

**Bloomington Historic Preservation Commission Showers City Hall  
McCloskey Room, Thursday September 27, 2018, 5:00 P.M.  
Minutes**

**I. CALL TO ORDER**

Meeting was called to order by Chair, Jeff Goldin, at 5:00pm.

**II. ROLL CALL**

**Commissioners**

Chris Sturbaum  
John Saunders  
Lee Sandweiss  
Doug Bruce  
Sam DeSollar  
Deb Hutton  
Jeff Goldin

**Advisory**

Duncan Campbell

**Staff**

Doris Sims – HAND  
Eric Sader – HAND  
Alison Kimmel – HAND  
Conor Herterich – HAND  
Philippa Guthrie – LEGAL  
Jackie Scanlan – Planning and Transportation  
Mary Catherine Carmichael – OOTM

**Guests**

Charles Russo  
Dorothy Rhodes  
Martha Harsanyi  
Richard Lewis  
Don Harp  
Laurel Cornell  
Russ Herndon  
Mark Figg  
Paul Puzzello

**Conor Herterich** introduced himself as the Historic Preservation Program Manager for the City of Bloomington.

**Doris Sims** gave an update on the commission retreat plans. We are planning on October 16, 2018 and the location is still to-be-determined.

**Jackie Scanlan** gave a brief presentation clarifying demolition delay process. Instead of all of the properties from the 2015 survey being subject to demolition delay, council decided to divide them into two different levels. Staff and Legal took all of the properties from the 2001 and 2007 list, and all of the properties that are outstanding and notable from the 2015 survey. If the properties did not appear on that list, but you're listed on the SHAARD survey as contributing, properties were subject to demolition delay if they are doing full demolition which means more than 50% demolition of the structure or adding more than 50% on to the structure. **Jeff Goldin** stated if the commission sends the survey to council and the council adopts the survey, then all of the structures listed as contributing would fall under the demolition delay ordinance. **Jackie**

**Scanlan** stated she believes the intent of this was only to be used during the interim until the new survey was produced. It all depends on what City Council decides to do. **Philippa Guthrie** stated the commission has the discretion to adopt only part of the survey. **Sam DeSollar** stated they could make recommendations to City Council as well. **Eric Sader** mentioned this will be a main topic for the commission retreat.

### **APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

**John Saunders** made a motion to approve September 13, 2018 minutes. **Deb Hutton** seconded. **Motion carried 5/0/2. (Yes/No/Abstain)**

**Chris Sturbaum** commented the Commission would like to review the letter notifying property owners of the resurvey changes before they are mailed.

### **III. CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS**

#### **Commission Review**

#### **G. COA 18-69**

515 W. 3<sup>rd</sup> Street

Petitioner: Charles and Patricia Russo

New exterior paint for home and garage.

*The petitioner requested to hear this COA application first due to conflict in his schedule.*

**Eric Sader** gave presentation. See packet for details.

**Charles Russo** clarified this is the Bill and Helen Sturbaum House. The Sturbaums purchased the house in 1964. He thought the colors would go with the style of the neighborhood.

**Sam DeSollar** asked if was a two-color or three-color scheme. **Charles Russo** stated it would be a two-color scheme. There are just two options for a grey choice.

**Lee Sandweiss** recommended painting swatches on the house before painting the entire house a particular shade of grey.

**Chris Sturbaum** recommended using the limestone as a guide.

**Sam DeSollar** stated when you have white trim and white windows they can mix together. Look at some examples of houses in town before they commit to the trim. Many houses have complimentary colors with three shades, rather than the two color scheme.

**Chris Sturbaum** made a motion to approve **COA 18-69**. **Lee Sandweiss** seconded. **Motion carried 7/0/0**.

#### **A. COA 18-64**

1018 E. 1<sup>st</sup> Street

Petitioner: Scott Libson and Dorothy Rhodes

Addition of five fly rafter braces on the east and west sides of the house to support roof overhangs. Braces are wood.

**Eric Sader** gave presentation. See packet for details.

**John Saunders** asked what type of wood the braces will be. **Dorothy Rhodes** stated she was not sure. They plan on painting the brackets to match the house.

