

Bloomington Historic Preservation Commission

Showers City Hall, McCloskey Room

Thursday October 10, 2019

MINUTES

Meeting was called to order by Jeff Goldin @ 5:03 pm

ROLL CALL

Commissioners

Present

Doug Bruce
Sam DeSollar
Jeff Goldin
Deb Hutton
Lee Sandweiss
John Saunders
Chris Sturbaum

Absent

Leslie Abshier
Susan Dyer

Advisory members

Present

Duncan Campbell
Jenny Southern
Derek Richey

Absent

Ernesto Casteneda

Staff

Eric Sader, HAND
Angela Van Rooy, HAND
Philippa Guthrie, Legal
Conor Herterich, HAND

Guests

Jaime Galvan, 324 S Rogers
Brett Pafford, Princess Theatre
Subin Pafford, Princess Theatre
Kevin Stearns-Bruner, 1313 S
Madison St.
Bill Glass, 1119 E 1st St.
Amanda Herterich

Jeff Goldin—We've had a couple of hiccups lately. I may have played a part in that by rushing through meetings. I want ask for Commissioners' help to be sure that we don't make mistakes in the future by paying attention to all of the details. Thank you for your work and for your help.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

John Saunders made a motion to approve September 26th, 2019 Minutes, **Doug Bruce** seconded.
Motion carried 6-0-1 (Yes-No-Abstain)

CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

Staff Review

A. COA 19-59

101 W. Kirkwood Avenue (Courthouse Square Historic District)

Petitioner: Everywhere Signs

Signage text change. Font, size, and location of sign will remain the same as before.

Conor Herterich gave presentation (see packet for details). Project meets guidelines. Staff approved.

Commission Review

A. COA 19-48

324 S. Rogers Street (Prospect Hill Historic District)

Petitioner: Jaime Galvan

Remove aluminum siding and restore original siding on east and south gables where possible. Add small balcony to north gable.

Conor Herterich gave presentation (see packet for further details). Staff recommends approval with these findings: (1) Remove aluminum siding and restore/replace siding to match original; (2). Small balcony on north elevation is appropriately scaled, as previously requested by HPC.

Jaime Galvan, Petitioner—I intend to keep what siding I can. Damaged siding will be replaced. Balcony size will match where the support beams are on the house.

Commissioner Questions

Duncan Campbell—Clarification on siding under gable, will aluminum remain below this? **Conor Herterich**—Yes.

Chris Sturbaum—Why take siding off gables? Water will get in. **Petitioner**—Inside of the gables will be built in and will need insulation and extra framing to support gable. Add decking on outside and moisture/air barrier. Water will not penetrate.

Doug Bruce—Question for Staff: We don't have say over things he's not touching, e.g. aluminum siding that is not slated for removal at this time? **Conor Herterich**—We can't demand that he replace all siding at one time. The question we have to ask is "is it appropriate to remove the aluminum siding?"

Sam DeSollar—Balcony is deep enough to occupy, so how will it be attached to structure? **Petitioner**—will be cantilevered to two loadbearing walls 6-8 feet inside. Inconspicuous metal railing, wood decking.

Commissioner Comments

Duncan Campbell—Significant structure because it's a John Nichols home. I believe it's the last one in Bloomington that hasn't yet been remodeled on the outside.

Chris Sturbaum—May be decorative patterns hiding in gable ends; important to replicate. Will likely find 90%+ siding that can be saved.

Jenny Southern—Suggest we approve with condition that any decorative details found will need to be Staff approved before removal. Balcony railing, I recommend staying as simple as possible.

Doug Bruce—Appreciate that Petitioner is willing to save and use wood siding.

Sam DeSollar—Concerned about structure of balcony. Water may come in where you cut a hole in the house for cantilever. Suggest hanging it from outside.

Jeff Goldin—Appreciate Petitioner's efforts and his willingness to work with HPC.

Chris Sturbaum—Metal balcony would be an option, anchored to side of house.

Duncan Campbell—Balcony has to look like what is presented here, this is not a carte blanche.

Deb Hutton made a motion to approve COA 19-48, 324 S. Rogers Street, with caveat of Staff approval prior to removal of any decorative detail that may be found under aluminum siding. **Doug Bruce** seconded. **Motion carried 7-0-0** (Yes-No-Abstain).

B. COA 19-62

324 S. Rogers Street (Prospect Hill Historic District)

Petitioner: Jaime Galvan

Construct addition to rear of home (west elevation). Color will be white.

Conor Herterich gave presentation (see packet for further details). Staff recommends approval.

Commissioner Questions

Duncan Campbell—Is porch original? **Petitioner**—I'm guessing not. **Duncan Campbell**—I would like a second opinion before approving removal. Are 2nd story windows taller than ground floor windows?

