# Bloomington Historic Preservation Commission Teleconference Meeting Thursday September 23, 2021, 5:00 P.M. MINUTES

# I. CALL TO ORDER

Meeting was called to order by Chair, Jeff Goldin @ 5:00 pm

## II. ROLL CALL

#### **Commissioners Present:**

Jeff Goldin Elizabeth Mitchell – 5:03 left @ 7:03 Chris Sturbaum Sam DeSollar Reynard Cross Lee Sandwiess Matt Seddon – 5:03 left @ 8:16

## **Advisory Members Present:**

Jenny Southern

## **Staff Present:**

Gloria Colom, HAND John Zody, HAND Brent Pierce, HAND Eddie Wright, HAND Daniel Dixon, City Legal Department

## **Guests Present:**

CATS Lauren Elderkin Paul Ash Lisa Freeman Nicholas Bauer John Wiebke Jim Rosenbarger Noah Rogers Angela Rickets Ron Walker Jean Lave Bob Shaw Holden Abshier Elizabeth Ash Sonja Johnson Marc Cornett Tessa Bent Charles Brandt Reina Wong Mike Boisvenue Rachid Maidi

## III. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

A. September 9, 2021 Minutes

Sam DeSollar made a motion to approve the September 9, 2021 minutes, Lee Sandweiss seconded. Motion carried: 5 - Yes (Sandweiss, Sturbaum, DeSollar, Cross, Goldin), 0 - No, 1 - Abstain (Bruce).

## IV. CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

#### **Staff Approvals**

#### A. COA 21-48

320 W 8th St, Showers Building (Showers Brothers Furniture Complex Local Historic District) Petitioner: CFC Properties Installation of Pedestal Mailbox

Gloria Colom gave presentation. See packet for details.

#### B. COA 21-49

922 W 8th St. (Near West Side Conservation District) Petitioner: Rashid Maidi and Dawood Maidi *New deck, back of building* 

Gloria Colom gave presentation. See packet for details.

## Commission Review

## C. COA 21-42

414 W Dodds St. (McDoel Historic District) Petitioner: Bob Shaw *Lifting a structure in place* 

Gloria Colom gave presentation. See packet for details.

**Bob Shaw** was not present at the time the COA was presented to the **Commission, Daniel Dixon** clarified that the COA must be voted on tonight or the 30 days will pass. Discussion and voting on **COA 21-42** was postponed until later in the meeting when **Bob Shaw** arrived.

**Chris Sturbaum** suggested using split faced block. **Bob Shaw** stated that he would have to tear down the front of the building to do so.

**Elizabeth** Ash asked if the neighborhood association would be advised on this project. **Gloria Colom** will reach out to the neighborhood association on Friday.

Matt Seddon made a motion to approve COA 21-42 amended to include 4 inch siding, Chris Sturbaum seconded.

Motion carried: 8 - Yes (Sandweiss, Sturbaum, DeSollar, Bruce, Mitchell, Seddon, Goldin, Cross), 0 - No, 0 - Abstain.

## D. COA 21-44

412 E 4th St. (Restaurant Row Local Historic District) Petitioner: Shawn Eurton *New Construction* 

Gloria Colom gave presentation. See packet for details.

**Doug Bruce** gave a brief presentation clarifying aspects of the proposed design and placement of the door.

**Chris Sturbaum** asked if there was room add something over the small side door. **Doug Bruce** stated they could add something there. **Chris Sturbaum** asked about the size of the siding, **Doug Bruce** stated they are using 4 inch siding but not locked into that. **Sam DeSollar** asked about doors on the bays and the visible interior of the garage. **Doug Bruce** explained what the interior would look like but he didn't think they could get garage doors that size.

Chris Sturbaum stated that to balance the lack of bay doors he recommends 4 inch siding and keeping with the pattern of the era. Sam DeSollar agreed with the 4 inch siding and adding something over the side door. But the open bays might present a problem for the owner. Matt Seddon, Jeff Goldin & Elizabeth Mitchell concur with previous comments. Jenny Southern has concerns about the open bays and that the building design may be misplaced. Jeff Goldin stated that the commission can make suggestions but this building does fit in with the area.

