

**Bloomington Historic Preservation Commission,  
Teleconference Meeting, Thursday October 8, 2020, 5:00  
P.M.  
AGENDA**

**I. CALL TO ORDER**

Meeting was called to order by **John Saunders @ 5:00 p.m.**

**II. ROLL CALL**

**Commissioners**

Doug Bruce (entered meeting at 5:15 p.m.)  
Sam DeSollar  
Susan Dyer  
Jeff Golden  
Deb Hutton (entered meeting at 5:10 p.m.)  
Lee Sandweiss  
John Sunders  
Chris Sturbaum

**Advisory**

Duncan Campbell  
Ernesto Casteneda  
Derek Richey  
Jenny Southern

**Staff**

Conor Herterich HAND  
Dee Wills HAND  
Philippa M. Guthrie, City Legal  
Daniel Dixon, City Legal  
Keegan Gulick, Planning and Transportation

**Guests**

CATS  
Kim Price  
Harry Chance  
Timothy Horney  
Susan Rudd  
Josh Alley  
Janice Corby  
Gigi Larmour-Goldin  
Lyndsi Brown  
Tim Ellis

Alayna Chambers Gray  
Deborah Reed

Mark Figg  
Franco Albornoz  
Emily Ernsberger-HT  
Karren Duffy  
Matt Ellenwood  
Cheyenne Riker  
Daniell Bachant Bell  
Trisha Gooch  
Matt Ryan  
Terri Beatty  
B Square Beacon  
Steve  
Beth  
Jared  
James  
CP

### III. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

#### A. September 24, 2020 Minutes

**Jeff Goldin** made a motion to approve September 24, 2020 Minutes  
**John Saunders** seconded.  
**Motion Carried 4-0-2 (Yes-No-Abstain)**

### IV. CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

#### Commission Review

#### A. COA 20-42

703 S. Woodlawn Ave (Elm Heights Historic District)  
Petitioner: Lyndsi Brown (Chickering Rentals)  
*Replace all windows on the house.*

**Conor Herterich** gave presentation. See packet for details.

**Lyndsi Brown** discussed their plan for the windows and that they are trying to get all of the windows to look the same. **Lyndsi Brown** stated that they use an Amish window maker company from Montgomery, Indiana, but

would be open to using a local company. **Conor Herterich** showed some examples of how the replacement windows would look. **Chris Sturbaum** asked when the lower windows were replaced. More discussion ensued about the style of the windows. **Sam DeSollar** asked if the replacement windows would be fiber glass and if they were going to do a one over one to match what is on the lower floor. **Lyndsi Brown** stated that they would be using fiber glass and that they would be one over one, but then clarified that she would like to use six over one for the whole house.

**Chris Sturbaum** explained how the details of the twelve over one and the six over one windows were the defining details of the house. He also stated that the windows below will fail in the next 15 years. **Chris Sturbaum** stated that their directive was not to have them replaced but restored. **Jeff Goldin** stated that they were going to replace all of the windows. More discussion and comments were made by the Commissioners about the windows and whether they should be replaced or restored.

**Sam DeSollar** made a motion to partially approve **COA 20-42** with the caveat that the original windows be retained and that the replacement windows can be replaced in the current configuration or with divided light windows with grid supplied with both inside and outside shadow bars matching the twelve over one pattern on the existing windows.

**Jeff Goldin** seconded.  
**Motion Carried 8-0-0**

**B. COA 20-43**

1210 N. Washington St (Garden Hill Historic District)  
Petitioner: Tim Horny (contractor) David Schoo (owner)  
*Construction of rear deck and screened porch.*

**Conor Herterich** gave presentation. See packet for details.

**Chris Sturbaum** asked if this would be guttered and asked if there was a reason to go higher than the existing gutter line. **Tim Horny** stated that they had put a step up to the deck, and that is why they went higher so that there would be an 8 foot ceiling.

**Chris Sturbaum** commented that the form was attractive, but hopes that it will be painted or stained. He stated that it was a nice looking roof. **Deb Hutton** asked if there were any neighborhood comments. **Conor Herterich** said that there was and that they supported it.

