

BLOOMINGTON HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

Showers City Hall

McCloskey Room

Thursday, February 9, 2017 5:00 P.M.

MINUTES

I. CALL TO ORDER

Meeting was called to order at 5:14 pm by Chairman, John Saunders.

II. ROLL CALL

COMMISSIONERS

John Saunders
Deb Hutton
Lee Sandweiss
Jeff Goldin
Chris Sturbaum

ADVISORY

Derek Richey
Duncan Campbell
Leslie Abshier

STAFF

Alison Kimmel – HAND
Bethany Emenhiser – HAND
Doris Sims – HAND
Philippa Guthrie – Legal
Jacqueline Bauer – ESD
Alex Crowley – ESD, left at 6:00PM

GUESTS

Lynn Coyne – BEDC
Paul Puzzello – Puzzello LLC
Doug Bruce – Tabor/Bruce
Danielle Thireaut – Blackline Studio
Coley Gillespie – LWB
Loren Wood – LWB
Craig McCormick – The Mill
Nicholas Carder – Stansy & Horn

III. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

A. January 26, 2017

Jeff Goldin made a motion to approve the January 26, 2017 minutes. **Deb Hutton** seconded. **Motion carried 5/0/0 (Yes/No/Abstain)**

IV. CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

Staff Review

Commission Review

A. COA-17-05

912 S. Madison St.: McDoel Gardens

Petitioner: Loren Wood Builders

Request to remove current aluminum siding and install 4” cement board siding. Request to replace all windows with Pella Proline double-hung simulated divided-light horizontal two over two.

Bethany Emenhiser gave presentation. See packet for details.

Loren Wood introduced himself. He stated he was planning on doing these changes on behalf of himself, not a client. He requested that all windows be approved to be replaced and not a partial approval. He is trying to increase the value and make the home more energy efficient. He stated he would agree to match the siding and wants to keep the roof detail caps. The door towards the alley makes it hard to layout the interior and they are doing their best to return it back to its original state and make it functional at the same time.

Jeff Goldin asked if the windows were moving because the floor plan is changing. **Loren Wood** commented it was. The current layout is not functional.

Chris Sturbaum asked **Bethany Emenhiser** if she thought the siding was original. **Bethany Emenhiser** stated she thought it was due to the layout of the house in relation to the shape of the parcel.

Lee Sandweiss asked what street the main entrance would be on. **Bethany Emenhiser** commented it would be on Madison.

Leslie Abshier asked what the neighborhood comments were. **Bethany Emenhiser** stated the neighborhood was in full support.

Derek Richey asked **Bethany Emenhiser** if she thought the side door was original. **Bethany Emenhiser** stated the opening is original, but probably not the door.

Jeff Goldin commented the proposals would improve the home.

Deb Hutton commented she agreed with keeping the barge details.

Leslie Abshier commented she is in support of the changes, the neighborhood is in support of the changes, but the neighborhood guideline contradict what they are approving. The neighborhood should take a look at their guidelines and see if they need to re-word the guidelines.

Derek Richey commented he agrees with Leslie, but the house looks as if not much of what is left is original.

Duncan Campbell commented historic houses should be redesigned from the outside to the inside. The interior may not be functional, but when dealing with a historic home, the preservation of the exterior trumps the layout functionality.

Loren Wood questioned if the commission wants it left in the homes original state, do you leave it in the state it has been remodeled or do you return attempt to return it to the original. **Duncan Campbell** commented that is a questions and situation the commission deals with and is going to deal with quite often.

Jeff Goldin made a motion to approve **COA-17-05** with the porch railing being a vertical, more appropriate design. **Chris Sturbaum** seconded. **Motion carried 5/0/0 (Yes/No/Abstain)**

B. COA-17-06

204 S. Rogers St.: McDoel Gardens

Petitioner: Paul Puzzello

Request to construct a 13' x 48' steel addition to the south side and to replace non-original overhead garage doors with aluminum and glass doors. There is also a request to install signage, a painted steel awning, painted steel fence, and new metal door and transom along 4th St.

Bethany Emehiser gave presentation. See packet for details.

Paul Puzzello commented the framed light box is for announcing events. The uplights can be replaced with downlights. The addition would not be set back, but it would reveal the current building so it would be like a setback. The material would be less than 20% of the primary material. The project is a contemporary art gallery and they feel it will fit well in the area.

Bethany Emehiser commented the neighborhood is in full support.

Leslie Abshier asked if the addition was open or enclosed. **Bethany Emehiser** stated it would be partially enclosed bathrooms and partially open.

Duncan Campbell stated the metal vent window being replaced with a door is concerning. He suggested setting back the brick where a garage door would be taken out to acknowledge it is not original.

Jeff Goldin asked if the garage door openings were original. **Bethany Emehiser** commented there were three bays, but those are not the original openings.

Chris Sturbaum stated he was concerned with the LED screen. **Paul Puzzello** corrected him and stated it is not a LED screen, it is a light box, similar to what you'd find at a movie theater.

Lee Sandweiss commented she is in favor of the project and looks forwarding to seeing it completed.

Leslie Abshier commented she agrees with Duncan about keeping the window because of its significance.

