Bloomington Historic Preservation Commission Showers City Hall McCloskey Room Thursday March 22, 2018 5:00 P.M. MINUTES

I. CALL TO ORDER

Chairman Jeff Goldin called meeting to order at 5:00pm.

II. ROLL CALL

Commissioners

Flavia Burrell – arrived at 5:04pm Sam DeSollar Jeff Goldin Lee Sandweiss John Saunders Chris Sturbaum

Advisory

Duncan Campbell Deb Hutton Derek Richey

Staff

Daniel Bixler Rachel Ellenson Philippa Guthrie Eric Sader Jackie Scanlan

Guests

Alan Balkema Brian Chelin Margaret Contompasis Jane Goodman Dawn Gray Robert Harman Cindy Kallet Michael Kee Grey Larsen David Markay **Roberta** Pergher Hannah Rea Charles Reafsnyder Mark Roseman Jim Rosenbarger Lucy Schaich

Jenny Southern Chad Vencel Thomas Westgard Linda Williams Ted Wininger Loren Wood Steve Wyatt Jordan Yanke

III. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

A. March 08, 2018

Sam DeSollar made a motion to approve minutes. John Saunders seconded. Motion carried 5/0/0 (Yes/No/Abstain).

IV. CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

Staff Review

A. COA 18-15
400 N. Walnut Street: The Elks Lodge 446 LHD
Petitioner: Bloomington Elks Lodge #446
Replacement of broken window pane on the second floor with 1" thick insulated annealed glass pane to match existing windows non-original window panes.

Rachel Ellenson gave presentation. See packet for details.

Commission Review

A. COA 18-16917 W. Howe Street: Greater Prospect HillPetitioner: Grey Larsen and Cindy KalletDemolition of an existing shed on the rear of the property and construction of a new shed with the same dimensions and design.

Petitioner arriving late. Hold discussion.

B. COA 18-17

512 S. Hawthorne Drive: Elm Heights

Petitioner: Barre Klapper, on behalf of Mark Roseman and Roberta Pergher Replacement of existing screened porch on the rear of house with a new 2-car garage with storage bay and a new screened porch, deck and green roof above Replacement of the existing metal garage door in the original garage opening with a set of 3 patio doors.

Rachel Ellenson gave presentation. See packet for details.

Barre Klapper, representing the petitioner, anticipates an upgrade to hard surface for the shared drive (per Planning). Brick used will be complimentary to original bricks on the house.

Deb Hutton asked about an unused, unimproved alley to the back of property.

Derek Richey asked about neighborhood input.

Sam DeSollar had questions concerning the square footage of the lot. He also asked about the materials and designs for the north elevation.

Duncan Campbell asked Rachel about a staff comment on size. **Rachel Ellenson's** comment expressed an aesthetic alternative, not Department of Interior standards.

Jeff Goldin inquired if the two car garage was a deal-breaker for the owners. **Mark Roseman** said the 2 car garage was very important.

Chris Sturbaum encouraged the owners use heavy lattice and planter material for the side to mitigate the garage size. Also recommended gravel and working with neighbors. He would support the second garage.

Sam DeSollar asked for caveats that (1) the brick be brought in for staff approval, (2) if Planning determines the need for a railing, it is brought back for staff approval, and (3) a setback be included where there is only a line between the old and the new.

Duncan Campbell said it's a real improvement over what was there.

Jeff Goldin supports the setback caveat suggested.

Jenny Southern, Elm Heights Neighborhood, concerns about materials matching, coverage for mechanicals, and setback.

Sam DeSollar made a motion to approve **COA-18-17** with the caveat that brick choice is approved by staff and the south wall of addition be recessed to the north by 8" from drawing as shown. **Chris Sturbaum** seconded. **Motion carried 6/0/0.**

A. COA 18-16 (resumed upon arrival of petitioner)
917 W. Howe Street: Greater Prospect Hill
Petitioner: Grey Larsen and Cindy Kallet
Demolition of an existing shed on the rear of the property and construction of a new shed with the same dimensions and design.

Rachel Ellenson gave presentation. See packet for details.

Cindy Kallet, petitioner, considering transom window on the non-alley side. Considering a metal roof which would require coming back for approval. Presently structure is 4' from alley, should go for 6'.

Jackie Scanlon said they may need to have survey for structure to be moved. Must be rebuilt as is, anything else requires a variance.

Duncan Campbell asked about chimney and use. He also asked about how the structure is supported.

Cindy Kallet stated the chimney was for a stove that is no longer there. Structure is on piers, sills. **Duncan Campbell** said this could present problems.

Sam DeSollar explained the process to get a variance if you rebuild it. However, to keep it in place would not require a variance. More research is suggested.

Jeff Goldin clarified that more research will be conducted if motion is tabled.

Chris Sturbaum made a motion to table COA-18-16 to the next meeting. John Saunders seconded. Motion carried 6/0/0.

V. DEMOLITION DELAY

Commission Review A. Demo Delay 18-05 711 North Lincoln Street Petitioner: Chad Vencel Partial demolition – installation of two top-hinged roof windows in the existing roof surface.

Rachel Ellenson gave presentation. See packet for details.

Sam DeSollar made a motion to release the permit for 711 N. Lincoln Street, Demo Delay 18-05. Chris Sturbaum seconded. Motion carried 6/0/0.