Matt Seddon made a motion to approve COA 21-42, Lee Sandweiss seconded. Motion carried: 7 - Yes (Sandweiss, Sturbaum, DeSollar, Mitchell, Seddon, Goldin Cross), 0 – No, 1 - Abstain (Bruce).

#### E. COA 21-47

1302 E 2nd St. (Elm Heights Historic District) Petitioner: John Wiebke *Build standalone storage shed in back yard* 

Gloria Colom gave presentation. See packet for details.

**Jenny Southern** asked about drainage in the corner of the yard where the shed is to be placed. **Jenny Southern** asked about and easement but the petitioner didn't know about an easement. She advised that placement of the shed might cause problems in this area. **Jenny Southern** clarified that anything involving Elm Heights the neighborhood committee has not reviewed anything.

**Chris Sturbaum** suggested the use of stain on the shed to blend into the neighborhood. **Sam DeSollar** suggested the use of different materials and shape of the roof to remain within the guidelines of the neighborhood. He also questions the setbacks and they might need a variance. **Jenny Southern** agreed with Sam's comments, and she had concerns about the color of the shed. **Chris Sturbaum** asked if the petitioner would encumber himself on the color of the shed. He stated that he would be acceptable with that.

Chris Sturbaum made a motion to approve COA 21-47, Doug Bruce seconded. Motion carried: 6 - Yes (Sandweiss, Sturbaum, Bruce, Mitchell, Seddon, Goldin) 2 - No (DeSollar, Cross) 0 - Abstain.

## F. COA 21-51

1319 E 1st St. (Elm Heights Historic District) Petitioner: Darrin C. Ricketts *Tuck pointing, remove air conditioning unit, restore limestone wall, replace concrete sidewalk with limestone* 

Gloria Colom gave presentation. See packet for details.

Sam DeSollar asked about the bench. Angela Ricketts stated that a stump is holding up the bench but they are going to keep and restore the bench. Jenny Southern asked what their plans are for the railings. Angela Ricketts is open to suggestions on what to do with those. Jenny Southern asked if the ones near the sidewalk are original. They are not, but the Angela Ricketts is not sure what to do about those for insurance reasons. But the rails will need to come out when redoing the concrete. Jenny Southern asked about forwarding the COA to the next meeting to get clarification. Chris Sturbaum asked if any work is scheduled that is non-controversial. Jeff Goldin asked about a new COA about the bench and railings.

**Doug Bruce** stated that he loves this house. **Commissioners** discussed the railing and will give suggestions on those for a new COA. **Sam DeSollar** stated that the railing is required by code and the petitioner would not need to return.

Lee Sandweiss made a motion to approve COA 21-51, Chris Sturbaum seconded. Motion carried: 8 - Yes (Sandweiss, Sturbaum, DeSollar, Bruce, Mitchell, Seddon, Goldin, Cross) 0 - No, 0 - Abstain.

G. COA 21-52

601 W 4th St. (Greater Prospect Hills Historic District) Petitioner: Lindsey Muller *Replacement of back deck* 

Gloria Colom gave presentation. See packet for details.

Lindsey Muller clarified their plans for this COA.

**Chris Sturbaum** asked if the plans are clear for replacement of the windows. **Lindsey Muller** stated that their designer has a program for design of the windows. **Sam DeSollar** asked if the COA has placement of the fencing. **Lindsey Muller** stated that is in the emails she sent to **Gloria Colom**, but gave clarification on the location of the fencing. **Jenny Southern** asked about the underneath of the deck with the lattice and was wondering if they are going with this lattice or the square lattice. **Lindsey Muller** stated they want to do something to cover up the cistern but will not use this lattice. **Jenny Southern** suggested they do what she did at her house. **Chris Sturbaum** asked if the fence shown in the pictures is the fencing they will be using. **Lindsey Muller** stated that is what they will be using.

Sam DeSollar would like to see a drawing before they approve the porch. Lindsey Muller emailed a sketch of the plans to Gloria Colom for this COA. Gloria displayed the sketch and Lindsey Muller clarified the sketch. Sam DeSollar asked for clarification on what the petitioner is planning on doing here and stated that if the petitioner wants to do something different they would need to return to the Commission. The Lindsy Muller clarified their plans. Sam DeSollar stated that he is not really clear on what their plans are for the deck. Lindsey Muller further clarified the plans for the deck and railing. The petitioner will do a survey for the proper placement of the fence on the property line. Chris Sturbaum gave a suggestion on placement of the deck railing. Jenny Southern asked about the steps being open or closed. Lindsey Muller stated the steps will not be open. Jenny Southern stayed that she doesn't feel like this COA is ready for approval.

