## CITY OF BLOOMINGTON



February 20, 2019 @ 2:00 p.m.
CITY HALL KELLY CONFERENCE ROOM \#155

## PETITIONS:

V-03-19 Canterbury Apartments (Herman \& Kittle Properties)
540 S. Basswood Dr.
Request: Variance from maximum size and number of accessory structures allowed for a multi-dwelling residential development to allow construction of new garages.
Manager: Eric Greulich
**Next Meeting: March 6, 2019

PETITIONER: Herman \& Kittle Properties, Inc.
500 E. $96^{\text {th }}$ Street, Indianapolis, IN
REQUEST: The petitioner is requesting a variance from the maximum number and size of accessory structures allowed for a multifamily property.

REPORT: The 14.3 acre property is located at 540 S. Basswood Drive and is zoned Residential High-Density Multifamily (RH). The property has been developed with several multi-family residential buildings and surface parking lots with portions of the parking covered by detached garages and carports. Surrounding properties to the east and west have also been developed with multi-family residences, while properties to the north are a mix of single family residences and commercial uses and to the south is a conservation area and also multi-family residences.

The property has been developed with 208 multifamily units that serve as low income housing and were constructed approximately 17 years ago. The petitioner is proposing to renovate the property and buildings that will include replacing all of the roofs on the buildings, replacing interior flooring and furnishings, modifying units to be ADA accessible, as well as replacing some of the detached garages and carports located within the parking areas. There are currently 5 detached carports and four detached garages scattered around the parking areas for residents use. The petitioner proposes to remove all 5 of the carports and construct 2 new detached garages instead.

The UDO allows for only 2 enclosed accessory structures and the cumulative square footage of all enclosed accessory structures shall not exceed 1,500 square feet or 50\% of the square footage of the primary structure, whichever is less.

The property currently has 10 enclosed accessory structures ( 4 garages, 5 carports, and 1 clubhouse) that total 14,997 square feet. If this petition is approved, there will be 7 enclosed accessory structures (6 garages and 1 clubhouse) that total 11,679 square feet. The total number of accessory structures will therefore be reduced by 3 on the property and come closer to compliance to current UDO standards.

## CRITERIA AND FINDINGS FOR DEVELOPMENT STANDARDS VARIANCE

20.09.130 e) Standards for Granting Variances from Development Standards: A variance from the development standards of the Unified Development Ordinance may be approved only upon determination in writing that each of the following criteria is met:

1) The approval will not be injurious to the public health, safety, morals, and general welfare of the community.

## PROPOSED FINDING:

Maximum Number: No injury is found with this petition. The 6 proposed detached garages and 1 clubhouse serve the 16 apartment buildings on the site and the number of accessory structures is not out of character with the number of primary structures or scale of this development.

Maximum Size: No injury is found with the granting of this variance. The amount of enclosed structures is proportional to the scale of this development and is appropriate. The square footage of the accessory structures is only $5 \%$ of the total square footage of all of the primary structures.
2) The use and value of the area adjacent to the property included in the Development Standards Variance will not be affected in a substantially adverse manner.

## PROPOSED FINDING:

Maximum Number: No negative effects from this proposal on the areas adjacent to the property are found. The granting of the variance will actually decrease the number of accessory structures on the property. The presence of the detached garages helps protect the belongings and vehicles of the residents thereby reducing storage costs of the residents.

Maximum Size: No negative effects from this proposal on the areas adjacent to the property are found. The proposed total square footage of enclosed accessory structures is proportional to the size of the primary structures and is appropriate. The garages are not seen from any public roads and will complement the design of the primary structures.
3) The strict application of the terms of the Unified Development Ordinance will result in practical difficulties in the use of the property; that the practical difficulties are peculiar to the property in question; that the Development Standards Variance will relieve the practical difficulties.

## PROPOSED FINDING:

Maximum Number: Practical difficulty is found in that the required limitation on the number of accessory structures was to ensure proper relation of accessory structures relative to the number of primary structures. The strict application of the terms of the UDO would not allow the improvements necessary to replace the dilapidated structures on the property. Peculiar condition is found in that there are already more accessory structures on the property that what the UDO allows and that the granting of this variance will allow the property to come closer into compliance with UDO standards.

Parking Setback: Practical difficulty is found in that the required limitation on the size of accessory structures was to ensure the proper proportion of accessory structures relative to the size of primary structures. The strict application of the terms of the UDO would not allow the improvements necessary to replace the dilapidated structures on the property. Peculiar condition is also found in that the site already has more square footage for accessory structures that what the UDO allows and that the granting of this variance will allow the property to come closer into compliance with UDO standards. The size of existing detached structures is only $9 \%$ of the size of the primary structures and is appropriately scaled.

