

Plan Commission minutes are transcribed in a summarized manner. Video footage is available for viewing in the (CATS) Department of the Monroe County Public Library at 303 E. Kirkwood Avenue. Phone number: 812-349-3111 or via e-mail at the following address: moneill@monroe.lib.in.us.

The City of Bloomington Plan Commission (PC) met on March 9, 2020 at 5:30 p.m. in the City of Bloomington Council Chambers. Members present: Burrell, Cate, Herrera, Kinzie, Sandberg, Shonkwiler, St. John, Wisler

ROLL CALL

MINUTES TO BE APPROVED: July & November 2019 & February 2020

****Kinzie moved to approve the July and November 2019 and February 2020 minutes. Sandberg seconded. Motion carried by voice vote 8:0—Approved.**

REPORTS, RESOLUTIONS AND COMMUNICATIONS: Jackie Scanlan introduced Israel Herrera as the newest Plan Commissioner, representing the Board of Park Commissioners.

MPO POLICY COMMITTEE REPRESENTATIVE ELECTION: Jillian Kinzie was nominated as primary and Craig Shonkwiler as alternate.

****Cate moved to approve Kinzie as MPO Policy Committee representative and Shonkwiler as alternate. St. John seconded. Motion carried by roll call vote 8:0—Approved.**

PETITIONS CONTINUED TO: April 13, 2020

SP-07-20 **Kiln Collective, LLC**
333 W. 11th Street
Request: Site plan approval to allow a 2-story addition to the existing kiln building.
Case manager: Eric Greulich

CONSENT AGENDA:

SP-05-20 **City of Bloomington Redevelopment Commission**
489 W. 10th Street
Request: Site plan approval to amend the Trades District parking garage site plan in the Commercial Downtown (CD) zoning district.
Case Manager: Eric Greulich

Public Comment:

Member of the public that spoke: Greg Alexander

Alexander said at the original hearing that the sidewalk on Rogers Street was supposed to be un-impacted as the Trades District was built out, but for a year the sidewalk was un-walkable due to construction. He said the Plan Commission has a duty to the Comprehensive Plan to encourage sidewalks and Staff cannot be trusted when they say a sidewalk will be un-impacted and construction impacts it.

****Kinzie moved to approve the Consent Agenda. Sandberg seconded. Motion carried by roll call vote 8:0—Approved.**

PETITIONS:

ZO-03-20

**City of Bloomington
Zoning Conversion Map Adoption**

Request: To consider the adoption of text amendments to the Unified Development Ordinance (UDO Amendments) and a proposed zoning conversion map (Map Proposal) that updates existing zoning districts to conform with the new UDO.

Case Manager: Scott Robinson

Jackie Scanlan presented the staff report. The Common Council adopted the UDO draft in December 2019. She explained that the map adoption is the first step in finalizing the UDO adoption process and the map will change zoning districts to the new naming convention. The Plan Commission will vote on the map, then it goes to the Common Council for a vote. The zoning districts and boundary line changes will be examined at a later time. Since Staff have edited the UDO, they have found a list of text updates that were unclear or found errors that needed review by the Plan Commission so those are also before the Plan Commission tonight. Staff is recommending a positive recommendation in a single hearing. If the Common Council approves this then the UDO will be ready to go into effect.

Plan Commission Questions:

Kinzie, St. John, and Scanlan discussed how a methadone facility should be referred to consistently in the UDO and St. John suggested Staff use Medication Assisted Treatment (MAT) clinics to broaden the facility use.

Public Comment:

Members of the public that spoke: Greg Alexander, Peter Dorfman, (first name unclear) Castro.

Alexander said that the City recently released the Transportation Demand Management (TDM) plan, part of which surveyed neighborhood parking permit holders. The plan showed only about one-third of permit holders in these core neighborhoods used their car to commute to work. Alexander said the core neighborhoods are a walkable resource and should be rezoned to allow plexes.

Dorfman said he lives in a core neighborhood, has a car that he uses to commute to work, and parks on the street. He is opposed to rezoning the core neighborhoods for plexes.

Castro says she rides Bloomington Transit route 1 and is concerned with upcoming route changes negatively affecting her commute. Wisler thanked her for her comment but said the petition doesn't affect any Bloomington Transit routes.

Plan Commission Discussion:

Kinzie asked about where to find the interactive map showing petition locations that accompanied the hearing packet emailed to Commissioners. Scanlan said a map will be on the Planning and Transportation website showing petition location and details. She said an interactive map will be emailed to Commissioners with each packet showing that hearing's petition locations. Kinzie said she finds the map very useful to see the zoning relative to the petition and thinks the map is amazing technology.

Shonkwiler asked for clarification concerning the petition number. The slides said the petition number is ZO-09-20, but the correct number is ZO-03-20.

