

**Bloomington Historic Preservation Commission
Showers City Hall
McCloskey Room
Thursday April 12, 2018 5:00 P.M.**

MINUTES

I. CALL TO ORDER

Chairman, **Jeff Goldin**, called the meeting to order at 5:00 pm.

II. ROLL CALL

Commissioners

Doug Bruce
Flavia Burrell
Jeff Goldin
John Saunders
Chris Sturbaum
Leslie Abshier @ 5:05

Advisory

Deb Hutton
Deriek Richey
Duncan Campbell @ 5:07

Staff

Rachel Ellenson
Eric Sader
Philippa Guthrie
Jackie Scanlan
Eddie Wright

Guests

James McBee
Brian Chelius
Mary Friedman

Heidi Leisz
Thomas Densford
Chris Valliant
Julia Lawson
Barrie Klapper
Faith Hawkins
Greg Larsen
Cindy Kallet

III. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

John Saunders made a motion to approve March 22, 2018 minutes. **Doug Bruce** seconded. **Motion carried 6/0/0 (Yes/No/Abstain).**

IV. CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

Staff Review

A. COA 18-19

125 North College Avenue: Courthouse Square

Petitioner: Amy Miller, Wagner Signs

Amendment to approve COA 18-13: Installation of a non-illuminated metal composite painted letter sign on the North side of the building to match the design of the East façade sign. The proposed sign will replace the previously approved wall mounted sign.

Rachel Ellenson gave her presentation. See packet for details.

Commission Review

A. COA 18-16 (cont. from last meeting)

917 West Howe Street: Greater Prospect Hill

Petitioner: Grey Larson and Cindy Kallet

Demolition of existing shed and construction of a new one with the same dimensions and design.

Rachel Ellenson gave her presentation. See packet for details.

Discussion continued from last meeting with the petitioner **Cindy Kallet** stating that there are no studs in the shed and the structure was constructed with a door put up then sheetrock followed by cardboard and foam board. The floor joists are not even and are

actually sitting on the ground with no foundation. **Duncan Campbell** stated that he entered the structure and the plank floor has been covered with a tongue in groove floor. The structure is leaning and where the rafters meet the walls the rafters are rotted all the way around. It is an unremarkable building and these were quite common behind bungalows but they are disappearing. The entire roof structure would have to be rebuilt to save the shed. But overall it's not fixable in the sense to give it integrity to make it the type of structure desired and to justify the expense. **Chris Sturbaum** stated that the only justification for rebuilding the structure is for setback purposes. **Cindy Kallett** stated that they will take the structure down and set the new shed two feet further into the property. Due to the geo thermal system they cannot move it the full five feet and therefore will need to ask for a variance. **Doug Bruce** stated that he wonders how much if anything original or historic you would have after you tried to rebuild and replace and upgrade. **Deb Hutton** stated that they might try to save some of the materials; **Cindy Kallett** said they will save everything they could from the shed, even some 1946 cardboard. The commission agreed that it was time to let the shed go but they were happy to get to review this demolition. **Jeff Goldin** stated that he saved a similar shed and there were some original pieces left, but that shed was in better shape when they began restoration.

John Saunders made a motion to approve **COA 18-16**, **Leslie Abshier** seconded. **Motion carried 7/0/0.**

Chris Sturbaum made a motion to support a variance to the setback for the new shed at 917 W Howe St to be compatible with the placement of the original structure on the property, **Leslie Abshier** seconded. **Motion carried 7/0/0.**

B. COA 18-18

421 South Highland Avenue: Elm Heights

Petitioner: Jeff Leisz

Replacement of damaged front steps with new limestone steps.

Chris Sturbaum stated that he assumes that the steps in question will be of the same size as the steps above and reduce the tread height for safety. **Deb Hutton** asked if the new railing was made of the same material and style as the current railing. **Rachel Ellenson** stated that she did not know and was not given that information. **Heidi Leisz** speaking for the petitioner stated that railing would be piping, silver in color. **Chris Sturbaum** felt like this could be a staff review, **Doug Bruce** agreed. It was pointed out that the plans state the dimensions of the railing.

John Saunders made a motion to approve **COA 18-18**, **Flavia Burrell** seconded. **Motion carried 7/0/0.**

C. COA 18-20

329 ½ South Maple Street: Greater Prospect Hill

Petitioner: Chris Valliant

Removal of existing shed roof addition on the rear of the house and reframe a new rear addition with a gabled roof to match the pitch of the roof on the rest of the house.

