

Bloomington Historic Preservation Commission
Showers City Hall McCloskey Room,
Thursday May 23, 2019, 5:00 P.M.
MINUTES

I. CALL TO ORDER

Meeting was called to order by **Jeff Goldin**, @ 5:00

II. ROLL CALL

Commissioners

John Saunders
Lee Sandweiss
Jeff Goldin
Chris Sturbaum
Deb Hutton
Leslie Abshier

Advisory

Duncan Campbell
Jenny Southern

Absent

Sam DeSollar
Susan Dyer
Doug Bruce
Ernesto Casteneda
Derek Richey

Staff

Conor Herterich, HAND
Eddie Wright, HAND
Philippa Guthrie, Legal
Eric Sader, HAND

Guests

Lynn Yohn
Jackie Moore
Michael Kee
Jacob Franklin
Lucy Schaisch

III. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

A. May 9, 2019 Minutes

John Saunders made a motion to approve May 9th, 2019 Minutes, **Lee Sandweiss** seconded.
Motion carried 5-0-1 (Yes-No-Abstain)

IV. CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

Staff Review

A. COA 19-30

204 S. Rogers Street (Greater Prospect Hill Historic District)

Petitioner: Lucas Brown

Amend COA 17-06. Painted steel fence will now include wood louvers in the upper panels. Height will remain 8'.

Conor Herterich gave presentation. See packet for details.

Commission Review

A. COA 19-32

325 S. Rogers Street (Prospect Hill Historic District)

Petitioner: Lynn & Teri Yohn

Replace 16 wood windows with custom designed Marvin double hung aluminum clad wood windows.

Conor Herterich gave presentation. See packet for details.

Discussion ensued

Chris Sturbaum asked for a description of the windows and how they are installed. **Lynn Yohn** stated they are insert replacement windows, he stated that he is not an expert and he asked that **Chris** refer to the description in the packet. **Jenny Southern** stated that it appears the damage to the windows are around the bottom and on the sill. **Lynn** stated there is damage at the bottom and on the sash and some of the windows do not open. There was an addition to the house and this is allowing water to leak into the structure. **Jenny** clarified that she was wanting to know what they would do with the most damaged portion of the windows. **Lynn** stated they would remove the windows and repair the substructure, not just a cosmetic repair. **Leslie Abshier** asked what the Commissioners found upon their inspection. **Jeff Goldin** stated that he and **John Saunders** looked at the home that day and they did find some significant water damage to the windows and the home. **John Saunders** stated the sashes are in pretty good shape, the issues are with the sills. He wasn't sure all the water damage was coming from the windows but underneath where they replaced the trim board that wasn't flashed. **Deb Hutton** asked about repairs and outside framing below the bay window. **Lynn Yohn** stated they are not trying to change the aesthetics and just eliminate the leaks and damages. **Duncan Campbell** noted that the request is to change the sashes out. The request is to change the windows but there is an argument that the storm windows don't fit, now the sills may be bad and the flashing may be bad which has nothing to do with the windows sashes. But there is no request to rebuild the sills or re-flash the fascia or the roof. **Duncan** is not convinced that the problem can be resolved by sash replacement and an ill-fitting storm window does not warrant a window replacement. **Lynn Yohn** stated that there are structural problems with the windows, they were not installed properly, are at bad angles and some do not lock.

Chris Sturbaum stated he supported this project the last time it came before the **Commission**, the inserts don't destroy the trim or the interior and the water problems are not from the windows. But he feels like the windows could be restored and he feels like the windows are not allowing the leaking in the home. But Chris does support replacing the windows. **Jeff Goldin** noted that there is a bay window in front with colored glass that will not be replaced. **John Saunders** is not in support of replacement of the windows, and the sill and flashing is the problem. He noted the 60% guideline of the dept. of Interior. **Jenny Southern** stated that replacement of the windows will not fix the leak problem but it is important to protect the structure. **Lynn Yohn** stated the windows may not be causing the leaking but it is contributing. They want to do all the work at once but they want to do it correctly. **Leslie Abshier** stated they need to decide if the windows are deteriorated beyond repair. She asked if the plan to replace the windows is approved do they have a plan to do the remaining work to preserve the structure. She also asked if they have a plan if replacement is denied. **Lynn** stated they do not at this point. But she is concerned if they delay that more deterioration will occur. **Lee Sandweiss** asked if they could address the leakage problem before addressing the windows. **Lynn** stated they have made numerous attempts to address the leakage problem with several contactors and they thought the problem was resolved but the leaks return. **Duncan Campbell** asked if the new windows are aluminum clad window over wood. They are with wood on the inside. **Duncan Campbell** stated that the standard procedure is remove the windows and repair then replace in kind as well as the sash. You cannot truly assess the situation without looking over the sash and the standard is 60% deteriorated for replacement. **Lynn Yohn** stated they are trying to repair before replacement but windows have been replaced in the past and they are trying to bring the windows into conformity. **Duncan** stated that preserving the integrity of the house means the windows should look like the age of the house. **Lynn** stated they will have to replace items on the home to improve the structural integrity. Everything that they are doing will allow the house to stand for another 100 years, which it wouldn't if this work was not done and it remained a rental. **Duncan** stated that he would go to each window and repair each one individually and restore it to original condition if this were his project. **Jeff Goldin** agreed with both **Leslie** and **Chris**. **Chris Sturbaum** suggested that the windows on the porch be retained and the other windows be replaced. He also asked that they save the sashes for restoration at a future date. **Eric Sader** stated that when an item returns to the commission they should focus the new information presented when making a determination.

