

Bloomington Historic Preservation Commission

Showers City Hall, McCloskey Room

Thursday November 14, 2019

MINUTES

Meeting was called to order by Jeff Goldin @ 5:00 pm

ROLL CALL

Commissioners

Present

Sam DeSollar
Jeff Goldin
Deb Hutton
John Saunders
Lee Sandweiss
Chris Sturbaum

Absent

Leslie Abshier
Susan Dyer
Doug Bruce

Advisory members

Present

Jenny Southern

Absent

Duncan Campbell
Ernesto Casteneda
Derek Richey

Staff

Conor Herterich, HAND
Doris Sims, HAND
Angela Van Rooy, HAND

Mary Catherine Carmichael,
Mayor's Office
Philippa Guthrie, Legal

Guests

Anthony Eller, DD 19-20
Larry Eller, DD 19-20
Becky Hill, PHNA
Chris Floyd, COA 19-64
Student Reporter, IDS

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

John Saunders made a motion to approve October 24th, 2019 Minutes, **Jeff Goldin** seconded.
Motion carried 4-0-2 (Yes-No-Abstain)

CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

Staff Review

A. COA 19-63

403 E. 4th Street (Greater Restaurant Row Historic District)

Petitioner: Dave Harstad

Installation of 35 1/2" x 61 1/2" double hung vinyl window in gable on west elevation

Conor Herterich gave a presentation. See packet for details. Staff approved.

B. COA 19-65

701 W. Dodds Street (McDoel Historic District)

Petitioner: Roy Miller

Replacement of lower exterior door (unoriginal) on east elevation with an embossed steel, six-panel door.

Conor Herterich gave a presentation. See packet for details. Staff approved.

Commission Review

A. COA 19-64

506 S. Ballantine Road (Elm Heights Historic District)

Petitioner: Matheu Architects

Extend rear porch 4' to the west and enclose. Addition of master bathroom over the existing flat roof kitchen.

Conor Herterich gave a presentation. See packet for details. Staff has some concerns about the use of cement board siding on the addition. Overall Staff recommends approval, as the petition is consistent with Elm Heights guidelines and Secretary of the Interior Standards #9.

Chris Floyd, Matheu Architects (petitioner): Material is commonly used on large limestone houses of this period.

Commissioner Questions

Chris Sturbaum: What would you think about the use of bevel (lap) siding? **Chris Floyd**: I would be fine with that. I did not choose it because I thought it would not appeal to the Commission. **Chris Sturbaum**: I have no problem with the use of bevel siding.

Jenny Southern: Is there a portion of the flat roof left on the right side and is there egress to it? Metal rail goes away? **Chris Floyd**: Yes, a portion of the flat roof remains, but no access. Metal railing (not original) will be removed.

Deb Hutton: Can original window in the upper left be reused in the new addition? **Chris Floyd**: No, the bathroom being added is too small to accommodate a window of that size. Bathroom window will match a steel window on the first floor.

Sam DeSollar: Matching roof material to existing roof? **Chris Floyd**: Yes. **Sam DeSollar**: There is a small portion of flat roof that is left, which will be outside the new exterior wall of the bathroom?

Chris Floyd: Yes, it extends about 12-18 inches. **Sam DeSollar**: What is the roof slope and the roofing material for the porch extension? **Chris Floyd**: Slope is about an inch-12. Material will be two layers of ice dam and rubber with asphalt shingles on top for appearance.

Commissioner Comments

General agreement that project is well designed.

Sam DeSollar: I appreciate your sensitivity to the period. I think the foot and a half eave is going to look weird and the water proofing is going to be interesting.

John Saunders made motion to approve COA 19-64, 506 S. Ballantine Road. **Lee Sandweiss** seconded. **Motion carried 6-0-0** (Yes-No-Abstain).

DEMOLITION DELAY

Commission Review

A. Demo-Delay 19-21

829 E. Cottage Grove Avenue

Petitioner: Keenyn Smith

Partial demolition: Moving original basement window located on south elevation 32" to the east to meet egress requirements.

Conor Herterich gave a presentation. See packet for details. Staff recommends release of demolition delay, as alterations are not significant enough to recommend historical designation.

Commissioner Questions

None

Commissioner Comments

Sam DeSollar: After moving the window, they should maintain the façade material on this elevation.

Jeff Goldin: Since this is a demo delay, we can only make suggestions or designate.

Sam DeSollar: Please note in the minutes that this is my suggestion.