Rachel Ellenson gave her presentation. See packet for details.

Chris Sturbaum asked if the gable would be extending. **Chris Valliant** stated that he would trim the new addition to match the rest of the house. **Chris Valliant** stated that it is difficult to know what is under the siding.

John Saunders made a motion to approve **COA 18-20**, **Doug Bruce** seconded. **Motion carried 7/0/0.**

V. DEMOLITION DELAY

Staff Review

A. Demo Delay 18-13

609 West 9th Street

Petitioner: Steve Mascari, Bookabee, LLC

Partial demolition – relocation and replacement of several windows, opening previously closed off front porch.

Rachel Ellenson gave her presentation. See packet for details.

Commission Review

A. Demo Delay 18-09 (cont. from last meeting)

717 North Maple Street

Petitioner: Michael Kee, on behalf of Richard Wells Full demolition

Rachel Ellenson gave her presentation. See packet for details.

Deb Hutton asked if **Rachel Ellenson** has had any communication from the neighborhood association concerning this house. **Lee Sandweiss** asked about the cutoff date for the demo delay? **Rachel Ellenson** stated that it is 90 days after March 12th but it could be extended 30 days. She will remind the neighborhood association of the deadline. **Chris Sturbaum** stated that he recommends the home owner explore all options concerning the house including moving the house.

John Saunders made a motion to continue **DD 18-09** to the next meeting, **Leslie Abshier** seconded. **Motion carried 7/0/0.**

B. Demo Delay 18-10

1209 West 2nd Street

Petitioner: Barre Klapper, Springpoint Architects

Full demolition

Rachel Ellenson gave her presentation. See packet for details.

Barrie Klapper representing the owner, **Mary Freeman**, stated that the property was purchased with the intention of building a multi-use project but the house sits in the middle of the property. **Chris Sturbaum** asked if there has been any attempt to incorporate the house into the project as it stands. **Barrie Klapper** stated that setback regulations and support for parking puts the house in conflict. John Saunders asked if there were businesses located at the property in the past. **Barrie Klapper** stated that there was a car sales operation located there. **Deb Hutton** asked about a driveway on the property, **Barre Klapper** said this was for access to buildings that have been removed from the property. **Derek Richey** asked what would be constructed on the property. **Barrie Klapper** stated that it would be downstairs commercial, upstairs residential.

Chris Sturbaum believes it is a beautiful house that is out of place at its present location, **John Saunders** agreed. **Doug Bruce** stated that another house the commission saved was in a better location. This house has merit but is in a location that no one would want to live. And there is no historic integrity since no one notable have lived here. He would like to know a little more about this home and would like delay demolition for a few weeks. **Deb Hutton** stated that she would like to see something done similar to what was done on North Walnut, and it appears the house is at the edge of the property, making it easier to save. **Barrie Klapper** clarified that the property owner owns multiple lots at the location with the house actually sitting in the middle of the entire set of lots. **Lee Sandweiss** stated that if this house was on East 1st St it would be a jewel, the house was not out of context when it was built but it is now. It would be a challenge to the architect who is very gifted to incorporate it into the design. She would like to have more information and discuss again later. **Leslie Abshier** agreed with **Doug Bruce** and stated further that if the commission tried to take this to the council for a local designation it would be a difficult fight. She inquired about the possibility of moving the house, **Derek Richey** stated that it is feasible to move the house but it would be a challenge and expensive. **Derek Richey** continued, this house goes back to blanket zoning the city did a number of years ago and similar houses in the area have disappeared. The house used to be connected with a market that was in the building across the street. He would also like to delay demolition to do some research into the history of the house and maybe incorporate the house into the use of the property. **Flavia Burrell** stated that the

commission needs a little more information, but the house warrants demolition only because it sits in the middle of a project. **Duncan Campbell** stated that context is criteria for local designation, but not the only criteria. If you look at the area you could say the neighbors are gone. But if you look at the property you can see the property retains its own context. Everything is there in place in reference to the house which is a criteria for single designation. This building has a lot of integrity and the commission is to evaluate based upon the integrity of the house and property itself. The commission faced a similar situation on South Walnut and they moved the house and after the move the house lost its context. **Derek Richey** asked the chances of the area being rezoned back to residential. Consensus was zero. **Chris Sturbaum** stated that if this was the Garrett sitting here it would be a much easier decision but this is a step down which is why its notable but doesn't have a strong historical context or criteria that we know of now. **Derek Richey** stated it's out of place now but it wasn't at the time it was built, and at the time it was built it was built by someone with money and more research needs to be done.

