

Bloomington Historic Preservation Commission
Showers City Hall
McCloskey Room
Thursday June 28, 2018
5:00 P.M.
Minutes

I. CALL TO ORDER

Meeting was called to order by Chairman, Jeff Goldin, at 5:05 pm.

II. ROLL CALL

Commissioners

Jeff Goldin
Lee Sandweiss
Sam DeSollar
John Saunders
Flavia Burrell
Chris Sturbaum

Advisory

Deb Hutton – arrived at 5:04 pm
Duncan Campbell

Staff

Rachel Ellenson – HAND
Alison Kimmel – HAND
Eric Sader – HAND
Anahit Behjou – LEGAL

Guests

Rebecca Stoops
Dylan Grigar
Jack Baker
Candace Finch
Jefferson Shreve
Elizabeth Cox Ash
Paul Ash

III. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

- A. June 7, 2018 Minutes
- B. June 14, 2018 Minutes

Sam DeSollar made a motion to approve minutes from June 7th 2018 and June 14th 2018, mentioning the reason we tabled **COA 18-42** during the June 14th meeting, was to receive neighborhood feedback. **John Saunders** seconded. **Motion carried 6/0/0 (Yes/No/Abstain).**

IV. CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

Staff Review

A. COA 18-48

101 W. Kirkwood Avenue #116: Courthouse Square
Petitioner: FASTSIGNS, on behalf of Marcy Cook
Installation of new signage above the storefront.

Rachel Ellenson gave presentation. See packet for details.

COMMISSION REVIEW

A. COA 18-42 (cont. from last meeting)

325 S. Rogers Street: Prospect Hill
Petitioner: Lynn & Teri Yohn

Replacement of 16 existing windows with custom designed Marvin clad ultimate insert double hung aluminum windows. Resubmission of request from COA 18-29 that was denied.

Rachel Ellenson gave presentation. See packet for details.

The commission was originally advised to table **COA 18-42**, due to the petitioners not being present. Doing this, **COA 18-42** would have exceeded the thirty-day deadline, causing automatic approval of the request. Therefore, for COA 18-42, **Chris Sturbaum** made a motion to suspend the rule in regards to presence of the petitioner at the meeting. **John Saunders** seconded. **Motion carried 5/0/0**. Flavia Burrell was not present to vote. This COA was discussed at the end of the meeting.

B. COA 18-45

118 N. Walnut Street: Courthouse Square
Petitioner: Flow Bloomington, LLC, Candace Finch (owner)

Replacement of existing storefront with new anodized steel storefront that will fit the existing opening. The new entrance facing Walnut Street will be recessed 3' and the window installation between the existing entrance door and the new recessed door will be at an 8' recess. Installation of lighting above the store front and installation of new wooden sign.

Rachel Ellenson gave presentation. See packet for details.

John Saunders asked if there were windows behind the canopy. **Sam DeSollar** explained there is plywood and it will eventually be transom windows.

Sam DeSollar asked for clarification on dimensions of depth for the store fronts. He also asked for details on the sign that would be installed. **Candace Finch** stated it is a horizontal wood backed sign with track lighting.

Deb Hutton asked if the lighting was angled up or down. **Candace Finch** stated it will be down and pointed towards the store front.

John Saunders stated he is supportive of this project.

Chris Sturbaum asked if there will be grids in the new windows. **Candace Finch** stated there will not be.

Sam DeSollar made a motion to approve **COA-18-45**. **Flavia Burrell** seconded. **Motion carried 6/0/0 (Yes/No/Abstain)**.

C. COA 18-46

812 S. Morton Street: McDoel

Petitioner: Jefferson Shreve

Full demolition.

Rachel Ellenson gave presentation. See packet for details.

Jefferson Shreve stated he owns this property and multiple properties nearby. This house is not occupied and would not pass a HAND inspection. He does not feel the house is worth the amount of money that is needed to put in to it. It would be more cost efficient to tear it down.

John Saunders asked how long the house has sat empty. **Jefferson Shreve** stated about 1.5 years.