John Saunders made a motion to waive the demolition delay waiting period for Demo Delay 19-21. **Chris Sturbaum** seconded. **Motion carried 6-0-0** (Yes-No-Abstain).

B. Demo-Delay 19-20

1508 W. 11th Street

Petitioner: Thomas Excavating

Full demolition of primary and accessory structures.

Conor Herterich gave a presentation. See packet for details. Staff recommends release of demolition delay.

Petitioner: House is in very bad condition: floors are caving in. We want to clean up the neighborhood.

Commissioner Questions

None

Commissioner Comments

None

John Saunders made a motion to waive the demolition delay waiting period for Demo Delay 19-20. **Chris Sturbaum** seconded. **Motion carried 6-0-0** (Yes-No-Abstain).

NEW BUSINESS

A. HPC Consulting Grant Application: 213 S. Rogers Street (Frosted Foods Building)

Conor Herterich: HPC offers \$300-400 grant for A&E work prior to physical restoration. HPC must make a motion to approve the grant. Owners want to replace canopy, tuck point, repair limestone, paint. They wanted to cut off the chimney, but Staff determined that was not acceptable.

Deb Hutton: Is this a typical use of such a grant? **Conor Herterich:** Yes, HPC has plenty of money in the budget for this type of grant. This would be the first we've awarded for 2019.

Jeff Goldin: This is an important building. I think it's a great idea.

Conor Herterich: Approving this grant does not mean that you are approving the work. Owner still needs to submit a COA to HPC for approval. This building is locally designated.

Chris Sturbaum: Is this grant for design consulting? **Conor Herterich:** Yes.

John Saunders made a motion to award an HPC Consulting Grant to 213 S Rogers St. **Deb Hutton** seconded. **Motion carried 6-0-0** (Yes-No-Abstain).

OLD BUSINESS

A. Kohr Hospital Building Historic Designation

Conor Herterich: Bloomington's hospitals have a long history at this site: 1905 local Council of Women purchased an Italianate farmhouse (Hopewell House) for the first hospital. After WWI there was need to expand from 10 beds, so a 35-bed limestone building was constructed. In 1947 the Kohr building was constructed. Current hospital building dates to the 1960s, with additions in the 1990s, which resulted in the demolition of the Hopewell House and the 1919 structure. Therefore, the Kohr building is the oldest extant structure on the site.

Staff finds that the Kohr Building meets two of the ten criteria for historic designation:

1A: Association with the evolution of the hospital site and because it has historical value as the oldest building on the grounds.

2G: Kohr represents a minimalist Art Deco style, which was popular in the U.S. from the 1920s to the 1940s. A lot of public building were built in the Art Deco style. Features include a sleek linear appearance and geometric ornamentation. Kohr Building presents bold massing, verticality, stylized ornamentation that characterizes Art Deco.

Chris Sturbaum: Were there other criteria that you thought were close? (e.g. architect?)

Conor Herterich: We know who the architect was, but I believe that he was not a prominent enough figure (locally) to warrant use as a criterion for designation.

Commissioner Comments

Chris Sturbaum: This is an important building in the city's history. Memorializes the hospital site and the local Council of Women. Architecturally it holds an important corner. Deserves to at least go to Common Council for consideration.

John Saunders: How structurally sound is it? **Chris Sturbaum:** It's solid as a rock. One of the worries about it is that walls between offices would be hard to move.

Jenny Southern: It's a cool building, made of local stone. Speaks to the style of the period. It's well-kept, in good condition. Could easily be reused.

Lee Sandweiss: Agree with **Chris**. It's an important part of hospital history, and is a fine example of Art Deco style. We don't have a lot of Art Deco in Bloomington. It has been reused successfully, and could be reused again.

Deb Hutton: I agree with others' comments.

Sam DeSollar: City has raised concerns over costs. City requested that they get their info together before we vote. Maybe we should consider this. There is a hardship—where does the money come from? If we want to designate it, can we help pay for it? I want to know costs and structural integrity. Hospital totally changed this neighborhood. How can this site be redeveloped? Can it be brought back to a single family neighborhood? I want to hear more from the City before making a move on this.

Jeff Goldin: I share Sam's concerns.

Chris Sturbaum: We're not the engineering commission, or the how-will-it-be-reused budget commission. We're the Historic Preservation Commission. Other concerns are not ours. Council will consider the hardships. I suggest that we consider whether or not it's historic.

