

Bloomington Historic Preservation Commission

Showers City Hall, McCloskey Room

Thursday July 25, 2019

MINUTES

Meeting was called to order by Jeff Goldin @ 5:00pm

ROLL CALL

Present

Doug Bruce
Susan Dyer
Jeff Goldin
Deb Hutton
Lee Sandweiss
John Saunders
Chris Sturbaum (5:02)

Absent

Leslie Abshier
Sam DeSollar
Ernesto Casteneda
Duncan Campbell
Jenny Southern
Derek Richey

Staff

Eric Sader, HAND
Angela Van Rooy, HAND
Mike Rouker, Legal

Guests

Joe La Mantia, COA 19-42 Petitioner
Jeannine Butler
Judy Fulford

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

John Saunders made a motion to approve July 11th, 2019 Minutes, **Deb Hutton** seconded.
Motion carried 4-0-2 (Yes-No-Abstain)

CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

Commission Review

A. COA 19-42

820 W. Howe Street (Greater Prospect Hill Historic District)
Petitioner: Joe La Mantia
Removal of historic sidewalk in front of 820 W. Howe and 401 S. Euclid.

Eric Sader gave presentation. See packet for details.

Commissioner Questions

Chris Sturbaum asked whether the neighbor's sidewalk is also included in this petition, as that area is in similar condition. **Eric Sader** confirmed that 820 W Howe and 401 S Euclid are both included. **Chris Sturbaum** stated that this is a critical precedent setting action by the HPC because in the past the HPC protected the sidewalks so that nobody could repair them. When the City did repairs it was expensive and they decayed rapidly (~10 years). Considering the condition of many

of the stones in this 80 year old sidewalk, the best strategy for HPC is to let go of the stones that are beyond repair and focus on saving that portion which can be saved and repaired.

Deb Hutton said on 13th St between Indiana Ave and Woodward Ave. the sidewalk is similar to the one in this petition. IU is now building new sidewalks in that area and using stamped, poured concrete.

Commissioner Comments

Chris Sturbaum stated that it is important and sensible to know when to let something go and when to fix it. That makes HPC be more reasonable and allows continued cooperation with Public Works. This also makes the sidewalks safer for the public.

John Saunders stated he appreciates saving the date-stamped portion of the sidewalk.

Deb Hutton asked if there could be a plaque added to the retaining wall stating the history of the 1939 sidewalk. Maybe it could become part of an historic tour.

Doug Bruce stated that he appreciates **Chris Sturbaum's** comments about the balance between saving structures and letting them go. This is a good compromise because public safety is an issue. HPC is setting up a good precedent for future historic sidewalk repair and preservation.

Lee Sandweiss agrees with others' comments.

Susan Dyer agreed that retention of the 9-foot stretch is a good compromise, and that the current sidewalk is a public safety issue.

Jeff Goldin stated that the petition represents a great balance between historic preservation, public safety, and realistic cost for homeowners. It's great to be saving as many stones as possible so they are available for others to use to fix sidewalks on their properties.

Chris Sturbaum stated that the City has program to share costs with homeowners as an incentive to make sidewalk repairs. **Eric Sader** clarified that this program is currently only available in designated neighborhoods based on low-income census tracts.

John Saunders made a motion to approve COA 19-42, **Susan Dyer** seconded.
Motion carried **7-0-0 (Yes-No-Abstain)**.

DEMOLITION DELAY

Commission Review

A. Demo-Delay 19-12

521 N. Dunn Street

Petitioner: David Howard

Full demolition of the structure

Eric Sader gave presentation. See packet for details.

Jeannine Butler asked HPC to reject releasing this demolition permit. McCalla school is across the street. This was a neighborhood for African American workers, before they moved to the westside. May have been an African American fraternity in this neighborhood, as well as boarding houses. Demolition of this house would destroy the integrity of a core neighborhood. It would start a trend for high rise apartments to be built in this area. Preserve this house to stop incursion of multi-story apartments.

Commissioner Questions

Chris Sturbaum asked if this area this zoned multifamily (**Eric Sader** confirmed that zoning is *residential, multi-family*), as the proposed UDO would turn all multi-family into high-density.

Judy Fulford lived in neighborhood for over 30 years, and expressed her concern that demolition of this house would begin the process of destroying the character of neighborhood. What replaces this house matters. There is a disconnect between what is torn down and what gets built in its place.