John Saunders made a motion to continue **DD 18-10** to the next meeting, **Doug Bruce** seconded. **Motion carried 6/1/0.**

C. Demo Delay 18-11

726 West 6th Street

Petitioner: James McBee, MBC Construction Partial demolition – removal of chimney stacks

Rachel Ellenson gave her presentation. See packet for details.

James McBee added the three existing chimneys are all interior; they are in poor condition causing roof leaks and are no longer in use. They would like to remove the chimneys to free up more space in the home. The owner would also like to remove the existing windows and return to the original size windows in the near future.

Chris Sturbaum asked if by taking the chimneys down, would enough room be gained that would justify the cost and work involved. **James McBee** stated that the chimneys go through the entire house from the foundation to the roof and are about two feet wide, so some space would be freed. **Chris Sturbaum** suggested bracing and keeping the chimneys from the attic up. **James McBee** stated that the home owner is receptive to that idea however with cathedral ceilings in the second floor there is no way to brace and keep the chimneys. **John Saunders** asked about the firmness of the chimneys at the foundation level, **James McBee** stated that there are problems at that level and he is working with a foundation expert to address those issues. **John Saunders** inquired as to the amount of space to be freed and **James McBee** stated the area is eighteen inches by two feet. **John Saunders** asked what was behind what was covering the fire places. **James McBee** stated the fire places had been converted for wood stove use. **Deb Hutton**

asked for the total number of fire places on the property, there are three. **Leslie Abshier** asked if the neighborhood association is on board with the changes. **Rachel Ellenson** stated this is something they would want to be involved with but they haven't received an application. But she would follow up with the neighborhood association. **John Saunders** asked about the addition to the back of the house. **Rachel Ellenson** stated that she didn't know if that was a later addition. There was a question about previous ownership of the house; **Rachel Ellenson** stated that the ownership history gets lost pretty quickly in the deed books.

Chris Sturbaum stated that the chimneys are defining features, and the house predates the development of the area. He likes the idea of continuing the demo delay to learn more about the structure. **John Saunders** believes the chimneys are defining and should be kept. **Doug Bruce** agreed with **John Saunders** and favors continuing, but he's not sure about designating the structure as historic. **Deb Hutton** is happy to see the windows being taken back to original and asked if a COA would be necessary. **Rachel Ellenson** said it would only be necessary if the structure is designated. **Chris Sturbaum** stated that the windows would likely be vinyl. **James McBee** stated that they have kept the original windows and those are being restored for reuse and those are wood. **Deb Hutton** congratulated the owner and **James McBee** for the work with the windows. **Leslie Abshier** agrees with continuing. **Flavia Burrell** feels like the chimneys are defining features of the house and once they are removed the house becomes something simple and not defined. **Duncan Campbell** noted that the chimneys are built in this manner, inside the hose for heat and they go all the way to the foundation and removal would be a serious intrusion into the architectural integrity of the home. Removal of the chimneys would be to remove a key feature of the house. It is one of the oldest houses in Bloomington and he believes it deserves local designation. **Jeff Goldin** agrees with everything said before concerning the chimneys as well as local designation.

Rachel Ellenson read a letter from Sandi Clothier in support of local designation.

Jeff Goldin stated that the commission could release, continue or recommend local designation. **James McBee** stated that the home owner is willing to keep the chimneys if he has to with all the structural issue they are having. He would just clean and repair the chimneys and seal the leaks. **Chris Sturbaum** said it might be a good idea to just withdraw the petition. **James McBee** stated that if the demo delay was not approved then he would withdraw the petition. **Leslie Abshire** stated that it might be a good idea to withdraw first since the commissioners' favor continuing and moving for a local designation. **Chris** was concerned about delays to work being done on the property should the commission continue the demo delay. He asked if **James McBee** could speak for the petitioner concerning withdrawal. He stated that he could not but noted that he has a completion date of August first so he cannot have any delays at this point. **James McBee** stepped out of the room to contact the owner. He returned shortly thereafter.

No vote taken, petition withdrawn by petitioner. The owner will leave the chimneys and work to clean the chimneys and seal the roof.