Petitioner—yes. **Chris Sturbaum**—Duncan are you suggesting that upper windows should be short too.

Duncan Campbell—Would rather see taller windows below so they match, paired or not. Tall, narrow windows are important to the look of the house. **Petitioner**—I would agree to increase height of lower windows.

Jeff Goldin—Duncan does addition have to match original? **Duncan Campbell**—Rear additions have more leeway, but you still want to do the best job you can. I think this is an important detail.

Chris Sturbaum—I would like reassurance that the intent is to match new siding to the original.

Petitioner—I have already committed to that in previous meetings. **Chris Sturbaum**—Will you build out window trim on new windows to match old? **Petitioner**—yes

Jenny Southern—What is date of house? **Petitioner**—1889. **Jenny Southern**—Likely one or two cisterns/wells in back yard; use caution. You should also match trim.

Derek—Question for HPC: Have we approved crazy extensions on other houses? **Jeff Goldin** —yes

Commissioner Comments

Chris Sturbaum—I would like a commitment that all aluminum siding will come off within a 10 year window. (Petitioner did not want to agree to this and neither Derek Richey nor Sam DeSollar thought we should be asking for this kind of 10 year commitment.)

Lee Sandweiss—Appreciate Petitioner working with HPC.

Sam DeSollar—Thanks for making changes based on previous HPC comments. Petitioner taking pains to differentiate addition from original house.

Derek Richey—Should be able to tell that this is an addition, rather than try to copy the original.

Jeff Goldin—Agree with Sam and Derek. I am for approval.

John Saunders made a motion to approve COA 19-62, 324 S. Rogers Street. **Sam DeSollar** seconded.

Motion carried 7-0-0 (Yes-No-Abstain).

C. COA 19-53

324 S. Rogers Street (Prospect Hill Historic District)

Petitioner: Jaime Galvan

Rehabilitate shed/carriage house. Work includes adding foundation, straightening and stabilizing walls, replace windows and doors, and patch/replace siding where needed.

Conor Herterich gave presentation (see packet for further details). Staff recommends approval, with condition that double doors remain on side facing Prospect Street.

Jaime Galvan, Petitioner—agreed

Commissioner Questions

Duncan Campbell—What's going on with horizontal boards to right of door? **Petitioner**—Don't know what that was, maybe a door? There is currently a cabinet behind it. **Duncan Campbell**—Is this a wholesale remodel? Or is it being done because it has to be done? These are the questions you should be asking. **Petitioner**—There is a lot of decay. Front wall is bowed, foundation is gone.

Chris Sturbaum—Will structure be insulated and heated? What is future intent of building? **Petitioner**—yes, insulated/heated. Don't know what I'll do with it in the future. Currently used as a garden shed.

John Sanders—Will new windows be in same location? In drawing they appear higher up. **Petitioner**—Windows will be in same location and will mimic originals. Windows are not consistent throughout the building.

Jenny Southern—Tree is heaving a corner. Are you going to remove it? **Petitioner**—Yes, will remove tree. **Jenny Southern**—Are the replacement windows double-hung? Are you replacing wood on outside? You could keep horizontal boards to the right of the door to maintain some of the history of the building.

Petitioner—Windows will be double-hung. Repairing and only replacing wood where needed.

Deb Hutton—Will metal chimney be staying? **Petitioner**—Removing chimney and inside stove.

Sam DeSollar—Will foundation be a slab? **Petitioner**—Foundation wall, no slab. Will raise building about 6". Will have some kind of floor on the inside.

Commissioner Comments

Duncan—Boarded up section next to the door was probably another door, back windows are replacements, so don't replace them (replace with 3 over 3 to match the originals). Looks like window was where stack is now, you could replace that window as well. All windows should match.

Doug Bruce—I like this quirky building as it is, don't match the windows and homogenize. Embrace the building for what it was and what it is.

Lee Sandweiss—Agree with Doug, it should retain as much of its original character as possible.

Sam DeSollar—Third the quirkiness, appreciate keeping materials and giving it foundational structure.

Derek Richey—Fourth the quirkiness.

Jeff Goldin—Fifth the quirkiness.
Chris Sturbaum left the meeting at 6:21 p.m.

John Saunders made a motion to approve COA 19-53, 324 S Rogers St. **Doug Bruce** seconded.
Motion carried 6-0-0 (Yes-No-Abstain).

D. COA 19-58

1119 E. 1st Street (Elm Heights Historic District)
Petitioner: Fionnuala Thinnis
Removal of mature tree in front yard.

Conor Herterich gave presentation (see packet for further details). Staff recommends approval.
Neighborhood is in favor of tree removal.

Bill Glass, Petitioner's Representative—Saucer magnolia is healthy, but removal is necessary to protect the home. The tree was originally planted too close to the house.