Kinzie asked what will happen with the petition after tonight's action. Scanlan said tonight's action is a recommendation to the Common Council, and once the Common Council receives the petition again, they will have 30 days to accept the recommendation.

****Kinzie moved to forward ZO-03-20 with a positive recommendation and one amendment regarding the correction to the “methadone facility,” adding “facility” back into the UDO when referring to this use. Cate seconded. Motion carried by roll call vote 8:0—Approved.**

SP-04-20 **City of Bloomington**
105 & 111 W. 4th Street
Request: Site plan approval for the new 4th street parking garage in the Commercial Downtown (CD) zoning district.
Case Manager: Jackie Scanlan

Jackie Scanlan presented the staff report. The property is located at the southwest corner of 4th and Walnut Streets and is zoned Commercial Downtown (CD), in the Downtown Core Overlay. Surrounding land uses include the Waldron Arts Center to the north; an office building and Firestone Tire Company to the east; a bank, bars, a restaurant, and apartments to the west; and an office building to the south. The Downtown Transit Center is in the vicinity at the southeast corner of 3rd and Walnut Streets. The property is currently vacant. The petitioner proposes to redevelop this property constructing a new 7-story parking garage with commercial space and public amenity space on the first floor. The parking garage would contain 537 parking spaces. The design also includes 60 indoor bicycle parking spaces as well as a minimum of 4 outdoor bicycle parking spaces, office space for City Parking Staff, and 6,750 square feet of commercial space on the ground floor, as well as restrooms available to the public. The petitioner is proposing to include various green features, such as electric vehicle charging stations and solar panels. The petitioner is seeking a Silver level ParkSmart designation. The petitioner proposes vehicular and pedestrian entrances on 4th Street. The current design requires two variances related to the 4th Street vehicular entrance as its width exceeds the allowable maximum and its location is too close to Walnut Street per code. An alley runs along the west side of the property, connecting 3rd and 4th Streets. There is at least one business that derives primary access from the alley and the alley is often used by pedestrians.

Scanlan also showed slides of the planned art installation that will cover the north, south, and east open concrete bays. The other slides shown detailed the garage’s internal layout and ParkSmart features. She reminded Commissioners that tonight’s petition is for the site plan, and requested variances for the entrances will be reviewed by the Board of Zoning Appeals (BZA) later this month. Scanlan said the UDO’s definition of height is from the lowest to highest point of a building and the garage is 98 feet tall. Currently the downtown overlay limits height to 40 feet. The garage is a large structure, but some floors will be built set back, such as the Cityside building at 4th and Washington. The motorcycle parking does not align with code and will be removed and some compact spaces are only eight feet and will need to either be restriped to meet the 9-foot requirement or approved by the BZA. The garage has ample bicycle parking near the commercial space and meets street tree and light requirements, but in lieu of some street trees, other greenery may be substituted. Staff are currently working with the department’s environmental planner. Scanlan says the petition satisfies the City administration’s stated need for enhanced downtown parking. Based on the findings of fact, the Planning and Transportation department recommends approval of SP-04-20 with the following amended conditions:

1. The approval is contingent upon approval of the variances by the Board of Zoning Appeals related to entrances and drives, as listed in this report.
2. The petitioner will continue to work with Planning and Transportation staff to improve the vehicular portion of the Walnut Street right-of-way by including bump-outs at the 4th Street corner.
3. Required bicycle parking for the commercial spaces will be added to the site plan before a grading permit is approved.
4. The petitioner will submit a site plan that meets the minimum street tree requirement. If the petitioner desires to use a portion of the tree plot area for bioretention to serve the site, the Senior Environmental Planner must review such a plan and approve any reduction in street trees.
5. The petitioner will submit a plan for pedestrian improvements to the alley east of the site, while working in conjunction with adjacent property owners and tenants.

6. All exterior modules shall be treated with the art installation urban fabric that is shown as part of this development.
7. The petitioner shall include additional windows on the 4th Street side of the northwest stair tower.
8. The commercial space entrances of the building will be required to meet pedestrian entrance standards related to the inclusion of awnings and/or canopies.
9. The opening along 4th Street at the northeast corner of the building shall be improved to allow for passage of only pedestrian and bicycles into the building through that entrance.

Alex Crowley, Department of Economic and Sustainable Development (ESD) director, said the City received a report from CE Solutions concerning the state of the 4th Street garage prior to demolition. The original garage had required steel beams to maintain it over the years, and it was no longer safe for use, and fiscally irresponsible to repair. The City began to demolish the garage and acquire the 222 S. Walnut property in fall 2019 with good faith negotiations, and eventually eminent domain, but the City did not acquire the property. Crowley said the site plan presented is for a design on the former garage's original footprint. Crowley said the garage was built in 1985 during the Fountain Square Mall's renovation and the garage aided in successfully renovating the languishing downtown. Now the downtown has 1.5 million visitors annually, including many who commute from out of town to shop or work. The TDM plan will reduce this but a centralized parking resource is needed and will serve this purpose for the next 50 years. Crowley said the garage cannot be built with today's parking needs in mind, but rather what the parking needs will be as the intersection is renovated and the downtown's density and building height increases. Crowley concluded by highlighting the commitment to art on the garage, the ParkSmart features, and that the garage will be the first ParkSmart garage in the state. Crowley said the Plan Commission is being asked to review and approve in one hearing tonight to increase the chance of staying on the timeline to complete construction by the 2021-2022 Indiana University school year.

