

Bloomington Historic Preservation Commission

Showers City Hall, McCloskey Room

Thursday September 12, 2019

MINUTES

Meeting was called to order by Jeff Goldin @ 5:02pm

ROLL CALL

Commissioners

Present

Jeff Goldin
Deb Hutton
John Saunders
Chris Sturbaum
Sam DeSollar

Absent

Leslie Abshier
Doug Bruce
Susan Dyer
Lee Sandweiss

Advisory members

Absent

Duncan Campbell
Ernesto Casteneda
Jenny Southern
Derek Richey

Staff

Conor Herterich, HAND
Doris Sims, HAND
Eric Sader, HAND
Angela Van Rooy, HAND
Philippa Guthrie, Legal

Guests

John Pearson, for Jaime Galvan
Angie Ricketts, Elm Heights
Wendy Saffell-Clemmer
Sue Swartz
Jackie Scanlan, Park & Trans

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

John Saunders made a motion to approve August 8th, 2019 Minutes, Deb Hutton seconded.

Motion carried 4-0-1 (Yes-No-Abstain)

CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

Staff Review

In the interest of time, this was not presented to HPC

Commission Review

A. COA 19-48

324 S. Rogers Street (Prospect Hill Historic District)

Petitioner: Jaime Galvan

Modifications to primary structure. See Packet for details.

Jaime Galvan, Petitioner, being represented by **John Pearson**

Conor Herterich gave presentation (see packet for further details). Previous petition before the HPC on August 8 was too large, so COA was denied. HPC recommended that he return and break up the project into thirds. This is the first of three COA requests petitioner will be submitting.

COA 19-48 has four parts:

1. Remove aluminum siding and original wood clapboard siding on E and S gable and ends. Replace original siding with wood or cement board to match exposure of original. Action is compatible with Secretary of the Interior Standards (SIS) #6. Staff Recommendation: Approval on condition to assess the condition of the original siding and repair selectively, replace only as necessary.

2. Add shed dormer to west elevation. Staff Recommendation: Approval, as addition is appropriately scaled and is necessary for petitioner to utilize attic as living space.
3. Addition of sun tubes to the roof. Staff Recommendation: Approval, as sun tubes will allow light into the attic living space without need to add windows, and tubes can be removed in the future.
4. Addition of a balcony on north elevation. Staff Recommendation: Approval.

John Pearson indicated that Petitioner, **Jaime Galvan** will do as HPC recommends.

Commissioner Questions

John Saunders—no questions.

Chris Sturbaum—Siding condition may be decorative; that is unknown. Long-range restoration includes exposing all siding, so cement board should be avoided. Repair or replace damaged wood with new wood siding as needed. Why is it necessary to open the gable?

Jeff Goldin—Petitioner indicated last time that opening the gables was necessary, but can't remember why.

Deb Hutton—Is the balcony a Romeo & Juliet balcony, or is it deeper? **Conor Herterich**—specs of the balcony are unknown. **Deb Hutton** to **Chris Sturbaum**—Are you saying petitioner should wait to repair/replace siding until he can do the whole house? **Chris Sturbaum**—Yes. **Conor Herterich**—Why does he have to do the whole house all at once?

Jeff Goldin—HPC needs to table this discussion until the Petitioner is present. We have questions that cannot be answered now.

Sam DeSoller—I can save my questions if we are going to table discussion.

Chris Sturbaum—HPC can partially approve, sun tubes and gable (#'s 2 & 3 of the petition).

No further input from Public or Petitioner's representative.

Chris Sturbaum made a motion to conditionally approve items 2 & 3 and to continue discussion at the next meeting of items 1 & 4 of COA 19-48, 346 S Buckner St. **John Saunders** seconded.

Motion carried 5-0-0 (Yes-No-Abstain).

B. COA 19-49

529 S. Hawthorne Drive (Elm Heights Historic District)

Petitioner: Wendy Saffell-Clemmer

Replace original front door, sidelights, and transom.

Conor Herterich gave presentation (see packet for further details). Property is a notable structure in the Elm Heights Historic District, known as the Buskirk House. Petitioner is requesting a new entryway, including door slab, sidelights, and transom. Staff Recommendation: Approval of door slab replacement; denial of sidelight and transom replacement, as these are defining features of the home. Refer to Elm Heights Guidelines.