Commissioner Questions

None

Commissioner Comments

Jenny Southern—There has been a lot of damage to the terrace of the home. I encourage owners to begin repair immediately.

Deb Hutton—Right thing to do.

Lee Sandweiss—This is important to the integrity of the house.

John Saunders made a motion to approve COA 19-58, 1119 E 1st St. **Lee Sandweiss** seconded.
Motion carried 6-0-0 (Yes-No-Abstain).

E. COA 19-60

206 N. Walnut Street
Petitioner: Bret Pafford
Rebuild front entryway to bring doors located on either side of the "ticket both" closer to the sidewalk.

Conor Herterich gave presentation (see packet for further details). Staff recommends approval.

Commissioner Questions

Duncan Campbell—have you contacted BRI for approval? **Petitioner**—Yes.

Sam DeSollar—Where is the language in guidelines about primary and secondary entrances? **Conor Herterich**—That actually refers to secondary facades or alleyways, not secondary entrances on the main facade. **Sam DeSollar**—Will this affect façade tile? **Petitioner**—Original façade will be repaired.

Derek Richey—You did bring this to BRI? **Petitioner**—Yes.

Commissioner Comments

Duncan Campbell—This is a major alteration to original façade, bad idea. Put up a gate to help with vagrancy problem.

John Saunders—No problem with it because it can be removed in future.

Jenny Southern—Lighting would do wonders for keeping people from peeing in the alcove. They are looking for a dark corner, so eliminate the dark corner.

Doug Bruce—Is there an interesting ceiling in the alcove? **Conor Herterich**—Decorative details where wall meets ceiling. **Doug Bruce**—Original doors and transom being reused and brought forward? **Petitioner**—Yes.

Sam DeSollar—Agree with Duncan. Better solutions would be lighting and a gate.

Derek Richey—Agree with Duncan and Sam.
Jeff Goldin—Proposal is inappropriate for this building.

Sam DeSollar made a motion to deny COA 19-60, 206 N Walnut Street. **Lee Sandweiss** seconded.
Motion carried 6-0-0 (Yes-No-Abstain).

F. COA 19-61

1313 S Madison Street (McDoel Gardens Historic District)
Petitioner: Kevin Stearns-Bruner
Addition of 228 square feet on the north side of the residence

Conor Herterich gave presentation (see packet for further details). Staff recommends approval. Neighborhood approves the addition.

Commissioner Questions

Derek Richey—Unanimous neighborhood support? **Conor Herterich**—yes

Commissioner Comments

Duncan Campbell—Roofline is not well thought out. **Petitioner**—Hip roof or gable roof would put too much weight on the existing rafters/roof. Neighborhood expressed that this design impinged less on the original roof line, and this was less obtrusive as an addition. It's set back about six feet from front of house.

Sam DeSollar—Under the guidelines, have no problems with this.

John Saunders made a motion to approve COA 19-61, 1313 S Madison Street. **Deb Hutton** seconded.
Motion carried 6-0-0 (Yes-No-Abstain).

NEW BUSINESS

A. Historic Preservation Fund grants for CLGs.

Conor Herterich—This fund has over \$100,000 to give. Deadline unknown; should know next week. Commissioners please submit ideas for projects that Staff might apply for.

Deb Hutton—Suggest Batman house. Also, HPC has an open invitation to go to Madison to be hosted by their Historic Preservation Office. **Conor Herterich**—Great idea. That could count as HPC training.

Jenny Southern—Print paper guidelines for historic districts.

OLD BUSINESS

A. HPC Retreat

Conor Herterich—Commissioners please email topic ideas for HPC Retreat. Will be held Nov 6th or 7th at 2nd Baptist Church.

COMMISSIONER COMMENTS

Duncan Campbell—Shouldn't Kohr Building at hospital site be on our agenda? **Conor Herterich**—It will be on the October 24th agenda.

Deb Hutton—We had interim protection motion right in front of us on the sheet we use for Demo Delays. I request that Angela reformat the Demo Delay release paper to make it more visually accessible.

Eric Sader—Legal Dept. is in discussions with Planning and Transportation for violations and fines for demolition of 523 W. 7th St. house. Each day until permit was issued would be a separate violation; starts with \$2500, goes up to \$7500 the next day, each subsequent day an additional doubling could occur. If you have input for consideration, please pass it along to Conor. **Jeff Goldin**—Owner knew our wishes and went ahead anyway. An example should be made. **Derek Richey**—This is a little guy. We don't want to bankrupt them. If this were a major corporation, would we go after them just as hard? I hope that answer would be yes **Duncan**

Campbell—We're the ones that screwed up. Demolition dispute is not up to this board. **Eric Sader**—You can provide input. **Sam DeSollar**—We shouldn't have input. It's not our domain. We didn't do what we should have done.

Meeting adjourned by Jeff Goldin 7:04@ p.m.

END OF MINUTES