**Lindsey Muller** stated they did not understand the historic significance of the lattice and spindles. The **Commission** explained the historic significance and the Petitioner stated they will replace in kind and will consult with **Gloria Colom** on replacement materials.

Matt Seddon made a motion to approve COA 21-52 with staff approval of the spindles, Chris Sturbaum seconded.

Motion carried: 8 - Yes (Sandweiss, Sturbaum, DeSollar, Bruce, Mitchell, Seddon, Goldin, Cross) 0 - No, 0 - Abstain.

#### H. COA 21-53

601 W 4th St. (Greater Prospect Hills Historic District) Petitioner: Lindsey Muller *Window Replacement* 

Gloria Colom gave presentation. See packet for details.

**Chris Sturbaum** asked if the windows currently don't open. **Lindsey Muller** stated the windows don't open and they have problems with being screwed shut and the glazing falling out.

**Doug Bruce** stated that he's surprised the neighborhood guidelines allow full replacement. **Chris Sturbaum** stated that he believes the windows can be restored and they would last another 100 years. He also stated they could save money by going with restoration. **Lindsey Muller** stated that the current windows are not energy efficient. **Sam DeSollar** agreed with **Chris Sturbaum** and these can be restored but he will support replacement because the guidelines allow replacement. **Jeff Goldin** added to **Chris Sturbaum** and **Sam DeSollar** statements stating that old windows with good storm windows can be just as energy efficient.

Sam DeSollar made a motion to approve COA 21-53, Matt Seddon seconded. Motion carried: 8 - Yes (Sandweiss, Sturbaum, DeSollar, Bruce, Mitchell, Seddon, Goldin, Cross) 0 - No, 0 - Abstain.

I. COA 21-54

601 W 4th St. (Greater Prospect Hills Historic District) Petitioner: Lindsey Muller *Moving the main entryway* 

Gloria Colom gave presentation. See packet for details.

**Chris Sturbaum** stated that he understands what they are doing with this. **Sam DeSollar** asked if a new rail would be added to the walkway. **Lindsey Muller** stated they would bring that back to the commission in the spring. The walkway will remain on the Jackson St side. **Jenny Southern** asked if anyone has looked to be sure this isn't the original placement of the door and stairs and original lattice. **Lindsey Muller** stated this is an old picture but not the location of the original door.

Doug Bruce stated everything in this project looks like it makes sense. Chris Sturbaum

stated that this is a perfect time to replace the panel near the door.

Lee Sandweiss made a motion to approve COA 21-54, Chris Sturbaum seconded. Motion carried: 8 - Yes (Sandweiss, Sturbaum, DeSollar, Bruce, Mitchell, Seddon, Goldin, Cross) 0 - No, 0 - Abstain.

#### J. COA 21-55

601 W 4th St. (Greater Prospect Hills Historic District) Petitioner: Marc Cornett *Barn demolition and garage construction* 

Gloria Colom gave presentation. See packet for details.

**Marc Cornett** clarified the plans for the project and explained the drawings, photos and the uses for the garage.

**Chris Sturbaum** asked if this could be a reconstruction as opposed to build. **Sam DeSollar** asked of the siding would go all the way up. **Marc Cornett** stated that it would and the replacement would be in kind. **Chris Sturbaum** asked about a resolution for maintaining this site. **Chris Sturbaum** stated that this project should be respective of the site. **Sam DeSollar** likes the look of the project, but he suggested placing some doors on the openings. This should be contingent on a site plan. **Jeff Goldin** agrees with Sam.

**Sam DeSollar** made a motion to approve **COA 21-55** under conditions of a site plan and petition for setback variance, **Doug Bruce** seconded. **Motion carried: 8 - Yes (Sandweiss, Sturbaum, DeSollar, Bruce, Mitchell, Seddon, Goldin, Cross) 0 – No, 0 - Abstain.** 

## K. COA 21-56

344 S Rogers St. (Prospect Hill Historic District) Petitioner: Sonja Johnson and Keith Stolberg *Gutter Replacement* 

Gloria Colom gave presentation. See packet for details.