Wendy Saffell-Clemmer, Petitioner. Our family is committed to reducing energy use. Entry door has been problem for long time (rainstorm forced water into the house, cold air comes through, unable to properly secure the home). Replacing the sidelights and transom would not change the view of the home from the street.

Commissioner Questions

John Saunders—none

Chris Sturbaum—Wouldn't interior storm windows be adequate to deal with the single-pane glass?

Petitioner—Storm windows would detract from the appearance of the door from the inside.

Deb Hutton—Is glass in the sidelights and transom opaque and original? Will you maintain the storm door? **Petitioner**—Would replace with multi-pane, clear glass. Assume the windows are original. Will

maintain storm door.

Sam DeSoller—Is there documentation of the door jam condition? **Petitioner**—Door jam very shallow and latch mechanism poor. **Sam DeSoller**—Have you explored staff recommendation to replace door slab or find a new locking mechanism? House of Antique hardware. **Petitioner**—Not interested in replacing one bad lock with another bad lock. **Sam DeSoller**—Replacement doors are commercially available.

Petitioner—Door size is not commercially available.

Jeff Goldin—none.

Public—none.

Commissioner Comments

John Saunders—Replacement doesn't match original, as dimensions of the windows are different. Recommend denying this change. There are other ways to correct the problem. **Petitioner**—So you're suggesting that I replace the windows and keep the rotting wood frames? There is water damage visible on the inside, I should have brought photos of that. **John Saunders**—Wood frames can be repaired.

Chris Sturbaum—Secretary of Interior Standards don't support replacing something that is repairable. Sam and I can look at the door and report back on condition. Continue to the next meeting.

Deb Hutton—Windows should look the same as the original (opacity, shape & dimensions).

Sam DeSoller—Submit evidence of moisture problems and water damage to the HPC. **Petitioner**—It would have been nice to have been told this before this meeting. **Sam DeSoller**—Door slabs in these dimensions are commercially available. I would be happy to look at the door with Chris. This is a Notable House in a historic district with the most restrictive guidelines in city. If you have issues with the guidelines, talk to the neighborhood and get the guidelines changed. Our job is to interpret the Guidelines and make decisions based upon them. Cannot support petition as submitted, but would support staff recommendations.

Jeff Goldin—none

Chris Sturbaum—An historical house belongs to more than just the current owner; in a sense it belongs to the community as well. Once something original is gone, it's gone forever. Recommend continuing this until we look at the door.

Petitioner—Happy to have a list of contractors. Request that this be expedited.

Deb Hutton—Is the door knocker original? **Petitioner**—It appears not to be.

Petitioner—You will not approve of replacing a wood door with another wood door? Who cares if it's original if the replacement looks the same?

Sam DeSoller—Original doors are special: proportions of panels are different, hand hewn, species of wood, longevity of the wood.

Conor Herterich rebutted the Petitioners statement that she was not told to bring evidence of moisture damage. This was not communicated to Staff beforehand. Had it been, the petitioner would have been advised to present evidence to the Commission.

Chris Sturbaum made a motion to continue discussion of COA 19-49, 529 S. Hawthorne Drive, at the next HPC meeting, with the condition that Chris and Sam examine the door, subject to the approval of the Petitioner. **Deb Hutton** seconded.

Motion carried 5-0-0 (Yes-No-Abstain).

C. COA 19-50

407 S. Walker Street (Greater Prospect Hill Historic District)

Petitioner: Rebecca Stoops

Replace seven original wood windows located on front, sides and rear of house with Pella 250 Series double hung, vinyl windows. Window size, shape, and style will not change.

Conor Herterich gave presentation. See packet for details. Staff recommends approval. Neighborhood feedback stated support for window replacement.

Petitioner—Previously had wooden windows restored. It was a disappointment. Would like to have functioning, energy efficient windows.

Commissioner Questions

John Saunders—none

Chris Sturbaum—Did Rich do the windows? It wasn't satisfactory? **Petitioner**—Yes he did. Wood was not reinforced. One window is cracked. Many cannot be opened. Holes in frames cause air to come through.

