

Bloomington Historic Preservation Commission
Showers City Hall McCloskey Room,
Thursday May 9, 2019
MINUTES

I. CALL TO ORDER

Meeting was called to order by **Jeff Goldin**, @ 5:00 pm.

II. ROLL CALL

Commissioners

John Saunders
Lee Sandweiss
Deb Hutton
Jeff Goldin
Chris Sturbaum
Sam DeSollar
Susan Dyer
Doug Bruce

Advisory

Ernesto Casteneda

Absent

Leslie Abshier
Derek Richey
Jenny Southern
Duncan Campbell

Staff

Conor Herterich, HAND
Eddie Wright, HAND

Guests

Marty Miller
Chuck Heintzeman
Noor Heintzeman
Ania Hill
Narges Noori
Ted Hill
Bryan Payne

III. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

A. April 11, 2019 Minutes

Doug Bruce made a motion to approve the April 11th, 2019 Minutes, **Sam DeSollar** seconded with the amendment to the minutes that the measurement

of the porch height in the Maple Heights courtesy review be changed from feet to inches.

Motion carried 8-0-0 (Yes-No-Abstain)

IV. CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

Staff Review

A. COA 19-23

2820 E. 10th Street (Garton Farm Local HD)

Petitioner: Bloomington Restoration Inc.

Replace modern K-style aluminum gutters with galvanized half round gutters.

Conor Herterich gave presentation. See packet for details.

B. COA 19-24

112 S. Maple Street (Greater Prospect Hill Historic District)

Petitioner: John Kirtland

Replace the limestone stacked piers with a conventional cinder block foundation.

Conor Herterich gave presentation. See packet for details.

C. COA 19-25

530 S. Jordan (Elm Heights Historic District)

Petitioner: Dale & Sharon Andrews

Replace the side door and storm door.

Conor Herterich gave presentation. See packet for details.

D. COA 19-26

115 S. Walnut Street (Courthouse Square Historic District)

Petitioner: Bob Magiera

Installation of 4" refrigeration piping on rear façade.

Conor Herterich gave presentation. See packet for details.

E. COA 19-27

346 S. Rogers Street (Prospect Hill Historic District)

Petitioner: Karla Lewis

Build 8' tall privacy fence along west side of property.

Conor Herterich gave presentation. See packet for details.

Commission Review

A. COA 19-22

1105 W. 3rd Street (Greater Prospect Hill Historic District)

Petitioner: Chuck Heintzelman
Rehabilitation of Gospel Tabernacle building.

Conor Herterich gave presentation. See packet for details.

Discussion ensued

John Saunders asked if this was part of a bigger project, **Jeff Goldin** answered that it is but the commission does not have purview. **Doug Bruce** asked about information about the door. **Conor Herterich** clarified that the information is in the packet. **Sam SeSollar** asked about moving the steps **Chuck Heintzelman** stated that the steps need to be changed because they are no longer in conformance with current code as they wish the use the door as an emergency exit. **Deb Hutton** asked if the style of replacement windows would be based on any evidence of the historic windows. **Chuck** stated that 3 x 5 manufacturing steel windows were found and that many of the windows are damaged but they will try to preserve the stained glass windows and display them inside the building.

Chris Sturbaum stated that he likes the use of the building and the neighborhood is very supportive of the project. The Commissioners were in agreement that this is a very good project. **Doug Bruce** stated that he believes the character defining features will remain intact and he is supportive of the project. **Lee Sandweiss** stated it was a terrific project. **Sam DeSollar** stated that he appreciated the level of work and detail that **Chuck Heintzelman** has given the project. Sam also wanted to make sure that the awning mounting was attached to the mortar joints and not directly into the stone. **Susan Dyar** said that she thinks it is great and she lives and walks by there and is happy to see something done with the building. **Jeff Goldin** stated that this is a great project and that this is how historic preservation works, adaptive reuse. **Chris Sturbaum** had one other thought, and wondered if the awning could have a less steep slope so as not to block the entrance. He stated this was not a condition of approval but that the petitioner should think about it.