**Sonja Johnson** made a statement about the gutters and that they would like their gutters to match what is on houses in the neighborhood.

**Chris Sturbaum** looked into this and the gutters are not functioning as intended and would like to see the gutter replaced. **Sam DeSollar** asked what gutter were removed from the house 35 years ago. **Sonja Johnson** does not remember. **Jenny Southern** asked that the long run across the front remain unbroken. **Chris Sturbaum** stated that they should probably be using 6 inch guttering.

**Doug Bruce** stated that the gutters can be replaced and the problems they've had they should allow for replacement. **Sam DeSollar** stated that replacement looks ok and the downspouts should remain around the corner.

Matt Seddon made a motion to approve COA 21-56, Lee Sandweiss seconded. Motion carried: 6 - Yes (Sandweiss, DeSollar, Bruce, Seddon, Goldin, Cross) 0 – No, 1 - Abstain (Sturbaum).

L. COA 21-57

1114 W Kirkwood Ave. (Near West Side Conservation District) Petitioner: Reina Wong New Shed

Gloria Colom gave presentation. See packet for details.

Petitioner stated that the shed is intended to be temporary.

**Chris Sturbaum** asked what material would be used for the shed and suggested she use plywood. **Doug Bruce** stated that Chris made a good point about materials used. He suggested some points about making the shed match the house. **Chris Sturbaum** offered to be consulted if they have any questions. **Sam DeSollar** cautioned that a temporary thing can sometimes stick around for a long time.

Matt Seddon made a motion to approve COA 21-57, Sam DeSollar seconded. Motion carried: 7 - Yes (Sandweiss, Sturbaum, DeSollar, Bruce, Seddon, Goldin, Cross) 0 - No, 0 - Abstain.

#### M. COA 21-58

"Paris Dunning House" 608 W 3rd St. (Prospect Hill Historic District) Petitioner: Nicholas Bauer *Roof Shingle Replacement* 

Gloria Colom gave presentation. See packet for details.

Nicholas Bauer discussed his intentions for the shingle replacement. Chris Sturbaum asked if it was clear that this is not a precedent for replacement of the lower shingles. Nicholas Bauer stated that the lower roof line is not involved in the shingle replacement, this would remain cedar shake roof. Sam DeSollar asked if a color has been selected. Nicholas Bauer stated they have not at this time, but are favoring at a shingle looking like weathered cedar.

**Doug Bruce** stated that he like the Malarkey shingles and they are the best out there. The cedar shingle may become an issue at a later time. **Chris Sturbaum** stated that they should get the color right and bring three samples on site and do an approval on the staff level. **Sam DeSollar** agreed with Chris and he likes the look of the Malarkey shingles.

Chris Sturbaum made a motion to approve COA 21-58 with a staff approval on the color of the shingles, **Doug Bruce** seconded.

Motion carried: 7 - Yes (Sandweiss, Sturbaum, DeSollar, Bruce, Seddon, Goldin, Cross), 0 - No, 0 - Abstain.

N. COA 21-59

"Henderson House" 748 S Morton St. (McDoel Historic District) Petitioner: James Rosenbarger *Addition* 

Gloria Colom gave presentation. See packet for details.

**Chris Sturbaum** asked about one of the pictures. **James Rosenbarger** stated that this is just an example of what they are planning but if needed, they could add a window later. **Jenny Southern** asked if there is a flat roof on the walkway. It is a flat low membrane roof. Jim then gave an explanation on what they are planning with the roof and the addition of solar panels. Jenny asked if this structure is a standalone historic designation. It is and the replacement is in kind. **Elisabeth Cox Ash** stated that the neighborhood has national historic designation and that these changes are not facing the street and the materials are in kind. The neighborhood approved the changes and they are lucky to have someone that is sensitive to historic preservation.

Chris Sturbaum appreciates the addition. All commissioners like the project.

Matt Seddon made a motion to approve COA 21-59, Lee Sandweiss seconded. Motion carried: 6 - Yes (Sandweiss, Sturbaum, DeSollar, Bruce, Seddon, Goldin, Cross) 0 - No, 0 - Abstain.