B. Demo Delay 18-06

711 West 9th Street Petitioner: Charles Reafsnyder Full demolition.

Rachel Ellenson gave presentation. See packet for details.

Charles Reafsnyder, petitioner, wants to enlarge house by 200' and the basement 350' for his sons to live in the basement. Christine Matheu will be the architect.

Chris Sturbaum asked if the petitioner asked the architect about adding on to the back. **John Saunders** asked about expanding the upstairs.

Charles Reafsnyder expressed the view that he and his wife would age into the property. This would also allow them to walk out to garage. Neighbors have expressed some opposition.

Sam DeSollar said that the petitioner does not seem to have been too involved with the architect as of yet. Sam said that Christine Matheu is a very good architect. He encouraged the petitioner to work with her to see what options she could come up for achieving his goals

for expansion without destroying the historic feel and look of the property. The petitioner agreed that he could do that.

Chris Sturbaum made the case that this property is amazingly intact and to alter it would destroy the historic fabric of the neighborhood. He would not support release of the permit. He suggested the 90 day delay period should be invoked.

Derek Richey provided some of the historical detail for the property.

Sam DeSollar added that there are unexplored options being eliminated by full demolition.

Duncan Campbell noted that this is part of a National Historic District.

Alan Balkema, Near West Side Neighborhood Association, said the Association intends to initiate process for designation of neighborhood and requests the Commission respect the full delay period.

Margaret Contompasis, likes plan of not wanting a second floor. Notes he can't move garage door over.

Lucy Schaich, reading Karen Duffy's statement, asked that the Commission uphold the delay period.

Robert Harman supported the view to invoke the delay.

Chris Sturbaum, reading Sandi Clothier's statement, made the case for the historic significance of the property and the neighborhood.

Chris Sturbaum made a motion to institute the 90 day delay for 711 W. 9th Street, Demo Delay 18-06. John Saunders seconded. Motion carried 6/0/0.

C. Demo Delay 18-07

506 South High Street Petitioner: Jim Rosenbarger Partial demolition – rear 1-storey addition.

Rachel Ellenson gave presentation. See packet for details.

Jim Rosenbarger stated that the owners would have no objection to designation in the future. However, they would appreciate input for the design. The plans would be for future development. Voluntary review requested.

Duncan Campbell complimented the attention to Secretary of Interior standards.

Chris Sturbaum agreed that this could be released and followed for designation on another track.

Lee Sandweiss stated this house deserves to be protected.

Sam DeSollar expressed that he was happy it was being kept up. Caveat that tile be stockpiled for repairs. Asked that he return to talk about railing and other details. **Jeff Goldin** also supports releasing property and designation.

Chris Sturbaum made motion to release the permit for 506 S. High Street, Demo Delay 18-07. John Saunders seconded. Motion carried 6/0/0.

Chris Sturbaum made the point that they could gather information and bring it to the next meeting concerning designation.

D. Demo Delay 18-08 605 South Fess Street Petitioner: Jim Miller Partial demolition – replacement of flat roof with a pitched roof.

Rachel Ellenson gave presentation. See packet for details.

Chris Sturbaum, John Saunders, Deb Hutton, Derek Richey, Lee Sandweiss, Sam DeSollar, Flavia Burrell and Jeff Goldin stated that they support designation.

John Saunders made a motion to prepare a formal report and put the property of the HPC agenda to be officially considered for local designation for 605 S. Fess Street, Demo Delay 18-08. Lee Sandweiss seconded. Motion carried 6/0/0.

E. Demo Delay 18-09 717 North Maple Street Petitioner: Michael Kee Full demolition.

Rachel Ellenson gave presentation. See packet for details.

Michael Kee stated the house has been abandoned for decades.

Derek Richey noted that BRI has made overtures to purchase the property.

Steve Wyatt, BRI, said they still had an interest in the house, but the owner never gave any definitive answers to inquiries.

Jane Goodman, Maple Heights Neighborhood Association, has expressed interest in saving this house. The Association is interested in creating a Blair House Historic District, which would include this structure.

Lucy Schaich, neighbor, reiterated the view that this property has value. She made an impassioned call for saving this property.

Sam DeSollar reminded the neighbors that the move to designation needed to come from the community.

Duncan Campbell stated this is a clear example of demolition by neglect. He would support an individual designation for the property if the neighborhood could not summon the support for a district. **Flavia Burrell** concurred.

John Saunders made a motion to institute the 90 day delay and begin research on the property for designation for 717 North Maple Street, Demo Delay 18-09. Chris Sturbaum seconded. Motion carried 6/0/0.

VI. NEW BUSINESS

Rachel Ellenson updated work on Preservation Month. IU historian will conduct walking tour of IU buildings. The County is interested in partnering on this. **Jordan Yanke**, intern with the County, was present. Photo-contest is in the Atrium throughout May. Display case of 200 years of Bloomington architecture. We need a guest for the Rosemary Miller lecture. Henry Glassie has been suggested. Duncan Campbell volunteered to help from the County, Lee Sandweiss will represent the BHPC.

VII. COURTESY REVIEW

NONE

VIII. OLD BUSINESS

NONE

IX. COMMISSIONER COMMENTS

NONE

X. PUBLIC COMMENTS

NONE

XI. ANNOUNCEMENTS

NONE

XII. ADJOURNMENT

Meeting was adjourned at 7:48pm.