**Sam DeSollar** asked if the fly rafter was filled in or exposed. **Dorothy Rhodes** was unable to answer the question. **Sam DeSollar** asked if the brackets were going to stick out. **Dorothy Rhodes** stated they would stick out a little bit.

**Duncan Campbell** asked where the failure of the roof was. **Dorothy Rhodes** stated the back end of the roof and they would continue them along the entire side for aesthetics and to prevent future failure of the overhang.

He stated he is worried about the detail of the application. The look of the brace and how the brace is going to be applied is left out of the application.

**Chris Sturbaum** commented the traditional way to do this is to have the brace project beyond the fly-rafter.

**John Saunders** stated he does not think there is enough information from the application and the decision should be tabled.

**Doug Bruce** stated he does not think this type of bracket fits this style of house. He doesn't have a problem with putting brackets on the house but it is important these are installed correctly and how it is going to interact with the current materials on the house.

**John Saunders** made a motion to continue **COA 18-64** due to lack of details and information. **Deb Hutton** seconded. **Motion carried 7/0/0.**

### **B. COA 18-65**

1109 E. Hunter

Petitioner: Chris Sturbaum (Golden Hands Construction)

Replacement of windows and door of sunroom (rear of house). Proposed windows are Marvin casements with wood interior grills. Replacement door is in kind metal or fiberglass.

**Eric Sader** gave presentation. See packet for details.

**Chris Sturbaum** stated they believe the addition was added on in the 1950's or 1960's. The goal is to replace the windows that match the rest of the house on the enclosure. It isn't visible from the street, however it is visible from the alley.

**Martha Harsanyi** commented the windows are not efficient and she would like to change them to match the rest of the house.

**John Saunders** asked if the windows would go to the top. **Chris Sturbaum** stated they would go to the door height. **John Saunders** asked what the material of the door would be. **Chris Sturbaum** stated they hadn't picked out an exact door yet.

**Sam DeSollar** asked if there were grids on the windows. **Chris Sturbaum** stated the owner specifically asked for interior grids that snap off. **Sam DeSollar** asked if there was any feedback from the neighborhood. **Eric Sader** stated he sent information out to all neighborhood contacts for the COA applications on the agenda and only heard back from one.

**Deb Hutton** stated the Elm Heights guidelines state the windows and doors should be repaired rather than replaced. **Martha Harsanyi** stated the door does not open or close. **Chris Sturbaum** stated they would replace it in-kind.

**Duncan Campbell** asked what material the current windows are. **Martha Harsanyi** stated the outer ones are aluminum and the interior windows are single-paned wood windows. **Duncan Campbell** asked what the date of the addition is. **Martha Harsanyi** stated they are not sure. They purchased the house in 1978 and the addition seemed well-established at the time. The original house was built in 1938.

**Russ Herndon** commented if they installed double-hung windows they would be much easier to install, especially since the sash swings forward, making cleaning the windows much easier.

**Chris Sturbaum** left the room.

**Doug Bruce** commented he agreed with Russ Herndon's comment and would like the windows to be double hung.

**Sam DeSollar** stated since the window replacements are going to be on the addition to the house and not on the original house, he does not have any issues with the windows. He would prefer the grids not be snap-off, but true divided lights.

**Duncan Campbell** stated the addition is on the cusp of being historic, but since we don't have an exact date of when it was built he can't argue that.

**John Saunders** made a motion to approve **COA 18-65** with a contingency the petitioner uses double-hung windows. **Sam DeSollar** seconded. **Motion carried 6/0/0**. Chris Sturbaum did not vote.

### **C. COA 18-66**

720 W. 3<sup>rd</sup> Street

Petitioner: Chris Sturbaum (Golden Hands Construction)

Substantial interior remodel will result in window and door changes at rear of home, in addition to smaller windows for bath and kitchen areas. Marvin "Integrity" double-hung windows (x7). Movement of rear backdoor to east.

**Eric Sader** gave presentation. See packet for details.

**Chris Sturbaum** clarified the plans for the application.

**Richard Lewis** stated they are attempting to return the house to the original footprint.

**John Saunders** asked if the new windows would be longer than what is currently there.

**Chris Sturbaum** stated they would be the same size. They are Marvin with fiberglass exterior and wood on the interior.