Mary Catherine Carmichael, Public Engagement Director, Office of the Mayor: Information is still being gathered about the building. The Administration would prefer for everyone to wait on this decision. Nothing is going to happen on this site anytime soon. We don't have all of the information we need to make an informed decision. The site on which the Kohr building stands is part of a big redevelopment of 24 acres. The City recognizes that Kohr is an important building, and will not tear it down without consulting HPC. Based upon what we do know, there looks to be a \$10.5 million shortfall between the value of building and work that would need to be done to make it whole again, as the back of it will come off where it is attached to the current hospital building. Asbestos is also an issue, which has not yet been fully investigated.

Jeff Goldin: Asbestos will have to be dealt with no matter the fate of the building, so that isn't really a consideration.

Philippa Guthrie: If the building is demolished, the cost will not be ours to bear.

Jeff Goldin: The point is that the hospital will not be moving for at least two years. There is no rush. There are lots of things to consider. We owe it to the people who are developing the site to take our time.

Chris Sturbaum: I don't agree. We owe it to developers to let them know whether we think this is an historic building. Decisions will be made based upon our decision. We will hear, "it's too late" or "we've already made a decision". This building will not be less historic in a couple of months.

Jeff Goldin: Is it fair to start this process now, when we're in the middle of so many other things? We have to be realistic about the political side of this. Is City Council even going to consider this right now?

Chris Sturbaum: Council could put this off for a long time. Our only role is to decide if this is an historic building or not. Things will happen if we don't put this in place. Things may happen anyway, but we are the only people in the City speaking up for this building at this moment. If we don't do this, it increases the likelihood of demolition.

Mary Catherine Carmichael: The Administration will not pull a fast one on the HPC. We respect this body and its responsibilities. This is a question of timing. The rush feels artificial to me. I think it's always unwise to make a decision without all of the facts.

Chris Sturbaum: Would you rather we make this decision at the last minute? We know it's historic.

Mary Catherine Carmichael: Its years before the last minute. There's no last minute looming.

Chris Sturbaum: The hospital is going to have to start committing to demolition. We have some time, but the hospital is calling the shots.

Mary Catherine Carmichael: The City is in cooperative negotiation with the hospital.

Chris Sturbaum: I've heard the discussions. Every fact that was brought up said "tear it down". Whether the building is historic is a fact to consider as well. We shouldn't wait until more facts can be built up about why it can't be saved. The Showers building was the same. There were so many reasons given for how it couldn't work, but against all odds it was saved. And it was worth saving. Council can counter us with all the practical reasons in the world. We just have to say it's historic. That won't change in a month or in three months. It's better for them to know what we think.

Sam DeSollar: What is the timeline for getting this information?

Mary Catherine Carmichael: Within the first quarter of next year.

Jeff Goldin: Do you know the hospital's deadline for deciding on demolition.

Mary Catherine Carmichael: We're negotiating with them.

Chris Sturbaum made a motion to recommend the Kohr Building to the Common Council for historic designation. **Deb Hutton** seconded. **Motion carried 3-2-1** (Yes-No-Abstain).

Deb Hutton: When homeowners come before this commission, with properties in very poor condition, we have made them rehab those buildings at their own cost. If we're willing to tell an individual homeowner that they cannot demolish a little house, we have to be willing to do the same for City or a corporation, or for a business, etc.

Jenny Southern: This Commission cannot designate a building as historic. We can only recommend. Council are the money people, and they will make the decision whether or not to designate. Our only role is to determine the building's historic value, regardless of other considerations.

Chris Sturbaum: Only Council can protect the building. HPC cannot protect it.

Jeff Goldin: There is another step to this process. Are we going to place interim protection on this building?

Chris Sturbaum made a motion to place the Kohr Building under Interim Protection pending action by the Common Council, under BMC 8.08.015. **John Saunders** seconded. **Motion**

carried 4-0-2 (Yes-No-Abstain).

Deb Hutton: I would like to assure the Administration that the HPC will do whatever it can to find grant money at the state and federal levels to help ameliorate the City's costs.

Chris Sturbaum: We could seek designation on the National Historic Register.

Conor Herterich: With National Register designation, we would have access to federal tax rehabilitation credits at 20% (which were used to rehab the Showers building).

ANNOUNCEMENTS

Conor Herterich: Remember that tomorrow there is a Board and Commission Appreciation event at the Cascades Clubhouse, beginning at 5:30.

ADJOURNMENT

Meeting adjourned by Jeff Goldin at 5:51 p.m.

END OF MINUTES