Chris Sturbaum made a motion they retain the interior window on the porch and replace the remainder of the windows in the home, while retaining, numbering and storing the sashes for later restoration. **John Saunders** seconded.

Motion carried 6-0-0.

B. COA 19-33

715 N. Maple Street (Maple Heights Conservation District)

Petitioner: Mike Kee

New construction on a vacant lot. See Packet for details.

Conor Herterich noted that a member of the neighborhood committee asked if this could be tabled so the neighborhood would have more time to review the plans and provide feedback. **Jeff Goldin** noted that they would like to move forward on this

COA as it has been on the docket for a while and the home owner is under a time constraint. **Chris Sturbaum** asked about the timeline for this project, and why time is so important. **Michael Kee** stated it is because of the time limit from insurance from the previous structure. Also, the 30 day review period will be up before the next Commission meeting on June 13th and it would be automatically approved.

Conor Herterich gave presentation. See packet for details.

Discussion ensued

Jenny Southern stated she can see the issue with the porch and the pitch of the roof. **Michael Kee** stated the pitch is a little off in the drawings. **Jenny** asked about lighting for the project as she didn't see anything listed in the plans. She noted that flood lights are prohibited on homes within the city. **Jeff Goldin** stated the drawings have been stretched to fit on the screen and that may be why the pitch looks a little different. **Deb Hutton** asked what materials would be used. **Michael Kee** stated they are still open on materials to be used, but they are planning on using 6 inch concrete board siding and a shingle roof and regular wooden windows. **John Saunders** asked about the shingles, **Michael** stated they haven't decided on shingles but they will not use three tab shingles. **Lucy Schaisch** stated the neighborhood would like to have the opportunity to review the plans and discuss that with the commission. She stated the neighborhood is having their meeting tonight or they would be present.

Chris Sturbaum asked **Philippa Guthrie** how they could get more time to allow the neighborhood the opportunity to speak. **Philippa** asked if this was the first or second hearing, **Conor Herterich** stated this is the first. They originally brought this before the commission as a courtesy review. **Eric Sader** and **Philippa Guthrie** stated they could either allow him to approve at the staff level or schedule a special meeting.

Chris Sturbaum made a motion to table the matter until a special meeting on June 4th to give the neighborhood time to review the plans and give feedback. **John Saunders** seconded.

Motion carried 6-0-0.

V. DEMOLITION DELAY

A. Demo-Delay 19-08

Petitioner: Jackie Moore

Full demolition of barn structure.

Conor Herterich gave presentation. See packet for details.

Discussion ensued

Jacob Franklin stated they were cleaning the barn and there was structure deterioration and they do not want anyone to enter the barn due to the deterioration. **Leslie Abshier** asked what they would do with the wood, **Jacob** stated he would find a use for the wood as he is in the wood working business. **Deb Hutton** asked for clarification on the date of the barn, 1880 or 1910. Neither **Conor Herterich** nor **Duncan Campbell** could enter the barn so they cannot determine this for certain. **Deb** also asked about the age of the house, **Conor** stated it is circa 1910 that has been heavily modified. **Duncan** stated that anything could be fixed if but there isn't an interest to repair it is not safe to restore. **Deb** asked if **Duncan's** organization

could take the barn down, he stated they really can't save this. **Jeff Goldin** reminded the Commission this is demo delay and the parameters.

John Saunders made a motion to waive the demo delay period. **Leslie Abshier** seconded.

Motion carried 5-0-0.

VI. NEW BUSINESS

Conor Herterich updated the commissioners on the Mill event of May 22nd. He also mentioned the event and guest speaker Randy Shipp on Friday May 31st at 7pm the Waldron Arts Center.

VII. OLD BUSINESS

VIII. COMMISSIONER COMMENTS

Deb Hutton shared that a steel mill her grandfather managed in Hamilton Ont. has been converted to use similar to the Dimension Mill.

Leslie Abshier asked if they could get some clarification on the 60% standard for the replacement of windows. She is concerned that there could be a hardship on people to maintain their homes in a historic fashion. **Conor Herterich** suggested a rubric for determining if a window is deteriorated and grade each one on an individual basis. **Jeff Goldin** stated the home owner needs to bring documentation for the deterioration of the windows. **Conor** mentioned that this will be discussed at this year's retreat. **Duncan Campbell** stated that contributing buildings are just as important as outstanding buildings. He stated that the determination for replacement is always based upon condition. If you stray from the standards then you move into opinion. **Duncan** stated that it does not cost more to repair than it does to replace. **Jenny Southern** said that she restored her windows when she was in college and it was not difficult.

IX. PUBLIC COMMENTS

X. ADJOURNMENT

Meeting was adjourned by **Jeff Goldin** @ 6:27 pm.

END OF MINUTES