#### O. COA 21-60

619 E 1st St. (Elm Heights Historic District) Petitioner: Charles Brandt and Theresa Bent *Garage demolition, new construction* 

Gloria Colom gave presentation. See packet for details.

**Charles Brandt** and **Theresa Bent** stated their intentions for the property and what they are wanting to do with the garage.

Lee Sandweiss asked if the elm heights historic district has given feedback. They stated they are not in the historic district. It was determined that there is no need to come before the commission for this, they need to return as a demo delay. No motions made, no vote taken.

#### P. COA 21-61

208 E 16th St. (Garden Hills Historic District) Petitioner: Lisa Freeman Renovate front porch and entryway, add retaining wall and 6 diagonal parking spaces, replace windows, siding, eliminate existing sidewalk in yard

Gloria Colom gave presentation. See packet for details.

**Lisa Freeman** explained what they are doing on the front of the house in reference to the elevation. He also discussed the siding and front porch. They have not decided on a color for the siding.

**Doug Bruce** asked the staff about the house and windows historically. **Gloria Colom** stated that the house may have been altered in the past and is contributing. The **Lisa Freeman** stated that it has been in her family since the early 60's and needs a lot of work. **Chris Sturbaum** asked about the location of the porch. **Lisa** clarified the placement of the porch. **Chris** asked for clarification about the siding and if they have consulted with the neighborhood. **Jenny Southern** asked about the district guidelines. She also asked if this has gone before city planning.

Chris Sturbaum stated that he does not have enough information to approve. Sam DeSollar stated that structures in the district has a varying difference in age. This house is set back so far that it's like it's not there, and he wonders why it's contributing. Matt Seddon concurs with the staff. Jeff Goldin stated that the loss of this house would not hurt anything. Reynard Cross does not like the look of the house and the changes to the house would be an improvement. Chris Sturbaum has concerns if the wishes of the neighborhood are being taken into consideration. Jenny Southern stated that she is surprised that people are supporting this project. She has concerns about the parking in the front, if she knew the

neighborhood supported this project then she might. But they should consult with planning about the parking in the front.

**Noah Rogers** asked for clarification on what the commission is asking for to get approval. A 3D drawing, neighborhood feedback and a scale with neighboring houses.

Matt Seddon made a motion to continue COA 21-60, asking for better plans and neighborhood feedback, Sam DeSollar seconded.

Motion carried: 7 - Yes (Sandweiss, DeSollar, Bruce, Seddon, Goldin, Cross) 0 – No, 0 - Abstain.

## V. DEMOLITION DELAY

## VI. NEW BUSINESS

A. 816 and 812 W Kirkwood Ave (Near West Side Historic District) Mike Boisvenue Consultation on potential demolition request

**Mike Boisvenue** stated what he is looking to do on the site. He gave an explanation with the problems with the structures and why he is looking to take those down. **Jeff Goldin** asked what he is wanting from the **Commission**. **Mike** stated that this would have to come before the board at some point so he wanted input from the **Commission**. **Jeff Goldin** stated that they don't have enough information at this point to support or deny. **Chris Sturbaum** stated that talking to the neighborhood is a good start and letting them know what he is planning. **Sam DeSollar** stated that if he is wanting a read on the project if something is built in the same foot print then it is better to get approval before demolition. To show that you are replacing this with that. But to go to the neighborhood first, because the **Commission** usually support what the neighborhood supports.

## VII. OLD BUSINESS

A. Discussion of 2001 East Hillside Drive, House 8 (The Faris House) for Local Designation

**Gloria Colom** will give her full presentation on the Faris House on the October 14<sup>th</sup> HPC meeting.

**B.** Johnson Creamery Update

**Gloria Colom** stated that peerless is applying for a state grant for \$100,000 grant and will rebuild the top 15 feet of the smokestack. Anything they do they have to consult the HPC.

## VIII. COMMISSIONER COMMENTS

Doug Bruce stated to the commission why he has missed several meetings in the recent past.

## IX. PUBLIC COMMENTS

X. ANNOUNCEMENTS

## XII. ADJOURNMENT

Meeting was adjourned by Jeff Goldin @ 8:30 p.m.

# **END OF MINUTES**

Video record of meeting available upon request