

Bloomington Historic Preservation Commission
Showers City Hall, McCloskey Room
Thursday January 23, 2020
MINUTES

Meeting was called to order by John Saunders @ 5:00 pm

ROLL CALL

Commissioners

Present

Sam DeSollar
Jeff Goldin
Deb Hutton
John Saunders
Lee Sandweiss
Chris Sturbaum

Absent

Doug Bruce
Susan Dyer

Advisory members

Present

Duncan Campbell
Ernesto Casteneda
Derek Richey

Absent

Jenny Southern

Staff

Conor Herterich, HAND
Eric Sader, HAND
Angela Van Rooy, HAND
Philippa Guthrie, Legal

Guests

David Kebber, DD 19-25
Carl Salzmann, 1114 N College
Mary Catherine Carmichael,
Mayor's Office

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Jeff Goldin made a motion to approve January 9th, 2020 minutes, **Deb Hutton** seconded.
Motion carried 6-0-0 (Yes-No-Abstain)

CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

Commission Review

A. COA 20-4—TABLED to February 13, 2020

703 S. Woodlawn Avenue (Elm Heights Historic District)

Petitioner: Lyndsi Brown

Build deck between porch stoops and replace iron guard rails on stair step with cedar wood

DEMOLITION DELAY

Commission Review

A. Demo-Delay 19-23

1109 N. College Avenue

Petitioner: NKS Development LLC

Full demolition

Conor Herterich gave a presentation. See packet for details. Staff recommends release of demolition delay.

Petitioner not present.

Commissioner Comments

There was general consensus that this house does not warrant individual designation, but that owner should be encouraged to salvage original windows, doors, hardware, etc.

Derek Richey: 1970s re-zoning of this area as commercial was the beginning of the end for the neighborhood that once existed here. Few single-family homes remain.

Sam DeSollar made a motion to waive the demolition delay waiting period for **Demo Delay 19-23**, 1109 N College Avenue. **Chris Sturbaum** seconded. **Motion carried 6-0-0** (Yes-No-Abstain).

B. Demo-Delay 19-24

1116 N. College Avenue

Petitioner: N College 1116 LLC

Full demolition

Conor Herterich gave a presentation. See packet for details. Staff recommends release of demolition delay. Structure has sustained heavy fire damage.

Petitioner not present.

Commissioner Questions & Comments

Chris Sturbaum: This is in the same commercial corridor as DD 19-23. HPC has to know what to save and what to release.

Duncan Campbell: I am concerned about all of the demolition delays coming before the HPC. Peter Hamlin's response to a Limestone Post article 8-3-2016: "*Are Market Forces Ruining Bloomington's Sense of Place?*" says our challenge is to ensure that future development (in the face of macroeconomic trends) respects our legacy community assets. This structure (and others) may not be rated Contributing, thus leading Staff to recommend against designation, but they are part of the city's legacy. How do we get the developer community to respect this?

Chris Sturbaum: Development is like fire, it's a good thing as long as it's controlled. We're going to have to exercise a lot of judgement in determining what's worth saving and what's not.

Sam DeSollar made a motion to waive the demolition delay waiting period for **Demo Delay 19-24**, 1116 N College Avenue. **Deb Hutton** seconded. **Motion carried 6-0-0** (Yes-No-Abstain).

C. Demo-Delay 19-25

414 E. 9th Street

Petitioner: David Kebber

Full demolition

Conor Herterich: I reached out to Bill Coulter (via Derek Richey)—he said this could have been Nichols himself who designed this house, as he is known to have worked with Dr. Fred Prow. Staff and a few commissioners toured the structure looking for distinctive features/details indicative of Nichols' style. Unable to confirm any African American history or occupancy.

Derek Richey: Bill Coulter *suspects* this is a Nichols house. He built at least one house for Fred Prow. This funky house is Nichols' style.

Conor Herterich: It's original; hasn't been altered.

Sam DeSollar: Rafters, sub-surface drainage, and roof are shot, but a lot of the exterior details remain, original windows and doors, foundation is stable and in good repair. It's a solid house.

David Kebber, Petitioner: nothing to add

Commissioner Questions

Lee Sandweiss: What's around it? Are there other houses around it, or is this the last house standing? Looks like a neighborhood to me.

Sam DeSollar: Have we exhausted resources to determine if it's a Nichols house?

Derek Richey: No, I've forwarded photos to Bill Coulter and Steve Wyatt, and am waiting to hear back from them.

