0/0.

VI. NEW BUSINESS

VII. COURTESY REVIEW

VIII. OLD BUSINESS

A. Trojan Horse Exploratory Work Update – Dan Oh, OEI, Inc.

Dan Oh gave presentation on 103-111 S. Walnut Street and 100 E. Kirkwood Avenue. **Dave Walker** stated the aluminum siding that has been covering the original siding has been doing a good job at preserving the original materials underneath it.

Jeff Goldin asked how long the replacement windows have been there. **Dave Walker** stated he moved to Bloomington in 1980 and the windows were present when he arrived.

Dan Oh stated they are going to come back with a modern, sustainable material that would fit the era of this building.

B. SHAARD Resurvey Update – Steve Wyatt

Steve Wyatt gave the commission an update of the SHAARD resurvey. This completes two-thirds of the entire survey. It was also stated that he did not think he would meet the February deadline. **Philippa Guthrie** asked if they had a new deadline to propose. **Steve Wyatt** said they thought maybe spring. **Philippa Guthrie** stated she would look at the contract to see when the deadline for completion was.

IX. COMMISSIONER COMMENTS

Philippa Guthrie stated the city has withdrawn its proposal of demolishing the Kiln.

X. PUBLIC COMMENTS

XI. ANNOUNCEMENTS

A. Commission elections - John

John Saunders stated Jeff would consider being Chair and Leslie would consider being Vice Chair.

Duncan Campbell asked whether there wasn't supposed to be a nominating committee that proposes a slate.

Philippa Guthrie stated she would look up the rules for nomination. She then did so during the meeting and reported that there is no requirement of a nominating committee, although the Commission could create one if it wanted to. The Commission agreed that the nominations are going to happen the first meeting in January.

B. Batman House update.

Rachel Ellenson stated the work has been completed. She is going to see the owner tomorrow to have her sign paperwork.

XII. ADJOURNEMENT

Meeting was adjourned at 6:50 p.m.