John Saunders made a motion to approve COA 19-22, **Sam DeSollar** seconded.

Motion carried 8-0-0

B. COA 19-28

413 S. Highland (Elm Heights Historic District)

Petitioner: Narges Noori

Replace current non-functioning wood windows with ThermaStar, single-hung, vinyl windows.

Conor Herterich gave presentation. See packet for details.

Discussion ensued

Narges Noori clarified why she was requesting the replacement of the windows. She wants the windows to be safe but also remain in conformance with neighborhood standards. They recently had a HAND inspection and none of the windows on the lower level open up. The issue is that these windows do not seal and if we replace them with wood we would have the same problems. The property is a rental and the tenants have tried to do repairs to the windows themselves. She is concerned the current windows are a fire hazard and explained that she wanted to use vinyl windows to replace because the windows will be able to be properly sealed without expansion and contraction of wood. She stated that the windows are truly beyond repair, and everyone else in the neighborhood has vinyl windows so she is not changing the look of the building.

Chris Sturbaum asked what a single hung window is. **Jeff Goldin** answered that it's a window where the top is inoperable. Chris Sturbaum asked if there are going to be grids in the windows, internal, inside the glass. Ted Hill answered that yes the grilles would be inside the window and clarified that the windows would be double hung, not single hung. The new windows will appear as the old windows. He also suggested they consider fiberglass windows as opposed to vinyl because the fiberglass have the grids (grilles) applied to the glass and has a more traditional look. **John Saunders** asked if the weights are out of the windows. He stated it looks like there has been a lot of neglect over the years which is why the sills are rotted. **Ted Hill** stated that most of the windows are just rotted. **Ernesto Casteneda** agreed with **Chris Sturbaum's** statement that adding grill to outside will give more detail to the structure. **Sam DeSollar** asked about the Elm Heights Neighborhood opinion on the changes. **Conor Herterich** stated that Jenny Southern stated the neighborhood would like to see the windows repaired. **Sam DeSollar** asked if Narges was aware that the home was in the Elm Heights historic district when she purchased it. **Narges Noori** stated Reza Kaffash sold the homes to her mother and that her mother had no clue. She blamed Mr. Kaffash on the current problems.

Chris Sturbaum stated that the design of replacement windows have advanced to the point that they look very similar to original wood windows. He is ok with replacement if the new windows look the same as the original windows and have the grids (grilles) on the outside of the glass. **John Saunders** stated that he would like to see the windows removed and repaired, as he feels as though these windows are not in that bad shape. **John** stated that repairing the windows wouldn't cost that much more than replacement windows. **Ernesto Casteneda** stated that he is against vinyl, he wants the grille to be on the outside and encourages removal and repair of the original wood windows or replace with new quality windows. **Deb Hutton** stated she is ok with replacement but wanted to see it look as historic as possible. **Doug Bruce** stated that he agrees with **Chris** that designs of new windows has come very far. But when replacing windows the replacement windows must be right. He could support replacement if the replacement was in kind that had the grid on the exterior. **Lee Sandweiss** agreed with both **Chris** and **Doug**. **Sam DeSollar** stated that the lower windows on the south elevation is what makes the house contributing. As for replacement he has to go with the guidelines and Elm Heights has the most restrictive

guidelines. He stated that his first leaning is to get the windows repaired but that we have to look at what the guidelines say and Elm Heights has one of the most restrictive guidelines in the city. But if these can't be repaired then they must be replaced in kind. **Jeff Goldin** stated that he is with Chris and Doug, and that if they can get some fiber glass windows with some grids that match style and configuration of the current windows that he would be on board, but vinyl windows would destroy this house.

John Saunders made a motion to deny COA 19-28, **Sam DeSollar** seconded.
Motion carried 8-0-0

C. COA 19-29

121 S. Walnut (Courthouse Square Historic District)

Petitioner: John Simon

Install 14" x 30" cast aluminum sign on side of building. See Packet for wall placement, materials, and design. Addition of black text to the face of vinyl awning.