RECOMMENDATION: Based upon the written findings above, the Department recommends that the Hearing Officer adopt the proposed findings and recommends approval of V-03-19 with the following conditions:

1. The petitioners must obtain a building permit prior to construction.
2. This approval is for the submitted site plan only. Any modifications may require separate approval.



V-03-19 Herman \& Kittle Propeties
540 S Basswood Drive
Hearing Officer
2016 Aerial Photograph

By: greulice
15 Feb 19
200

City of Bloomington

## Planning \& Transportation

Scale: $1^{\prime \prime}=200^{\prime}$

January 25, 2019

City of Bloomington Hearing Officer
401 N Morton St
Bloomington, IN 47404
Dear Hearing Officer,

We are respectfully requesting a variance related to the maximum number and maximum size of accessory structures for an existing multi-family property currently known as Canterbury House Apartments ("CHA") located at 540 S Basswood Dr., Bloomington, IN 47403.

CHA is a 208 unit property that we originally developed approximately 17 years ago to serve a predominately lowincome population. While the buildings are structurally sound many of the components are approaching the end of their useful life and we are planning a moderate rehab of the property to ensure its long term viability as safe, quality housing for low-income families. As part of this effort we will rebrand the property to Limestone Crossing.

Though the final scope of work is to be determined, in general we will be updating interiors (including appliances and HVAC systems) as well as replacing all roofs and making exterior repairs as needed. Additionally, we will modify some first floor units to typical Fair Housing/ADA accessibility standards and make corresponding modifications to the flatwork to accommodate these units. The scope does not include any changes to unit count or bedroom count.

Regarding accessory structures, our plan is to remove the existing five carports and to build two new garages similar to the existing four, which will give the property a total of six garages to better meet the needs of our residents. The new garages will be built in existing parking areas resulting in no additional parking spaces and virtually no net increase in impervious area. While the property was originally developed under a different zoning that allowed the existing amount of accessory structures, the current zoning (RH) allows only two accessory structures totaling no more than 1,500 square feet. Our rehab plans result in a net reduction of accessory structures as summarized below:

| Existing | Count | Sq. Ft. |
| :--- | ---: | ---: |
| Garages | 4 | 5,732 |
| Carports | 5 | 6,740 |
| Clubhouse | 1 | 2,525 |
| Total Existing | 10 | 14,997 |
|  |  |  |
| Post-Rehab | Count | Sq. Ft. |
| Garages - Existing | 4 | 5,732 |
| Garages - New | 2 | 3,422 |
| Clubhouse - Existing | 1 | 2,525 |
| Total Post-Rehab | 7 | 11,679 |
|  |  |  |
| Net Change | (3) | $(3,318)$ |

We believe this request is within the guidelines of the Development Standards Variance Criteria:

1) The approval will not be injurious to the public health, safety, morals, and general welfare of the community.
a. Response: The additional garages will be built to the applicable codes and will not be injurious to the public health, safety, morals, and general welfare of the community.
2) The use and value of the area adjacent to the property included in the Development Standards Variance will not be affected in a substantially adverse manner.
a. Response: The additional garages will be within the interior of the property boundaries and we don't foresee any way in which they would impact adjacent properties.
3) The strict application of the terms of the Unified Development Ordinance will result in practical difficulties in the use of the property; that the practical difficulties are peculiar to the property in question; that the Development Standards Variance will relieve the practical difficulties.
a. Response: The additional garages help us meet the storage needs of our residents and spare some residents the difficulties of off-site storage.

Thank you for your consideration of this variance request. If you have any questions or need additional information please contact Steve Graver by phone at 985-290-1843 or email at scraver@hermankittle.com.


Jeffrey L. Kittle
President









$\forall$ NVIONI ' A 'NOOO $\exists \mathrm{ZOYNOW}$
 $S \perp N \exists W \perp Y \forall d \forall$ ตNISSOYว ヨNOISヨWIา










|  |  |
| :---: | :---: |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |


 ©










e




|  | Firae |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Insons | DTEE |
|  |  |  |
|  |  |  |
|  |  |  |
|  |  |  |
|  | NOT SCAE <br> RURED DIMEN | （is．Use |
|  | OEECNO． |  |
|  | 18018 |  |
|  | ［⿴囗十TTIE |  |
|  | ay garage－E | atoos |

AG2 28

GENERAL ELEVATION NOTES

 （


