

BLOOMINGTON HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

Showers City Hall

McCloskey Room

Thursday, April 13, 2017

5:00 P.M.

MINUTES

I. CALL TO ORDER

Meeting was called to order by Chairman, John Saunders at 5:02 pm.

II. ROLL CALL

COMMISSIONERS

Leslie Abshier

Flavia Burrell

Sam DeSollar

Jeff Goldin

Kelsey Maas

Lee Sandweiss

John Saunders

Chris Sturbaum

ADVISORY

Marjorie Hudgins

STAFF

Alison Kimmel- HAND

Bethany Emenhiser - HAND

Philippa Guthrie – LEGAL

GUESTS

Norma Jain Jacobson

Al Jacobson

Robert Friedman

Joy Skidmore

Brian Chelius

Chelsea Blanchard

Andy Bayer
Deb Hutton
Abe Schultz
Nicholas Carder
Mary Krupinski

III. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

A. March 9, 2017

Jeff Goldin made a motion to approve the March 9, 2017 minutes. **Lee Sandweiss** seconded. **Motion carried 7/0/1 (Yes/No/Abstain)**

IV. CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

Staff Review

A. COA-17-14

609 W. Dodds St.: McDoel Gardens
Petitioner: Esteban Jose Garcia Ortiz
Construction of a porch off the rear of the house.

Bethany Emehiser gave presentation. See packet for details.

B. COA-17-15

208 S. Dunn St.: Greater Restaurant Row
Petitioner: Ross Glass
Installation of two wall signs and one blade sign.

Bethany Emehiser gave presentation. See packet for details.

C. COA-17-16

1001 E. University St.: Elm Heights
Petitioner: Herb Marks and Perry Hodges
Installation of 30 flush mounted solar panels on a rear addition.

Bethany Emehiser gave presentation. See packet for details.

D. COA-17-18

1120 E. 1st St.: Elm Heights

Petitioner: Charlotte Agger and Asa Palley
Removal of a non-original wooden front accessible ramp.

Bethany Emehiser gave presentation. See packet for details.

E. COA-17-20

1302 E. 2nd St.: Elm Heights

Petitioner: Alisan Donway

Removal of Evergreen trees along Highland Ave. and construct a 6' wooden fence along the back of the property and along Highland Ave up about 8' from the rear of the house.

Bethany Emehiser gave presentation. See packet for details.

F. COA-17-21

525 W. 3rd St.: Prospect Hill

Petitioner: Patrick and Glenda Murray

Installation of five new limestone steps with ashlar styling to match existing and provide proper treads. Brick and mortar repointing in various locations. Installation of metal handrail up front steps.

Bethany Emehiser gave presentation. See packet for details.

G. COA-17-22

812 E. 12th St.: University Courts

Petitioner: Donald Lee

Install new sidewalks in rear, remove non-original concrete block wall and expand rear parking pad.

Bethany Emehiser gave presentation. See packet for details.

H. COA-17-23

714 W. 4th St.: Greater Prospect Hill

Petitioner: Craig and Kathy Taylor

Retroactive request for removal of hail damaged aluminum siding with 4" vinyl siding.

Bethany Emehiser gave presentation. See packet for details.

I. COA-17-24

1319 E. 1st St.: Elm Heights

Petitioner: Darrin Ricketts

Request for removal of two evergreens causing foundation damage and removal of front yard hedges and shrubs.

Bethany Emehiser gave presentation. See packet for details.

J. COA-17-25

221 E. Glendora Dr.: Matlock Heights

Petitioner: Yu Hsing Lin

Removal of a 5' chain-link fence and replace with a 6' wood fence in the back yard.

Bethany Emehiser gave presentation. See packet for details.

K. COA-17-26

724 W. 3rd St.: Greater Prospect Hill

Petitioner: Austin Goodman Removal

of front fence.

Bethany Emehiser gave presentation. See packet for details.

L. COA-17-27

116 N. Walnut St.: Courthouse Square Petitioner:

Talia Halliday—Gather

Request for new 2'x5' wood sign with metal letters affixed.

Bethany Emehiser gave presentation. See packet for details.

Automatically approved per 30 day statute.

A. COA-17-17

1319 E. 1st St.: Elm Heights

Petitioner: Darrin Ricketts

Request to remove limestone wall along alley and construct a wood fence.

Request to remove a limestone fire pit and construct a new fire pit and patio area. Request to install a black rod iron fence along east property line and up to the edge of the front of house. Request to add stairs to access the west side of the house. Request to construct a 6'x6'x9' storage garage in front of non-original addition. Request to add two skylights to the rear addition.