Chris Sturbaum commented it sounds like the house is in the way of future plans.

Deb Hutton asked if the house next to the property is historic. **Jefferson Shreve** stated he did not think it was, although it is older than the American Foursquare.

John Saunders asked if he has considered restoring the house considering the price of the houses across the street. **Jefferson Shreve** stated he has considered it.

Sam DeSollar asked if he knew what was under the vinyl siding. **Jefferson Shreve** stated he does not know.

Jeff Goldin asked the petitioner what the property was zoned. He did not know. The commissioners looked the property up on the GIS and it stated IG – Industrial General.

Jack Baker stated he is a part of the McDoel Gardens Neighborhood Association. He was a part of the creation of the conservation and historic district. He stated they started the district because they did not want to lose any more homes in the neighborhood, let alone have more large buildings go in without their say in the plans. He stated it hasn't been rented because no effort has been put in to it. This house can be renovated.

Elizabeth Cox Ash stated when they started forming their neighborhood, they weren't looking at the zoning, they were looking at the housing stock that was in the area. She stated there are homes in the city that have been in much worse condition and easily renovated. She recommends denial of this petition to tear down.

Paul Ash stated he is a founding member of the McDoel Gardens neighborhood association. He requested the petition to be denied.

Chris Sturbaum stated he thinks the regulations call for preserving the house, which is why the staff recommended denial. This house can set the tone for the neighborhood and could easily be a favorite house of the neighborhood once restored.

Deb Hutton stated she agrees with Chris. She also stated rebuilding a home on the property where the house sits could be harder than restoring the house because the design guidelines must be followed.

Flavia Burrell asked the petitioner if knew the house was in a district when he purchased the house.

Jefferson Shreve stated he did not.

Elizabeth Cox Ash stated in 2014 all property owners received ballots to either stay a conservation district or be elevated to a historic district. She did not receive a ballot back from the petitioner. There is no reason he should not know he is in a historic neighborhood.

Duncan Campbell stated the neighborhood was created to protect the current structures in the neighborhood. It stopped the hospital from expanding in that direction and any other buildings that could have gone in there. City Council approved this district, therefore the commission has an obligation to protect this neighborhood.

Jefferson Shreve stated the notion of “demolition from neglect” is not the case. He has looked at the cost of a rehab and it is substantial. He does not think that rehab is the best financial decision.

Deb Hutton stated if he is not able to take down the house and he wants to build on his empty lots, he will still have to be approved by the commission and follow the guidelines since he is in the district. **Jefferson Shreve** asked if she was trying to dissuade any development on his lots. **Deb Hutton** stated she was not, she was only asking if he was aware of the guidelines.

Jefferson Shreve asked if the commission would approve the demolition of the garage. After deliberating, the commission stated he would need to submit a separate application since the garage was not part of the submitted application.

Chris Sturbaum made a motion to deny **COA-18-46**. **Lee Sandweiss** seconded. **Motion carried 6/0/0 (Yes/No/Abstain).**

D. COA 18-47

407 S. Walker Street: Greater Prospect Hill

Petitioner: Rebecca Stoops

Installation of 18 solar panels on the east-facing portion of the roof. They will not be visible from the primary public right of way.

Rachel Ellenson gave presentation. See packet for details.

Rebecca Stoops stated she is excited to get solar panels installed.

Chris Sturbaum stated he appreciates balancing the historic and sustainable sides of the house.

Sam DeSollar stated he agreed with Chris with a caveat that sometimes you don't have a choice where you put the solar panels.

Sam DeSollar made a motion to approve **COA-18-47**. **Lee Sandweiss** seconded. **Motion carried 6/0/0 (Yes/No/Abstain).**

V. DEMOLITION DELAY

Commission Review

A. Demo Delay 18-24

1214 S. Pickwick Place

Petitioner: Dylan Grigar, Loren Wood Builders

Partial Demolition – construction of a rear addition.

Rachel Ellenson gave presentation. See packet for details.

John Saunders asked if the majority of the limestone would be retained. **Dylan Grigar** stated the limestone would be retained as much as possible.

