Bloomington Historic Preservation Commission Showers City Hall McCloskey Room, Thursday March 28, 2019

MINUTES

I. CALL TO ORDER

Meeting was called to order by **Jeff Goldin**, @ 5:05.

II. ROLL CALL

Commissioners

John Saunders Lee Sandweiss Deb Hutton Jeff Goldin Chris Sturbaum

Advisory

Duncan Campbell Ernesto Casteneda Derek Richey

Absent
Sam DeSollar
Susan Dyer
Leslie Abshier
Doug Bruce
Jenny Southern

Staff

Conor Herterich, HAND Eddie Wright, HAND Eric Sader, HAND Phillippa Guthrie, Legal Jeff Underwood, Controller

Guests

Tim Cover Malcom Dalglish Sandy Bonfib Suzanne O'Connell Johnny Bickley Richard Stumper Mark Cornette Selma Sabanovic Matthew Francisco

III. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

A. March 14, 2019 Minutes

John Saunders made a motion to approve March 14th, 2019 Minutes, **Deb Hutton** seconded.

Motion carried 5-0-0 (Yes-No-Abstain)

IV. NEW BUSINESS

Jeff Underwood, City Controller and project manager for construction of the Trades District gave a presentation on the administration building garage. This was a courtesy presentation as this building is not part of the Showers Historic District nor is it on any historic survey or registry. Jeff stated that there is currently no use for the building and it is collapsing and beginning to bow out. The City has had to remove parking next to the building if it collapses it will throw brick outward. The City is going to demolish building as it is reducing the value of the admin building which the City is going to sell. While taking down the structure they will save as much of the brick and other material as possible for future artistic purposes. **Deb Hutton** stated that she is happy that they are saving as much materials as possible. **Duncan Campbell** asked if they have had anyone look at the structure to determine if it might be historic. Jeff Underwood stated that they looked at saving the building but with the roof collapsing the cost to save the structure outweighed the overall value of the building. **Duncan** suggested the building be looked at from a historic perspective before it is decided the structure is noncontributing or has no historic value. Jeff **Underwood** and **Conor Herterich** will look into the history of the building to determine historic value.

V. CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

Staff Review

A. COA 19-14

606 W. Howe (Greater Prospect Hill Historic District)

Petitioner: Lindsey Muller

Build 6' vertical plank privacy fence to replace existing chain link fence.

Conor Herterich gave presentation. See packet for details.

Chris Sturbaum gave a brief explanation of guidelines for fencing.

Commission Review

A. COA 19-09

1111 E. Wylie (Continuation from 2/28/19 Meeting)

Petitioner: Malcolm Dalglish

Widen driveway, relocate retaining wall, and construct shed roof

attachment on east elevation of the home

Conor Herterich gave presentation. See packet for details.

Discussion ensued

Malcolm Dalglish stated the he was using polycarb over tempered glass to make it easier to clean. Also he will be using water to clean the panels on a regular basis. Even though they may yellow or discolor over time it will be easier to replace polycarb panels than tempered glass.

Duncan Campbell stated that he went to the property and looked over the project and the petitioner has done the things asked of him by the Commission at the previous meeting.

John Saunders made a motion to approve **COA 19-09**, **Deb Hutton** seconded. **Motion carried 5-0-0.**

B. COA 19-11 (Continuation from 2/28/19 Meeting) 512 W. Howe (Greater Prospect Hill Historic District) Petitioner: Matthew Francisco & Selma Sabanovic Construct 400sqft garage with a 322sqft ADU unit on the second floor

Conor Herterich gave presentation. See packet for details.

Discussion ensued

Mark Cornett gave a brief discussion on the history on the property, he also discussed the process and the changes made as suggested by the **Commissioners** at the last meeting.

Chris Sturbaum asked about the siding on the front of the house. **Deb Hutton** asked about the second story of the structure infringing upon the neighbors' walnut tree. **Mark Cornett** stated that the electric company has already taken the top out of the tree.

Chris Sturbaum noted the neighborhood approved of the project. John Saunders likes the changes to the project.

John Saunders made a motion to approve COA 19-11, Lee Sandweiss seconded.

Motion carried 5-0-0.

C. COA 19-12

1003 W. Howe (Greater Prospect Hill Historic District) Petitioner: Chris Sturbaum (Golden Hand)

Two additions to the rear of the home.

Phillippa Guthrie clarified that since **Chris Sturbaum** is involved with this project he would have to excuse himself from the discussion phase and abstain

during voting. This does not affect quorum even though only 5 Commissioners are present, including **Chris Sturbaum**.

Conor Herterich gave presentation. See packet for details.

Discussion ensued

Mark Cornett gave a presentation to clarify plans for the project. **Chris Sturbaum** pointed out the fencing at the rear of the property and the alignment of the garage to the house. Also the placement of the doors and the doors on the garage.

Chris Sturbaum then excused himself and left the room prior to the discussion process.

Deb Hutton feels like the placement of the garage placement is a bit much and they should move the garage in line with the house. **Duncan Campbell** and **Derek Richey** like the project and **Jeff Goldin** feels like it fits in with the vision of the neighborhood.

John Saunders made a motion to approve COA 19-12, Lee Sandweiss seconded.

Motion carried 4-0-1. Chris Sturbaum abstained.

D. COA 19-13

221 E. Kirkwood (Victoria Towers)

Petitioner: Tim Cover (Studio 3 Design, Inc)

Add second floor to the one-story addition on north side of property; raise the wall and a portion of the flat roof on a block building addition on the west side; add skylights to roof of original building; restorative work on Kirkwood façade.

Conor Herterich gave presentation. See packet for details.

Discussion ensued

Tim Cover gave an explanation and clarification of the plans for the building.

Chris Sturbaum asked for clarification on the placement of the sky lights. Tim Cover explained exactly where the skylights would be placed, Chris suggested light tunnels as opposed to sky lights provided there is enough ceiling space. Ernesto Casteneda had concerns about so many windows and skylights facing Kirkwood. Lee Sandweiss agrees. Duncan Campbell stated the building has been radically altered, but what he is concerned about is the carriage house. It dominated and separates itself from the structure and he does have a problem with that façade. He suggested removing the artificial doors. He doesn't feel like the sky lights are the issue, it's the addition directly across from the library.

Chris Sturbaum commented that he doesn't have an issue with a structure separate from the main structure. John Saunders agreed with Duncan

Campbell in reference to the carriage house. Ernesto Casteneda stated that he does have a problem with both the sky lights and the carriage house with the artificial doors. Deb Hutton finds the façade of the carriage house to be very busy. Lee Sandweiss agrees with Deb concerning the carriage house. Derek Richey stated that additions to this house began back in the 1950's and has continued to the point that very little of the original house remains. Jeff Goldin agrees with Duncan on the carriage house and he agrees with Ernesto concerning the sky lights. Jeff suggested removing the doors, but he believes this is a good project. It was discussed that denying the petition would allow the petitioner to come back with a redesign at a pace that works for them and not run into problems with the statutory deadline that comes up in two weeks.

Jeff Goldin made a motion to deny **COA 19-13**, **John Saunders** seconded. **Motion carried 5-0-0.**

- VI. DEMOLITION DELAY
- VII. OLD BUSINESS
- VIII. COMMISSIONER COMMENTS
- IX. PUBLIC COMMENTS
- X. ANNOUNCEMENTS
- XII. ADJOURNMENT

Meeting was adjourned by **Jeff Goldin** @ 6:30 pm.

END OF MINUTES