Bethany Emenhiser gave presentation. See packet for details.

B. COA-17-19

620 W. 4th St.: Greater Prospect Hill

Petitioner: Ernesto Castaneda

Extension of non-original garage 4' and construction of a new second story addition.

Bethany Emenhiser gave presentation. See packet for details.

III. DEMOLITION DELAY

Commission Review

A. Demo Delay 17-04

639 N. College Ave.

Petitioner: Omega Properties

Partial demolition.

Bethany Emenhiser gave presentation. See packet for details.

Robert Friedman stated the siding is failing, specifically on the south side past the point of regular upkeep.

Chris Sturbaum asked to the petitioner what was specifically wrong with the siding. **Robert Friedman** stated it is rotting and falling apart, mainly on the south side.

Jeff Goldin asked if the trim would be replaced as well. **Robert Friedman** stated if the trim can be kept, it will be.

Sam DeSollar asked if the replacement product would be the same size and profile. **Robert Friedman** stated it probably would be.

Marjorie Hudgins commended the Friedman's on how the house looks.

Chris Sturbaum stated he was uncomfortable with all of the trim and siding coming off. He suggested tabling the decision until next meeting.

Lee Sandweiss stated she agreed with Chris.

Jeff Goldin commented he trusts the Friedman family with replacing the siding and making correct decisions regarding what material they choose.

Sam DeSollar stated he was surprised by Chris and Lee's comments. As long as the owner promises to match the size and profile of the replacement product with the current siding he would have no problem with it.

Flavia Burrell commented she is in favor of the replacement.

Leslie Abshier asked Bethany if the commission can put stipulations on Demolition Delays. **Bethany Emehiser** stated if the petitioner agrees to the stipulations at the meeting, it is a binding agreement when the petition is released.

Jeff Goldin released **Demo Delay 17-04. Motion carried 8/0/0 (Yes/No/Abstain)**

B. Demo Delay 17-05

512-514 S. Fess St.

Petitioner: Mary Krupinski

Partial demolition.

Bethany Emehiser gave presentation. See packet for details.

Mary Krupinski reviewed the proposal with the commission.

Chris Sturbaum stated the other approach would be to match the existing siding that would be revealed at a later time. **Mary Krupinski** commented they would be open to that.

Sam DeSollar asked what the front columns would be made of. **Mary Krupinski** stated they would be wood or pvc wrap.

Marjorie Hudgins stated she liked the project.

Chris Sturbaum stated he supports these projects.

Lee Sandweiss stated she likes the house and what it is going to be.

Sam DeSollar commented he agrees with Chris and encourages the petitioner to stay away from pvc wrap.

Jeff Goldin released **Demo Delay 17-05**. **Chris Sturbaum** seconded. **Motion carried 8/0/0 (Yes/No/Abstain)**

C. Demo Delay 17-06

802 S. Washington St.

Petitioner: Andrew Bayer

Partial demolition.

Bethany Emenhiser gave presentation. See packet for details.

Andre Bayer explained the efficiency bathroom is going to become the kitchen and will need a window.

Marjorie Hudgins asked if they were planning on adding windows in the rear where there are none now. **Andrew Bayer** stated they were not.

Chris Sturbaum asked if they were going to use casement windows. **Andrew Bayer** stated they would either use casement or some sort of side sliders.

Sam DeSollar asked if the windows on the back of the house are in such bad shape they need replaced, what material window they will be replaced with. **Andrew Bayer** stated, wood.

Leslie Abshier asked if the small window would be the only window that would change size. **Chelsea Blanchard** stated yes. The bank of windows in the back would technically change size, but the openings would be the same. **Leslie Abshier** asked if they knew what type of window. **Andrew Bayer** stated they would be using a double hung.

Kelsey Maas commented she thought it would look good. **Sam DeSollar** and **Leslie Abshier** both agreed.

Jeff Goldin released Demo Delay 17-06. Chris Sturbaum seconded. Motion carried 8/0/0 (Yes/No/Abstain)

D. Demo Delay 17-07

754 S. Walnut St.

Petitioner: Al Jacobson

Partial demolition.

Bethany Emehiser gave presentation. See packet for details.

Marjorie Hudgins asked if there were any special treatments when working with asphalt siding. **Norma Jain** commented if the siding is being removed, then yes. If the side is just being covered, no.

Leslie Abshier asked if the siding was original. **Bethany Emehiser** stated it was not. It was probably from the 30's or 40's.

Marjorie Hudgins asked what color the siding was going to be. **Norma Jain Jacobson** stated it will be a medium gray with white trim.

Chris Sturbaum asked what trim they will use. **Norma Jain Jacobson** commented the vinyl trim will cover the current trim.