Chris Sturbaum asked if the window placements were going to be moved. **Dylan Grigar** stated some were going to be moved, some would remain.

The commissioners had some design questions regarding the windows the representative could not answer.

Rachel Ellenson reminded the commission it is Demo Delay. There are no recommendations on design. The commission needs to move to designate the house or release the demolition permit.

John Saunders wanted to remind the commissioners this property belonged to Menahem Presslar.

Chris Sturbaum wanted to make the release of the permit conditional based on design. **Anahit Behjou** advised she was not aware of the ability to do so.

Sam DeSollar made a motion to release **Demo Delay 18-24**. **Lee Sandweiss** seconded. **Motion carried 6/0/0 (Yes/No/Abstain)**.

Chris Sturbaum asked legal if the petitioner was committed to what was presented to commission. He stated they may designate the building, depending what the plans were for the structure.

Jeff Goldin stated if the commission thinks the house should be designated, they should move to designate no matter what the plans are.

COA 18-42 (cont. from last meeting)

325 S. Rogers Street: Prospect Hill

Petitioner: Lynn & Teri Yohn

Replacement of 16 existing windows with custom designed Marvin clad ultimate insert double hung aluminum windows. Resubmission of request from COA 18-29 that was denied. This petition was continued from June 14th meeting.

Jeff Goldin asked staff if neighborhood feedback was provided. **Rachel Ellenson** stated she did not receive any feedback from Prospect Hill, only Greater Prospect Hill. The feedback she received from Greater Prospect Hill stated they are not comfortable making decisions for houses located in Prospect Hill.

Jeff Goldin stated he received an informal response from a neighbor wanting to stay anonymous stating, the homeowners have significantly improved the property, and while the change is significant, it will minimally alter the look of the home.

Duncan Campbell stated random neighbor input does not have as much validity compared to a neighbor who is on the design guideline committee.

Sam DeSollar stated whoever was advising the owners did not advise them very well.

Chris Sturbaum stated he spoke with the sales person who sold the home owners the windows and asked if he advised them to speak the commission first. The sales person stated he did, but they proceeded to purchase the windows.

Flavia Burrell asked what happens if they proceed to install the windows.

Sam Desollar stated they will have to put the originals back in. If they do not, they can be fined per day until they reinstall the original windows.

Duncan Campbell stated the ultimate recourse for the homeowner in a historic district is the court system. He stated he used to teach a preservation law course. All of the cases he is familiar with, the court has always upheld the district regulations.

John Saunders made a motion to deny **COA 18-42**.

Sam DeSollar seconded. **Motion carried 5/1/0 (Yes/No/Abstain)**

VI. COURTESY REVIEW

NONE

VII. NEW BUSINESS

COA 18-49

618 W. 3rd Street

Staff was advised of a house that did not appear before the commission before they started work on their property. **Rachel Ellenson** stated the home owners received the permits from planning and they were not notified they were in a district, therefore she believes the home owners should not be held accountable for this mistake. Staff requested the commission to make a motion to allow this to be approved on a staff level.

The commission discussed how to improve the process so these permits are not released without an appropriate COA or Demo Delay.

John Saunders made a motion to allow staff to approve **COA 18-49** with the contingency that staff approves columns. **Lee Sandweiss** seconded. **Motion carried 6/0/0**.

Deb Hutton made a motion to request staff meet with planning regarding permits being released without being seen before the commission. **John Saunders** seconded. **Motion carried 5/0/1 (Yes/No/Abstain)**

VIII. OLD BUSINESS

IX. COMMISSIONER COMMENTS

John Saunders announced the house on 717 N Maple Street had caught fire. The fire department has not released a report yet.

Chris Sturbaum stated he is working with the Street Department and Public Works regarding historic sidewalks needing repaired. Some of the sidewalks are going to need repaired in the near future.

X. PUBLIC COMMENTS

NONE

XI. ANNOUNCEMENTS

NONE

XII. ADJOURNMENT

Meeting was adjourned at 6:50 pm.