Chris Sturbaum made a motion to approve **COA-17-06**. **Jeff Goldin** seconded. **Motion carried 5/0/0 (Yes/No/Abstain)**

C. COA-17-07

401 N. Morton St. (Plant #1): Showers Brothers Furniture Factory Historic District
Petitioner: City of Bloomington
Request to install a solar system on City Hall.

Bethany Emehiser gave presentation. See packet for details.

Jacqueline Bauer gave power point presentation. The presentation included the cost breakdowns, energy analysis, and compared other historic buildings with solar panels and modern technologies.

Chris Sturbaum asked where you would have to stand to be able to see the solar panels. **Duncan Campbell** commented a person would have to be on 7th street.

Deb Hutton commented a solar panel that is visible on one of the parking lot awnings would be great for learning opportunities.
The commissioners all commented they are in full support of the project.

Jeff Goldin made a motion to approve **COA-17-07** with inclusion of southern tooth. **Chris Sturbaum** seconded. **Motion carried 5/0/0 (Yes/No/Abstain)**

D. COA-17-08

335 W. 11th St. (The Mill): Showers Brothers Furniture Factory Historic District
Petitioner: Craig McCormick (Blackline Studio)
Request to install new skylight glazing system, tuck point and repair masonry, install new lighting, install aluminum clad wood windows, new storefront glazing and storefront entrance doors, a new balcony and entrance additions utilizing heavy timber and steel railings.

Bethany Emehiser gave presentation. See packet for details.

Craig McCormick gave visual presentation of the project. The building is going to serve partially as an event space and also as office areas. Two options were given for the deck structure; steel or wood. He stated they are looking at two options for the skylights in the building taking thermal value and cost into consideration. The two options are glass or a polycarbonate system.

Chris Sturbaum asked **Bethany Emehiser** to review her recommendation of the sky light windows. **Bethany Emehiser** stated she recommended option 2, the glass system.

Deb Hutton asked if the Showers building was originally 18 inches and switched to the 36 inch opening or did the building have original 36 inch window openings for the sky lights. **Bethany Emehiser** commented they were originally 18 inch openings. **Deb Hutton** asked if the fencing to hide the mechanical systems was necessary. **Craig McCormick** stated options are still open for this plan. They are trying to take advantage of the only flat spot on the roof, so the system does not have to be in the alley.

Jeff Goldin asked if the system could be shown without a fence. **Craig McCormick** commented they could extend the saw tooth and create a block from the mechanical systems.

Leslie Abshier commented she does not like the fence on the roof, but she likes the system on the roof rather than on the ground in the alley.

Derek Richey asked if the rendition of the landscaping was accurate. **Craig McCormick** commented it is the design of what would actually be planted.

Duncan Campbell asked if they considered not screening the utility systems. He compared it to the Johnson Creamery chiller on top of their roof. **Craig McCormick** stated they had not, but they would be open to the idea. He stated they would propose multiple options and come back to the commission. **Duncan Campbell** asked for clarification on the windows. **Craig McCormick** stated the windows would be wood and not aluminum. **Duncan Campbell** stated the maintenance on the wood windows was much easier than aluminum.

Jeff Goldin stated he was very pleased with the proposal.

Chris Sturbaum stated he was in favor of the steel decking rather than the wood.

Lee Sandweiss commented she liked the steel structure as well.

Leslie Abshier stated she was not sure which skylight opening would be better. The 18” would preserve the building, but the 36” would allow more light.

Derek Richey stated he is in favor of the steel decking.

Duncan Campbell commented he was also in favor of the steel. If they want to include timber, show it on the inside of the building. He stated he could go either way regarding the skylight size options. He stated he is in favor of exposing the mechanicals, taking the noise of the mechanicals into consideration.

John Saunders stated he agrees with all comments of the commissioners.

Chris Sturbaum commented he is in favor of the glass skylights rather than the polycarbonate.

Chris Sturbaum made a motion to approve **COA-17-08** with steel deck structure, clear glass paneling system and returning to approve site for mechanicals. **Jeff Goldin** seconded. **Motion carried 5/0/0 (Yes/No/Abstain)**

V. DEMOLITION DELAY

Staff Review

A. Demo Delay 17-02

1414 S. Lincoln St.: Bryan Park Survey Area

Owner: James Gronquist

Partial demolition.

VI. NEW BUSINESS

Jeff Goldin made a motion to do an encomium for Marlene Newman. **Chris Sturbaum** seconded. **Motion carried 5/0/0 (Yes/No/Abstain)**

Bethany Emenhiser stated that will be read at the Council Meeting on February 22, 2017.

VII. OLD BUSINESS

NONE

VIII. COMMISSIONERS' COMMENTS

Bethany Emenhiser stated she will be meeting with the Presbyterian minister who did a presentation for the Monroe County History Center on the Covenanters Cemetery to be a speaker for Historic Preservation Month.

IX. PUBLIC COMMENTS

NONE

X. ANNOUNCEMENTS

Derek Richey announced the annual BRI event is February 16, 2017 at 7:00pm.

XI. ADJOURNMENT

Meeting was adjourned by Chairman, John Saunders at 7:10 pm.