Sean Starowitz, ESD's assistant director for the Arts, said the City solicited art proposals from two companies. This is the first project where art has been truly integrated into the structure and Bloomington is the first city to adopt the 1% program, funding an art installation from 1% of the structure's budget. Starowitz said the installation is aluminum with a quiltblock pattern design based off of the City's logo. He showed slides of art on other garages to show how art installations can be integrated successfully into the architectural elements and said the public generated interest in some of those designs.

Josh Scism, Core Planning Strategies, said the City has been resilient and Planning Staff have given good ideas throughout the process. He said CSO Architects has done great revising the site plan to fit the original footprint. Scism explained the revision eliminated the 3rd street entrance and reduced the commercial space, but an elevated connecting pedestrian bridge is possible in the future, and overall the site plan has yielded what is needed by the community, and can be built with the nine conditions from Staff.. Scism showed slides of the County's garage on 7th and Morton streets and explained the potential a high-density development can offer.

Plan Commission Questions:

St. John, Kinzie, and Wisler discussed the transportation drop off/pick up hub for rideshare users, lighting detail, the one percent art installation fund amount being \$385,000, alleyway improvements, attaining Silver and Gold ParkSmart status, motorcycle parking, and number of parking spots.

Crowley and Scism responded that the goal is to easily enter, park, and exit the garage quickly and that lighting will be motion activated with brightness depending on foot traffic. Scism would like a clear delineation between cars and businesses when improving the alleyway. ParkSmart Gold status is ideal, but the improvements needed exceed the budget, so Silver status will be attained through site plan features. Scanlan explained again that the motorcycle parking spots are too small and motorcycles can park in regular spaces. The former space for motorcycle parking could possibly be used as bike parking, but not as a drive cut.

Public Comment:

Members of the public that spoke: Nick Blanford, Greg Alexander, Talisha (last name unclear), Mary Morgan, Peter Dorfman, Timothy Clark, Hugh Farrell, Jennifer Pearl, Morning Wilder, Cody Roach, Isabel Piedmont-Smith, Bob Walker, Ajar Rose

Those that spoke in favor of the petition did so citing the need for a denser downtown and the restoration of missing, high-demand parking that encourages private-sector growth and patronizing the arts. Others supported the use of funds for an art installation, that the garage supports the TDM and provides parking for employees and customers who come from out of town to the regional hub that is Bloomington, and for whom biking is impractical. Some of the public liked that the garage will take up less land than may surface lots, and that the garage will provide safety and ease to park and walk to destinations. Walker, with CFC Properties, said many historical buildings have been preserved because businesses are thriving in them and their customers have had a place to park. The ballroom in the mall has experienced a decrease in bookings, and businesses and evening events have lost customers and attendance since the garage closed.

Those that spoke in remonstrance of the petition did so citing the TDM's plan encouraging biking, walking, and other alternative modes of transportation over driving and parking, and that cities often overestimate parking needs. Alexander said the Plan Commission has a responsibility to the Transportation Plan and the Comprehensive Plan to put pedestrians first. Others said the garage isn't needed, the resources could be used in a better way, and for the climate, driving needs to be discouraged to decrease fossil fuels. Wilder said the traffic is her least favorite part of downtown and the garage bike parking is inconvenient when plenty of bike parking can be found in front of businesses. Others said they don't currently have trouble finding parking downtown, don't see businesses suffering, and for the cost, protected bike lanes and expanded public transit services could be funded, reducing traffic. Farrell spoke for a friend who left to take her child to therapy after the father was killed on a bicycle last summer, and said the Trades District garage is an absurd use of space and the downtown doesn't need another garage. Dorfman and Piedmont-Smith wanted more details on the garage's solar panels since it was barely presented on by the petitioner. Piedmont-Smith also said the downtown needs more parking, but not a garage with seven stories, and that the garage was originally supposed to be only six stories. She said this garage is not supporting the Comprehensive Plan's aim for alternative transportation and asking for variances encourages private developers to do the same. She liked the green alley idea, but thinks more conditions should be added to the petition.