**Jeff Goldin** made a motion to approve **COA 20-43**.  
**Deb Hutton** seconded.  
**Motion Carried 8-0-0**

**C. COA 20-44**

208 E. 15th St (Garden Hill Historic District)  
*Demolition of rear room and construction of new room. Restoration of front porch and entry. Removal and replacement of siding and windows.*

**Conor Herterich** gave presentation. See packet for details.

**Chris Sturbaum** asked if staff recommended replicating the replacement windows with the six over one applied to the glass. **Conor Herterich** stated absolutely without question. **Susan Rudd** stated that this was their plan. **Deb Hutton** asked if the **Petitioner** would be removing part of the brick columns and replacing them with more authentic looking columns and if so, what material would be used to replace the brick. **Susan Rudd** explained in detail what the plan was for the columns and that they intended on trying to replicate the original columns as close as they can using a round wooden column. **Doug Bruce** asked if there were any comments from the **Neighborhood Association**. **Conor Herterich** stated that they supported this project as well. **Ernesto Casteneda** asked if the pitch of the front porch roof will be raised. **Susan Rudd** stated “No”. **Ernesto Casteneda** asked if the soffit around the house was aluminum and what they were planning to do there. **Susan Rudd’s** contractor **James** stated that they would probably go back to wood and that there were no exposed rafters. More discussion ensued between the **Commissioners** and **Susan Rudd** about details of the windows of the house and also the front door.

**Jeff Goldin** made a motion to approve **COA 20-44** with the exception of retaining the front windows.

**Deb Hutton** seconded.

**Motion Carried 8-0-0**

## V. DEMOLITION DELAY

### Commission Review

#### A. Demo Delay 20-17

424 ½ S. Walnut Street

Petitioner: Josh Alley

*Full demolition*

**Conor Herterich** introduced **Charlie and Joyce Boxman** to the meeting, and stated that **Charlie** was the son of **Henry Boxman**. **Conor Herterich** gave presentation. See packet for details.

**Charlie Boxman** stated that he would be very grateful if they could preserve the building in some fashion. Maybe not a complete restoration, but at least the façade to preserve the character. I do see a difference in the durability of the two buildings. **Charlie Boxman** explained how he was able to see the inside of the building two years ago and was aghast at what he saw and how the whole first floor had been made into one room with all of the partitions removed. **Deb Hutton** asked **Charlie Boxman** when he had worked at the restaurant, if the building was two separate buildings. **Charlie Boxman** explained how the two buildings were before. **Deb Hutton** asked **Charlie Boxman** what the front looked like when he worked there. Whether it was the blocked glass front or wooden box front. **Charlie Boxman** stated that his memories of the building were with the blocked glass front from the early 1950’s. **Derek Richey** asked **Charlie Boxman** if he had ever met **Colonel Sanders**. **Charlie Boxman** replied

yes, indeed. In fact **Coronal Sanders** helped serve the cake and punch at his sister's wedding in December of 1956. More discussion ensued about the history of the connection between **Henry Boxman** and **Colonel Sanders**.

**Josh Alley** stated that they would name the new building **The Boxman** and that they would be more than happy to put up a plaque to reference all of the history. **Josh Alley** also stated that they would do their best to repurpose the limestone and as much of the brick on the front façade onto the new building as much as they possibly could. The main driving force on the petition that they had was that the building is beyond repair. These are the opinions of the experts that they relied on. One of those contractors restored the **Von Lee Theatre**. He was able to save that building, but said that this building was beyond repair.

**Chris Sturbaum** stated that buildings travel through time by being forever repaired. They get restored and they get put back to life. I will have to vote to support staff's recommendation to send this to council. It's a good building with history. **Jeff Goldin** stated that he reviewed all of the public responses. This building is in disrepair. Most of this building will have to be torn down and put in a land fill. Saving this building will not bring back the **Players Pub**. As far as the **Boxman's** and the restaurant, I think that they should be honored in some way. What is left of that building doesn't pay homage to what the **Boxma's** did. There is really nothing left other than what is the front façade. **Jeff Goldin** stated that it is time to revitalize this part of the city. I am going to support releasing this permit. **Deb Hutton** stated that she also read all of the comments. I think the whole point of restoration is to see that it becomes viable. This would be the first food service building restored or saved or put into historic designation. I do see the history of the **Boxman's** and the restaurant business in this town.