**Lee Sandweiss** asked if the siding would be affected. **Chris Sturbaum** stated they would take it down and then put it back up.

**Sam DeSollar** asked if they knew what was underneath the aluminum siding. **Chris Sturbaum** stated he thinks it is probably old wood siding.

**Duncan Campbell** wondered if they are reading the Sandborn Maps correctly that the area would have been an open porch under the existing pyramid roof. He stated it may not have been a porch, since that is almost 25% of the foot print.

Chris Sturbaum left the room.

**Lee Sandweiss** stated she likes the project.

**Sam DeSollar** stated since it is highly altered, he is okay with the changes.

**Duncan Campbell** stated in a situation where there have been this many changes already, it is difficult to figure out where to draw the line for allowing changes.

**Jeff Goldin** stated Greater Prospect Hill's intentions were to protect the character of the neighborhood. He does not feel this will detract from the neighborhood.

**John Saunders** made a motion to approve **COA 18-66**. **Sam DeSollar** seconded. **Motion carried 6/0/0**. Chris Sturbaum did not vote.

### **D. COA 18-67**

402 S. Rogers

Petitioner: Chris Sturbaum (Golden Hands Construction)

Replace existing vinyl windows with Marvin "Integrity" windows. Build screen porch with traditional rail and spindles on southwest corner of house. Restore the west exterior wall with wood and replacement of damaged siding.

**Eric Sader** gave presentation. See packet for details.

**Chris Sturbaum** clarified the plans for the application.

**Laurel Cornell** stated the reason for the porch is she would like for a spot to go in the summer under a roof where she does not have to sit in the air conditioning.

**John Saunders** asked for clarification with a discrepancy between two measurements. One measurement stated 10 feet and another stated 12 feet. **Chris Sturbaum** stated he is not sure which is correct.

**Sam DeSollar** asked if there would be any infill underneath the porch to keep animals out. **Chris Sturbaum** stated it would stay open. **Sam DeSollar** asked if the gabled end would be screened in as well or covered with siding. **Chris Sturbaum** stated it will be screened in.

**Duncan Campbell** asked for detail on the spindles and the posts. **Chris Sturbaum** stated the spindles would be 2"x2" and the posts would be 4"x4" posts with a paintable wrap.

Chris Sturbaum left the room.

**Doug Bruce** stated this is far enough back from the road that he does not have a problem with it.

**Sam DeSollar** commented on the incorrect proportions from the drawings on the porch.

**Duncan Campbell** stated the posts should not be too skinny. He suggested looking at the dimensions on the front porch on the house or others in the neighborhood to compare posts and spindles.

**Jeff Goldin** stated he does not think the changes will detract from the neighborhood.

**John Saunders** made a motion to approve **COA 18-67**. **Doug Bruce** seconded. **Motion carried 5/0/1 (Yes/No/Abstain)**. Chris Sturbaum did not vote.

**E. COA 18-68**

201 E. State Road 45/46 Bypass

Petitioner: Derk Brewer

Attach lumber and vinyl garage to rear of existing home.

**Eric Sader** gave presentation. See packet for details.

**Doug Bruce** made a motion to approve **COA 18-68**. **Lee Sandweiss** seconded. **Motion carried 7/0/0**.

**F. COA 18-50 (amendment)**

210 E. Gilbert Drive

Petitioner: Russ Herndon (Loren Wood Builders)

Change to a freestanding detached pool structure in rear.

**Eric Sader** gave presentation. See packet for details.

**Russ Herndon** stated the clients previously wanted an attached structure to the garage, but it would cut off their view and natural airflow. The smaller structure will eliminate those problems. He explained the details of the structure.

**Deb Hutton** asked how they would access the structure. **Russ Herndon** stated they would enter from the garage.

**John Saunders** made a motion to approve **COA 18-50** as amended. **Sam DeSollar** seconded. **Motion carried 7/0/0.**

#### **H. COA 18-70**

204 S. Rogers Street

Petitioner: Paul Muzzello

Stained wood fence enclosure for trash and electrical panels on north side of building.

