

Bloomington Historic Preservation Commission

Showers City Hall, McCloskey Room

Thursday October 24, 2019

MINUTES

Meeting was called to order by Jeff Goldin @ 5:01 pm

ROLL CALL

Commissioners

Present

Leslie Abshier
Susan Dyer
Jeff Goldin
Lee Sandweiss
John Saunders
Chris Sturbaum

Absent

Doug Bruce
Sam DeSollar
Deb Hutton

Advisory members

Present

Duncan Campbell
Jenny Southern

Absent

Ernesto Casteneda
Derek Richey

Staff

Eric Sader, HAND
Angela Van Rooy, HAND
Philippa Guthrie, Legal

Mary Catherine Carmichael,
Office of the Mayor

Guests

Mary Ann Valenta, IU Health
Jamie Morris, D-D 19-18
Becky Holzman, Prospect Hill

Jeff Goldin has received several requests to delay the Commission’s discussion of the Kohr Hospital Building until IU Health completes its assessments and research of the site. Therefore, he suggested that the Commission table this item until a future meeting.

John Saunders made a motion to table the discussion of item VI.A., “Historic Designation of the Kohr Hospital Building” to a future meeting. **Susan Dyer** seconded. **Motion carried 5-0-0** (Yes-No-Abstain)

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

John Saunders made a motion to approve October 4th, 2019 Special Meeting Minutes, **Susan Dyer** seconded. **Motion carried 3-0-2** (Yes-No-Abstain)

John Saunders made a motion to approve October 10th, 2019 Minutes, **Susan Dyer** seconded. **Motion carried 3-0-2** (Yes-No-Abstain)

DEMOLITION DELAY

A. **Demo-Delay 19-18**

119 S Clark Street

Petitioner: Casey Peck

Full demolition of accessory building

Eric Sader gave presentation, see packet for details. Staff recommends release of the Demo-Delay 19-18, as accessory structure does not meet criteria for historic designation.

Jamie Morris, Petitioner’s Representative—structure has a dirt floor

Commissioner Questions

John Saunders—Is the structure in decay? **Jamie Morris**—Yes, there’s wood rot, chipping paint, not well-maintained.

Lee Sandweiss—Are they going to build another garage? **Jamie Morris**—Property is for sale. There may be a request to demo the house sometime in the future, as its foundation is compromised.

Commissioner Comments

Duncan Campbell—Accessory structures are historic too, but we would not designate it without the house.

Chris Sturbaum—I have fixed many like this. It can be repaired and a slab added underneath. Often lose the setback if taken down. This structure has value.

Jeff Goldin—I have fixed a structure just like this one

Jenny Southern: Surprised that it will be demolished when house is for sale?

John Saunders made a motion to waive the demolition delay waiting period for Demo Delay 19-18.

Susan Dyer seconded. **Motion carried 5-0-1** (Yes-No-Abstain).

Chris Sturbaum commented that releasing the Demo Delay does not mean that the owner has to tear down the structure, only that they have permission to do so.

B. Demo-Delay 19-19

3620 E 3rd Street

Petitioner: Jay Cherry

Full demolition of house

Eric Sader gave presentation, see packet for details. Staff recommends release of the Demo-Delay 19-19, as structure does not meet criteria for historic designation.

Commissioner Questions

Chris Sturbaum—What surrounds it? **Jeff Goldin/Eric Sader**—a mix of new and older homes on large lots, with large setbacks.

Jenny Southern—Will they have to build 15 feet from the road? **Eric Sader**—There are minimum setbacks, don’t think there are maximum setbacks.

Lee Sandweiss—Why do they want to tear it down?

Leslie Abshier—Does it meet criteria for designation? **Jeff Goldin**—not according to Conor’s research.

Commissioner Comments

Duncan Campbell—What information does Staff have? I would like to have all of the information so I can decide if it meets criteria for designation. I don’t want Staff giving recommendations based upon information they’re not giving us or haven’t found **Eric Sader**—Conor and I did visit the property and do a walk-around.

John Saunders—What is property class “commercial housing”? **Jeff Goldin**—It means it was a rental, what is zoning? Residential Single-family.

Leslie Abshier—Agree with Duncan. **Duncan Campbell**—It’s on the (SHAARD) Survey, so at least give us the survey information.

Jeff Goldin—We can table until Conor is here and can do more research. My personal opinion is that we’re not going to designate this property.

Chris Sturbaum—I think we should just go ahead and release it.

John Saunders made a motion to waive the demolition delay waiting period for Demo Delay 19-19.

Susan Dyer seconded. **Motion carried 4-2-0** (Yes-No-Abstain).

NEW BUSINESS

A. Historic Designation of the Kohr Hospital Building (tabled to future meeting)

Chris Sturbaum—Does the fact that the building might have asbestos in it relate to its historic value?

Jeff Goldin—It's an economic discussion too. The estimate to rehab the building is \$12,000,000.

Chris Sturbaum—Our job is only to decide if it deserves historic protection. The Council can decide based upon other criteria.

Jeff Goldin—I would still like to wait until we have all of the information.

Leslie Abshier—I agree it's fair to wait, we have been asked to wait.

Chris Sturbaum—How long will it take?

John Saunders—First quarter of 2020.

Philippa Guthrie—IU Health is doing a complete analysis of the building in the event they have to demolish it.

Chris Sturbaum—It would be more informative to the City and the Hospital, if they knew that we considered it an historic building.

Jeff Goldin—I agree with Chris.

COMMISSIONER COMMENTS

Jenny Southern—I attended the special Council meeting during which there was a lot of discussion of building duplexes/triplexes/quads in historic districts. One Council member mentioned that homes that are *contributing* must be brought before the HPC before they can be torn down. People were content with this. But this worries me because HPC does not designate many Demo-Delays. Council doesn't understand how many we release for demolition. I think we will have many more Demo-Delays in the future if the UDO goes through.

Chris Sturbaum—I told the Council that Conservation Districts don't review additions (only demolition or new construction). In an Historic District we would review it as an addition. Preservation will not stop duplexes/triplexes; it can only stop demolition. Up to 50% demolition does not come to HPC (whether it's the front half or the back half). Height of a new building is restricted within 50 feet of an *outstanding* or *significant* building, but not for a *contributing* building (which are 90% of an historic district).

Philippa Guthrie—50% demolition is not changing in the new UDO. That is the current definition of "substantial demolition".

Eric Sader—On all of the newest surveys *contributing* properties require Staff review.

Jeff Goldin—If we can alter historic houses into a duplexes/triplexes, is that bad? How does the Commission feel about increasing density in historic districts?

Chris Sturbaum—That's not our purview. Our job is to focus on historic compatibility.

Jenny Southern—It doesn't matter how the building is used. It could be a restaurant.

Duncan Campbell—Easiest way the think about it is that HPC doesn't evaluate use (under the law).

Chris Sturbaum—Are we going to consider the Kohr building at our next meeting?

Jeff Goldin—I think based upon what Chris said earlier, we should alter our previous motion to specify discussion will be at the next meeting.

John Saunders made a motion to table the discussion of item VI.A., "Historic Designation of the Kohr Hospital Building" to the next HPC meeting on November 14, 2019. **Chris Sturbaum** seconded. **Motion carried 6-0-0** (Yes-No-Abstain)

ADJOURNMENT

Meeting adjourned by Jeff Goldin at 5.39 p.m.

END OF MINUTES