**Susan Dyer** stated that she was on the fence before because this building is in such bad shape. But I really do like the historic nature of our downtown. I am in agreement with the comments made about preserving it. So at this point I think I am going to support moving it on to the Common Council for designation. **Doug Bruce** stated that he was going to side with **Jeff Goldin**. This building has changed so much over time that I'm not sure what point in time we are looking at now, is as historic as some of the other lovely pictures, specifically when the **Boxmans** had this building and their restaurant. I am afraid that the **Council** will not find enough here for designation. I'm still not in agreement that this is a **Mitchell Building**. **Doug Bruce** stated that as a final comment, is this building as it sits right now more historic than the **Chocolate Moose** structure? **Sam DeSollar** also commented on the public responses. This building has had so many changes over the course of its life. At what point do we say this is the historic building. I'd also like to know what the neighborhood thinks about this building. Every neighbor, every business owner in the neighborhood wants to tear this down. **Sam DeSollar** pointed out the changes in this area, and the bad shape of the building. **Ernesto Casteneda** stated that he also read the public comments, and that some people were for and some were against. There is a lot here to talk about and to save this building. As much as people say it is in bad shape, that is what restoration is all about. There is something there to be saved. **Derek Richey** stated that the building was in bad shape. It is a contributing structure number one, and why is it contributing? Most of the west side starting at the **Alcove Building** and heading south fit the context. This building provides some history and some context for what remains of the west side. I agree that we send it to the **Common Council** to designate. **Jenny Southern** also agreed to the designation. **Duncan Campbell** stated that to designate this for demolition is to say that there is no history here, and I don't agree with that. What makes it so difficult is the condition of the building.

Twelve **Public** comments were made during the meeting. See packet for details.

**Jeff Goldin** made a motion to approve **Demo Delay 20-17**  
**Sam DeSollar** seconded.  
**Motion Denied 5-3-0**

**Chris Sturbaum** made a motion to approve staff recommendation to begin formal process for forwarding this to the **Common Council**.  
**Lee Sandweiss** seconded.  
**Motion Carried 5-2-1**

**B. Demo Delay 20-23**  
1003 W. 1st Street  
Petitioner: Matt Ryan  
*Full demolition*

**Conor Herterich** gave presentation. See packet for details.

**Chris Sturbaum** asked if this could be continued. **Jeff Goldin** asked why it should be continued.

**Chris Sturbaum** made a motion to move **Demo Delay 20-23** to the next meeting.  
**Susan Dyer** seconded.  
**Motion Denied 4-4-0**

**Chris Sturbaum** asked **Cheyenne Riker** what the purpose of removal was. **Cheyenne Riker** stated that this building has some structural issues. There is very little historic value to this project and the direction that this area is moving in. Regardless of the direction we go, as long as it is in the same realm as the current use which is largely health care, I think that the **HPC** can justify what it is we are hoping to accomplish. **Cheyenne Riker** discussed some of the ideas that they have for this property. **Chris Sturbaum** stated that a typical agreement can be to donate demolition costs toward a move. That would be something that we would like to see discussed with **Bloomington Restorations** if you could. **Cheyenne Riker** stated "Sure".

**Jeff Goldin** commented that this will be a difficult sell in the political sense. Especially since we have already allowed two demolitions on this street. I think it is worth our while to let this go.

**Jeff Goldin** made a motion to approve **Demo Delay 20-23**.  
**Chris Sturbaum** seconded.  
**Motion Carried 7-0-0**

**V. NEW BUSINESS**

**VI. OLD BUSINESS**

**A. Adoption of Restaurant Row Design Guidelines**

**Jeff Goldin** made a motion to approve **Adoption of Restaurant Row Design Guidelines**.  
**Deb Hutton** seconded.  
**Motion Carried 7-0-0**

**VII. COMMISSIONER COMMENTS**

**VIII. PUBLIC COMMENTS**

**IX. ANNOUNCEMENTS**

**XII. ADJOURNMENT**

Meeting was adjourned by **John Saunders @ 7:14 p.m.**

**END OF MINUTES**

**Video record of meeting available upon request.**