**Eric Sader** gave presentation. See packet for details.

**Paul Puzzello** stated they intend on planting landscape to buffer the structure from the street. They are going to have a back lit sign on the dumpster cover as well.

**Sam DeSollar** asked if there would be a cap to the top. **Paul Puzzello** stated there is not one in the plans, but he would be open to adding a cap.

**Deb Hutton** asked if there would be any lighting installed along that wall. **Paul Puzzello** stated there is only lighting over the sign right now. There is lighting from the street.

**Duncan Campbell** asked if the material was pressure treated. **Paul Puzzello** stated it was. **Duncan Campbell** stated he had concerns of the wood shrinking and leaving gaps in the wood. He would prefer seeing this wrapped in metal, similar to what is on the other side of the building.

**Chris Sturbaum** stated if this was proposed as a sign holder, it may not look like a dumpster cover.

**John Saunders** stated he agree with Duncan, he would prefer a metal wrap.

**Doug Bruce** stated he could go either way. Since the wood is already there on the building he is not opposed to it, but he likes the idea of the metal wrap to tie-in to the other side of the building. He agrees with the idea that it needs a cap.

**Sam DeSollar** complimented the petitioner on the clarity of the plans. He suggested using a 2-by or a tongue and groove wood to avoid the gapping of the boards. He believes metal would show more dings and damage than the wood would.

**Deb Hutton** stated she agreed with Chris regarding the sign idea. She stated her concern about lighting from the building after installing a 7 foot tall structure.

**Sam DeSollar** made a motion to approve **COA 18-70** adding a condition of using a 2-by board and pressure treated cap. **Chris Sturbaum** seconded. **Motion carried 7/0/0.**

#### **IV. DEMOLITION DELAY**

##### **Commission Review**

##### **A. Demo Delay 18-36**

910 N. College Avenue

Petitioner: Jeff Fanyo (Bynum Fanyo and Associates, Inc.)

Full demolition of structure.

**Eric Sader** gave presentation. See packet for details.

**Mark Figg** stated he does not see any redeeming qualities in the building, but he is open to suggestions.

**John Saunders** asked what the condition of the building was. **Mark Figg** stated it is a wreck. It has been tenant maintained and was basically run into the ground. **John Saunders** asked if some of the limestone could be recycled from the old building. **Doug Bruce** stated he is not sure if the limestone can be recycled.

**Lee Sandweiss** asked for details on the rooming-house plans.

**Chris Sturbaum** stated he is okay with the demolition

**Lee Sandweiss** stated she hates to see this building go due to its history, but she does like the idea of rooming houses coming back.

**Jeff Goldin** reminded the commission they have no purview over what is going up after the demolition. The commission's purview is to designate or release the permit.

**Duncan Campbell** stated his concern about tearing down buildings that don't fit into the plans of the property owners rather than repurposing the buildings and improving their sustainability

**John Saunders** released **Demolition Delay 18-36**. **Deb Hutton** seconded. **Motion carried 6/0/0**. Doug Bruce did not vote.

#### **COA 18-37**

3820 E. Moores Pike

Petitioner: Phillip Emmi

Partial Demolition for addition.

**Eric Sader** gave presentation. This is the Friends Meeting House.

**Phillip Emmi** explained they were previously approved, but did not start in time. They have scaled the project back due to funds.

**John Saunders** released **Demolition Delay 18-37**. **Sam DeSollar** seconded. **Motion carried 6/0/1**.  
(Yes/No/Abstain)

#### **IV. OLD BUSINESS**

##### **A. Rules, Ethics**

**Conor Herterich** commented he is clarifying the procedure on the national register process before we adopt the updated rules and ethics.

**Deb Hutton** made a motion to table Rules and Ethics. **Sam DeSollar** seconded. **Motion carried 7/0/0**.

##### **B. Retreat**

**Eric Sader** confirmed the retreat will be on October 16, 2018. The venue is to-be-determined.

#### **V. COMMISSIONER COMMENTS**

**Deb Hutton** stated she was in the Batman House and met the grandson of Fred Batman. She was able to get his contact information.

#### **VI. PUBLIC COMMENTS**

NONE

#### **VII. ADJOURNMENT**

Meeting was adjourned at 7:15 pm.

**END OF MINUTES.**