D. Demo Delay 18-12

722 East University Street

Petitioner: Faith Hawkins and Glenda Schulz

Partial demolition - rear addition

Rachel Ellenson gave her presentation. See packet for details.

Deb Hutton asked if the addition would be squared with the existing structure. **Chris Sturbaum** stated he would like the historic designation to be voluntary. **John Saunders** asked if this was a Sears home. **Faith Hawkins** stated it was not, it is a John Nichols home. **Duncan Campbell** asked if there was a request to remove the whole back part. They are not removing the whole back part, just squaring the kitchen and the breakfast nook will remain.

Chris Sturbaum encourages local designation **John Saunders** agrees. **Doug Bruce** agrees but he would like to see an elevation since they are adding windows. **Faith Hawkins** showed **Doug Bruce** an elevation and he agreed with the project. **Deb Hutton** agreed with previous comments. **Lee Sandweiss** encouraged them to support local designation. **Duncan Campbell** noted that this house is one of only a few left in Bloomington that was built by John Nichols. If they continue and do not designate then it would be under the purview of the COA. **Derek Richey** stated that we have lost many Nichols buildings and it is important to recognize this. **Duncan Campbell** further stated that East University has the best bungalows in Bloomington and should be a historic district. This deserves more than just a standalone. **Chris Sturbaum** stated that could be a reason not to go ahead now and get some momentum for a district. **Flavia Burrell** stated that it should be a district, and **Faith Hawkins** would be willing to do this if someone would walk her through the process. They are dedicated to this house and the project. **Jeff Goldin** is in favor of releasing the demo delay and Rachel pursuing historic designation.

John Saunders made a motion to release **DD 18-12**, **Chris Sturbaum** seconded. **Motion carried 7/0/0.**

VI. NEW BUSINESS

A. Local Historic District Designation – 506 South High Street

See packet for details.

Deb Hutton asked for clarification on which house is being designated. **Rachel Ellenson** stated it is the one with the green roof.

Lee Sandweiss made a motion to send historic designation for 506 S High St. on to City Council, **Doug Bruce** seconded. **Motion carried 7/0/0.**

B. Local Historic District Designation – 605 South Fess Street

See packet for details.

Chris Sturbaum stated this is an example of not wanting to lose architectural features and the loss of this property would take away proof that things can be done well. Even though some aspects of that have been lost on this building. **Rachel Ellenson** supports local designation because the owners of the building are not supportive of the Commission, and won't preserve the historic character of the building. There was a question as to the time frame for designation by the City Council. It's a three week process and interim protection might be a good idea.

Doug Bruce made a motion to send historic designation for 605 S Fess St. on to City Council, **Chris Sturbaum** seconded. **Motion carried 7/0/0.**

Deb Hutton was concerned about the time period before historic designation by the City Council. **Chris Sturbaum** suggested interim protection for both properties going for City Council designation. The commission agreed,

Chris Sturbaum made a motion for interim historic protection for 605 S Fess Ave. while the City Council considers permanent historic designation, **Lee Sandweiss** seconded. **Motion carried 7/0/0.**

Chris Sturbaum made a motion for interim historic protection for 506 S High St. while the City Council considers permanent historic designation, **Lee Sandweiss** seconded. **Motion carried 7/0/0.**

A Question was asked if maintenance would be halted by interim designation. **Philippa Guthrie** clarified that interim designation does not stop general maintenance and repairs.

VII. COURTESY REVIEW

VIII. OLD BUSINESS

IX. COMMISSIONER COMMENTS

Jeff Goldin stated that he was visiting 1175 S Smith that was once owned by the Harley family and is now surrounded by development. He spoke with the current owner Mr. Harvey about historic designation. The owner didn't think it would qualify because the property has had several modifications. He suggested approaching the Harvey's about historic designation.

X. PUBLIC COMMENTS

None

XI. ANNOUNCEMENTS

A. Preservation Month Photo Contest - entry form is on the website.

B. This Place Matters – website update added preservation month information. Also to engage the community.

C. Rosemary Miller Lecture with Henry Glassie – May 4, 2018 in City Council chambers. It's free but only the first thirty people get to go.

D. Walking Tour with Jim Capshew – May 19, 2018 entry form is on the website.

XII. ADJOURNMENT

Jeff Goldin adjourned meeting at 7:05 p.m.