Sam DeSollar commented he understand the economics of the vinyl, but is not a fan of it.

Flavia Burrell commented it would improve the look.

Leslie Abshier stated she agreed with Sam.

John Saunders asked how the new trim would cover the current lip around the windows. **Norma Jain Jacobson** stated she was not sure what the plan was for the windows, but the man doing the job does have a plan for it to cover it up and look nice.

Jeff Goldin released Demo Delay 17-07. Sam DeSollar seconded.
Motion carried 8/0/0 (Yes/No/Abstain)

VI. NEW BUSINESS

A. Findings of Fact approvals

Finding of Fact

122 S. College Ave.

Bethany Emehiser read Finding of Fact. See packet for details.

Jeff Goldin made a motion to approve Finding of Fact 122 S. College. **Sam DeSollar** seconded. **Motion carried 8/0/0 (Yes/No/Abstain)**

Finding of Fact

925 E. University

Bethany Emehiser read Finding of Fact. See packet for details.

Sam DeSollar commented he did not agree with this approval due to it contradicting the neighborhood guidelines. His concern is that it sets a dangerous precedent for future approvals. **John Saunders** proposed asking the neighborhood to review their guidelines. **Sam DeSollar** commented the way the guidelines are written, it is not serving the neighborhood as they want them to. Based on the guidelines the dormer should not have been approved. **Jeff Goldin** asked what he would do to change this Finding of Fact. **Sam DeSollar** stated changing the Finding of Fact is not going to change his issues with the approval and the guidelines. **Bethany Emehiser** stated she would speak with the neighborhood about their guidelines.

Jeff Goldin made a motion to approve Finding of Fact 925 E. University. **Chris Sturbaum** seconded. **Motion carried 6/1/1 (Yes/No/Abstain)**

Finding of Fact

912 S. Madison

Bethany Emehiser read Finding of Fact. See packet for details.

Jeff Goldin made a motion to approve Finding of Fact 912 S. Madison. **Chris Sturbaum** seconded. **Motion carried 8/0/0 (Yes/No/Abstain)**

Finding of Fact

204 S. Rogers St.

Bethany Emehiser read Finding of Fact. See packet for details.

Jeff Goldin made a motion to approve Finding of Fact 204 S. Rogers St. **Chris Sturbaum** seconded. **Motion carried 8/0/0 (Yes/No/Abstain)**

Finding of Fact

401 N. Morton

Bethany Emehiser read Finding of Fact. See packet for details.

Jeff Goldin made a motion to approve Finding of Fact 401 N Morton. **Chris Sturbaum** seconded. **Motion carried 8/0/0 (Yes/No/Abstain)**

Finding of Fact

335 W. 11th St

Bethany Emehiser read Finding of Fact. See packet for details.

Jeff Goldin made a motion to approve Finding of Fact 335 W. 11th. **Chris Sturbaum** seconded. **Motion carried 8/0/0 (Yes/No/Abstain)**

Finding of Fact

204 N. Walnut

Bethany Emehiser read Finding of Fact. See packet for details.

Jeff Goldin made a motion to approve Finding of Fact 204 N. Walnut. **Lee Sandweiss** seconded. **Motion carried 8/0/0 (Yes/No/Abstain)**

Finding of Fact

416 E. 4th St

Bethany Emehiser read Finding of Fact. See packet for details.

Jeff Goldin made a motion to approve Finding of Fact 416 E. 4th St. **Chris Sturbaum** seconded. **Motion carried 8/0/0 (Yes/No/Abstain)**

Finding of Fact
912 W. 12th St

Bethany Emenhiser read Finding of Fact. See packet for details.

Jeff Goldin made a motion to approve Finding of Fact 912 W. 12th St. **Chris Sturbaum** seconded. **Motion carried 8/0/0 (Yes/No/Abstain)**

B. Annex Project Review- S. Grant St.

Bethany Emenhiser gave presentation. See packet for details.

Joy Skidmore commented the elevations of the project are being revised. She reviewed the part of the project the commission has purview of.

Chris Sturbaum asked what materials were being used and if they were acceptable materials. **Joy Skidmore** stated all materials would meet architectural guidelines.

Jeff Goldin asked how many apartments would this building have. **Joy Skidmore** commented about 100 apartments.

Bethany Emenhiser reviewed the planning issues before the revised plans were made, which included, development in the right-of-way along 3rd Street, height, not stepping the retail space with the street grade along 3rd street, the garage is on Grant Street, and the context with the other development.

Marjorie Hudgins stated she is too overwhelmed.