Plan Commission Discussion:

Herrera and Wisler asked for more information about solar panels planned for the garage. Crowley said the aim is to install the maximum amount allowed, but the City is limited by Duke Energy. Cost is not an issue, though, because funds being used are left over from a previous grant. Herrera said he would abstain from voting after hearing sound arguments for and against the garage. Wisler said he didn't like the petition before and said it is important to get the garage's site plan right, because the garage could have been an ugly icon. It will be a tall structure that will define downtown, and hopefully lead to a more creative density, because he doesn't want the garage to be the tallest structure in town. Wisler said he wants the garage to have as many solar panels as possible because it's imperative to set a standard for solar power.

Sandberg said she was impressed with the architects' ability to accommodate so many Common Council requirements. She said the City needed to get as much of the original parking and accommodations but on a smaller footprint, and the need for parking is clear. She said she understands the goals to reduce vehicle travel in the Comprehensive and Transportation plans, but the parking demand now must be resolved before reducing it for the future. Sandberg explained she is an arts patron and most patrons are older and need more convenient parking. She said the lack of the garage is hurting people she hears from every day but aren't at these meetings. She said this is a garage, not a housing project, and by building it, the City is not against safer pedestrian efforts and the garage is not an antithesis to future sustainability.

Kinzie and Crowley discussed another proposed garage behind a current hotel next to the convention center. Crowley said that proposed garage will work with the 4th street garage to manage overflow since the new convention center hopes to attract thousands to events. Crowley said even without a new convention center, the

downtown needs more parking. Kinzie asked about the garage's convertibility should not at much parking be needed in the future and Crowley responded it's not economically sound. Kinzie thanked the public for their comments, and said she heard thoughtful deliberation on both sides. She sees demand for parking for the Wonderlab, the Buskirk-Chumley theater, and the Waldron arts center. She is grateful that the garage will continue to allow out-of-area patrons to support the arts so Bloomington can have arts locally without a need to travel to Indianapolis. Kinzie said she does see a problem with the current construction barricades being a safety issue to pedestrians, and she wants to see construction move quick. She would like the garage to attain ParkSmart Gold status during a time we really need to reduce fossil fuel consumption, but Silver status is an important step, and she thinks the alley can be green and have potential to be an interesting walkaround. She concluded by congratulating Starowitz on the art installation, and said she appreciates Pearl's comment about parking needed for those who can't afford to live in the area, but still drive to Bloomington to patronize local businesses and the arts, and she said she is in favor of the petition.

Burrell and Crowley discussed the possibility of converting more spaces for electric cars in the future, and Crowley explained the garage will have a conduit built around it, allowing for the installation of a large number of charging spaces through the years, and every parking space could have a charging station. She asked to see solar panel renderings and Scism said he did not have a graphic, but explained the panels would be installed in the center of the garage's roof. Burrell commented that she has heard a lot about what the garage should be in the future, and heard from downtown employees that the garage has been and will continue to be an inclusive way for people to get downtown to work. She said it's not a new garage, but a replacement for a garage that previously served downtown parking needs. Discussion ensued between Burrell and Crowley about monthly parking rates, and possible parking programs. Burrell asked Staff why the petition won't have a second hearing and then go before the Common Council. Scanlan said that site plans to not have two hearings and do not go before the Common Council. Burrell concluded by saying that the town becomes inflated during parts of the year and a new hospital is being built. This garage will give people coming from surrounding towns and counties a place to park.

Shonkwiler said he couldn't find a downtown parking space when he first moved to the community last fall. He echoed Burrell's earlier comment that this is a replacement garage to restore missing parking and not a new garage being built at this site for the first time. CFC employees lost 250 spaces when the old garage was demolished, displacing them, and that made an impression on him. He said the new site plan is aesthetically pleasing and supports the petition.

St. John pointed out that the packet says the garage doesn't meet architectural standards, and if the objective is to conceal the dark area, then condition six should be more specific. Scanlan said the Plan Commission could amend the condition. St. John said she supports the petition and remembers downtown Bloomington in the early 1980s and is grateful for its revitalization. She said businesses are operated for profit and need customers who need parking, and the downtown at night is currently dangerous because of circling traffic looking for parking. She also likes the art installation.

Cate and Crowley discussed the TDM study and Cate asked why the garage needs to be this big with so many spaces when the TDM's aim is to discourage driving. She understands biking and walking are not realistic for all, but wondered what the algorithm was for so many spaces. Crowley said the garage's size and spaces shouldn't be seen as a net gain, but rather a better use of netting surrounding parking. He said a larger garage consolidates surrounding parking lots and those lots can be repurposed to expand or build resources. Cate concluded that she supports the petition.

****St. John motioned to approve SP-04-20 with the nine conditions of approval as stated in the hearing packet with the following changes: Condition one amended to include "parking space width." Condition five amended to read "the alley west of the site." Condition six amended to include "dark crashwalls as shown in page 65 of the packet." Sandberg seconded. Motion carried by roll call vote 7:0:1—Approved.**

Meeting adjourned.