Commissioner Comments

Jeff Goldin: This is in good condition, I would like to save it. I advocate waiting to hear all data, and putting it off to another meeting.

Chris Sturbaum: Owner was under the impression that he couldn't add on to the house. I told him HPC has approved additions to most historic houses. An addition would make this house more desirable as a student rental.

Ernesto Castenada: We should save this and promote a nice addition. We could help with that.

Deb Hutton/Lee Sandweiss: I advocate waiting for more info before making a decision.

Sam DeSollar: We just voted to allow demolition of three houses, one of which was in much better shape than this one. If it's not a Nichols house, we may not have an argument for historic preservation. I would support a variance to add rooms. Sadly this house is in the same situation as the last three houses we looked at.

Jeff Goldin: I would argue that the context makes this situation different than last DDs. It's in a neighborhood. **Sam DeSollar:** Agreed. I take that back.

Duncan Campbell: Staff recommendation is a little open ended for me. If you listed the architectural considerations and the historical criteria that you think are applicable and stated which are not met, it would be easier. Because we get to decide what the historical criteria are for designation and whether the structure is significant. The architecture is unique. This is clearly a significant building, whether it's a Nichols or not. Everything we protect doesn't have to meet its highest and best use in the community. We're not supposed to be engaged with the developer's criteria. If I were voting, I'd vote for designation now.

Derek Richey: I'm 100% with Duncan. This is a unique, amazing structure. We can be flexible about an addition on the back. I'll keep digging for info. It contributes to the neighborhood. It's well worth designation.

Deb Hutton: Even if it's not Nichols house, it is a Prow house.

Derek Richey: Prow was an important person in Bloomington society. He was president of a number of organizations and associations.

David Kebber, Petitioner: We can have the discussion to add an addition, though I don't know whether that would change our current position. It was purchased with that in mind.

Conor Herterich: After examining the house, and learning more, I wouldn't be so quick to release to demo delay. I'm happy to see the commissioners rally to want to save something. HPC has not designated a Contributing structure on its own, to my knowledge. You have to have a strong argument for designation to bring to Council.

Jeff Goldin: I would argue the rating.

Deb Hutton: Would improving the condition also improve the rating?

Conor Herterich: A home in very poor condition can cause a rating to be lower than it could be if the structure was in good condition.

Duncan Campbell: Surveyors sometimes don't have a lot of training. They have very little time to assess each structure. They're underpaid. They can miss things. If they say it's Contributing, it doesn't mean we can't say it's Notable.

Chris Sturbaum: We may be setting a precedent for how these houses will be treated in the future. We may have to add density in order to save these structures.

Jeff Goldin made a motion to table the discussion of **Demo Delay 19-25** to the February 13, 2020 meeting, **Deb Hutton** seconded. **Motion carried 6-0-0** (Yes-No-Abstain).

Additional Comment on **Demo-Delay 19-24**, 1116 N. College Avenue

Carl Salzmann, owner of 1114 N College: I want to compliment the Bloomington Fire Department. They saved my law office next door. Homeless people started a fire in the second floor of the house to keep warm and it took off. My office cut off our electric and water where they had previously been accessing it, so they could no longer steal it.

NEW BUSINESS

A. Restaurant Row Design Guidelines

Conor Herterich: With the help of an intern, I have been working on these guidelines since summer 2019. A draft version is in the packet. HPC must eventually vote to approve these. Please give me feedback. I still have to talk to some of the business owners in the area.

Duncan Campbell: I suggest you put Restaurant Row guidelines on the agenda for the next meeting.

Conor Herterich: Agreed. RR Guidelines will be on the agenda for 2-13-20. Please read, get comments to me before the meeting, and be prepared to discuss.

B. Design Guidelines Committee for Near West Side Conservation District

Conor Herterich: We need to work on NWS guidelines. I would like 1-2 commissioners to help me, along with the neighborhood committee, to draft the guidelines. Derek Richey and Deb Hutton volunteered.

Conor Herterich: Maple Heights guidelines are nearly complete. I have provided my comments to the neighborhood. I will follow up to see if they are ready to present to the HPC. You will eventually vote to approve them.

OLD BUSINESS

COMMISSIONER COMMENTS

PUBLIC COMMENTS

ANNOUNCEMENTS

Gift for Conor and Amanda

Angela's last meeting. She has been promoted to Program Manager for Neighborhood Services. Eddie will be back at the next meeting.

ADJOURNMENT

Meeting adjourned by John Saunders at 5:57 p.m.

END OF MINUTES