Conor Herterich gave presentation. See packet for details.

Discussion ensued

Marty Miller gave a further explanation of the placement of the sign.

Deb Hutton asked about the wording of the sign. **Marty Miller** explained it was the date K of C assumed ownership. **Sam DeSollar** asked if the sign could be mounted to the mortar joints. He also asked if the lettering is large enough. **Marty Miller** stated he is happy with the sign.

Sam DeSollar made a motion to approve COA 19-29, **Doug Bruce** seconded.
Motion carried 8-0-0.

v. DEMOLITION DELAY

Commission Review

A. Demo Delay 19-06

1723 W. Gray Street

Petitioner: Shelia Stephens

Full demolition of home.

Conor Herterich gave presentation. See packet for details.

Discussion ensued

John Saunders made a motion to waive the demo delay period, **Doug Bruce** seconded.
Motion carried 8-0-0.

B. Demo Delay 19-07

613 N. Morton Street

Petitioner: City of Bloomington

Full demolition of structure.

Conor Herterich gave presentation. See packet for details.

Discussion ensued

Brian Payne added that the city is doing a lot of work in the alley and the building is bulging into the alley.

Chris Sturbaum asked why the building was allowed to deteriorate. **Bryan** stated that he could only speculate. **Ernesto Casteneda** asked about salvaging of the brick. **Bryan** stated they will salvage as much of the brick as possible. Once the garage is down the open lot will be marketed for parking. **Deb Hutton** asked about the building being used in milling operations in the past. **Bryan** stated that he could not be certain, but a gentleman that was involved with project stated that is wasn't. **Sam DeSollar** asked when the building was acquired by the city. **Bryan** stated it was the early 2000's.

Chris Sturbaum stated that the chance to save the building has passed. **John Saunders** stated that it is a shame the city let the building deteriorate. **Doug Bruce** agreed with **Chris Sturbaum**. **Lee Sandweiss** would like to know what the building was used for when the Showers factory was in operation. **Bryan Payne** stated they did an asbestos test and none was found. **Sam DeSollar** stated that he loves this building and he went to the city and tried to save the building in 2016, but was rebuffed, this is a case of demolition by neglect. He would like to see legislation to stop people from letting historic buildings just sit and decay. **Jeff Goldin** stated that trying to save this building at this point would not be realistic, this building is lost.

John Saunders made a motion to waive the demo delay period, **Chris Sturbaum** seconded.
Motion carried 5-1-2.

VI. NEW BUSINESS

- A. Preservation Month Events Update – **Conor Herterich** has organized a history themed trivia competition on May 22nd @ The Mill 6 - 8pm. Food will be served and prizes will be awarded. He also has guest speakers lined up. All funds will be donated to BRI. See packet for further details.

Conor Herterich also has Randy Shipp giving a presentation “Press a Button, Get a House” set for May 31st @ the Waldron Arts Center 7pm. See packet for further details.

Conor Herterich stated that he nominated the Dimension mill for historic recognition.

VII. OLD BUSINESS

VIII. COMMISSIONER COMMENTS

Chris Sturbaum stated he will no longer be on the City Council but he will

continue with Historic Preservation.

John Saunders had concerns about the windows decision earlier in the evening. He feels like they Commission is lightening up. **Sam DeSollar** stated they are interpreting guidelines, and Elm Heights guidelines are very restrictive. **Conor** stated that replacement vs repair is a very hot topic at this time. Indiana Landmarks are working on a set of guidelines. **Jeff Goldin** stated that each case should be reviewed on an individual basis. They are only guidelines and like a court ruling. **Sam DeSollar** stated they are all from different backgrounds and have different viewpoints but they all have the city's best interest at heart.

IX. PUBLIC COMMENTS

X. ANNOUNCEMENTS

XII. ADJOURNMENT

Meeting was adjourned by **Jeff Goldin** @ 6:36 pm.

END OF MINUTES