Deb Hutton—none

Sam DeSoller—Petition follows all guidelines except *to continue to reflect period of house*.

Jeff Goldin—Intent of the guidelines is to allow people to do what the Petitioner is doing when necessary.

Public—none.

Commissioner Comments

John Saunders—none

Chris Sturbaum—Replacement windows should look the same as the originals.
none

Sam DeSoller—Dislike vinyl windows. **Petitioner**—Vinyl will be black on outside, which looks less like vinyl than white. **Conor Herterich**—Have you considered metal clad? **Petitioner**—Don't like the idea of wood clad in metal that could hide rot.

Jeff Goldin—none

John Saunders made a motion to approve COA 19-50, 407 S. Walker Street. **Chris Sturbaum** seconded. **Motion carried 5-0-0** (Yes-No-Abstain).

D. COA 19-51

912 E. 2nd Street (Elm Heights Historic District)

Petitioner(s): Bruce Solomon & Sue Swartz

Replace non-original front door with Prairie-style, mahogany door and remove storm door.

Conor Herterich gave presentation. See packet for details. Staff Recommendation: Approve.

Petitioner—Welcome recommendations from HPC for replacement of door, hardware, and storm door.

Commissioner Questions

John Saunders—Is the jamb/frame in good shape? **Petitioner**—Yes.

Chris Sturbaum—Is proposed door new with insulated glass? **Petitioner**—Mahogany with clear glass.

Deb Hutton—Are you retaining white frame/door or will the frame and door be natural wood?

Petitioner—Have not settled on a color for the door, but jamb will remain white.

Sam DeSoller—Would you be open to a ¾ light door? Are you putting on another storm door?

Petitioner—Glass panes are negotiable. No Storm door.

Jeff Goldin—none

Commissioner Comments

John Saunders—Ok with door, will enhance look of the house.

Chris Sturbaum— Approve of door, Dark stain is appropriate, would match interior wood features.

Deb Hutton—Fine

Sam DeSoller—Advise to get undrilled door slab, can position the lock to match the current jamb. Emtek for custom-made hardware. Style could be less *prairie* and more *cottage*. Great improvement.

Jeff Goldin—none

John Saunders made a motion to approve COA 19-51, 912 E. 2nd Street. **Chris Sturbaum** seconded.

Motion carried 5-0-0 (Yes-No-Abstain).

Jeff Goldin needed to leave, and quorum was lost. The portion of the meeting involving official business was adjourned by **Jeff Goldin** @ 5:58 pm.

John Saunders took over chairing the meeting.

NEW BUSINESS

A. Courtesy Review for Dustin Shannon: 1901 E. Maxwell

Home owners have a Lustron home and wished to get HPC input on work they would like to have done to a breezeway attached to the home.

B. Johnson's Creamery Telecommunications Equipment Feedback

Conor Herterich—HPC is a consulting party only. Ingenious to use this as a tower instead of building a tower. Do Commissioners have any ideas, issues, questions to bring back to the State?

Sam DeSoller—Why add another assembly below the one that's already there? Can't they add on to existing location/belt?

Deb Hutton—Appreciate not covering the letters in "Johnson's"; also appreciate that they are not building more towers. Brick color is helpful.

Chris Sturbaum—Could they consolidate, so as not to have such a large vertical gap between the arrays?

Conor Herterich—**John Saunders**—What about Fairview school chimney?

Conor Herterich/Sam DeSoller—Better not to add something to another original structure since this one already has equipment.

Chris Sturbaum—Question about Demo Delay 19-15, do we have any input on blank wall?

Conor Herterich—HPC has no input

Philippa Guthrie—HPC doesn't have any control over that. Ask Jackie Scanlan, Planning & Transportation, whether it's allowable under code.

Conor Herterich—Will wait until the next meeting to discuss, (1) Recommend BRI Resurvey for Council adoption as "Bloomington Historic Sites and Structures Survey" and (2) HPC Annual Retreat.

Meeting adjourned by John Saunders @ 6:17 p.m.

END OF MINUTES