Eric Sader reminded everyone that HPC is only focusing on the designation of this particular property, not what might replace it.

Jeannine Butler reiterated her request that HPC not release the Demolition Delay, and

asked Conor to conduct an “in-depth survey” to determine whether this house is worthy of historic designation.

Eric Sader cautioned that preserving this property on the basis of neighborhood character rather than benefits of this particular house may set a precedent for how other properties in this neighborhood might be handled in the future.

Commissioner Comments

Chris Sturbaum noted that a *contributing structure* means that it has value in being a part of the other houses, and what happens in that area is relevant to the decision about this house. Residential/multi-family zoning (5-unrelated individuals) was introduced to moderate neighborhoods that were too dense to down zone to single-family. The proposed zoning change is to do away with Residential/multi-family and make is residential high-density. This is a radical change, if it goes through anything could be built on this property. Advocated tabling until next meeting.

John Saunders said it’s important to retain the character of the neighborhood, and would like to see this property protected.

Deb Hutton advocated tabling until next meeting, and asked that Conor conduct more research.

Doug Bruce concurred. Jeannine’s comments are important, and if there might be more information on the house, HPC should delay a decision in order for Conor to conduct more research.

Lee Sandweiss agreed that HPC should not release the demo delay at this time, and asked if the area could be designated as historic. **Jeff Goldin** clarified that HPC cannot unilaterally designate historic districts. **Chris Sturbaum** said HPC can recommend designations to the City Council, but it’s “messy”. **Lee Sandweiss** suggested that tabling until next meeting would allow Advisory members (who were absent) to contribute what they know about the neighborhood.

Jeff Goldin stated that HPC can start designation process, which would protect the property from today, or HPC can table until the next meeting to allow Conor to conduct further research. **Doug Bruce** advocated tabling because there is no precedent to begin formal designation with a staff report being what it is.

John Saunders made a motion to table Demo Delay 19-12, **Chris Sturbaum** seconded. **Motion carried 7-0-0 (Yes-No-Abstain).**

B. Demo-Delay 19-13

801 S. Walnut Street

Petitioner: David Howard

Full demolition of the structure

Eric Sader gave presentation. See packet for details.

Commissioners reviewed the street view map to get a sense of the surrounding area. Zoning is Commercial Arterial, one of the least restrictive.

Commissioner Questions

Chris Sturbaum asked if the petitioner could explore moving the house.

Commissioner Comments

Chris Sturbaum stated that this is an example of “strayed from the herd house”

John Saunders said that the condition of the inside of the house is not good.

Doug Bruce said this is an example of how HPC looks at “contributing” structures. There is nothing to contribute to in this area, so there is no basis to designate.

Lee Sandweiss agreed that this is the last house of its kind in the area. HPC should let it go.

Jeff Goldin stated that this is a difficult area, and redevelopment could be a positive thing. He sees no reason to save it. Could someone reach out to petitioner to see if he

would be willing to donate it?

Chris Sturbaum added that this is a good example of how Demolition Delay works. Some properties are not worth saving, but Demo Delay gives HPC one more chance to think about it.

John Saunders made a motion to release Demo-Delay 19-13, **Chris Sturbaum** seconded. **Motion carried 7-0-0 (Yes-No-Abstain).**

OLD BUSINESS

Update on “523 W. 7th” historic designation review proceedings

Conor will give an in depth update on the status of 523 W. 7th at the next HPC meeting.

COMMISSIONER COMMENTS

Deb Hutton asked how HPC can ask owner of 523 W. 7th to preserve the central passage house if HPC deals only with the outside of structures. **Jeff Goldin** clarified that HPC is only asking that the owner retain the exterior, and can only hope they save the inside. HPC can only advise.

Doug Bruce invited everyone to come to the Indianapolis Speedway next week Th/F/S/S to see him race his 1972 Formula 4.

Jeff Goldin expressed his appreciation for Jeannine Butler’s presence at the meeting. She served on the HPC for many years and he misses her experience.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

Jeannine Butler stated that when she was on the HPC there was great effort to save every possible property, and in the long run it has been a positive for the City. She is happy to know that the current HPC has released only a small number of Demo Delays.

ADJOURNMENT

Meeting was adjourned by **Jeff Goldin** @ 5:52 pm.

END OF MINUTES