Chris Sturbaum asked what architectural style this project is. **Joy Skidmore** stated she couldn't answer that question. **Chris Sturbaum** stated the project gave no attempt to blend with Bloomington. He also asked if height was still an issue. **Joy Skidmore** stated they are asking for a height waiver. They are 14 feet too tall.

Steve Brehob stated the plans the commission is looking at are first submittal before any of the planning issues were heard.

Lee Sandweiss commented she has only lived in Bloomington for 15 years. She compared it to the Poplars building and when it was built based on the size of it.

Jeff Goldin stated the building has no style and there is nothing special about the building.

Kelsey Maas asked if the current retail space would stay the same with this building or if the project would increase it. **Steve Brehob** thought it would increase it.

Sam DeSollar asked how many feet were in between the building and the historic structure. **Steve Brehob** commented about 10 feet. **Sam DeSollar** commended the increase of retail space, but was not a fan of the overall project.

Flavia Burrell asked if the parking was adequate for the residence or if it was for the retail too. **Joy Skidmore** commented it was for residence only. The retail spaces would be valet parking along with some on-street parking.

Leslie Abshier asked if the building dropped down next to the house. **Steve Brehob** stated the area next to the house was a green roof.

Flavia Burrell asked what the project name is. **Joy Skidmore** stated, Annex of Bloomington.

Leslie Abshier commented she appreciated the dropped roof next to the house. Overall she did not like the project, it blocks the view for many people.

John Saunders agreed with Leslie Abshier.

Chris Sturbaum commented the retail area needed columns or forms to separate the store fronts.

Marjorie Hudgins asked if a height waiver is needed. **Bethany Emenhiser** stated, yes, it is needed.

Sam DeSollar commented the retail could have street planting, terracing, and other items to allow the retail spaces to be modularized. **Steve Brehob** stated the

initial submittal to planning had everything that was just commented on, but it was too much encroachment in the right-of-way.

Sam DeSollar asked when this would be going to the Planning Commission meeting. **Bethany Emehiser** stated it would be on May 8th.

C. Local Designation Public Hearing: 1400 N. Lincoln St.

Bethany Emehiser gave presentation. See packet for details.

Marjorie Hudgins asked if any notable person has built or lived in this house.

Bethany Emehiser stated there was no information she could find.

Chris Sturbaum asked if we should take context in mind when thinking about the importance of this building. **Bethany Emehiser** responded, a lot of the context is gone, but it is not completely gone yet. On the other hand, this zone is Residential High-Density so it is at risk for demolition. **Abe Schultz** commented he purchased this property 20 years ago planning on developing.

Jeff Goldin asked Bethany if she thought the property was notable. **Bethany Emehiser** stated yes.

Sam DeSollar asked what shape the property was in. **Abe Schultz** stated the property is in decent shape, considering it has been a student rental for the past 14-16 years. **Sam DeSollar** asked if you could fit another building on the parcel. **Abe Schultz commented** the house sits directly in the center and it is not possible.

Flavia Burrell commented she would be more uncomfortable with it if there were more homes like this surrounding it.

Leslie Abshier asked if the condition of the house has anything to do with designating local properties. **Bethany Emehiser** stated the 9 criteria are used when designating a local house, condition isn't one of them.

John Saunders commented he did not like the box structure of the proposed properties. He suggested hiring an architect to help with the design of the structure. **Abe Schultz** commented he is building a cost-effective structure for students. He is not attempting to build anything unique.

Chris Sturbaum commented he thinks it is smart to choose the commissions battles.

Lee Sandweiss stated she agrees with Chris.

Jeff Goldin stated he is also in complete agreement.

Kelsey Maas commented she would like to see more windows on the structure.

Sam DeSollar stated he thinks the house is interesting. The zoning on this property is overpowering the house in his opinion.

Leslie Abshier commented she did not feel comfortable letting the house go, but would.

John Saunders reiterated, there are many students who like living in historic homes.

Jeff Goldin made a motion to **not recommend** this property for local designation. **Lee Sandweiss** seconded. **Motion carried 7/0/1 (Yes/No/Abstain)**

D. Courthouse Square Design Guidelines

Jeff Goldin made a motion to approve the Courthouse Square Design Guidelines. **Lee Sandweiss** seconded. **Motion carried 7/0/1 (Yes/No/Abstain)**

VII. OLD BUSINESS

A. Preservation Month

Bethany Emenhiser reviewed all activities planned for Preservation Month.

VIII. COMMISSIONERS' COMMENTS

NONE

IX. PUBLIC COMMENTS

NONE

X. ANNOUNCEMENTS

NONE

XI. ADJOURNMENT

Meeting was adjourned at 7:25 pm.